

**ANNUAL JOINT PROGRAMME PROGRESS REPORT**

**REPORT COVER PAGE**

<p><b>Date of Submission:</b> 31 March 2009</p> <p><b>Submitted by:</b> Nese Cakir UN Joint Programme Manager UN House Birlik Mah. 2. Cadde, No: 11, Çankaya Ankara / TURKEY</p>	<p><b>Country and Thematic Window</b> TURKEY CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT</p>					
<p><b>OPAS No.</b> <b>MDTF Atlas Award No:00220</b> <b>MDTF Atlas Project No: 67179</b></p> <p><b>Title:</b> MDG-F 1792 Alliances for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia</p>	<p><b>Report Number:</b> 2<sup>nd</sup> Annual Joint Programme Progress Report</p> <p><b>Reporting Period:</b> 1 Jan. - 31 Dec. 2009</p> <p><b>Programme Duration:</b> Extended to 30 Months with the approval dated 11 December 2009.</p>					
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Participating UN Organizations</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>UNDP</td> </tr> <tr> <td>UNESCO</td> </tr> <tr> <td>UNICEF</td> </tr> <tr> <td>UNWTO</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Participating UN Organizations	UNDP	UNESCO	UNICEF	UNWTO	<p><b>Implementing Partners</b></p> <p><i>Ministry of Culture and Tourism Republic of Turkey</i></p> <p><i>Ministry of Foreign Affairs Republic of Turkey</i></p>
Participating UN Organizations						
UNDP						
UNESCO						
UNICEF						
UNWTO						

## **Abbreviations**

AA	Administrative Agent
DRR	Deputy Resident Representative
EU	European Union
GAP	South Eastern Anatolia Project
JP	Joint Programme
KARTAB	Kars Tourism and Infrastructure Service Union
LOA	Letter of Agreement
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MDG-F	Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund
MDT-F	The Multi-Donor Trust Fund
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoCT	Ministry of Culture and Tourism
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NSC	National Steering Committee
PMC	Project Management Committee
RC	Resident Coordinator
RL	Representative List
SHÇEK	Social Services and Child Protection Agency
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
SPA	Specially Protected Area
SPO	State Planning Organization
TAC	Technical Advisory Committee
UN	United Nations
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
UNWTO	United Nations World Tourism Organisation
UNJP	United Nations Joint Programme

# **1. PURPOSE**

## **1.1 Provide the main outputs and outcomes of the program**

The main output of the programme is to mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia and increase incomes for the people of Kars province. Specifically, the JP will develop the culture tourism sector in Kars by contributing to social cohesion, recognizing pluralism and reducing income disparities between the people of Kars and the rest of the country. This objective will be obtained through a set of mutually supportive Joint Program Results.

Specifically, it will result in:

- A participatory governance model for strategic direction, prioritization and coordination of cultural heritage protection and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions in general and increased incomes for the people of Kars in particular where implementation will take place.
- Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in the culture based tourism sector.
- Local authorities and civil society in Kars and its environs and relevant provinces promote social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism.

## **1.2 Reference to how the JP relates to the UNDAF and how it aims to support National Development Goals, including the Millennium Development Goals**

The Joint Program will directly contribute to the achievement of MDG-1 at a localized level by addressing Turkey's regional developmental disparities with the mobilization of the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia Region. Specifically, it will contribute to the UNDAF -Turkey Outcome 2.1.2 "Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented within the framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF)" by recognizing pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighbouring countries. It is expected to contribute the implementation of existing National Strategies, Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013), Tourism and Strategy Action Plan (2007-2013) and Tourism Strategy (2023). The Joint Program will ensure national ownership, effective cohesion of program outputs, and institutional set-up of management for cultural policy and cultural tourism in the country and program targets with those of the relevant national authorities.

## **2. RESOURCES**

### **2.1 Provide details on any budget revisions approved by the appropriate decision-making body, if applicable**

On 11 December 2009, a six-month no-cost extension of the Joint Programme was approved by the MDG-F Secretariat. Accordingly, the existing resources were re-allocated to cover 30 months instead of 24 months and the revised budget was approved in the PMC meeting, which took place on 24 February 2010 and endorsed in the NSC Meeting on 26 February 2010.

### **2.2 Provide information on additional financial resources obtained to fund the joint programme or if there are other external sources of information from other donors (if applicable)**

Even though there are no direct financial contributions to the JP, complementary support of the MoCT for the programme activities can be considered under this heading. The contribution provided by the MoCT through assigning of trainers in the local capacity development trainings is an in-kind contribution channelled to the priorities of the Joint Programme, resulting in lower training costs that are transferred to other budget lines.

## **3. IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS**

### **3.1 Summarize the implementation mechanisms primarily utilized and how they are adapted to achieve maximum impact given the operating context**

The implementation mechanisms have been applied in line with to Multi Donor Trust Fund Operational Guidance Note for the Participating UN Organizations (MDG-F, June 2009). Coordination and collaboration between participating UN agencies have been ensured by the UN Resident Coordinator a.i. in Turkey and lead agency UNDP. Implementation is led by the Programme Management team, i.e. the Joint Programme Manager, Site Manager and a Programme Assistant to ensure the facilitation of collaboration between UN organizations. UNDP acts as the Administrative Agent (AA) of the Joint Program and UNDP Turkey supports the implementing agency in the overall coordination of the outputs and management of administrative, financial and procurement issues related to project implementation. UNDP also assists coordination among the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program, particularly for UNESCO and

UNWTO which are non-resident in Turkey, including support in recruitment of programme staff and dissemination of JP objectives and strategies to the stakeholders. UNESCO has established a backstopping unit with a National Professional Officer in UN House in Ankara for direct implementation and assistance in the direct implementation of relevant JP activities.

For the technical and policy components of the JP, the MoCT and SPO are responsible respectively. UNJP Team also has developed a close working relationship with MoCT, both with the Department of Foreign Relations, which is responsible for overall coordination within the Ministry and other technical units within the Ministry such as General Directorate of Cultural Assets and Museums and General Directorate of Investments and Enterprises.

The NSC includes a representative of the Turkish Government, a representative from the Government of Spain and the UN Resident Coordinator and was established to monitor all MDG-Fund Projects. The NSC also monitors this Joint Program semi-annually.

A PMC, composed of the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program, the Department of Foreign Relations and EU Coordination of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (ensuring coordination between relevant Departments of the Ministry), as well as relevant General Directorates of MoCT, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Social Services and Child Protection Agency, State Planning Organization, Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality and other relevant stakeholders has been organized to meet quarterly.

During the reporting period, a Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) constituted in addition to NSC and PMC. TAC has been visualized as a platform for focused discussions on key issues related to the objectives of the JP, as well as the development of cultural tourism at a wider perspective. It provides technical advice to support JP implementation if and when needed. TAC is comprised of governmental technical staff, chambers, academia and other stakeholders who might be invited to attend meetings with respect to the agenda. TAC consists of almost 14 distinguished experts in their relevant fields. The major topics stated in the JP document include *inter alia* Inventory and mapping of tangible and intangible cultural heritage; ii. Preservation and site management plan; iii. Business development (seed funding for local initiatives, enterprise support services, enterprise clustering, handicraft sector development etc.); iv. Development of a cultural tourism strategy within the context of the “Brand City” Programme (Marketing strategies for Kars).

Members of the PMC do not serve on the TAC, except for technical experts from relevant organizations. This committee will be jointly coordinated by the PMC and the Programme Manager of the Joint Programme and consists of about 14 national experts.

### **3.2 Provide details on the monitoring system(s) that are being used and how you identify and incorporate lessons learned into the ongoing programme**

JP monitoring has been carried out in line with the indicators developed in the Joint Programme Document, primarily by the JP Team and the Programme Management Committee. In order to ensure the coordination among resident and non-resident agencies, weekly teleconferences and programme team meetings are arranged. Weekly teleconferences function as an information sharing platform on previous and planned activities within the JP and serves as a day-to-day monitoring as well as an internal decision making platform. Additionally, face-to-face or videoconference team meetings before or after each PMC meeting are arranged so that all agencies have a chance to have face to face discussions on strategic issues.

In addition to the existing monitoring and evaluation framework in the JP document, UNDP also currently works with a Monitoring and Evaluation expert to review the indicators and update where relevant to ensure a better monitoring and impact evaluation of the JP.

### **3.3 Report on any assessments, evaluations or studies undertaken.**

Between the 24<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup> of August, MDG-F Secretariat had a mission to Turkey. For all MDG Funded Joint Programmes, the Secretariat underlined the tendency among the UN agencies to want to revert to individual component implementation once the funds are in place. The mission also drew attention to the fact that joint implementation will be an element for the mid-term evaluation and is a requirement in the model. The UN Agencies must continue to work together and jointly manage the programme.

Specifically for the Joint Programme 'Alliances for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia', the change in the local authority partners was reported as a factor decreasing the programme pace. It also has been noted that the Kars Governorate is very supportive of the JP and, as indicated above, the Mayor, while supportive, requests an official letter sent by MoCT following the MDG-F visit detailing the expected role of the Municipality in the JP.

The current priorities of the Mayor, including reducing debt and improving infrastructure, are not necessarily aligned with those of the JP. The mission also underlined the need to further sensitize local officials to the potential benefits of the JP. With this aim, the JP Team organized a Joint Mission to Kars with the participation of the Undersecretary of MoCT, Spanish Ambassador to Turkey and UNDP RR a.i. to provide support to the UN Joint Program and interact with local authorities and actors on the issue of cultural tourism and to review the progress of the UN Joint Program. As it will be discussed further in the

following parts, the mission had a positive impact on strengthening local ownership in Kars.

Apart from this, in order to better understand the strengths and weaknesses of the implementation, the programme activities, especially the trainings, have been evaluated with questionnaires and follow-up meetings. During the reporting period two important activities were evaluated with this aim. The first one is the assessment of “Capacity Development Training” applied in Kars between 5<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> October with the participation of 263 citizens currently working or potentially to work on the tourism sector. The evaluation results revealed quite successful reflections about the activity with 81% of the participants, indicating that the activity met their needs and expectations completely. The overall rating of the participants for the training was above 4.8 out of 5, by which we can conclude the training was quite satisfactory in general. The second activity is the “Study Tour to Spain” with 28 participants from national, local stakeholders between 13<sup>th</sup> -20<sup>th</sup> December. According to their feedbacks approximately 99% was highly satisfied.

## 4. RESULTS

### 4.1 An assessment of the extent to which the program components are progressing in relation to the outcomes and outputs expected for the year.

The activities completed or initiated during the reporting period are summarized below the table. The supporting details of these activities are given in part 4.2.

ANNUAL TARGETS	ACTIVITIES	UN AGENCY	PROGRESS
<b>JP OUTPUT 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars</b>			
	<i>Technical assistance and support to the mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs (including description and evaluation of items; assessment of conservation status; recommendations for priority interventions)</i>	UNESCO	Draft technical specifications for the tender process has been prepared and submitted by MoCT.
	<i>Assessment of the institutional and regulatory frameworks for the protection of cultural heritage in Kars and its province</i>	UNESCO	National implementing partner proposes to revise the activity into awareness-raising action on the existing regulatory framework. This revision was presented for approval and the approval received in the 4th PMC (24 February 2010) Meeting.
	<i>Assessment of site management capacities focusing on institutional stakeholders of Ani</i>	UNESCO	Capacity Building Workshops in Kars and Ankara were held with the participation of both local and national stakeholders.
	<i>Preparation and realization of training</i>	UNESCO	Workshop completed.

	<i>workshop on site management methodology with case study focusing on Ani</i>		
	<i>Inventory of tourism facilities and services in Kars Province</i>	UNWTO	The inventory completed and submitted within the “Diagnostic of the Tourism Sector in Kars Tourism Destination and Preliminary Strategic Framework”
	<i>Assessment of tourism potential of cultural tourism assets – tangible and intangible – based on UNESCO’s identification and evaluation</i>	UNWTO	A detailed evaluation of tourism potential is given both in “Diagnostic of the Tourism Sector in Kars Tourism Destination and Preliminary Strategic Framework” and “Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy in Kars Tourism Destination” Reports.
	<i>Assessment of institutional capacity of Governorate, Municipality and stakeholder structures in destination management, development and promotion</i>	UNWTO	This is an ongoing activity, institutional capacity of the national and local stakeholders closely monitored. Also, the study tour completed aimed to improve destination management capacity.
	<i>Assessment of tourism facility performance, quality and needs (cross referenced activity)</i>	UNWTO	This activity is cross referenced with above inventory , hence completed under the “Diagnostic of the Tourism Sector in Kars Tourism Destination and Preliminary Strategic Framework”
	<i>Stakeholder consultation (tourism sector, civil society, others) on aspirations/options for tourism</i>	UNWTO	The process is ongoing.

	<i>Assessment of market profile, trends and opportunities assessment of visitor monitoring</i>	UNWTO	These assessments are submitted in both “Diagnostic of the Tourism Sector in Kars Tourism Destination and Preliminary Strategic Framework” and “Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy in Kars Tourism Destination” Reports.
	<i>Conceptual positioning of Kars with respect to themes, circuits etc in Eastern Anatolia location/access assessment</i>	UNWTO	“Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy in Kars Tourism Destination Report” prepared and submitted to Ministry of Culture and Tourism. Currently the comments of MoCT are expected.
	<i>Kars brand identity and visioning</i>	UNWTO	This visioning is again available under the “Kars Tourism Strategy Report”.
<b>JP OUTPUT 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism</b>			
	<i>Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers</i>	UNWTO	A training needs suggestion has been provided in the mentioned reports in general. These needs are currently evaluated and further be detailed.
	<i>Initiation of feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets</i>	UNWTO	This activity assessed in the tourism strategy
	<i>Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, women’s groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events</i>	UNWTO	This activity will start early second year.

	<i>Study tours within Turkey and international.</i>	UNWTO	A study tour to Spain has been completed with the participation of 28 local opinion leaders and entrepreneurs.
	<i>Identify and design a communication and dissemination strategy for enterprise support activities in line with EU competitiveness agenda requirements for regional development</i>	UNDP	An agreement with the Kars Tourism and Infrastructure Service Union (KARTAB) <sup>1</sup> established in November 2009 in order to provide support <b>for two initiatives</b> for the tourism development in Kars region, particularly for promotion and capacity development activities, in line with the priorities identified.
	<i>Identify and address the capacity shortcomings of local institutions for non-financial and financial business development services</i>	UNDP	The capacity shortcomings of local institutions were identified through the tourism diagnosis and business development assessments conducted through the exploratory missions. In response to these assessments, capacity development training for the urgent needs of tourism employers has been conducted in cooperation with MoCT with 263 participants.
	<i>Conduct a series of roundtables with the local stakeholders with a view to develop a roadmap to improve the competitive strength of tourism industry including creative industries in Kars</i>	UNDP	Cluster development experts for the development of roadmap are mobilized. The first local level activities will be initiated in the first quarter of 2 <sup>nd</sup> year.
	<i>Based on the assessments at the local level and in line with the Brand City Action Plan for Kars, draw up a plan of business development services provision for enterprise development in Kars and environs in line with EU competitiveness agenda</i>	UNDP	The needs assessment of the region completed and a list of local development initiatives developed. The prioritization of initiatives completed in cooperation with local stakeholders and two of them will be supported under the above mentioned KARTAB agreement.

	<i>Based on the Roadmap developed in partnership with the local stakeholders, design and implement local level actions to address the high priority issues</i>	UNDP	This activity is also cross linked with KARTAB agreement mentioned above, as well as the activities to be supported within the roadmap to be implemented in the second year.
<b>JP OUTPUT 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</b>			
	<i>Capacity building workshop to identify and define the Intangible Cultural Heritage of the Kars Province (2003 Convention)</i>	UNESCO	One “Regional Capacity Building Workshop” including the local authorities of all Eastern Anatolia Provinces and two provincial workshops have been completed. These workshops also targeted the enhancement of national owner’s capacity.  50 university students have been trained on the mapping of ICH.
	<i>Technical assistance and support to mapping of intangible culture in Kars and environs (including description and assessment of items; recommendations for safeguarding and transmission)</i>	UNESCO	An agreement with Kafkas University in Kars has been established. The field analysis for mapping of ICH has been completed. Currently the results are being reported.
	<i>Technical assistance for the preparation of nomination files for inscription of Intangible Cultural Heritage from the Kars Province (2003 Convention) NB: to be extended till end of project</i>	UNESCO	Minstrels Tradition recently inscribed in RL (Sept.2009). National implementing partner proposes to revise the activity into a support to safeguarding and promotion of this element. Any revision will be presented for approval at the 4th PMC (24 February 2010).
	<i>Identify local and national stakeholders for a participatory governance structure to promote social cohesion and MDG goals</i>	UNDP	A study tour to Spain has been completed in order to facilitate the relation within national and local stakeholders. The study tour included partners from NOGs, entrepreneurs and public representatives. Furthermore, the

			stakeholders for the participatory governance structure are identified within the scope of clustering initiative
	<i>Organization of interim Monitoring and Evaluation Mission on behalf of the program, including drawing up of M and E criteria and strategies for joint program</i>	UNDP	An M&E expert mobilised. Currently, the criteria mentioned in the programme document are being updated. On the other hand, the interim evaluation planned within the JP will not be undertaken since the interim evaluation will be conducted by the MDG-F Secretariat. The M&E expert supports programme management for development of indicators and setting up a monitoring system.
	<i>Dissemination of all project activities on behalf of non-resident other participating agencies in Kars and Ankara</i>	UNDP	These activities have been carried out continually by the Joint Programme team and the respective agencies. During the reporting period, a communication expert has been recruited in order to better provide the visibility of both JP and Kars region.
	<i>Technical assistance and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will provide secretariat for this governance structure (one stop shop-umbrella international presence in Kars)</i>		In addition to Joint Programme Office in Ankara, an office in Kars has been allocated for the programme purposes. The JP office in Kars is allocated by the Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism.
	<i>Child's Rights Committees in two provinces develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding</i>	UNICEF	A workshop on child participation organized in Kars. An agreement with Ankara University to provide activities on Child Museum Rooms and Trainings has been signed.
	<i>Capacity building among thirteen Child's Rights Committees on cultural wealth, heritage etc. for preparation of</i>	UNICEF	Under the umbrella of 10 <sup>th</sup> Child Forum, training has been delivered to Child Rights Committee members

	<i>the Friendship Train</i>		of all 81 provinces in Turkey.162 children participated to event took museum training.
	<i>Eight Child Rights Committees travel on board of the “Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train” from Istanbul to Kars</i>	UNICEF	Friendship Train agenda is prepared. The train will be moving in the 3 <sup>rd</sup> week of May, which includes the National Holiday for Youth and Sports of Turkey. (19 May)
	<i>Kars Child’s Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of children from eight provinces</i>	UNICEF	This activity is in progress and will be carried out within the Friendship Train activities on the 3 <sup>rd</sup> week of May.

## **4.2 Main activities undertaken and achievements**

### **Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars**

#### **Target 1: Policy for the protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars**

##### **Technical assistance and support to the mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs**

For the technical assistance and support for the mapping of tangible cultural heritage and digitization of related documentation, UNESCO is about to launch a tender, prepared in close coordination with MoCT. Also the content for the recommendations for ensuring cultural assets protection including conservation, legislation, sponsorship and property tax has been prepared by MoCT and submitted to UNESCO for follow-up. Terms of Reference for mapping of tangible cultural heritage has been under consideration by UNESCO according to its procedures. After the completion of assessment by UNESCO tendering process will be started.

#### **Target 2: Training program for site management capacity development**

A capacity building workshop on site management for Ani was prepared by UNESCO in close coordination with MoCT, and carried out between 4<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> December 2009 in Kars. This activity is followed by a three days session in Ankara between 7<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> December 2009. The aim of the workshop was to enhance the site management capacities of the participants, with special focus on the application of a participatory approach included approximately 111 participants from relevant MoCT staff, noteworthy academicians of the field, NGO representatives, representatives from Chambers and Associations in Kars, Site Management Committee Members of other archaeological, historical sites and local authorities and citizens. During the workshop, basic modalities of "Site Management", good experiences, lessons learned were presented and discussed. Additionally, the participants conducted roundtable discussions in three different working groups to analyse the following topics:

- The possible strengths/weaknesses/opportunities/threats of the Ani site
- Stakeholders to coordinate with during the site management process
- Vision and mission of Kars and Ani for the next five years
- Strategy for the development of defined vision and mission

On state of the art in preparation of Ani management plan, cultural and human resources, bottlenecks and emerging needs and priorities for possible follow-up activities in terms of technical assistance for management plan has been complemented. The assessment will serve as a guiding tool for the management team who is responsible to conduct the management plan for Ani.

### **Target 3: A cultural tourism strategy and action plan**

Following the consecutive site visits and stakeholder analysis for the evaluation of Kars's tourism potential two fundamental reports for the development of tourism strategy in Kars have been prepared during the reporting period. The first report is the "Diagnostics Study" prepared according to the outcomes of various stakeholder analysis and validation meetings in Kars. The report included the current status of the tourism sector and tourism products as well as the possible tourism products and product development alternatives. Detailed comments of national partner (MoCT) arrived early December and currently the team is revising the report accordingly.

The second report, "Tourism Strategy for Kars" prepared according to initial assessments in the former report and vision of the region as a centre for both winter, nature and culture tourism.

The report also included possible strategies in order to enhance the current tourism potential of Kars, as well as the relations with the further business development activities and the basis for the tourism strategy after the Joint Programme completion as well as throughout the definition of activities during the Joint Programme. This report has been submitted for the comments and contributions of MoCT and all local stakeholders during early December. After receiving and reflecting the comments and contributions of both national and local stakeholders, workshop will be organized in spring 2010 with local and national stakeholders. The strategic framework aims to position tourism in the tourism destination on a competitive environment. The implementation of the global strategy requires the definition of a Tourism Governance Organisation (TGO) for Kars, which would facilitate the coordination and decision process between the public sector, private sector and civil society. Close coordination with MoCT and other UN Agencies will be required for the validation and implementation of the strategy. Tourism Strategy Report linkages with national tourism strategic planning which the Tourism Strategy of Turkey 2023, the 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan and the Kars Brand City Action Plan

### **Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism**

#### **Target 1: Enterprise and community needs for income generation in tourism sector**

##### **Study Tour**

A Study Tour to Spain for the national and local partners of the programme to experience successful tourism governance practices while establishing network relations between national and local counterparts was organized in 13-20 December 2009. The tour was organized with the joint effort of three Joint Programme partners, namely UNESCO, UNDP and UNWTO benefitting from the presence, network and technical competency of UNWTO.

The 28 study tour participants were composed of the proposed Tourism Governance Organisation potential members, including the representatives from Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality, Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism, Sarıkamış District Governorate, Sarıkamış Municipality, business people from Kars and Sarıkamış and NGOs where the women participation number was nine.

Following a two day comprehensive training programme on tourism development, strategy development studies under UN Joint Programme, tourism governance structures, case studies in Spain, sustainable tourism mechanisms; field visits to Granada, Malaga and Segovia were carried out. Those field trips also included individual meetings with local counterparts like Governorates, Municipalities and tourism offices for experience sharing and network development. (See Annex1) The study tour was followed up by a meeting in Kars to discuss the experiences and lessons learned from the study tour, which reveals that the participants found the study tour very useful and relevant, particularly related to the governance mechanisms and partnership structures observed in the visited places.

## **Target 2: Business Development Service Strategy**

### **Capacity Development Training**

A capacity building activity for the tourism sector employees and employers in Kars was held between 5-12 October 2009 under the framework of the business development activities. The training programmes were delivered by the trainers of MoCT on the subjects of “social behaviours”, “home pensioning seminar”, “food and beverage service”, “food production “,”housekeeping”, “reception (front desk)”. In total 263 people benefited from the training programmes where the women participation level was close to 38%.

### **Local cooperation (KARTAB Agreement)**

An Agreement with the Kars Tourism and Infrastructure Service Union (KARTAB) established in November 2009 in order to develop **two initiatives** for the tourism development in Kars region. During prioritization of possible activities, a long list of local development initiatives were developed based on the studies carried out within the JP as well as the other relevant studies undertaken by the MoCT and Kars Governorate. This long list together with evaluation criteria was shared with MoCT and local stakeholders for selection of the activities. Evaluation criteria developed included **relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability**. Level of expected contribution to JP outputs, direct and indirect benefits to MDG-F targets and sustainability prospects were also taken into consideration.

The first initiative is the “Hygiene Awareness Campaign” which aims to increase general hygienic conditions in Kars for the purposes of increasing quality of services provided to tourists. The second initiative is the preparation and distribution of the promotional materials of Kars. The objective of this second initiative is to increase the variety and quality of promotional materials available for Kars, increase visibility of Kars in general public, and to contribute in the dissemination of information on history, culture and nature of Kars.

### **Cluster Development Activities**

In line with the diagnostic study and strategy development activities of carried out by UNJP, **a cluster development team has been mobilized** for activating local cooperation potential to foster competitiveness in tourism sector. Cluster development activities aims to increase overall competitiveness of tourism cluster in Eastern Anatolia by promoting innovative actions and innovative products in line with the overall strategy development of the UNJP.

UNJP Team will play a facilitating role, provide technical assistance and ensure commitment from stakeholders important to put planning into actions. Cluster development roadmap will target to utilize all available resources while encouraging local actors to work together for increased competitiveness of the tourism cluster.

### **Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism**

#### **Target 1: 2003 Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage follow up initiated in Kars**

##### **Mapping of Intangible Cultural Heritage**

The first activity of the mapping of Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) Regional Awareness Raising Workshop has been completed. In order to support the implementation of 2003 UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage and to enhance the capacity of stakeholders on the national inventory process, a regional workshop was held in Sarıkamış, Kars on 23rd June 2009 with 63 participants. The workshop has been attended by the representatives of different NGO's, universities, directors of culture and tourism offices, public trainers from 13 Eastern Anatolian Provinces together with Kars. Within the workshop, the basic principles and implementation modalities of the UNESCO Convention for Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage, the process of preparation of Intangible Cultural Heritage inventories in Turkey together with the samples of inventory forms for nominations, proposals have been presented.

**An Agreement with Kafkas University and UNJP has been established aiming at identification and mapping of the main intangible cultural assets in Kars Province, to be prepared and implemented in cooperation with MoCT , the University of Kafkas and UNJP.**

Within the framework of the agreement, a two days training programme in Kafkas University (Kars) was delivered in 7-8 October 2009 in Kars with 62 participants of Kafkas University students, local and international experts on in the field of ICH . The aim of the programme was to prepare the students of the University, who will be carrying out the field research and data collection on ICH with the leadership of experts from MoCT. The programme included the definitions, types and key features of each category under the intangible cultural heritage according to UNESCO modalities and 2003 Convention. The candidates successfully completed the training programme and carried out the field research for the data collection of ICH in Kars Province. Following this four-week field research, currently the data obtained is in the evaluation and reporting process in cooperation with MoCT and UNESCO. During all stages of the field research, from its preparation and throughout the implementation of field activities, special attention was paid in order to reflect the cultural diversity of the target area. A strong cooperation among local communities, authorities and the University representatives and students has been observed while implementing the research, as well as the close coordination of activities with UNESCO and relevant partner agency and with MoCT.

**Target 3: Children’s understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child’s Rights Committees**

**Friendship Train and Children Museum**

For the children museum activities, the mobilization of responsible team on the “Children Museum” was completed. The team composed of the focal points of relevant GDs from MoCT, Turkish Railways and Ankara University, Institute of Museum Training. Following consecutive working sessions on 15<sup>th</sup> September, 16 October, 26<sup>th</sup> October, and 5<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> November 2009 the working plan and the components of the museum training has been completed. The museum training was also delivered with a one day training for 162 children from each Child Right Committee of Turkish Provinces within the activities of “National Child Forum” on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2009 .

Both in the construction of work plan and training module the ongoing project of MoCT on “Child Friendly Museum” taken as the basis. Accordingly, the second pilot city for the implementation of “Children Museum” determined in Erzurum which is one of the pilot cities of MoCT “child friendly museum project”.

Another important development took place during the field visit and meeting for the children museum in Kars between 21<sup>st</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> December 2009. During this event a building owned by the Directorate of Museum in Kars was allocated to Programme to be used in “Child Museum” activities. The building will be used for the activities of “Child Museum” such as drama, history, poetry lectures and it will also be the gallery for the children’s productions.

Also, the programme and content of the “Friendship Train” has been completed. The friendship train will start from Istanbul with the participation of 8 child right committee members. The first activities will take place in Ankara, where the Ethnography Museum, Anatolian Civilizations Museum and Ankara Arts Gallery will be visited. The train will stop in Sivas and Independence Museum where the important Sivas Congress of Turkish Independence War was held will be visited. Lastly, the train will stop in Kars and children will announce the “Child Rights Declaration” and carry out active child participation activities for two days.

**4.3 Implementation constraints, lessons learned from addressing these and knowledge gained from evaluations and studies that have taken place in the course of the year.**

National ownership and coordination, strong local participation and civic engagement are the key factors determining the achievement of the programme outcomes. This fact is based on the lessons learned from previous programming and also observed during the initial phases of the programme. In this sense, the JP aimed to prioritize the following strategies for obtaining successful results:

- Ownership of the local stakeholders and joint planning and strategy development with the participation of local partners,
- Prioritization of promotion of the tourism potential of the region (demand side)

and improved service quality (supply side) at the same time, feeding into each other,

- Developing strong visual communication/promotion materials to support promotion of the region,
- All outputs and activities of the program should feed into and strengthen each other.

The UNCT experience in Turkey also underlines that leadership from Central Ministerial units is required for local authorities to contribute to project results effectively. The leadership of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism for the JP has been provided through the Foreign Relations and EU Coordination Department of MoCT, which ensures that the multiple General Directorates of the Ministry provide the necessary inputs and guidance to JP results.

As explained above, the ownership in the local level was low during the initiation of the programme activities, especially due to changes in the local authorities and concerns about the impact of the programme at the local level. In order to mitigate this situation, a Joint Visit with the participation of the Undersecretary of Culture and Tourism, Spanish Ambassador and UN RR a.i. was conducted by JP Team. The visit resulted in a concrete increase in local level ownership, which can be demonstrated by the provision of an office space in Kars and the agreement with KARTAB.

Additionally, a Study Tour to Spain was conducted to strengthen the relations and cooperation between the local stakeholders and MoCT and to raise awareness and increase the ownership of JP. The outcome of the tour was very productive in understanding and ownership of the JP by local partners. The observations of participants are concentrated on the following points. 1. Comprehensive tour content was appreciated by the stakeholders. 2. Interaction with local counterparts was found very beneficial, even leading to institutional cooperation between Kafkas University and the Boğatepe Nature Association. 3. The public-private partnership model is also appreciated and the importance of cooperation between local actors is specifically highlighted. 4. The purpose of the UN JP was clearly understood by the actors. 5. Importance of capacity building, product development and awareness rising for tourism development was also highlighted. 6. Urgency for coming and acting together is also indicated. 7. All participants are willing to contribute for future activities under the UNJP.

#### **4.4 Key partnerships and inter-agency collaboration: impact on results.**

As well as the strong linkages with the main beneficiary and national stakeholder of the Joint Programme – the Ministry of Culture and Tourism - linkages with the other national institutions, such as the State Planning Organization and Ministry of Foreign Affairs have been established. Another key partnership is established at the local level, where the Governorate of Kars has full support for JP activities. Also, the Municipality of Kars and the local NGOs have been informed and consulted at every stage of the implementation.

In the design of each JP activity, the Kars Brand City Action Plan has been used as a basis, and the priorities are given to local needs and requests instead of ad-hoc planning. The activities of the “Brand City” Action Plan were designed during the JP preparation process, and the activities with regard to Kars have been launched (The draft action plan has been submitted to the Ministry in November 2008 in the Kick-off Meeting). The activities planned in this framework are very much in line with the JP, and the activities will be carried out in cooperation with JP partners.

At the local level, the main government counterpart is the Governorate, which is also responsible for implementing the Brand City Program at the local level. The Municipality is also equally important given the responsibility and authorities related to tourism (e.g. organization of cultural and tourism activities, preparation of plans, etc.) Local NGOs and local stakeholders and private sector representatives are also represented in the JP coordination and management.

Considering the support provided by the Governorate during the last quarter of the reporting period and the active participation of NGOs and entrepreneurs, local level commitment and participation can be reported to be high. In terms of interagency collaboration, as a result of field studies, consultation with stakeholders and diagnosis by UNWTO, a first capacity development activity was organized in cooperation with MoCT. A training program for tourism sector employees and managers was organized in October 2009 in Kars, which was reported as a high priority need by the local stakeholders. In line with the diagnostic study and strategy development activities prepared during the first year, a cluster development team was mobilized in November 2009, for activating local cooperation potential to foster competitiveness in the tourism sector. Also a study tour to Spain was organized jointly with the technical support of UNESCO, UNWTO and UNDP in December 2009.

- Similarly, the joint work of participating UN Agencies will provide a strategic framework for cultural tourism development building on the existing initiatives, such as preservation of the tangible and intangible cultural heritage of the province through mapping, preparing publications, promoting and developing as a tourism product and marketing and creating job opportunities by supporting entrepreneurs in the tourism sector.
- Establishment of Children Museums in Kars and Erzurum as living museums and places for giving opportunity to children to improve their skills and learning process for museums.
- The JP will strengthen its local governance support with support to local initiatives developed and implemented by local stakeholders in line with the local priorities and the roadmap developed within the clustering initiative.
- UNWTO will utilize inputs from UNESCO supported experts in the handicraft sector, including design elements, relating to production and retail sales to tourists.
- UNWTO will feed into UNDP supported delivery of enterprise support services, including enterprise clustering, supply chain development, business support, training delivery and indirect support to enhanced financial services to enterprises.

**4.5 Other highlights and cross cutting issues pertinent to the results being reported on.**

There are no further specific cross cutting issues or highlights during the reporting period.

## **5. FUTURE WORKPLAN**

### **5.1 Priority actions planned for the following reporting period to overcome constraints build on achievements and partnerships and use the lessons learned during the previous reporting period:**

- In order to keep high level of ownership at the local and national level, all JP outputs are validated with the partners and their inputs are incorporated as appropriate.
- Achievements of the JP activities were shared with local and national partners regularly as taking into consideration position changes in the local and national authorities.
- Preparations for a complete communication strategy for the JP, which will both be used for the dissemination of JP activities and promotion of Kars, have been completed. The communication plan also includes the strategies to communicate with local partners and ensure their buy-in. This is also based on lessons learned from the previous programme period, during which misunderstandings and lack of information about the programme created obstacles for smooth implementation. The dissemination of all programme activities will be made accordingly.

### **5.2 Indication of any major adjustments in the strategies, targets or key outcomes and outputs planned in the joint programme**

No major change in the outputs, strategies and key outcomes of the joint programme exist at the moment.

## ANNEXES:

### ANNEX I Work Plan for: Alliance for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia (ACT in Kars) Period: Y2

JP Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars												
Annual targets	Activities	Details	TIME FRAME				UN AGENCY	RESPONSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET			
			Year 2						Source of Funds	Budget Description	Estimated remaining Y1 unspent funds)	Amount
			Q 1	Q 2	Q 3	Q 4						
Policy for the protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars presented for adoption by national authorities	Technical assistance and support to the mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs (including description and evaluation of items; assessment of conservation status; recommendations for priority interventions)	1.1.Appointment of a responsible technical team and preparation of tender file by MoCT 1.2 Tendering procedure for procurement of technical services 1.3. Digitization of existing data regarding existing inventory for Kars Province	X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts:	84. 579	179.000
	Awareness-raising action about existing regulatory framework.	MoCT prepares the content of the informative booklet concerning the necessary parts of the regulatory framework	X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT		Personnel:		43.000
	Recommendations for ensuring cultural assets protection and management in the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" programme – linkage and input to UN WTO	Support to the promotion, awareness raising public information on conservation legislation, incentive, sponsorship, property tax aimed at all relevant stakeholders An activity in order to promote the informative booklet to be scheduled	X				UNESCO	MoCT		Miscellaneous:		2.000
									<b>TOTAL:</b>		<b>224.000</b>	

Training programme for site management capacity development commenced.	Assessment of site management capacities focusing on institutional stakeholders of Ani		X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT				
Site management processes for Ani launched.	Technical assistance in establishing site management committees for Ani and launching their respective activities		X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT				
	Technical assistance to the site management committees throughout the first year of existence		X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT				
	Site management planning priorities are updated and feed into the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" programme – linkage and input to UNWTO			X	X		UNESCO	MoCT				
New information delivery and marketing system established in Kars	Stakeholder consultation (tourism sector, civil society, others) on aspirations/options for tourism	Together with UN sister Agencies identification and creation of TGO members	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I): Personnel (N): Contracts (I): Contracts (N): Miscellaneous: <b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>3115</b>	28,400 27,200 50,000 5,000 7,240 <b>117,840</b>
	Assessment of market profile, trends and opportunities assessment of visitor monitoring	According to the input by MoCT, Diagnostic Study will be revised and stakeholder workshops held on strategic positioning of Kars Tourism Destination together with TGO	X	X	X	X	UNWTO	MoCT				

	Survey of international tour operators on current and potential interest in Eastern Anatolia and Kars	Awaiting input from UNDP on TO Survey. After the completion of the survey, meetings with the most interesting ones will be organized.		X	X			UNWTO	MoCT				
	Meetings/workshop with Turkish (incoming) tour operators on above	Technical support for the organization of a workshop after TO Study completed.		X	X			UNWTO	MoCT				
	Stakeholder workshop on options etc.	Together with UN Agencies and TGO options on strategic positioning for Kars Tourism Destination will be discussed.	X	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT				
	Awareness training on cultural heritage and visit opportunities within tourism sector	Creation of international team of experts together with national and local Universities training material will be prepared and implemented.	X	X	X	X		UNWTO	MoCT				
	Improved Kars website and linkages	In cooperation with UN Agencies a website for Kars Tourism Destination will be created.	X	X	X	X		UNWTO	MoCT				
	Tour operator and media familiarization visits			X	X			UNWTO	MoCT				
<b>JP Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism</b>													
Community initiatives started for enterprise development in cultural tourism in Kars	Specific focus on tourism/community enterprise delivery with respect to Ani site – guiding, handicrafts, retail, catering – including provision of space for this.	Training programmes targeted at level for leaders, middle managers and inter facers based on the needs of Kars Tourism Destination.	X	X	X	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I): Personnel(N): Contracts(I): Contracts (N): Training-Conf: Travel: <b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>6257</b>	34,600 36,720 40,000 7,500 9,000 11,250 <b>139,070</b>

	Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers	Based on UNWTO TedQual Methodology and MoCT's existing network of training, an assessment of training needs will be carried out by a national researcher team.	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT				
	Training programmes designed based on above.	Elaboration of training materials	X	X	X		UNWTO	MoCT				
	Feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets	Product development and draft business plans	X	X	X	X	UNWTO	MoCT				
	Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, women groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events	Enterprise opportunities presented in Development Strategy and Action Plan. Awaiting input by MoCT and local stakeholders. Ongoing activity through TGO and by creation of Service Centre in Kars	X	X	X	X	UNWTO	MoCT				
	Specific focus on tourism/community enterprise delivery with respect to Ani site – guiding, handicrafts, retail, catering – including provision of space for this.		X	X			UNWTO	MoCT				
Business development services strategy in	Identify and design a communication and dissemination strategy for	Completed in 2009 Q3 and Q4 (initial BDS paper prepared, study tour proposal for joint	X				UNDP	MoCT Chamber of Commerce	MDG-F	Contracts: Personnel: Supply: Training:	406010 120000 - -	

place	enterprise support activities in line with EU competitiveness agenda requirements for regional development	activity and implementation of study tour								Travel: Miscellaneous: <b>TOTAL:</b>	- 21000 -	- 21000 <b>547010</b>
	Identify entrepreneurship potentials with focus on women entrepreneurship in line with the JP activities and outputs	Assessment of WE potential and income generating activities in Ocaklı will be followed by complementary activities w/ UNESCO and UNWTO. This activity will also be covered within cluster development activities through implementation of short term actions	X	X	X	X	UNDP	MoCT Chamber of Commerce				
	Conduct a series of roundtables with the local stakeholders with a view to develop a roadmap to improve the competitive strength of tourism industry including creative industries in Kars	In parallel to development of cluster roadmap short term action plans will be implemented in the short run	X	X	X	X	UNDP	MoCT Governorate				
Culture tourism and wider sector enterprise cluster established	Provide business development services for enterprises in Kars and environs	On the job training carried out in October09 and cooperation agreement w/ KARTAB	X	X	X	X	UNDP	MoCT				
	Organize roundtables and fairs on commercial opportunities that are created around creative industries	Identification and organisation of networking and promotional events	X	X	X	X	UNDP	MoCT				
	Build operational links between Kars cluster	Cluster roadmap and implemented short term				X	UNDP	MoCT				

	and others in Turkey through vertical and horizontal integration and document experience	actions will be reviewed and evaluated. Following this network development activities for Kars tourism cluster will be carried out.											
	Support scheme for tourism development activities (income generating activities and/or cluster development activities	According to feedback from field experience and JP partners, medium-long term action plans could be supported through competitive selection process under this act.			X	X		UNDP	MoCT				
<b>JP Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</b>													
2003 Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage follow up initiated in Kars and Eastern Anatolia	Technical assistance and support to mapping of intangible culture in Kars and environs (including description and assessment of items; recommendations for safeguarding and transmission)	December-1 February 2010 reporting on field research Possible publication of research findings (to be proposed to PMC as joint activity)	X	X	X			UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts: Personnel: (assessments and participatory meetings) Supply: <b>TOTAL:</b>	-	10000 40000 20000 <b>60000</b>
Awareness raising on diversity of Cultural Heritage, Empowerment in Cultural Industries and fostered intercultural dialogue	Training workshop for teachers	Translation in Turkish of the "World Heritage in Young Hands" kit . This intervention has to be in parallel with UNICEF Friendship Train		X	X			UNESCO	MoCT				
	Training workshop for school children			X	X			UNESCO	MoCT				
	Identification of the handicrafts sector in Kars and its environs		X	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT				
	Training course in crafts design and production		X	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT				
	Training course in marketing of handicrafts				X			UNESCO	MoCT				

The governance structure involving civil society-government partnerships in cultural heritage promotion functional	Technical assistance and support to localized MDG target setting	Parallel assessment will be undertaken according to initial outcomes and formulation of activities will be carried out depending on the assessment				X	UNDP	MoCT and SPO	MDG-F	Contracts: Personnel: Supply: Training: Travel: Miscellaneous:	45000 60000 22000 32000 - -	
	Dissemination of all project activities, overall management and communication tasks for the UN Joint Programme	Ongoing activity for UNJP	X	X	X	X	UNDP			<b>TOTAL:</b>	- <b>159000</b>	
	Support the participatory local governance structure for promotion of social cohesion and dialogue in Kars	This is in connection w/ Output2 activities, includes local cooperation agreements and cluster development activities	X	X	X	X	UNDP	MoCT				
	Updating of the monitoring and evaluation framework of the joint programme to improve the existing system and update indicators, etc. as appropriate	Initial assessment was carried out and methodology developed, follow up will be undertaken in the course of activities	X	X	X	X	UNDP					
	Technical assistance, financial and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will provide secretariat for this governance structure	UNJP office in Kars is up and running. In addition implementation of roadmaps will be linked to this activity. KARTAB agreement will continue to support local initiatives on capacity development and promotion	X	X	X	X	UNDP	MoCT				

Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of Istanbul, Eskişehir, Ankara, Kayseri, Sivas, Erzincan, Erzurum and Kars .	With the support of local communities, an additional Children Cultural Diversity Room is established by the Child's Right Committees within the third selected provincial museum and LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities conducted (seminars, photo exhibitions handicraft etc)		X	X	X	X	UNICEF	MoCT, SHCEK	MDG-F	Personnel (N): Contracts: Travel: Supply:  Sub-Total: <i>Indirect costs:</i>  <b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>95000</b>	80.000
	Child's Rights Committees in two provinces (Erzurum and Kars) develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding		X	X	X	X	UNICEF	MoCT, SHCEK				125.000
	Eight Child Rights Committees travel on board of the "Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train" from Istanbul to Kars		X	X	X	X	UNICEF	MoCT, SHCEK				10.000
	Kars Child's Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of children from eight provinces				X	X	UNICEF	MoCT, SHCEK				45.000
											260.000	
											18.200	
											<b>278.200</b>	

### Work Plan for: Alliance for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia (ACT in Kars) Period: Y3

Annual targets	Activities	Details	TIME FRAME		UN AGENCY	RESPONSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET		
			Year 3				Source of Funds	Budget Description	Amount
			Q 1	Q2					
Site management processes for Ani	Introduction of an action plan for the implementation of a possible site management plan for Ani.		X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts: Personnel: Miscellaneous:  <b>TOTAL:</b>	10.000 20.000 1.000  <b>31.000</b>
New information delivery and marketing system established in Kars	Relocated and improved tourist information centre in Kars		X	X	UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I): Travel: Miscellaneous:  <b>TOTAL:</b>	8,000 8,000 2,250  <b>18,250</b>
	Capacity building with Province staff and others on promotion and information delivery		X	X	UNWTO	MoCT			
	Improved linkage of Kars to E Anatolia promotion and itineraries		X		UNWTO	MoCT			
	Identification and promotion of itineraries/circuits within Kars Province and surrounding area		X	X	UNWTO	MoCT			
	Strengthened promotion of cultural events		X	X	UNWTO	MoCT			
	Support for promotional campaigns		X	X	UNWTO	MoCT			
Culture tourism and wider sector enterprise cluster established	Build operational links between Kars cluster and others in Turkey through vertical and horizontal integration and document experience	Implementation of medium term action plans for Kars Tourism cluster	X	X	UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts: Personnel: Supply: Training: Travel: Miscellaneous:  <b>TOTAL:</b>	60000 60000 - - - 5000  <b>125000</b>
Awareness raising on diversity of Cultural Heritage,	Preparation for and organization of round table of academics for promoting intercultural/inter	Networking events for marketing and promotion	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts: Personnel:	20.000 19.000

Empowerment in Cultural Industries and fostered intercultural dialogue	religious dialogue								
	Presentation of to the local authorities and civil society and establishment of joint recommendations and publication of proceedings			X	UNESCO	MoCT		<b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>39.000</b>
The governance structure involving civil society-government partnerships in cultural heritage promotion functional	Technical assistance and support to civil society to monitor localized MDG targets and the contribution of the cultural tourism sector to these	Implementation of medium term action plans for Kars Tourism cluster	X		UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts Personnel	15000 30000
Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of İstanbul-Eskişehir-Ankara-Kayseri-Sivas-Erzincan-Erzurum-Kars	Selected provincial museums (Kars and Erzurum) and LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities conducted (seminars, photo exhibitions handicraft etc)		X	X	UNICEF	MOCT SHCEK MOI MONE	MDG-F	Personnel:	40.000
	Child's Rights Committees in two provinces (Kars and Erzurum) develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding		X	X	UNICEF			Supply:	17.000
	Kars Child's Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of children from eight provinces		X	X	UNICEF			Travel:	10.000
							<b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>67.000</b>	

**ANNEX II: Estimated Progress in Year 1 Color Coded: Green (Done)-Yellow (Ongoing)-Red (Not Started)**

JP output: 1.1 Please highlight the rate of delivery for each joint programme's output: a. Less than 30% b. between 31%-50% c. between 51-60 d. between 61%-70% e. between 71%-80 f. More than 80%													
Programme Outputs	Activity	TIME FRAME				UN AGENCY	RESPONSIBLE PARTY	Estimated Implementation Progress					
		Q 1	Q 2	Q 3	Q 4			NATIONAL /LOCAL	Source of Funding	Budget Description	Total Amount Planned	Estimated Total Amount Committed	Estimated Total Amount Disbursed
A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars	Technical assistance and support to the mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs (including description and evaluation of items; assessment of conservation status; recommendations for priority interventions)					UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts(I) Personnel(I) Miscellaneous	152.600	43.392,14	29805.79	B
	Assessment of the institutional and regulatory frameworks for the protection of cultural heritage in Kars and its province					UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts(I) Travel		-	-	
	Assessment of site management capacities focusing on institutional stakeholders of Ani					UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts(I) Travel	97905	3208.82	37723.89	B

	Inventory of tourism facilities and services in Kars Province				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F						
	Assessment of tourism potential of cultural tourism assets – tangible and intangible – based on UNESCO’s identification and evaluation				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F						
A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey’s less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars	Assessment of institutional capacity of Governorate, Municipality and stakeholder structures in destination management, development and promotion				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I)	71,000	-	71,000		F
								Personnel (N)	54,400	13,638.31	29,278.98		F
								Contracts (N)	15,000	-	15,000		F
								Training – Conf	12,000	-	12,000		F
								Facilities/Admin	11,928.00	954.68	10,169.53		F
	Assessment of tourism facility performance, quality and needs (cross referenced activity)				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Travel	15,000	-	15,000.00		F
								Miscellaneous	3,000	-	2,999.99		F
	Stakeholder consultation (tourism sector, civil society, others) on aspirations/options for tourism				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F						
Assessment of market profile, trends and opportunities assessment of visitor monitoring				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F							
Conceptual positioning of Kars with respect to themes, circuits etc in Eastern Anatolia location/access assessment				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F							
Kars brand identity and visioning				UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F							
<b>Total</b>									<b>472.833</b>	<b>95.468</b>	<b>222.978,18</b>		

**JP output: 2. Please highlight the rate of delivery for each joint programme's output:**

**a. Less than 30% b. between 31%-50% c. between 51-60 d. between 61%-70% e. between 71%-80 f. More than 80%**

Programme Outputs	Activity	TIME FRAME				UN AGENCY	RESPONSIBLE PARTY	Estimated Implementation Progress						
		Q 1	Q 2	Q 3	Q 4			NATIONAL /LOCAL	Source of Funding	Budget Description	Total Amount Planned	Estimated Total Amount Committed	Estimated Total Amount Disbursed	Estimated % Delivery Rate of Budget
		Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism	Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers							UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I)	14,200
Initiation of feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets						UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts	42,500	-	42,500	F	
									Travel	3,750	-	1,388.25	B	
									Miscellaneous	3,750	-	515.72	A	
Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, women's groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events						UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Facilities/Admin	8,150.80	527.10	6,902.28	F	
									Training	40,000	-	40,000.00	F	
					Personnel (N)				12,240	7,530.00	-	C		
								<b>Total</b>	<b>124,590.80</b>	<b>8057.10</b>	<b>105,506.25</b>	<b>84.68</b>		
Study tours within Turkey and international. <sup>1</sup>					UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F							

<sup>1</sup>The activity was completed in cooperation with UNDP, UNWTO and UNESCO with the approval of PMC as indicated in the above part of the report.

	Identify and design a communication and dissemination strategy for enterprise support activities in line with EU competitiveness agenda requirements for regional development				UNDP	MoCT Chamber of Commerce	MDG-F	Personnel (N) Contracts (N)	70000	69257.63	-	D
	Conduct a series of roundtables with the local stakeholders with a view to develop a roadmap to improve the competitive strength of tourism industry including creative industries in Kars				UNDP	MoCT Chamber of Commerce	MDG-F	Personnel (N) Personnel (I)	56642.705	11642.705	35000	A
Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism	Provide Business Development Services for enterprises in Kars and environs				UNDP	MoCT Governorate	MDG-F	Training Conf. Personnel (N) Personnel(I) Contracts (N)	87309.935	55309.935	32000	C
	Organize roundtables and fairs on commercial opportunities that are created around creative industries (linked w/ Activity 2.2.4)				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (N) Personnel (I) Contracts (N) Contracts (I)	56642.705	11642.705	35000	A
	Technical assessment and sector analysis for establishment of a culture tourism cluster of enterprises				UNDP	MoCT CoC	MDG-F	Personnel (N)	13153.025	10000	23153.025	C
<b>Total</b>								<b>415,596.80</b>	<b>321,822.19</b>	<b>152,057.1</b>		

JP output: 3. Please highlight the rate of delivery for each joint programme's output: a. Less than 30% b. between 31%-50% c. between 51-60 d. between 61%-70% e. between 71%-80 f. More than 80%													
Programme Outputs	Activity	TIME FRAME				UN AGENCY	RESPONSIBLE PARTY	Estimated Implementation Progress					
		Q 1	Q 2	Q 3	Q 4		NATIONAL /LOCAL	Source of Funding	Budget Description	Total Amount Planned	Estimated Total Amount Committed	Estimated Total Amount Disbursed	Estimated % Delivery Rate of Budget
Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism	Capacity building workshop to identify and define the Intangible Cultural Heritage of the Kars Province (2003 Convention)					UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts (I) Contracts (N) Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Travel Equipment	104.200	36647.09	94.217.34	F
	Technical assistance and support to mapping of intangible culture in Kars and environs (including description and assessment of items; recommendations for safeguarding and transmission)					UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F					
	Technical assistance for the preparation of nomination files for inscription of Intangible Cultural Heritage from the Kars Province (2003 Convention) <i>NB: to be extended till end of project</i>					UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F					

Dissemination of all project activities on behalf of non-resident other participating agencies in Kars and Ankara				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F					
Design of a communication and outreach strategy addressed at stakeholders based on site management and urban conservation priorities, tourism strategies and tourism related business development services (cross linked to Output 2)				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Contracts (N) Training – Conf Travel Miscellaneous	160000	161453.7	4950	F
Design and implement a communication plan to ensure the visibility of the Joint Programme and the cultural/tourism potential of Kars				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F					
Support the participatory local governance structure for promotion of social cohesion and dialogue in Kars (linked w/ Activity 2.3)				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts (N) Contracts (I) Personnel (N) Personnel (I)	212000	68709.25	143000	B
Organization of interim Monitoring and Evaluation Mission on behalf of the programme, including drawing up of M and E criteria and strategies for joint programme				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (N) Contracts(N) Travel	45000	4500	40500	A

	Technical assistance, financial and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will provide secretariat for this governance structure (one stop shop-umbrella international presence in Kars)				UNDP	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Contracts (N) Training – Conf	18000	17389.295	550	F
Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism	Children develop their own cultural and LSBE training and communication materials and conduct peer training within their respective three Child’s Rights Committees				UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDG-F	Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Contracts (N) Training – Conf	77.000	67.725,55	9275	F
	Eight Child Rights Committees travel on board of the “Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train” from Istanbul to Kars											
	With the support of local communities, two of the selected Child’s Right Committees establish a Children Cultural Diversity Room within their provincial museum and conduct LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities (seminars, photo exhibitions				UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDG-F	Personnel (N) Contracts (N) Training – Conf	50000	19909,65	30090	B

	Child's Rights Committees in two provinces develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding				UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDG-F					
	Capacity building among thirteen Child's Rights Committees on cultural wealth, heritage etc. for preparation of the Friendship Train				UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDG-F	Contracts (N)	70000	67000	3000	F
	Kars Child's Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of children from thirteen other provinces				UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDG-F	Contracts (N) Training – Conf	63.005,72	10000	53000	A
<b>Total</b>									<b>787560</b>	<b>291499</b>	<b>226499</b>	

## Annex III: The Monitoring Framework and Baselines

Expected Results (Outcomes & Outputs)	Indicators (with baselines & indicative timeframe)	Means of Verification	Collection Methods (with indicative time frame & frequency)	Responsibilities	Risks & Assumptions
<p><b>JP OUTCOME</b></p>	<p>Contribution to MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1- Percentage of population below the poverty line;</p> <p>Indicator 3- Income distribution by population, by gender (UNDAF, 2.1.2)</p> <p><u>Baseline:</u> Disparities between regions measured through inequalities in HDI between provinces of Eastern Anatolia Region and national averages (HDI, Kars: 0.644 and Turkey 0.742, year 2000, HDR and NHDR)</p> <p>Disparities in share of income between quintiles of income brackets: lowest 20%: 6; highest 20%: 48 (UNDAF, 2.1.2)</p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by TURKSTAT.</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from TURKSTAT</p>	<p>UNDP,UNESCO,UNWTO, UNICEF, Government of Turkey</p>	<p>Baseline indicators are measured in 2000 so; gap between the next measured values may not reflect contribution of the JP to the MDG target.</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -4</b></p> <p><b>Poverty Rate of Kars Compared by National Poverty Rate of Turkey</b></p> <p>Baseline: Poverty rates of Kars : % 31(TURKSTAT regional office,</p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by TURKSTAT.</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from TURKSTAT if available at the end of the project.</p>	<p>UNDP,UNESCO,UNWTO, UNICEF, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	

	<p>unofficial)          Poverty rates of Turkey: % 17,11          (Source:TURKSTAT)          Note: (Internationally accepted poverty rates, end of 2008 below the %17,11 food &amp; non-food consumption)</p>				
<p><b>JP Output 1:</b>          A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars</p>	<p><b>Indicator -1</b>  <b>Digitization of the registered site areas and immoveable culture and natural assets database within Kars province</b>            Baseline : 0          (beginning of year 2009)    <u><b>Progress as of end 2009: No progress, preparations of technical specifications with the MoCT</b></u></p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level (Erzurum Preservation Council)</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs, MoCT, Erzurum Preservation Council</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Procurement of the SW development services is realized within the planned time and budget.          SW development activities are completed in the planned schedule and implemented properly.            Risk(s): Bureaucratic obstacles, incomplete data and delay in software development, climate conditions</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -2</b>  <b>Site management capacity developed (an action plan prepared) towards preparation of a site management plan</b>            Baseline : An assessment report for Ani site management available, Ani site manager appointed)          (beginning of year 2009)    <u><b>Progress as of end 2009: A workshop conducted on site</b></u></p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs and MoCT</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Ensuring participatory approach in management process, interest of MoCT and other stakeholders.          Developed "Action Plan" is approved and owned by the relevant parties.            Risk(s): delays due to Regulatory Framework, lack of participation of the Head of Excavations</p>

	<i>management, initial assessments conducted through a participatory mechanism to be followed by an action plan in 2010</i>				to the process
	<p><b>Indicator -3</b></p> <p><b>Availability of a Tourism Strategy for Kars</b></p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><b>Progress as of end 2009:</b> A draft strategy prepared and comments received from the MoCT and stakeholders from Kars</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNWTO, MoCT and local stakeholders	<p>Approval and implementation of Tourism Strategy.</p> <p>Risk(s): Change in the political and sectoral policies that may risk the validity of the Strategy in the future.</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -4</b></p> <p><b>Availability of Tourism Products strategically designed on the basis of supply and demand</b></p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>End of 2009</u> <b>33 tourism products identified within the Strategy development process</b></p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNWTO, MoCT and Local stakeholders	<p>Production of defined products with high quality and proper cost. Awareness raising to the defined products. Put into proper marketing strategies.</p> <p>Risk(s): Insufficient interest to the developed products</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -5</b></p> <p><b>Presence of a tourism governance organization</b></p> <p>Baseline : 1 (KARTAB: Kars Service Union for Tourism and Infrastructure) (beginning of year 2009)</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT ,Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality, Sarıkamış District Governorate, Sarıkamış Municipality	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNWTO, MoCT and Local stakeholders	<p>Sufficient number of contributors and proper implementation of the local tourism strategy.</p> <p>Risk(s): Regulatory Framework</p>

	<p><b>Progress as of end 2009:</b> A group of local stakeholders start to work together towards preparation and implementation of a local tourism strategy (related to clustering activities and study tour that aim at increasing ownership and joint action)</p>				
<p><b>JP Output 2:</b> Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism</p>	<p><b>Indicator -1</b></p> <p><b>Number of Capacity building activities of local and national Stakeholders</b> Baseline: 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><b>Progress as of End 2009</b> # of training :6 # of participant :263 # study tour :1, # of participant : 30</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs</p>	<p>UNDP, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>Sufficient number of participants with appropriate qualifications. Delivery of qualified and proper trainings.</p> <p>Risk(s): Lack of interest among local participants</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -2</b></p> <p><b>Number of jointly implemented tourism related local economic development activities in Kars;</b></p> <p>Baseline: 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><b>End of 2009</b> Activity 1-Tourism Cluster Analysis designed and prepared for early 2010</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs</p>	<p>UNDP, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>Ensuring of commitment of local and national stakeholders. Development of realistic and practical Clustering approach.</p> <p>Risk(s): Impact of economical crisis Lack of interest of local and national stakeholders</p>

	<p><b>Indicator -3</b></p> <p><b>Number of Arrivals to Kars</b></p> <p>Baseline: (2008)  Number of arrivals thru tourism operation license: 44.981  Number of arrivals thru municipality operation license: 59.059  Total number of arrivals :104.040  (Source: MoCT)</p> <p><b>Progress will be provided at the end of 2010</b></p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT.</p>	<p>Information will be directly gathered from MoCT end of each year.</p>	<p>UNDP,UNESCO,UNWTO, UNICEF, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>The Joint Program will mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia. It will result in increased number of arrivals at a localized level</p> <p>Risk(s) : Poor implementation of defined strategies and inadequate awareness raising to the cultural assets</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -4</b></p> <p><b>Number of overnights in Kars</b></p> <p>Baseline: (2008)  Number of nights spent thru tourism operation license: 72.489  Number of nights spent thru municipality operation license: 60.411  Total Number of nights spent : 132.900  (Source: MoCT)</p> <p><b>Progress will be provided at the end of 2010</b></p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT.</p>	<p>Information will be directly gathered from MoCT end of each year.</p>	<p>UNDP,UNESCO,UNWTO, UNICEF, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>The Joint Program will mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia. It will result in increased number of nights spent at a localized level.</p> <p>Risk(s) : Poor implementation of defined strategies and inadequate awareness raising to the cultural assets</p>

<p><b>JP Output 3:</b></p> <p>Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</p>	<p><b>Indicator -1</b></p> <p><b>Number of Awareness Raising Workshops on Cultural Heritage and social cohesion implemented in Kars</b></p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>End of 2009</u> 2 workshops were organized on intangible cultural heritage of Kars</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regional workshop covering Eastern Anatolia of Turkey ,14 provinces , 63 participants , approximately 10 NGOs , 8 universities</li> <li>• Local workshop in Kars, 74 participants, 5 NGOs</li> </ul>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs and MoCT</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Sufficient number of participants with appropriate qualifications. Delivery of qualified and proper workshops.</p> <p>Risk(s): Lack of participation to the workshops</p>
	<p><b>Indicator -2</b></p> <p><b>Availability of information on Main ICH Assets in the Target Area</b></p> <p>Baseline -0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>End of 2009</u> Field research for ICH mapping completed in 80 villages, 50 students involved and trained</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs, MoCT and field research through survey, voice and video recordings, and interviews</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Contribution to national ICH inventory preparations. Significant increase in the quantity and quality of inventory forms for the definition of national ICH inventory in the target area</p> <p>Risk(s) : Lack of reflection of diversity, incomplete data regarding preparation of inventory forms.</p>

					Insufficient safeguarding measures
	<p><b>Indicator -3</b></p> <p><b>Establishment of Children Museums in Eastern Anatolia</b> Baseline -0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><b>Progress as of end 2009:</b> Contacts established with national and local governments, MoUs prepared and in progress for Museums in Kars and Erzurum</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNICEF, MoCT	<p>Obtaining official approvals and delivery of the museum buildings within the planned schedule. Equipped and furnished in accordance with project schedule and budget</p> <p>Risk(s): regulatory framework ,lack of commitment of responsible parties</p>