

Section I: Identification and JP Status

Alliances for Culture Tourism (ACT) in Eastern Anatolia

Semester: 2-10

Country	Turkey
Thematic Window	Culture and Development
MDGF Atlas Project	67179
Program title	Alliances for Culture Tourism (ACT) in Eastern Anatolia

Report Number	
Reporting Period	2-10
Programme Duration	
Official Starting Date	2008-12-11

Participating UN Organizations	* UNDP * UNESCO * UNICEF * UNWTO
--------------------------------	---

Implementing Partners	* Ankara University * Kafkas University * Kars Governorate * Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MCOT) * Prime Ministry, Social Services and Child * Protection Agency
-----------------------	--

Budget Summary

Total Approved Budget

UNDP	\$1,697,450.00
UNESCO	\$830,320.00
UNICEF	\$670,890.00
UNWTO	\$601,340.00
Total	\$3,800,000.00

Total Amount of Transferred To Date

UNDP	\$1,697,450.00
UNESCO	\$830,320.00
UNICEF	\$670,890.00
UNWTO	\$601,340.00
Total	\$3,800,000.00

Total Budget Committed To Date

UNDP	\$1,311,367.00
UNESCO	\$608,905.00
UNICEF	\$530,000.00
UNWTO	\$419,211.00
Total	\$2,869,483.00

Total Budget Disbursed To Date

UNDP	\$1,089,169.00
UNESCO	\$514,947.00
UNICEF	\$191,000.00
UNWTO	\$343,695.00
Total	\$2,138,811.00

Donors

As you can understand, one of the Goals of the MDG-F is to generate interest and attract funding from other donors. In order to be able to report on this goal in 2010, we would require you to advise us if there has been any complementary financing provided in 2010 for each programme as per following example:

Amount in thousands of US\$

Type	Donor	Total	For 2010	For 2011	For 2012
Parallel					
Cost Share					
Counterpart					

DEFINITIONS

1) PARALLEL FINANCING – refers to financing activities related to or complementary to the programme but whose funds are NOT channeled through UN agencies. Example: JAICA decides to finance 10 additional seminars to disseminate the objectives of the programme in additional communities.

2) COST SHARING – refers to financing that is channeled through one or more of the UN agencies executing a particular programme. Example: The Government of Italy gives UNESCO the equivalent of US \$ 200,000 to be spent on activities that expand the reach of planned activities and these funds are channeled through UNESCO.

3) COUNTERPART FUNDS - refers to funds provided by one or several government agencies (in kind or in cash) to expand the reach of the programme. These funds may or may not be channeled through a UN agency. Example: The Ministry of Water donates land to build a pilot 'village water treatment plant' The value of the contribution in kind or the amount of local currency contributed (if in cash) must be recalculated in US \$ and the resulting amount(s) is what is reported in the table above.

Direct Beneficiaries

	Men	Men from Ethnic Groups	Women	Women from Ethnic Groups	Boys	Girls	National Institutions	Local Institutions
Targeted Number	220		226				26	46
Reached Number	277		226				20	167
Targeted - Reached	-57	0	0	0	0	0	6	-121
% difference	125.91	0	100.0	0	0	0	76.92	363.04

Indirect Beneficiaries

	Men	Men from Ethnic Groups	Women	Women from Ethnic Groups	Boys	Girls	National Institutions	Local Institutions
Targeted Number	1717		748					35
Reached Number	1139		652					101
Targeted - Reached	578	0	96	0	0	0	0	-66

% difference

66.34

0

87.17

0

0

0

0

288.57

Section II: JP Progress

1 Narrative on progress, obstacles and contingency Measures

Please provide a brief overall assessment (250 words) of the extent to which the joint programme components are progressing in relation to expected outcomes and outputs, as well as any measures taken for the sustainability of the joint programme during the reporting period. Please, provide examples if relevant. Try to describe facts avoiding interpretations or personal opinions

Progress in outcomes

Joint Programme Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars

Outcome 1.1: Policy for the protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars

The development of the software and automated system for the creation of digital data on conservation, monitoring and supervision of registered sites and immovable cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars has been completed. As a result, 2643 files containing 852 Regional Board decisions, 920 identification cards, 295 rehabilitation projects, 82 plans and maps, 44 principle decisions and other 450 files were digitalized, and the software system developed. Feasibility Analysis on terrestrial measurements of 20 sites and registered buildings in Province of Kars was also completed. A first basic field training was held between 8-12 November in Kars with the participation of personnel from the Erzurum Region Preservation Council, the Museum of Kars, the Museum of Iğdır and the MoCT. An additional field training was held involving the terrestrial measurement within the area of the Kars Fortress.

The 2nd phase of the activity, to be implemented by UNESCO starting from January 2011, shall encompass the purchase of hardware, the further training of the system users, the completion of terrestrial measurements of 13 sites defined by MoCT, and the final activation of the system.

The activity will thus bring a decisive contribution to ensure the proper and effective safeguarding of cultural heritage in the target area, which is a necessary condition for the development of a sustainable cultural tourism. Furthermore, the development of the digital information-management system shall also constitute a best practice for the MoCT at the national level, to be possibly replicated over different areas.

A set of 7 brochures was produced (7.000 copies total), aimed at raising awareness at both local and national level on the legislative and normative framework for the safeguarding of cultural heritage in Turkey. The topics of the brochures are: Excavations, Museums, Contribution to the Restoration of Cultural Assets, Sponsorship and Incentives, Legal Framework for the Preservation of Cultural Assets, and Illegal Trafficking of Historical Works. The brochures are available on the MDG-F web site and will be also made available on the official web site of the MoCT. They will be officially presented on the occasion of the 7th PMC (Kars, 18 Jan 2011).

Outcome 1.2: Support to the implementation of the recommendations by the Site management Board

As a result of the 1st phase of the activity implemented by UNESCO for the preparation of the Ani Management Plan, a "Site Management Development Framework" was

approved, and an agreement established between the relevant stakeholders on the preparation of a draft 5-year Management Plan according to the current legislative framework. Accordingly, the MoCT established the “Ani Site Management Planning Team”, which will cooperate with the UNJP for the definition of the draft Management Plan. The Team is composed of archaeologists, art historians, geologists, public administration experts, culture and tourism experts, engineers, sociologists and additional backstopping personnel.

Within the Ani Site Management Plan Development Framework, a preliminary training programme comprised of two parts was accomplished. The first training was held at the MoCT on 26-27 November with about 30 participants. The second part focussed on the definition of a work-plan for the preparation of the draft Management Plan, for the use of the Site Management Team. The roles and responsibilities of each team member and the modalities of cooperation with the UNJP were also defined.

The 2nd phase of the activity, launched by UNESCO in December 2010, is expected to produce the first draft of the Site Management Plan. (It has to be noted that, due to reasons not related with the project, both the Ani's Site Manager and Head of Excavations resigned during 2010. The timely recruitment and appointment of their substitutes by the MoCT will be of crucial importance for the successful continuation of the activity).

The revision, update and integration of the existing official map of the Ani archaeological site was completed and integrated into the overall automated software system (see above), created for the production, collection and management of digital data on the conservation, monitoring and supervision of the registered sites and immovable cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars.

Outcome 1.3: A cultural tourism strategy and action plan agreed to by national authorities within the context of the “Brand City” programme

The tourism master plan has been approved by the Ministry. As a result, several activities related to training and marketing and promotion which spin off from the strategy will be launched in January 2011.

Joint Programme Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in culture based tourism

Outcome 2.2: Community initiatives started for enterprise development in cultural tourism in Kars

Train-the-Trainer programmes in hotel operations and tourism awareness were jointly organized by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UNWTO in Kars and Sarikamis. This has strengthened the coordination and collaboration between the two institutions as well as with the JP Secretariat. Furthermore, it has ensured that the training and human resource development standards of the Ministry are implemented in the Kars region. In an effort to incorporate South-South collaboration, UNWTO hired an Indian consultant, specialised in community-based capacity building initiatives, to undertake the capacity building audit of community skills to develop and manage tourism in Kars. The training programmes being conducted are a result of this analysis.

Outcome 2.3. Business development services strategy in place

Business development services strategy adopted several tools for the implementation. Capacity assessment followed by training services for local actors including different actors like NGOs, public authorities as well as tourism NGOs supported capacity development for local actors. Pilot cluster development activities revealed the need for collaboration while joint promotion activities lead enrichment on new business connections. Entrepreneurship training programmes set the basis and timing of the regional development agency support schemes will be complementary for enabling financial environment for new business set ups. Local development initiatives support scheme also contributed to business development strategy by promoting alternative product development, income generating activities in tourism sector and empowering women capacities through product development.

Outcome 2.4. Culture tourism and wider sector enterprise cluster established

In parallel to business development strategy internal networks mobilised through cluster development activities. In addition call for proposals encouraged partnerships between local actors while improving their capacities on project preparation, project implementation as well as enriching current business services with improved service capacities. Another important aspect was mobilisation of a cooperation agreement with a public private partnership (KARTAB) which is mainly operated by governorship in cooperation with local actors. This agreement resulted with the creation of promotional materials which was considered urgent needs of city like promotional film, information signs for historical buildings in Kars and billboards about Ani, Sarıkamış, Kars Castle, together with promotional materials for fair participations.

Joint Programme Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism

Outcome 3.1. 2003 Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage follow up initiated in Kars

An audio CD collecting selected Minstrels performances from the region was produced and released, in cooperation with the MoCT and the Municipality of Kars. The CD was distributed to local authorities, Minstrel Associations and on the occasions of national and international Minstrels festivals, with the aim to promote and contribute to the safeguarding of the Minstrels tradition.

A Cooperation Agreement was signed by the Municipality of Kars and the Minstrels Association in Kars, as a result of UNESCO's guidance and support, for the establishment of a "Culture House" dedicated to the promotion and safeguarding of the Minstrels tradition. The refurbishment and rehabilitation works of the Culture House premises were commenced based on specific agreements established between UNESCO and the Municipality of Kars.

An Implementation Partnership Agreement was established by UNESCO with a local NGO for the realisation of two training programmes on the making and performing of traditional musical instruments, "saz" and "tar". The programmes, scheduled over a period of 6 months, and will be attended by 20 participants. The training subject and modalities were defined by UNESCO in close cooperation with MoCT and in consultation with the Kafkas University, in the light of the Intangible Cultural Heritage Mapping research carried out by the latter.

The field research Final Report for the mapping of the main intangible cultural assets in Kars Province carried out by Kafkas University has been submitted and approved by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. The Research covered 80 villages, and 50 students were involved and trained. The collected data comprised of approximately 7000 pages of data transcriptions, 2000 photographs, 260 video recordings.

The preparation and publishing of a book on Eastern Anatolian Folk Tales is on-going, in close cooperation with the MoCT. The two volumes book will include a total of 40 tales from the region. The book is intended as a complementary activity for supporting the promotion, safeguarding and viability of local intangible cultural heritage.

Outcome: 3.2. The governance structure involving civil society-government partnerships in cultural heritage promotion functional

Outcome 3.3. Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of Istanbul-Eskişehir-Ankara-Kayseri- Sivas- Erzincan-Erzurum-Kars.

- Peer trainers applied child to child training module in three different cities (Kayseri, Sivas, Erzincan) and 60 children were trained.
- Peer training modules were completed and prepared for publishment.
- Preparations for the establishment of a "Children Museum Room" in Erzurum and Kars completed and Kars Children Museum Room is ready for opening.

-Children Museum awareness raising brochures were prepared.

Progress in outputs

Joint Programme Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars.

Activities concerning the strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible cultural heritage resulted in the definition of a set of best practices for the management of cultural heritage. The activities will thus bring a decisive contribution to ensure the proper and effective safeguarding of cultural heritage in the target area as a necessary condition for the development of a sustainable cultural tourism, and they will also constitute a model to be possibly replicated in different areas of the beneficiary country.

In particular, the activities for the enhancement of management capacities related to the site of Ani allowed the definition of an innovative methodology with a participatory approach, and its application for the first time in the target area. The approval of the "Ani Site Management Development Framework" and the agreement reached between the relevant stakeholders on the preparation of a draft 5-year Management Plan according to the current legislative framework is a decisive progress, and the overall experience may serve as a model for the establishment of management plans in different sites in Turkey.

The creation of the software and automated system for the creation of digital data on conservation, monitoring and supervision of cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars will also provided relevant authorities with an effective tool for the management of cultural assets, and serve as a good practice for similar actions in other Eastern Anatolian Provinces. The system, integrated on the GIS under a common database, was designed to operate independently of time and space, capable of being used jointly by the General Directorate, the Regional Conservation Boards, the Governorate of Kars, the Municipality of Kars and the relevant stakeholders. It will ensure an efficient and effective monitoring and the implementation of conservation, renovation, implementation, repair permit, building use permit, observation, inspection, licensing and project management activities in relation to the registered sites and assets.

The production of a set of 7 brochures aimed at raising awareness at both local and national level on the legislative and normative framework for the safeguarding of cultural heritage in Turkey is envisaged to be distributed in Kars as well as in all other provinces of Turkey. The brochures are expected to bring concrete results in terms of enhanced knowledge on the concerned issues, and thus to strengthen the respect and safeguarding of cultural heritage.

Joint Programme Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in culture based tourism

A Grant Scheme, which is considered as a tool to build up competencies and social capital, was launched for Kars civil society organizations in August 2010. The grant scheme is expected to contribute not only to build-up capacity of cluster stakeholders, but also facilitate the implementations of the actions identified by the UNJP. The project, which requires acting with at least one partner organization, also aims to flourish collaboration among the cluster stakeholders. Among the 15 projects submitted, 8 will be supported by the UNJP.

Feedback on the tour received from all participants in person. Importance of the local ownership and cooperation between public-private-university was underlined and highlighted. Also admitted and reflected by stakeholders

Tourism training programmes for tourism employees and mid-level managers were completed.

Promotion film, information and promotion signs for Kars was completed under the scope of local agreement in order to support local governance mechanisms to increase involvement and capacity building for tourism development.

Joint Programme Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism

The completion of the field research on Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) of Kars Province, with a view at completing the mapping of the local ICH in its diverse forms of expressions, will contribute in the first place to raise awareness on ICH as an integral part of the local cultural assets. Furthermore, the research will offer a necessary reference for all future actions aimed at the safeguarding and viability of this heritage, as well as for its inclusion into sustainable and responsible programmes of tourism development.

The activity will also contribute to the completion of the national inventory of ICH, and in general to the implementation of the UNESCO Convention for the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage.

This initiative could also serve as a model of cooperation between central and local institutions, to be possibly extended in other provinces of Turkey.

The UNJP also provided concrete contributions to the safeguarding and promotion of the Minstrelsy Tradition, inscribed in 2009 in the Representative List of the UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. In particular, the UNJP allowed to: organise an international festival of minstrels, with great participation and visibility; produce an audio CD of selected performances of local minstrels; launch a training activities on the making and performance of traditional musical instruments, “saz” and “tar”; creating the conditions for the establishment of a Culture House in Kars, intended for the use of the local minstrels association with a view at facilitating the viability, transmission and promotion of this art. The establishment of the Culture House, and the memorandum of understanding signed for this purpose by the Municipality of Kars and the Minstrels Association, will also ensure the continuity and sustainability of related activities beyond the end of the project.

Along the same line, the UNJP supported the preparation and publishing of a book on Eastern Anatolian Folk Tales, which will allow to further promote and safeguard oral traditions as a distinctive feature of the local ICH.

Measures taken for the sustainability of the joint programme

- a) Digitization of the registered site areas and immovable culture and natural assets database within Kars province
- b) Activation of a system for the management of the digitised information, including capacity building for relevant authorities
- c) Realisation of awareness-raising activities on the safeguarding of cultural heritage, and production of related information materials.
- d) Site management capacity developed (an action plan prepared) towards preparation of a site management plan
- e) Availability of a Tourism Strategy for Kars
- f) Availability of Tourism Products strategically identified on the basis of supply and demand
- g) Presence of a tourism governance organization
- h) Number of Capacity building activities of local and national Stakeholders

- i) Availability of information on Main ICH Assets in the Target Area
- j) Establishment of Children Museums in Eastern Anatolia (Kars and Erzurum Provinces)

Are there difficulties in the implementation?

Coordination with Government

What are the causes of these difficulties?

External to the Joint Programme

Briefly describe the current difficulties the Joint Programme is facing

Sometimes, language can be a constraint in communicating directly with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. While the JP Team is always extremely helpful to serve as an interlocutor, efficiency in implementing joint activities and understanding of technical parameters is nevertheless affected.

Payments are also not as efficient as possible – again – for a non-resident Agency (UNWTO), coordination of invoices/receipts can be a cumbersome process.

Briefly describe the current external difficulties that delay implementation

Explain the actions that are or will be taken to eliminate or mitigate the difficulties

Being a non-resident agency, UNWTO hired a National Project Liaison Officer to be based in Kars. This has increased the visibility of the JP in Kars (two officers now based in Kars on a full-time basis) and has increased the efficiency for the implementation of activities in the field including training programmes and marketing and promotion. It has also facilitated communication with the Ministry and local authorities.

2 Inter-Agency Coordination and Delivering as One

Is the joint programme still in line with the UNDAF?

Yes true
No false

If not, does the joint programme fit the national strategies?

Yes true
No false

What types of coordination mechanisms

The implementation mechanisms have been applied parallel to Multi Donor Trust Fund Operational Guidance Note for the Participating UN Organizations (MDG-F, June 2009). Coordination and collaboration between participating UN agencies have been ensured by the UN Resident Coordinator in Turkey. A supporting team including the Joint Programme Manager, Site Manager and a Programme Assistant ensure the facilitation of collaboration between UN organizations. UNDP acts as the Administrative Agent (AA) of the Joint Program and UNDP Turkey supports the executing agency in the overall coordination of the outputs and management of administrative, financial and procurement

issues related to project implementation. UNDP also assists coordination among the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program, particularly for UNESCO and UNWTO which are non-resident in Turkey including their contribution during recruitment and provision of support in the dissemination of JP objectives and strategies. UNDP has also facilitated high level attention from MoCT.

The NSC including a representative of the Turkish Government, a representative from the Government of Spain and the UN Resident Coordinator, which has been established to monitor all MDG-Fund Projects also monitors this Joint Program semi-annually. A PMC composed of the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program and the Department of Foreign Relations and EU Coordination of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (ensuring coordination between relevant Departments of the Ministry), relevant General Directorates of MoCT, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Social Services and Child Protection Agency with State Planning Organization, Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality and other relevant stakeholders has been conducted to meet quarterly.

During the reporting period following meetings were held:

- UN Agencies Coordination meeting in Ankara, 17-18 July
- 6th PMC meeting in Ankara, 22 July
- 4th NSC meeting in Ankara, 5 October
- 2nd and 3rd MDG-F UNJP Joint meeting with UNRC in July and December
- Weekly teleconferences with UNJP UN Agencies, UNJP Team

Please provide the values for each category of the indicator table below

Indicators	Baseline	Current Value	Means of verification	Collection methods
Number of managerial practices (financial, procurement, etc) implemented jointly by the UN implementing agencies for MDG-F JPs	4			
Number of joint analytical work (studies, diagnostic) undertaken jointly by UN implementing agencies for MDG-F JPs	1	6	-UN Agencies Coordination Meetings	Decision taking/Minutes of Meeting Decision taking/cooperation

Number of joint missions undertaken jointly by UN implementing agencies for MDG-F JPs

3 Development Effectiveness: Paris Declaration and Accra Agenda for Action

Are Government and other national implementation partners involved in the implementation of activities and the delivery of outputs?

Not Involved	false
Slightly involved	false
Fairly involved	false
Fully involved	true

In what kind of decisions and activities is the government involved?

Policy/decision making

Fully participating to the activities and benefiting from the results of the activities which initiatives and entrepreneurs are being supporting.

Management: other, specify

Fully participating to the activities and benefiting from the results of the activities which initiatives and entrepreneurs are being supporting.

Who leads and/or chair the PMC?

UNRC

Number of meetings with PMC chair

1

Is civil society involved in the implementation of activities and the delivery of outputs?

Not involved false

Slightly involved false

Fairly involved false

Fully involved true

In what kind of decisions and activities is the civil society involved?

Management: budget

Organization of Promotional Event, implementation of grant scheme projects

Management: procurement

Organization of Promotional Event, implementation of grant scheme projects

Management: service provision

Organization of Promotional Event, implementation of grant scheme projects

Management: other, specify

Organization of Promotional Event, implementation of grant scheme projects

Are the citizens involved in the implementation of activities and the delivery of outputs?

Not involved false

Slightly involved true

Fairly involved false

Fully involved false

In what kind of decisions and activities are the citizens involved?

Management: other, specify

Ocaklı Village (Next to the Ani Antique City) Headman (Muhtar) participated to the Ani Site Management works and during the intangible cultural heritage studies in 80 settlements field research, interviews were conducted with citizens.

Where is the joint programme management unit seated?

Local Government

UN Agency

Current situation

The Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UNWTO co-organized Train-The-Trainer programmes in Kars and Sarikamis on Tourism Awareness and Hotel Operations. Training was provided by 8 officials of the Ministry. About 25 local entrepreneurs were trained as potential trainers. Local authorities in both Kars and Sarikamis have been supportive of the training programmes which are scheduled to be launched in 2011 providing venues for training. Similarly, they are facilitating the promotion of the training programmes through the display of banners throughout the towns. Local foreign language institute in Kars will also be engaged for English language training.

Two children museum rooms were establish in two provinces in eastern Anatolia together with MoCT, Social Services and Child Protection Agency , Ankara University, UNICEF and Kars and Erzurum Museums.

In order to support local tourism initiatives grant scheme programme is going on together with UNDP and local beneficiaries.

Culture House for Minstrel tradition is established together with Kars Municipality, Ministrel Association, MoCT and UNESCO.

4 Communication and Advocacy

Has the JP articulated an advocacy & communication strategy that helps advance its policy objectives and development outcomes?

Yes true

No false

Please provide a brief explanation of the objectives, key elements and target audience of this strategy

The objectives of the UN Joint Program "Alliances for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia's communication strategy are aligned with the objectives of the JP itself. Strategy aims to help to promote local ownership, to raise the awareness of people of Kars about the JP; strategy will also help to get the media attention. The general objectives of the communication strategy are:

- Promoting Kars' potential in culture, winter and nature tourism
- Promoting tangible and intangible cultural heritage of Kars
- Promoting local ownership
- Raising the awareness for capacity building in tourism sector

- Using relevant media effectively to promote Kars and provide updated information to the media about what the city can offer to the visitors
- Encouraging women's entry to the entrepreneurship
- Securing sustainability through increased impact of the Joint Program at the local level
- Strengthening the participatory approach, taking decision and working together with different stakeholders by increasing the awareness and benefits of the JP.

The UNJP aims to reduce income disparities by mobilizing tourism sector in the Kars province. Target groups of this are: Public sector (local and national level), Private sector (tourism sector), NGOs, People of Kars, Public in general, Media.

Key elements are: Printed /published materials, Media relations, Web site of UNJP, Relevant Activities (meetings, trainings, media tours, study tours, press conferences, supporting relevant activities in Kars (exhibitions, festivals, etc.)

What concrete gains are the advocacy and communication efforts outlined in the JP and/or national strategy contributing towards achieving?

Increased awareness on MDG related issues amongst citizens and governments

Increased dialogue among citizens, civil society, local national government in relation to development policy and practice

New/adopted policy and legislation that advance MDGs and related goals

Establishment and/or liaison with social networks to advance MDGs and related goals

Key moments/events of social mobilization that highlight issues

Media outreach and advocacy

What is the number and type of partnerships that have been established amongst different sectors of society to promote the achievement of the MDGs and related goals?

Faith-based organizations 4

Social networks/coalitions 1

Local citizen groups 9

Private sector

Academic institutions 2

Media groups and journalist

Other

What outreach activities do the programme implement to ensure that local citizens have adequate access to information on the programme and opportunities to actively participate?

Focus groups discussions

Press Conferences

Use of local communication mediums such radio, theatre groups, newspapers

Press Conferences

Capacity building/trainings



Press Conferences
Others
Press Conferences



Section III: Millenium Development Goals

Millenium Development Goals

Target 1.A: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day

JP Outcome

Beneficiaries

JP Indicator

Value

Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Programme Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by fostering pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighboring countries by 2010.

JP Output 2:
Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism.
indicator -5

Poverty Rate of Kars compared by national poverty rate of Turkey

Baseline:
Poverty rates of Kars :
% 17
Poverty rates of Turkey: % 31
(current available official statistical values)

Progress will arrive after the publication of 2011 statistics.

indicator -6
Number of Arrivals to Kars
Baseline: (2008)
Number of arrivals thru tourism operation license: 44.981
Number of arrivals thru municipality operation license: 59.059
Total Number of arrivals: 104.040

Progress will arrive after the publication of 2011 statistics.

indicator -7
Number of Night spent in Kars

Baseline: (2008)
Number of nights spent thru tourism operation license: 72.489
Number of nights spent thru municipality operation license: 60.411
Total Number of nights spent : 132.900
Progress will arrive after the publication of 2011 statistics.

Additional Narrative Comments

Please provide any relevant information and contributions of the programme to de MDGs, whether at national or local level

JP has one Outcome which ; “Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Programme Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by fostering pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighboring countries by 2010.” Contributes the MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1A. Poverty headcount ratio (percentage of population below the national poverty line)

Issue with the indicators:

One of the most important issue regarding contribution of the programme to the MDG targets is a question of the indicators that were identified to measure progress in each area . Existing relevant data is obsolete (measured in 2000) and there is no systematic and periodical measurement process by the responsible parties so, it may not be possible to measure accurately the impact of the JP regarding the “Contribution to MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1A. Poverty headcount ratio (percentage of population below the national poverty line) and. (UNDAF, 2.1.2) Indicator 3- Income distribution by population, by gender.

This issue was also addressed in the “United Nations Development Assistance Framework 2006 – 2010 Turkey, Mid-term Review Final Report, November, 2008” as follows:
“UNFPA has been key in collecting and compiling statistical and disaggregated data and information, and making these available for policymakers and practitioners in formulating and implementing social and economic policies. UNIDO, ILO, and UNHCR have taken on auxiliary roles in addressing specific issues within their institutional remits. “
“One generally problematic aspect of the UNDAF Monitoring and Evaluation Framework (M&EF) under this Country Programme Outcome is the question of the indicators that were identified to measure progress in each area. In some cases, no benchmarks have been identified. In others, the indicators themselves do not act as valid measures gauging the level of progress. Therefore, the M&EF needs to be revised consulting members of the UNCT and possibly also outside experts working in the area of poverty and inequality.”

Please provide other comments you would like to communicate to the MDG-F Secretariat

Section IV: General Thematic Indicators

1 The development of government policies for the effective management of the country's cultural heritage and tourism sector strengthened and supported

1.1 Number of laws, policies or plans supported by the programme that explicitly aim to mainstream cultural diversity, and strengthen national and local government capacity to support the cultural and tourism sector.

Policies	
National	1
Local	2

Laws	
National	
Local	

Plans	
National	0
Local	1

1.2 Please briefly provide some contextual information on the law, policy or plan and the country/municipality where it will be implemented (base line, stage of development and approval, potential impact,):

Policy 1. Museum Training Policy - National + Local
Baseline: 0

Stage of Development and Approval: Proposal from UNJP –Approval from Ministry of Culture and Tourism and Social Services and Child Rights Institution – Implementation in Provincial Directorate of Culture and Museums

Potential Impact: A model for implementation of Child Museum Trainings developed. (1) Children have been implementing “Child to Child- Peer Education” Training Models in Museum Rooms (2) Child Museum Rooms established in two eastern provinces of Turkey.

Policy 2. Tourism Governance Organization and Tourism Strategy with Action Plan – National +Local

Stage of Development and Approval: Proposal from UNJP- Approval from MoCT- Endorsement of Local Stakeholders- Establishment of the Organization
Potential Impact: New form of public private and civil society partnership for sustainable tourism development. Tourism Strategy approved by MoCT.

Plan 1. Capacity Development for Ani Site Management Plan – Local

Stage of Development and Approval: UNJP in coordination with MoCT- Approval from Board of Conversation- Endorsement of MoCT

Potential Impact: A site management model for Ani site is available.

1.3 Sector in which the law, policy or plan is focused

Management and conservation of natural and cultural heritage

Tourism infrastructure

Ethnic minorities and inter-culturalism

Comments: Please specify how indicator 1.1 addresses the selected sectors

Plan 1 will have a direct impact on the management of cultural heritage by supporting the development of a Site Management Plan for Ani Archaeological Site.

Policy 2 will provide the required governance mechanism which will be an umbrella of institutions working for the development of Kars tourism destination.

Policy 1 will be implemented via promotion of social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism in children.

1.4 Number of citizens and/or institutions directly affected by the law, policy or plan

Citizens

Total 350

Urban

Rural

National Public Institutions

Total 2

Urban

Rural

Local Public Institutions

Total 4

Urban
Rural

Private Sector Institutions

Total 40
Urban
Rural

1.5 Government budget allocated to cultural and tourism policies or programmes before the implementation of the Joint Programme (annual)

National Budget 722 Million USD
Local Budget n/a

1.6 Variation (%) in the government budget allocated to cultural and tourism policies or interventions from the beginning of the programme to present time:

National Budget

Overall 4,180 Million 4%
Triggered by the Joint Programme n/a

Local Budget

Overall n/a
Triggered by the Joint Programme n/a

Comments

2 Building the capacity of the cultural and tourism sector

2.1 Number of institutions and/or individuals with improved capacities through training, equipment and /or knowledge transferred

Public Institutions

Total 30

Private Sector Institutions

Total 30

Civil Servants

Total 30

Women 46%

Men 54%

2.2 Number of actions/events implemented that promote culture and/or tourism

Cultural events (fairs, etc)

Total 4

Number of participants 2580

Cultural Infrastructure renovated or built

Total

Total number of citizens served by the infrastructure created

Tourism infrastructure created

Total

Other, Specify

Total

2.3 Number and type of mechanisms established with support from the joint programme that serve to document and/or collect statistics on culture and tourism.

Workshops

Total number 15

Number of participants 2043

Women 1043
Men 1000

Statistics

Total
National
Local

Information systems

Total
National
Local

Cultural heritage inventories

Total 4
National
Local 1000

Other, Specify

Total
National
Local

3 Cultural and tourism potential leveraged for poverty reduction and development

3.1 Number of individuals with improved access to new markets where they can offer cultural and/or touristic services or products

Citizens

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic groups

Tourism service providers

Total

Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Culture professionals

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic groups

Artists

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic groups

Artisans

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic groups

Others, specify

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

3.2 Based on available data, please indicate the number of individuals or groups supported by the joint programme that have experienced a positive impact on health, security and income

Citizens

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Culture professionals

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Artists

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Cultural industries

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Artisans

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Entrepreneurs

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Group

Tourism Industry

Total
Women
Men
% From Ethnic Groups

Others, specify

Total
Women

Men
% From Ethnic Groups

3.3 Percentage of the above mentioned beneficiaries that have improved their livelihoods in the following aspects

Income
% Of total beneficiaries

Basic social services (health, education, etc)
% Of total beneficiaries

Security
% Of total beneficiaries

Others, specify
% Of total beneficiaries

3.4 Number of individuals with improved access to cultural services, products and/or infrastructure

Citizens
Total
Women
Men
%from Ethnic groups

Culture Professionals
Total
Women
Men
%from Ethnic groups

Artists
Total
Women
Men

%from Ethnic groups

Cultural industries

Total

Women

Men

%from Ethnic groups

Artisans

Total

Women

Men

%from Ethnic groups

Entrepreneurs

Total

Women

Men

%from Ethnic groups

Tourism Industry

Total

Women

Men

%from Ethnic groups

Other, Specify

Total

Women

Men

%from Ethnic groups

b. Joint Programme M&E framework

Expected Results (Outcomes & Outputs)	Indicators (with baselines & indicative timeframe)	Means of Verification	Collection Methods (with indicative time frame & frequency)	Responsibilities	Risks & Assumptions
<p>JP OUTCOME UNDAF Outcome 2: By 2010, social and economic policies for poverty and disparity reduction implemented effectively and quality basic social services reaching vulnerable groups ensured. (Outcome 2, UNDAF)</p> <p>Outcome of Joint Program (from UNDAF): Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by fostering pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighbouring countries</p>	<p>Contribution to MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1- Percentage of population below the poverty line;</p> <p>Indicator 2- Income distribution by population, by gender (UNDAF, 2.1.2)</p> <p><u>Baseline:</u> Disparities between regions measured through inequalities in HDI between provinces of Eastern Anatolia Region and national averages (HDI, Kars: 0.644 and Turkey 0.742, year 2000, HDR and NHDR)</p> <p>Lorenz Curve Figures: Disparities in share of income between quintiles of income brackets: lowest 20%: receives 5 percent ; highest 20%: receives 55 % of total income(UNDAF,2.1.2)</p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by TURKSTAT.</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from TURKSTAT</p>	<p>UNDP, UNESCO, UNWTO, UNICEF, Government of Turkey</p>	<p>Baseline indicators are measured in 2000 so; gap between the next measured values may not reflect contribution of the JP to the MDG target.</p>

	<p>Indicator -3</p> <p>Poverty Rate of Kars Compared by National Poverty Rate of Turkey</p> <p>Baseline: Poverty rates of Kars : % 31(TURKSTAT regional office, unofficial) Poverty rates of Turkey: % 18,08 (Source:TURKSTAT) Note: (Internationally accepted poverty rates, end of 2008 below the %17,11 food &non-food consumption)</p> <p>Source: Results of 2009 Poverty Study, TURKSTAT</p>	Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by TURKSTAT.	Information directly gathered from TURKSTAT if available at the end of the project.	UNDP,UNESCO,UNWTO, UNICEF, MoCT and Local stakeholders	
<p>JP Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars</p>	<p>Indicator -1</p> <p>a)Digitization of the registered site areas and immoveable culture and natural assets database within Kars province</p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p>b) Activation of a system for the management of the digitised information, including capacity building for relevant authorities Baseline: 0 (as of Jan 2009)</p> <p>c) Realisation of awareness-raising activities on the safeguarding of cultural heritage, and production of related information materials. Baseline: 0 (as of Jan 2009)</p> <p><u>Proqress as of December 2010</u></p> <p>a) 2643 files containing 852 Regional</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level (Erzurum Preservation Council)	Information directly gathered from project's outputs, MoCT, Erzurum Preservation Council	UNESCO, MoCT	<p>Procurement of the SW development services is realized within the planned time and budget. SW development activities are completed in the planned schedule and implemented properly.</p> <p>Risk(s): Bureaucratic obstacles, incomplete data and delay in software development, climate conditions</p>

	<p>Board decisions, 920 identification cards, 295 rehabilitation projects, 82 plans and maps, 44 principle decisions and other 450 files have been digitalized, and the software system developed. Feasibility Analysis on terrestrial measurements of 20 sites and registered buildings in Province of Kars completed.</p> <p>b) The implementing partner (contractor) has been defined and consultations are on-going in cooperation with MoCT for the establishment of the related contract. Activities will start by end of January 2011.</p> <p>c) The preparation and publishing of a set of 7 (seven) brochures aimed at raising awareness on the legislative and normative framework for the safeguarding of cultural heritage in Turkey has been completed (7000 copies printed and delivered to MoCT, for use at local and national level)</p>				
	<p>Indicator -2</p> <p>Site management capacity developed (an action plan prepared) towards preparation of a site management plan</p> <p>Baseline : An assessment report for Ani site management available, Ani site manager appointed) (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p>Both Ani Site Manager and Head of</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs and MoCT</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Ensuring participatory approach in management process, interest of MoCT and other stakeholders. Developed "Action Plan" is approved and owned by the relevant parties.</p> <p>Risk(s): delays due to Regulatory Framework, lack of participation of the Head of Excavations to the</p>

	<p>Excavations Resigned (end of year 2010).</p> <p><i>Progress as of December 2010:</i></p> <p>Workshop on Site Management organised and successfully held, with approx. 45 participants (16 women-29 men) including academicians, local authorities, NGOs, press and staff from MoCT .</p> <p><i>Ani Site Management Plan Development Framework was approved, and an agreement achieved on the preparation of a draft 5-year Site Management Plan according to the current legislative framework. MoCT established the Ani Site Management Planning team, which will cooperate with the UNJP for the definition of the draft Ani Management Plan.</i></p> <p>Revision, update and integration of existing official map of Ani completed.</p>				process
	<p>Indicator -3</p> <p>Availability of a Tourism Strategy for Kars</p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><i>Progress as of December 2010:</i> Strategy document available and approved by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism through official communication dated 22 December 2010. The report includes a Diagnostic Report which</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNWTO, MoCT and local stakeholders	<p>Approval and implementation of Tourism Strategy.</p> <p>Risk(s): Change in the political and sectoral policies that may risk the validity of the Strategy in the future.</p>

	evaluates the potential of tourism development in Kars, a Master Plan with recommendations for the sustainable development of tourism in Kars based on culture, nature and winter sports tourism products, and, an Action Plan for the implementation of the Master Plan recommendations.				
	<p>Indicator -4 Availability of Tourism Products strategically identified on the basis of supply and demand</p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>Progress as of December 2010</u></p> <p>33 tourism products identified within the Strategy development process. Detailed itineraries are being developed to be converted into tourism brochures which can serve as promotional material. The design of the brochures will be ready by March 2010.</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNWTO, MoCT and Local stakeholders	<p>Production of defined products with high quality and proper cost. Awareness raising to the defined products. Put into proper marketing strategies.</p> <p>Risk(s): Insufficient interest to the developed products</p>
	<p>Indicator -5 Presence of a tourism governance organization</p> <p>Baseline : 1 (KARTAB: Kars Tourism Infrastructure Service Union (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><i>Progress as of December 2010:</i> A governance seminar was organized in Kars in May 2010 for local and national stakeholder in order to train them on the establishment of a Tourism</p>	Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT ,Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality, Sarıkamış District Governorate, Sarıkamış Municipality	Information directly gathered from project's outputs	UNWTO, MoCT and Local stakeholders	<p>Sufficient number of contributors and proper implementation of the local tourism strategy.</p> <p>Risk(s): Regulatory Framework</p>

	<p>Governance Organization</p> <p>The structure of TGO is ready for implementation.</p>				
<p>JP Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism</p>	<p>Indicator -1</p> <p>Number of Capacity building activities of local and national Stakeholders Baseline: 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>Progress as of December 2010</u></p> <p>1.Consultancy Help Desk for Call for Proposals-One-on one consultancy services delivered for finalising the project idea and formulating applications # of days: 30 consultant m/d's spent # of beneficiaries: More than 15 NGO's, 10 public authorities benefited from these consultancy services. In total 15 applications received involving more than 30 organisations with the proposed partnerships.</p> <p>2.Training seminars for Grant Beneficiaries: 2.1.Procurement and Project Management Training Programmes # of days: 1 day for Procurement and budgetary rules, 1 day for Project Management # of Participants: 26 participants (15 men 11 women)</p> <p>2.2 Visibility training # of days: 1 day # of participants: 12 participants (8 men, 4 women)</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs</p>	<p>UNDP, MoCT, UNWTO and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>Sufficient number of participants with appropriate qualifications. Delivery of qualified and proper trainings.</p> <p>Risk(s): Lack of interest among local participants</p>

	<p>3. Training Seminar for SERHAT Development Agency UN System Seminar by Programme Specialist and Advisor # of days: 1 day # of participants: 15 participants (staff from DA 13 men 2 women)</p>				
	<p>Indicator -2</p> <p>Number of jointly implemented tourism related local economic development activities in Kars;</p> <p>Baseline: 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>Progress as of December 2010</u></p> <p>1.Cluster Development workshop (December 14) – Discussion of the cluster roadmap, review of the cluster development activities # of participants: 35 participants (25men, 10 women)</p> <p>2. Applications for call for proposals According to the guidelines, partnership was set as a mandatory criterion in order to facilitate joint activities. # of partnerships for application period: In total 15 projects submitted with a total of 16 partners, 31 beneficiaries. # of partnerships for implementation: In total 8 projects will be implemented with 8 partners, 16 beneficiaries.</p> <p>3. Activities under KARTAB agreement-cooperation agreement on development of promotional materials. Activities led by KARTAB in cooperation with local actors like provincial</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs</p>	<p>UNDP, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>Ensuring of commitment of local and national stakeholders. Development of realistic and practical Clustering approach.</p> <p>Risk(s): Impact of economical crisis Lack of interest of local and national stakeholders</p>

	<p>directorate of MoCT, MoCT Promotion General Directorate, Kars Museum and tourism enterprises in KARS.</p> <p>3.1 Development of a promotional film for KARS</p> <p>3.2 Development and establishment of information signs and promotional billboards in KARS for historical buildings and around KARS for Sarikamis and Ani.</p> <p>Train-the-Trainer programmes in Tourism Awareness and Hotel Operations jointly organized by the MoCT and UNWTO in November/December 2010 in both Kars and Sarikamis. Approximately 50 people received training. Training programmes in other subjects including English language are expected to be launched in January 2011.</p>				
	<p>Indicator -3</p> <p>Number of Arrivals to Kars</p> <p>Baseline: (2008)</p> <p>Number of arrivals thru tourism operation license: 44.981</p> <p>Number of arrivals thru municipality operation license: 59.059</p> <p>Total number of arrivals :104.040 (Source: MoCT)</p> <p><i>Progress will be provided when the 2010 reports of MoCT published</i></p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT.</p>	<p>Information will be directly gathered from MoCT end of each year.</p>	<p>UNDP, UNESCO, UNWTO, UNICEF, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>The Joint Program will mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia. It will result in increased number of arrivals at a localized level</p> <p>Risk(s): Poor implementation of defined strategies and inadequate awareness raising to the cultural assets</p>

	<p>Indicator -4</p> <p>Increase in the number of overnights in Kars</p> <p>Baseline: (2008) Number of nights spent thru tourism operation license: 72.489 Number of nights spent thru municipality operation license: 60.411 Total Number of nights spent : 132.900 (Source: MoCT)</p> <p>Target: at least %2 increase in overnights.</p> <p><i>Progress will be provided at the end of when 2010 reports of MoCT published</i></p>	<p>Indicators are verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT.</p>	<p>Information will be directly gathered from MoCT end of each year.</p>	<p>UNDP, UNESCO, UNWTO, UNICEF, MoCT and Local stakeholders</p>	<p>The Joint Program will mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia. It will result in increased number of nights spent at a localized level.</p> <p>Risk(s) : Poor implementation of defined strategies and inadequate awareness raising to the cultural assets</p>
<p>JP Output 3:</p> <p>Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</p>	<p>Indicator -1</p> <p>Number of Awareness Raising Workshops on Cultural Heritage and social cohesion implemented in Kars</p> <p>Baseline : 0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><u>Progress as of December 2010.</u></p> <p>An audio CD collecting Minstrels Performances from the region has been produced and released, in cooperation with MoCT and the Municipality of Kars.</p> <p>The preparation and publishing of a book on Eastern Anatolian Folk Tales is on-going, in close cooperation with MoCT</p> <p>An Implementation Partnership Agreement was established with a NGO in order to realize two training</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project's outputs and MoCT</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Sufficient number of participants with appropriate qualifications. Delivery of qualified and proper workshops.</p> <p>Risk(s): Lack of participation to the workshops</p>

	<p>programmes on the making and performing of traditional musical instruments, “saz” and “tar”. The programme will be attended by 20 participants.</p> <p>Cooperation Agreement signed by the Municipality of Kars and the Minstrels Association in Kars, for the establishment of a “Culture House” dedicated to the promotion and safeguarding of the Minstrels tradition. Refurbishment and rehabilitation works of the Culture House premises has been commenced and are expected to be completed by end of January 2011.</p>				
	<p>Indicator -2</p> <p>Availability of information on Main ICH Assets in the Target Area Baseline -0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p>Progress as of December 2010</p> <p>Field research for the mapping of the ICH in the province of Kars completed by Kafkas University, under supervision of MoCT (covering 80 villages; 50 students from Kafkas University involved and trained). Approximately 7000 pages of data transcriptions, 2000 photographs, 260 video recording. The possibility is being considered to convert the research into a publication.</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>Information directly gathered from project’s outputs, MoCT and field research through survey, voice and video recordings, and interviews</p>	<p>UNESCO, MoCT</p>	<p>Contribution to national ICH inventory preparations. Significant increase in the quantity and quality of inventory forms for the definition of national ICH inventory in the target area</p> <p>Risk(s): Lack of reflection of diversity, incomplete data regarding preparation of inventory forms. Insufficient safeguarding measures</p>
	<p>Indicator -3</p>	<p>Indicators will be verified on the basis of</p>	<p>Information directly gathered</p>	<p>UNICEF, MoCT</p>	<p>Obtaining official approvals and delivery of the</p>

	<p>Establishment of Children Museums in Eastern Anatolia Baseline -0 (beginning of year 2009)</p> <p><i>Progress as of December 2010:</i></p> <p>Children Museum Training modules were completed and designed for publishment by Ankara University</p> <p>Museum Trainings delivered in 7 cities with the participation of 232 children</p> <p>“Ankara University provided Children Museum Training Reports</p>	<p>information provided by MoCT and relevant authorities at local level</p>	<p>from project's outputs</p>		<p>museum buildings within the planned schedule. Equipped and furnished in accordance with project schedule and budget</p> <p>Risk(s): regulatory framework ,lack of commitment of responsible parties</p>
--	---	---	-------------------------------	--	--

b. Joint Programme Results Framework with financial information

JP Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars

JP output: 1 Please highlight the rate of delivery for each joint programme's output:

Output 1	Activity	YEAR			UN Agency	Responsible Party	Source of Funding	Budget description	Implementation Progress			
		Y1	Y2	Y3					Total Amount Planned	Total Amount Committed	Total Amount Disbursed	% Delivery rate of budget
1.1. Policy for the protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars presented for adoption by national authorities	1.1.1. Technical assistance and support to the mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs (including description and evaluation of items; assessment of conservation status; recommendations for priority interventions)		X		UNESCO	MoCT and relevant authorities at local level (Erzurum Preservation Council)	MDG-F			Contracts: 168,973.94	Contracts: 165,386.01	
	1.1.2. Awareness-raising action about existing regulatory framework and recommendations for ensuring cultural assets protection and management in the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" programme – linkage and input to UN WTO	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Contracts (I) Contracts (N) Training – Conf. Supplies Equipment Travel Miscellaneous Total	80.000 155.000 - 61.000 50.000 7.000 6.000 43.000 14.000 416.000	131,097.99 Training: 4,196.60 Misc.: 720.23 Supplies & Equipment 1.020,05- Total:	118,009.93 Training: 4,084.27 Misc.: 703.18 Supplies & Equipment 1.020,05 Total: 289,203.44	%70
	1.1.3. Support to the implementation of the recommendations by the Site management Board.		X	X	UNESCO	MoCT and relevant authorities at local level	MDG-F			306,008.81		
TOTAL: 416.000										289,203.44	%70	

1.4. A cultural tourism strategy and action plan agreed to by national authorities within the context of the "Brand City" programme	1.3.1 Inventory of tourism facilities and services in Kars Province	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Agency Management Support (7%)	Personnel (I)	71,000		71,000	
	1.3.2 Assessment of tourism potential of cultural tourism assets – tangible and intangible – based on UNESCO's identification and evaluation	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Personnel (N)	54,400	19463.95	34,358.11	
	1.3.3 Assessment of institutional capacity of Governorate, Municipality and stakeholder structures in destination management, development and promotion	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Contracts (N)	15,000		15,000	
	1.3.4 Assessment of tourism facility performance, quality and needs (cross referenced activity)	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Training – Conf	12,000		12,000	
	1.3.5 Stakeholder consultation (tourism sector, civil society, others) on aspirations/options for tourism	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Equipment	3,000		2,999	
	1.3.6 Assessment of market profile, trends and opportunities assessment of visitor monitoring	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Travel	15,000		12594.59	
	1.3.7 Conceptual positioning of Kars with respect to themes, circuits etc in Eastern Anatolia location/access assessment	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Agency Management Support (7%)	11,928	2.405.41	12594.59	
	1.3.8 Kars brand identity and visioning	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F		Total	182,328	21.689.36	158.780.76	99.08%
	1.3.9 Stakeholder workshop on options	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F						
	1.3.10 Preparation of draft – presentation, review, revision – leading to final	X			UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F						

strategy and action plan											
1.5 New Information Delivery and Marketing System established in Kars	1.5.1 Relocated and improved tourist information centre in Kars	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I)	28,400	20.000		
	1.5.2 Capacity building with Province staff and others on promotion and information delivery	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (N)	27,200		17.420	
	1.5.3 Awareness training on cultural heritage and visit opportunities within tourism sector	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts (I)	55,000	1,797.70		40.488.05
	1.5.4 Improved linkages of Kars to E-Anatolia promotion and itineraries	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Travel	8,000	285.59		9.140.16
	1.5.5 Identification and promotion of itineraries/circuits within Kars Province and surrounding areas	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Miscellaneous	7,240			2,043.19
	1.5.6 Strengthened promotion of cultural events	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Agency Management Support (7%)	8,808.8			4.836.4
	1.5.7 Improved Kars website and linkages		X	UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Total	134,648.8	22.083.29	73927.86	71.3 %
	1.5.8 Tour operator and media familiarization visits		X	UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
	1.5.9 Support for promotional campaigns		X	UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
								316,976.8	96,368.79	167,392.28	83.21%

JP Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in culture based tourism

Output 2	Activity	YEAR			UN Agency	Responsible Party	Source of Funding	Budget description	Implementation Progress			
		Y1	Y2	Y3					Total Amount Planned	Total Amount Committed	Total Amount Disbursed	% Delivery rate of budget

2.1 Enterprise and community needs for income generation in tourism sector identified	2.1.1 Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I)	14,200		14.200	
							Personnel (N)	12,240			
							Contracts (I)	40,000			
							Contracts (N)	2,500	40.000	2.500	
							Training (ST)	40,000			47.020
						Travel	3,750	1.749.3		6.676.41	
						Miscellaneous	3,750	158.73		2.012.23	
						Agency Management Support (7%)	8150.8			5.068.65	
						Total	124,590.8	41.908.03		77.447.95	95.82 %
	2.1.2 Initiation of feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
	2.1.3 Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, women’s groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
	2.1.4 Study tours within Turkey and international	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
	2.1.5 Specific focus on tourism / community enterprise delivery with respect to sites in Kars – guiding, handicrafts, retail, catering – including provision of space for this	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
started for enterprise development in	2.2.1 Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Personnel (I)	42,600	840		
							Personnel (N)	36,720			
							Contracts (I)	40,000			40.0000
	2.2.2 Training programmes designed based on above	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Contracts (N)	7,500			
							Training - Conf	9,000			
	2.2.3 Feasibility studies	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Travel	11,250	250		3.805.36

	on tourism use of cultural assets – building, sites, other assets						Miscellaneous Agency Management Support (7%)	2,250 10,452.4	372	390.08	
	2.2.4 Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, women’s groups, etc) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs, - handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F	Total	159,772.4	1,437.02	3093.68 47,289.12	30.5%
	2.2.5 Study visits within Turkey and international	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
	2.2.6 Specific focus on tourism / Community enterprise delivery with respect to sites on Kars – guiding, handicrafts, retails, catering – including provision of space for this	X		UNWTO	MoCT	MDG-F					
								284,363.2	7,488.76	123,272.78	46%
2.3. Business development services strategy in place	2.3.1. Identify and design a communication and dissemination strategy for enterprise support activities in line with EU competitiveness agenda requirements for regional development		x	UNDP	MoCT Municipality Women NGO’s in Kars Ocaklı Village		Personnel Contracts Supplies Training Travel Misc	160.000 50.000 10.000 25.000 -	132.400 35.663 9.965 23.889 -	132.400 35.663 9.965 23.889 -	
	2.3.2. Identify entrepreneurship potentials with focus on women entrepreneurship in line with the JP activities and outputs		x	UNDP	MoCT Municipality Women NGO’s in Kars Ocaklı Village		Total	245.000	201.927	201.927	83 %

	2.3.3. Conduct a series of roundtables with the local stakeholders with a view to develop a roadmap to improve the competitive strength of tourism industry including creative industries in Kars		x	UNDP	MoCT Governorate NGOs Tourism SMEs University							
2.4. Culture tourism and wider sector enterprise cluster established	2.4.1. Provide business development services for enterprises in Kars and environs		X	X	UNDP	KARTAB Governorate NGO's Tourism NGO's		Contracts	60.000	57.378	57.378	80 %
	2.4.2. Organize roundtables and fairs on commercial opportunities that are created around creative industries	X	X	X	UNDP	Tourism SMEs Governorship, Municipality, Tourism NGOs, University		Personnel	170.000	165.000	165.000	
	2.4.3. Build operational links between Kars cluster and others in Turkey through vertical and horizontal integration and document experience		x	x	UNDP	Tourism SMEs, NGOs, Unions, Chambers, Cooperatives, Municipalities etc.		Supplies	10.000	8741.28	8741.28	
	2.4.4..Support scheme for tourism development activities (income generating activities and/or cluster development activities		x	x	UNDP	Tourism SMEs, NGOs, Unions, Chambers, Cooperatives, Municipalities etc		Training	10.000	7100	7100	
							Equipment	15.000	6657.92	6657.92		
							Monitoring Mission	40.000	23.000	-		
							Travel	15.000	11.390	11.390		
							Total	320.000	279.267	256.267		

JP Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism

Output 3	Activity	YEAR			UN Agency	Responsible Party	Source of Funding	Budget description	Implementation Progress			
		Y1	Y2	Y3					Total Amount Planned	Total Amount Committed	Total Amount Disbursed	% Delivery rate of budget
2003 Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage follow up initiated in Kars and Eastern Anatolia	3.1.1. <i>Technical assistance and support to mapping of intangible culture in Kars and environs (including description and assessment of items; recommendations for safeguarding and transmission)</i>		X		UNESCO	MoCT , Municipality of Kars	MDG-F	Personnel (I) 100.000 Personnel (N) 66.000 ----- Contracts (I) 130.000 ¹ Contracts (N) 20.000 Training – Conf. 20.000 Supplies Equipment 40.000 ----- Travel 4000 Miscellaneous 360.000 Total	Contracts: 248,138.89 Personnel (including travel): 11,743.49 Misc.: 588.98 Supplies& Equipment 12,048.40:	Contracts: 170,986.36 Personnel (including Travel): 11,743.49 Misc.: 588.98 Supplies& Equipment: 12,048.40	% 54.27	
	3.2.1. <i>Preparation and publishing of Eastern Anatolian Folk Tails (Translation in Turkish of the “World Heritage in Young Hands” kit . This activity revised and approved in the 4th PMC meeting)</i>	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT , Kafkas University	MDG-F	Total: 272,519.76 Total: 195,367.23				
diversity of Cultural Heritage, Empowerment in Cultural Industries and fostered intercultural	<i>Identification of the handicrafts sector in Kars and its environs</i>	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT , Kafkas University	MDG-F					
	<i>Training course in crafts design and production</i>	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT , Kafkas University	MDG-F					
	<i>Training course in marketing of handicrafts</i>	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT , Kafkas University	MDG-F					

¹ Training and conferences have been organized through contracts

3.2. The governance structure involving civil society-government partnerships in cultural heritage promotion functional	3.2.1. Identify local and national stakeholders for a participatory governance structure to promote social cohesion and MDG goals	X		UNDP		MDGF	Contracts *	340.000	273.281	114.310	
							Personnel	430.000	430.000	404.308	
							Training	45.000	5.024	5.024	
							Monitoring Conference	15.000		-	
							Supplies	20.000		-	
							Equipment	5.000		-	
							Travel	40.000	36.077	36.077	
						Premises	77.000		-		
	3.2.2. Technical assistance and support to localized MDG target setting	X		UNDP		MDGF					
	3.2.3. Dissemination of all project activities on behalf of non-resident other participating agencies in Kars and Ankara	X		UNDP		MDGF					
	3.2.3. Design of a communication and outreach strategy addressed at stakeholders based on site management and urban conservation priorities, tourism strategies and tourism related business development services (cross linked to Output 2)	X		UNDP		MDGF					
	3.2.4. Design and implement a communication plan to ensure the visibility of the Joint Program and the cultural/tourism potential of Kars	X		UNDP		MDGF					
	3.2.5. Technical assistance and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will provide secretariat for this governance structure (one			UNDP		MDGF					
							Total	972.000	744.382	559.720	57 %
							* Including Grant Contracts				

	stop shop-umbrella international presence in Kars)													
	3.2.6. Support the participatory local governance structure for promotion of social cohesion and dialogue in Kars		X	X	UNDP									
	3.2.7. Implementation of the communication and outreach strategy addressed at stakeholders		X	X	UNDP									
3.2. Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of Istanbul, Eskişehir, Ankara, Kayseri, Çorum, Erzurum, Trabzon and Kars	With the support of local communities, an additional Children Cultural Diversity Room is established by the Child's Right Committees within the third selected provincial museum and LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities conducted (seminars, photo exhibitions handicraft etc)	X	X	X	UNICEF	SHÇEK		MDGF		Personnel (N):	160.000	139.400	139.400	78%
	Child's Rights Committees in two provinces (Erzurum and Kars) develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding	X	X		UNICEF	SHÇEK		MDGF		Contracts:	250.000	162.500	162.000	
									Travel:	27.000	19.800	5000		
									Supply:	90.000	70000			
									TOTAL:	627.000	391.700	306.400		

	Eight Child Rights Committees travel on board of the "Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train" from Istanbul to Kars (This activity will be carried out April 2011)		X	UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDGF						
	Kars Child's Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of children from eight provinces		X	UNICEF	SHÇEK	MDGF						
TOTAL:							627.000	391.700	306.400	78%		