UNITED NATIONS TRUST FUND
FOR HUMAN SECURITY

I. PROJECT INFORMATION

Project title: Strengthening human security through the promotion of coexistence and improvement of citizen security in 3 municipalities in Sonsonate.

Reference number: MDTF No. Atlas: 00047610

Country and region: El Salvador, Central America

Project location: Municipalities in Sonsonate, Acajutla and Sonzacate

United Nations responsible organization: UNDP

UN executing partners: PAHO/WHO, ILO, UNICEF

Non UN executing Partners: National Council for Public Security, Municipalities/City Halls in Sonsonate, Acajutla and Sonzacate.

Start date: March 2008

Original ending date: Foreseen: August 2010 Real: June 2011
Extension period: 10 months
Closing of operations: June 30th 2011
Financial closing date: June 30th 2011

Total Project cost: MDTF funds: US dollars 2,334,960.00
UNDP: 1,261,000.00
ILO: 145,000.00
UNICEF: 426,000.00
PAHO: 330,000.00

Reporting period: March 1st 2008 – June 30th 2011

Type of report: Final report

Issuing date: March 06 2012
Delivered by: Name: Marcela Smutt, Title: Governance Coordinator, UNDP, Participant organization: UNDP, Contact information: marcela.smutt@undp.org

Project description and main objectives:

The aim of the project is to improve human security and guarantee the fulfillment of Human Rights, as substantial elements in the comprehensive development of the municipalities of Sonsonate, Sonzacate and Acajutla, in the department of Sonsonate. The main objective was to "Improve Human security and guarantee Human Rights for the comprehensive development of 3 municipalities in the department of Sonsonate". The project's expected outcome was organized into seven (7) specific objectives (S. O.):

S.O. 1) Improved coordination, complementary work and effectiveness of State institutions and civil society to prevent violence and promote coexistence and citizen security.

S.O. 2) Increased number of population using public spaces safely.

S.O. 3) Increased protection factors upon the vulnerability of the human rights of children, teenagers and youth.

S.O 4) Consolidation of strategies for the prevention and reduction of armed violence.

S.O. 5) Relevant institutions have inputs and mechanisms in place to reduce the mortality and morbidity caused by road accidents.

S.O. 6) State institutions at local level have mechanisms and tools to provide comprehensive attention to domestic and sexual violence.

S.O. 7) Strengthened institutional mechanism for the design and implementation of actions to reduce gender gaps in access to employment and representation at decision making instances.

II.   Numerical assessment

Evaluation criteria	Score
Applicability:	
1. Was the project as successful as it was originally conceived?	1
The project was as successful as it was originally conceived. The objectives and outcome resulted in response to the threats and vulnerabilities identified by local actors during the diagnosis stage and new challenges arising during its development. As it had been initially preconceived, the project focused on providing answers to violence and insecurity, the main concern in Salvadoran society and one of the main obstacles in human development and to guarantee human security. Initially presented objectives responded to a complex phenomenon and were oriented to respond in a comprehensive manner to the main threats and vulnerabilities which were identified by local actors during the diagnosis stage.	
Efficacy	
2. Have the project's main objectives been carried out according to the activities, outcome and indicators originally conceived?	1
The project's main objectives and its activities were developed and foreseen indicators were used. During the execution of the project there were changes in national and municipal governments as well as in Institutional representatives. Such changes required revising the project, but the focus on human security originally proposed remained the same. Some specific adjustments were made a) due to local conditions, we accomplished to install a cases follow up system for National Civil Police (PNC its acronym in Spanish) victims as it couldn't be installed at every institution in the Justice system; b) gender and child/youth protection policies were not worked on independently but rather included as specific components in citizen security municipal policies, which contributed to greater coordination in the implementation process.	
3. What is your evaluation of the efficacy of the management and administrative arrangements made in executing the project?	**1**
The Executive Committee agreed to establish a coordination unit, which came into operations at the City Hall in Sonsonate. Establishing this unit at municipal level was a key component to the dynamic articulation processes between State institutions and civil society at local level, for the development of institutional capacities, the strengthening of local governance and community empowerment. The Coordination unit had technical assistance and guidance provided by Technical Interagency Committee for prevention of violence, promotion of security and access to Justice. Such instance besides providing technical assistance also developed an important role in articulating between local and national levels, a key element in public policy incidence. The arrangements made in the management enabled the development of a joint planning exercise and favored an Interagency dynamic ideal for scale economies thus optimizing time and resources. Meetings with partners were important moments for accountability and transparency on the use of the resources.	
4. What has been the efficacy of the collaboration between project partners (specify which have been the main difficulties)	**2**
Coordination mechanisms, creation of common tools, focusing actions on vulnerable territories and populations have all enhanced the participation and consensual decision making between the partners, thereby achieving an effective implementation. Joint work between the partners potentialized all different results. The construction of Interagency cooperation within the project's frame work was a challenge that required constant	

reflection between agencies in the United Nations System. The lack of proper organization at City Halls has been an additional challenge which required special attention. In order to meet this challenge we developed a staff training process and new practices and municipal units were institutionalized.	
Efficiency	
5. Has the planned outcome been reached within the programmed time and budget, as established on the work plan and execution calendar? If any outcome has not been accomplished, briefly indicate the reasons why it hasn't.	**2**
The execution of the project has required a time extension of 10 additional months. Such set back was determined basically as the changes in Government took some analyzing time off from the project. It is worth mentioning though new actors defined their continuing without making any modifications to the approach. Environmental emergencies also caused some delay to the time of implementation. Such emergencies affected the municipalities, specially Hurricane Ida during the year 2009 and tropical storm Agatha in May 2010. This time extension did not involve additional budget as planned.	
Impact	
6. What is your evaluation of the global success and impact of the project?	**1**
The implementation of the project contributed to the reduction of vulnerabilities and threats to human security. It contributed to strengthening social tissue and increased development opportunities most specifically to youth, children and women. These translated on to a reduction in the number of crime (up to -20% homicides), reduction in number of car accidents (up to -50% deceased and -17% injuries), reduction of fear (the perception of security in public spaces increased 15%), greater trust on institutions, especially at City Halls and police departments (an 8% increase in trust to the National Civil Police). 36% reduction from people's expenses to increase the security/well being of their family. Partner institutions have made this experience their own and will provide continuity, even after the culmination of the project through the institutionalization of municipal structures for the prevention of violence, gender units, entrepreneurship assistance for women, citizen assistance at PNC offices in critical areas. At state institutions level a wide and comprehensive perspective of how to address vulnerabilities and security threats was established. The project contributed to discussions on the importance of addressing issues from a wider and comprehensive point of view. It also enabled the development of an intervention model, which is now being undertaken by the Government under the National Strategy for the Prevention of Violence. The entrepreneurship and empowerment model for women has been institutionalized as a strategy to promote development and human security of women and as part of a national Policy which is also being undertaken by the Treasury's National Support Commission for Micro and small enterprises (CONAMYPE its Spanish acronym). Gun bans implemented as part of the crime prevention strategy have been extended to 20 additional municipalities.	
7. If necessary, were the communication and knowledge components of the media or audience conducted efficiently? To what extent? – was it so the project objectives were brought to the attention of larger audiences? (to direct beyond beneficiaries)	**1**
As part of a communication strategy, a series of materials were designed, created and disseminated which helped raise awareness, provide information and communication, among these the following outstand: - ABC of coexistence and citizen security: a tool in local management; 3 notebooks on the experiences of each of the municipalities, - Project systematization: written and audiovisual document - Handbook Entrepreneur Women: a tool for empowering women. - National Strategy of Road Safety from the Ministry of Public Works - Communication campaign "My municipality is changing and so am I", aimed to promote a culture of respect towards legality and contribute to the prevention of gender violence, youth violence, armed violence and road accidents. The concept and design of such campaign have been undertaken and copied by other municipalities in the country. The project results have been promoted at forums and during national as well as international conferences. http://www.pnud.org.sv/2007/content/blogcategory/0/160/5/5/, http://alcaldiadesonsonate.org, http://www.conamype.gob.sv/index.php?option=com_phocadownload&view=category&id=29:presentaciones-de-eventos-conamype&Itemid=63,	
Sustainability	
8. What are the chances of the project activities and successes of becoming sustainable and having lasting effects after the end of the support provided by the Trust Fund? (Specify which are key factors and prospective follow up needs, to determine the sustainability of the effect of the activities being carried out.)	2
The creation of municipal units for the prevention of violence and coexistence, gender units, women entrepreneurship assistance, citizen assistance offices at National Civil Police (OAC its Spanish acronym), were key to the institutionalization and sustainability of the project beyond project implementation. The development of local capacities through training programs has also been a key element to sustainability. Empowering communities through	

the work developed with community boards, women leaders also contributed to the sustainability of the project. Although there was some important progress and institutionalization efforts made, the magnitude and dynamic phenomena of violence and insecurity in the country, establishes important challenges which need to be faced by the municipalities which cannot do so without this additional support. Although the project has also made important progress in the institutionalization of the territories and empowering local actors, still additional financial and technical resources are required at the municipalities. United Nations is therefore contributing to the institutionalization by providing technical assistance to the Justice and Public Security Ministry who is responsible for coordinating the Cabinet for the prevention of violence, whose objective is to promote the construction of an Inter Ministries agenda which will allow for the allocation of financial and technical national resources to priority municipalities. Also, it stimulated the creation of a network of safe cities with female and male Mayors from seven municipalities, where the aim is to share ideas, find solutions, innovate and promote public policies proposals, by joining efforts with a local management area of citizen security and social cohesion and the promotion of a joint work between the different institutions and actors linked to local development and citizen security.	
Global assessment of the Project's accomplishments	
9. What is your global evaluation of the project, considering criteria such as ownership, efficacy, efficiency, impact and sustainability of its effects?	2
From a human security perspective, the project focused on responding to security threats and vulnerabilities identified with the participation of local stakeholders. It accomplished to meet the established objectives and outcome. It allowed the generation of changes in the lives of persons and has had substantial impact in the reduction of levels of violence and fear. It contributed to joint partnerships and catalyzation of processes which will be later undertaken as part of national policies. It also contributed to the creation of a local citizen security management model and a discussion on the importance of a comprehensive security.	

Legend: 1- Excellent, 2 - Good, 3 - Satisfactory, 4 -Non satisfactory, 5 - Does not apply, 6 - Missing information

III.   TEXTUAL ASSESSMENT

1.   What were the main problems or difficulties encountered during the execution of the project?

During its implementation the project faced several challenges all different in kind and linked to several other factors. The change in National Government in the year 2009 brought some challenges although some of these associated risks had been already foreseen, we underestimated the time of transition and response when building alliances at local level with the new authorities. Under this context and in order to overcome the time invested in this Government rearrangement, the CNSP (National Council for Public Security) decided to delegate the implementation of the project to UNDP as this facilitated its implementation. Currently, the public security experience developed in these three municipalities has been recognized by the National Government and has become a mandatory reference on the topic. An important challenge is linked to the weak capacity of the different stakeholders at different levels (National and Local Government, community, agencies) around topics related to local security management, especially when building an innovative approach which will allow for a more complex and comprehensive vision. On that same note, City Halls required training processes for their key staff members during the implementation process in order to encourage the participation and therefore respond to the challenges raised by citizen security. Even such an action led to the enactment of municipal ordinances which allowed the creation and institutionalization of specialized units in gender, youth, coexistence, etc. which also allowed a much greater capitalization of the experience. Another challenge faced was the weak culture and experience of the coordination to achieve common goals, which made it difficult to create a joint agenda based on the objectives proposed by the project. In this sense, committees and commissions from benefiting communities have required constant accompaniment and time reflection to improve their organization and communication, so that efforts do not get dispersed. The construction of inter-agency cooperation within the project's framework added on an additional challenge which required specific methodological actions such as monthly meetings, thematic discussions which facilitated the coordination of actions at municipal level, the creation of common tools, targeting actions to critical areas, among others. The emergencies caused by flooding caused by natural disasters such as the storm E 12, affected the municipalities and due to their relevance, caused a great impact on the ordinary dynamic and development of the project as they had to deal for extended periods with much urgent and demanding schedules from the municipalities and their inhabitants.

2.   Have there been any (positive or negative) effects or results which were not anticipated on the initial proposal? If yes, what were they?

The project helped the development of an intervention model, which is currently being undertaken by the Government under the National Strategy for the prevention of violence. Also the model of entrepreneurship and empowerment of

women has been institutionalized as a strategy to promote the development and human security of women, as part of the national policy being picked by the Ministry of Economy's National Support Commission for Micro and Small enterprises (CONAMYPE its acronym in Spanish). It had not been anticipated to obtain a multiplier effect of several strategies developed in Sonsonate in such a short term, such as the gun ban, women entrepreneurship window assistance, communication campaign "My municipality is changing and so am I"; program "I am also a person", art and culture community schools, municipal art festivals, culture and sports, scholarship system to encourage first working experiences.

3. **Please describe, what has been the impact of the project in terms of strengthening and consolidation of implementation partners and the United Nations system as a whole**

It is worth mentioning the good will and political leadership of the municipal governments which has facilitated the creation of new municipal units much needed for the joint development and institutionalization of policies and citizen security and coexistence plans, the investment of public resources in the implementation of the different strategies and the support and/or adoption of new regulations. The United Nations agencies have generated a series of strategic alliances which were practically nonexistent prior to the implementation. Throughout the implementation process several agreements and conventions have been established with the municipalities and national government institutions such as National Civil Police, MJSP, ISDEMU, ISNA, CONAMYPE, MTPS, Vice Ministry of Transportation, Presidency's Culture Secretariat and other institutions such as the Human Rights Attorney's Office. It has also worked on articulating these partnerships with civil society and business associations such as the Chamber of Commerce. Also, state institutions have undertaken sustainability and replication of these initiatives in other municipalities.

4. **What types of project evaluations were conducted by the United Nations organizations which were associated to the implementation (either internal, external or participatory)**

We applied an external impact evaluation and project systematization with the participation of local stakeholders and partners. The evaluation allowed establishing the impact of the interventions on the groups and areas of greatest vulnerability. Also important aspects of the processes were recovered as well as the development and project results assessment from partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries.

5. **What were the Project's lessons learned (positive or negative)? Do you have specific recommendations to improve the chances of success in future programs?**

- Empowering Municipal Mayors as leaders in the process has been a key element so to accomplish their commitment to the project and ownership of the commitments made by municipal governments.
- Having knowledge of the issues and security and coexistence threats has been of great importance to the design of plans and strategies, focusing interventions in critical areas and to vulnerable groups specifically youth and women.
- The establishment of a coordination unit at municipal level has enabled strengthening relationships with local governments and other key stakeholders in process planning, development and follow-up. It is important for interagencies to define the profile of the Coordinator and clarify the role of the Project coordinator and the level of delegation that each agency establishes of its components in order to facilitate the implementation in the field.
- The creation of new organizational structures, interinstitutional coordination and the development of new work practices has generated some resistance to change among local stakeholders, resistance which has been overcome through constant collective reflection on such practices.
- It is important to be able to adapt to the different styles and paces each City Hall has, as well as the relationship they establish with the different institutions at local level.
- The permanence of Institutional representatives at local level has contributed to deepen and consolidate the expertise developed within the project's framework.
- Sustainability of actions runs through a key element: security committees or councils and local prevention. These spaces allow shifting the logic from national to local levels thus improving interagency coordination.
- Coordination and articulation inter and interinstitutional needs to be strengthened or created from concrete actions in the territory.
- The three government levels, national, regional and local, have different political times and structures. Therefore, to territorialize policies requires long lasting alliances so national agreements reach local levels. A bad articulation at any of these three levels may interfere with local efforts made.
- This articulation needs to be worked on so maintaining the alliances does not depend only of the will of several specific people.
- It is necessary to strengthen the technical capacity of public institutions according to their areas of expertise.

- A real and sustainable effort must run through co-participation and co-responsibility of the citizens.
- It is essential to allocate municipal and national financial resources.
- It is important to strengthen the decentralization of resources and services at local level, as part of a necessary commitment for the consolidation of human security in the municipalities.

6. What has been the added value – if any, of applying the human security concept on to the Project?

The human security concept has promoted innovative and comprehensive multidisciplinary and participatory approaches, to respond to a complex and dynamic issue. Allowed interventions to focus on reducing threats and vulnerabilities associated with the phenomena of violence and crime affecting the inhabitants of the municipalities. The articulated vision between peace (freedom from fear), development (with opportunities) and human rights (with dignity), was an ideal framework for the design, development and monitoring of municipal policies on public security and coexistence. The strategy of empowering partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries has helped strengthen the new schemes of work. It reached a certain level of sustainability from local level, generated a greater demand of the quality of public services, and promoted a joint responsibility between citizens, the services of public institutions and private sector's social responsibility, from a preventive approach.

7. Would you recommend this Project as a successful story of achievements accomplished in terms of human security to the United Nations Human Security Trust Fund?

I would recommend the Project's success to the United Nations Human Security Trust Fund. The Interamerican Human Rights Institute in Costa Rica (IIDH), with the support of the Trust fund, has carried out a study based on the application of human security approach. The results from the study have been conclusive, and the IIDH has taken elements from such experience (processes, materials, and video) to build modules and training tools which will help promote comprehension and the application of a human security concept. The reflection process promoted by IDDH during a regional workshop was ideal when deepening the implementation of the approach.

8. Have you accomplished important progress in promoting the concept of human security as a result of the project?

The human security approach has been consolidated into the work of the United Nations´ Inter agency thematic work and in others several spaces for national and international discussion which have promoted such approach.

9. Indicate any significant contribution from external donors to the United Nations system and specify what specific strategies have been applied to this financing.

The results from the experience have attracted investments from other partnerships; the Mayor of Santa Ana California (USA) for example will strengthen the City Hall of Sonsonate through decentralized cooperation. Other cooperation agencies such as GIZ have also worked with the City Hall in Sonsonate by offering job opportunities for young people and USAID by providing criminal investigation.

10. Has this Project been duplicated elsewhere using other financial resources?

The methodology is being applied under the Violence prevention Project and construction of social capital, being currently implemented in the municipality of San Salvador, with funding from the sale of Peace and Conflict, MDGs Fund. The ministry of Justice and Public security has taken over this concept for the development of gun bans in 20 municipalities, and using its own funds. The Ministry of Economy through CONAMYPE – replicated the model women entrepreneurship assistance window from Sonsonate in "Ciudad Mujer" in the municipality of Colon, assigning 800,000 US$ from an IDP loan. It was also integrated to the 2012 budget in order to extend its operations to other departments in the country. The model is currently being undertaken in a USAID bidding process for a contribution of 25 million for prevention, aimed at local level.