

# **UNIOGBIS**



# EXTERNAL EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT "BOOSTING THE MEDIA SECTOR FOR GREATER PEACE AND STABILITY IN GUINEA-BISSAU"

Vanda Medeiros

9 December 2020

### Acknowledgements

The evaluator would like to thank the members and staff of United Nations Integrated Peacebuilding Office in Guinea Bissau (UNIOGBIS) Public Information Unit (PIU); the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the National Community Radio Network (RENARC), the Union of Journalists (SINJOTECS), the Guinea-Bissau Journalists Association (OJGB), the Association of Women Professionals of the Media (AMPROCS), the Action for Development (AD), and the Media Consortium Innovation (CMICS) for their valuable assistance and for taking the time to share their experiences and information. Special mention goes to Sophie Pereira and Julia Alhinho for their invaluable assistance, information, and support. The evaluator would also like to acknowledge all the stakeholders and beneficiaries who participated in the evaluation process and generously shared their thoughts and experiences, providing an invaluable contribution to this report. Finally, the evaluator would like to acknowledge the National Consultant, Lamine Sonco, for his support on the field mission activities.

### Disclaimer

The views expressed in this report are those of the evaluator. They do not represent those of UNIOGBIS, UNDP, Peace Building Fund (PBF) or any of the institutions referred to in the report. All errors and omissions remain the responsibility of the author.

### Author

This report was written by Vanda Medeiros.

# Table of Contents

List o	of Acronyms	5
Exect	utive Summary	6
I. ] i.	Project Context and Evaluation Approach Development context	
ii.	The project objective and intervention rationale	.10
iii.	Project Theory of Change	.12
II. Ev i.	valuation Approach and Findings Relevance	
Ĺ	Adequacy	.15
1	Alignment	.16
]	Project Design	.17
ii.	Effectiveness	. 19
1	Outcome 1 - An improved and universally applied legal framework regulating the media sector and the journalistic profession contributes to enhanced professionalism and accountability as well as a decrease of tensions between media professionals and state actors	
(	Outcome 2 - Journalists, media professionals, outlets and associations organize more effectively and exercise greater professional and economic autonomy due to improve governance of the media sector	
	Outcome 3 – Established and young media professionals produce quality, impartial a conflict-sensitive content	
iii.	Efficiency	.26
7	Value for money	.26
]	Project management	. 27
]	Partnerships and synergies	. 27
iv.	Impact	. 28
]	Legislative and regulatory impact (media policies and professional regulation)	. 28
]	Institutional impact (media associations and journalists' empowerment)	. 29
g	Social impact (peacebuilding and democratization)	.30
v.	Sustainability	.31
vi.	Cross-cutting issues	. 32
III. C i.	onclusions and recommendations Relevance	
ii.	Effectiveness	.36
iii.	. Efficiency	.37

iv.	Impact	
v.	Sustainability	
vi.	Cross-cutting issues	40
IV. Le	essons Learned	
ANNI	EXE 1: PROJECT WORK PLAN AND BUDGET	
	EXE 2: DETAILED OUTCOME-LEVEL TARGETS, BASELINES AND PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION PERIOD	
ANNI	EXE 3: EVALUATION QUESTIONS	
ANNI	EXE 4: DOCUMENTS REVIEWED	
ANNI	EXE 5: LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED	

# List of Acronyms

AD	Action for Development
AEGUI	Writers Association of Guinea-Bissau
AMPROCS	Association of Women Professionals of the Media
CMICS	Media Consortium Innovation
CNCS	Nacional Council for Social Communication
ICIJ	International Consortium of Investigative Journalists
NCE	no-cost extension
OJGB	Guinea-Bissau Journalists Association
OSC	Civil Society Organisation
SMART	Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, Time-bound
PAIGC	African Party for the Independence of Guinea and Cape Verde
PBF	United Nations Peacebuilding Fund
PBFSO	Peacebuilding Fund Support Office
PD	Project Document
PIU	Public Information Unit
RENARC	National Community Radio Network
RSF	Reporters Without Borders
RTP	Portuguese Radio Television
SINJOTECS	Union of Journalists
ToC	Theory of Change
ToR	Terms of Reference
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNEG	United Nations Evaluation Group
UNIOGBIS	United Nations Integrated Peacebuilding Office in Guinea Bissau

### **Executive Summary**

This report evaluates the project "Boosting the media sector for greater Peace and Stability in Guinea-Bissau". Its primary purpose is producing in-depth analysis of the Project's results, based on the data and evidence gathered by the evaluator, to understand if it achieved the desired impact. It also aims to provide accurate recommendations and lessons learned for future and ongoing PBF funded projects.

The project ran from January 2018 until May 2020, with a total budget of \$801,877. It was implemented by the United Nations Integrated Peace-building Office in Guinea Bissau (UNIOGBIS) Public Information Unit (PIU), and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) acting respectively as the Project's technical and financial administrator. Other national stakeholders acted as (non-UN) project implementing partners.

It aimed to reinforce individual and institutional capacities within the media sector and its main players, to ensure that professionals and institutions are better skilled and equipped to promote self-initiative, responsibility, and accountability, and at the same time defend against attacks and dynamics of instrumentalization that further destabilize and undermine the central role that journalism plays in democratic systems. The project also intended to foster a sense of pride and self-esteem among journalists to encourage them to follow their ethics code.

The overall assessment of the project impact is quite positive, as the project furthered the *"institutional stabilization of the media sector in Guinea Bissau by supporting the creation of better conditions for journalists to perform their role in a democratic society in a more professional and responsible manner"*. <sup>1</sup>The project's achieved a remarkable performance in its relevance, efficiency, and impact. Another strong point was the project team capacity to adapt the implementation to the country's instability and unexpected events. The evaluation identified a few aspects that could have been better designed, some shortcomings regarding the effectiveness of specific activities and additional recommendations that may be used in future exercises.

The evaluator gathered substantial evidence that the project was **relevant as** the objectives addressed a real need by generating better conditions for journalists and media to play their central role in democratic processes and promoting peace and stability in Guinea-Bissau through responsible and conflict-sensitive reporting.

The project outcomes were **adequate and aligned** with the mandate and strategic aims of the donor (PBF), the UN implementing agency and the mission (UNDP and UNIOGBIS) and the National Implementing Partners.

The project outputs and activities were **well designed in general** and significantly contributed to the outcomes. The design included several noteworthy aspects such as the multidimensional approach and the inclusion of key local partners since the start. However, most indicators and targets were not SMART, hindering an accurate measurement of the project outcomes and the activities progress. In most cases, the project risks were adequately identified.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Project Document

Overall, the **project's efficiency and cost-benefit ratio were highly satisfactory**. Both international and national partners were able to optimize the existing resources and reduce costs. The project was led by a qualified team known for its expertise in the field and solid experience in the country. The project had many activities running in parallel, which required effective coordination and synchronisation, this was successfully achieved by proactive leadership of the Project Manager and the Public Information Unit.

The project activities were effective in progressing towards the project objectives. Nevertheless, the expected results of the Project outcomes were partially accomplished. The project faced significant challenges during its implementation, including strong political instability, inoperative government structures, and the covid19 pandemic. These events made it impossible to achieve some of the main results, despite the good performance of the project team.

The project contributed to transformations at different levels, **having an impact at the legislative**, **institutional**, **and social level**. Some of the most remarkable achievements were:

- The legal framework was successfully improved, increasing the media corporative solidarity, media partnerships and professional responsibility, including during the elections campaign.
- Three media laws were drafted. One was approved (the establishment of a professional regulatory body to issue press-cards for journalists) and two are on the way to receive the Council of Minister's approval (the draft law on online communication and the draft law on a new public fund for financing media).
- The training in Media Management produced tangible impacts on media market functioning, altering the newspaper *O Democrata*, the newspaper *Donos da Bola* and the communication company *Protoline*. At the same time, new institutions were brought into the media sphere the Media Innovation Consortium and the Journalists Professional School.
- Women were significantly empowered and female leadership in the media sector was successfully promoted. The success of the Bafata Women Radio inspired other radio stations to hire female journalists, and the Union of Journalists (SINJOTECS) is led by a woman for the first time.
- All the Project beneficiaries successfully increased their knowledge about journalists and media rights, national legislation, entrepreneurship, investigative journalism, fake news, and networking, improved their role as civic educator and produced better quality content.
- SINJOTECS positioned itself as one of the key players in the claim and protection of the journalists' rights.
- The community radios supported with solar panels increased their broadcasting time and allowed for increased savings on community radio budgets.

The **project has left important seeds that may contribute to conflict resolution and peace in the medium-term.** A few pieces of evidence were found showing that in some cases

journalists contributed to conflict resolution and decrease of political tensions. Journalists' interviewed stated that the project effectively contributed to enhance their role as civic educators and some examples of journalists' opposition to undue influence by state bodies were reported. It was unanimously endorsed by the partners that the project effectively encouraged journalists to defend their profession, to regulate it and to aspire to produce quality content.

Despite that, the fragility of this project is its **sustainability**. Even though the Project Team has made a notable effort to ensure long term sustainability, the successful implementation of the medium- and long-term strategy was partially achieved. This was due to external factors such as the political instability and the Covid-19 pandemic, but also to a lack of confidence, by national partners, in their capacities to ensure the continuity of the new institutions and the outlined sustainability strategies.

**Gender mainstreaming, environment and democracy** are three **cross-cutting issues** consistently approached by this project.

Some of the main recommendations and lessons learned identified in the evaluation are as follows:

- In the Project Document (PD), identify qualitative and quantitative SMART indicators to measure the outcome and impact of the project; include at least one impact indicator per Outcome, as well as measurable targets and reliable verification sources.
- Identify gender-related indicators/ targets and present disaggregated data in the implementation reports.
- Establish partnerships with national organisations to monitor the actors' compliance with the laws and professional regulations. The Union of Journalists or a Civil Society Organisation could play this oversight role.
- Establish media partnerships, at the regional and international level, to provide insite training in newspaper, radio and television newsrooms, as well as traineeships and exchanges programs.
- Consider introducing a Portuguese as non-native language module (written and spoken) in the Journalism course curriculum.
- Continue investing in activities to promote citizenship and behaviour change (such as radio and television programs).
- Fact-checking on issues outside of country political agenda (such as Covid-19), proved to be a good strategy to create a change in mentality regarding the reporting of misinformation and the publication of research results.

# I. Project Context and Evaluation Approach

## i. Development context

Despite the international consensus that media outlets play a crucial role contributing to collective right to information, citizenship and the democratic process, in Guinea Bissau, the media sector has been linked to political propaganda since its early days and still struggles to overcome that stigma. Commonly, the media lack literacy and professionalism. Also, they are characterised by structural financial fragility, often giving place to support provided directly by the economic and political elites. In absence of adequate legal and institutional frameworks that regulate the exercise of the related professions, they are highly vulnerable to political and economic pressures. This prevents comprehensive, impartial, and inclusive news coverage, undermining the sector's credibility and contributing to the permanent instability of the country.

Although independent media have existed since the 1960s, the main role of the press was the dissemination of colonial propaganda until independence. Since then, the press became a communication tool of the (only) African Party of Independence of Guinea-Bissau and Cape Verde (PAIGC). With the military-political conflict of '98 the media were heavily affected, looted and the main national radios occupied by the two hotbeds of conflict (the state and the military junta), becoming actively involved in politics. Since the military conflict of '98 to date, numerous political assassinations, repression and abuse of power against the media and journalists have taken place<sup>2</sup>.

With negligible demand from the local advertising market, the media struggle to get financial incomes, and rarely have any financial sustainability. Both the "broadcasting act" and the "television law" require the state to finance public media<sup>3</sup>, but those funds only cover the permanent staff salaries. These salaries are generally mediocre<sup>4</sup> and do not guarantee the financial independence of the workers. The poor management skills and the lack of cooperation among the several players exacerbate the media financial vulnerability.

Several legal and regulatory gaps promote the professional fragility of the sector: the inexistence of journalists' licenses, the inexistence of a professional code of conduct, and the ineffectiveness of the National Council of Social Communication, among others<sup>5</sup>. Some experts claim there is an urgent need to review and update the national legislation that regulates the exercise of the journalist profession, such as the hiring of professional media as politicians' public relations, the prosecution of hate speech, the inclusion of specific provisions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Tony Tcheka, *The media in Guinea-Bissau*, 2015

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Art. 13 of the Television Law and Art.  $10^{\circ}/n^{\circ}$  4 of the Broadcasting Act.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Final Report, *Media Law in Guinea-Bissau*, UNIOGBIS, Public Information Unit, and https://www.dw.com/pt-002/maioria-dos-jornalistas-guineenses-recebe-menos-de-50-euros-por-m%C3%AAs-sindicato/a-45720137

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Project Document and Final Report, *Media Law in Guinea-Bissau*, UNIOGBIS, Public Information Unit Page 9 of 51

that ensure respect for gender equality and non-discrimination in the profession; the threats and intimidation against journalists. <sup>6</sup>

The 2020 Reporters Without Borders (RSF) World Press Freedom Index ranks Guinea-Bissau in 94th out of 180 countries<sup>7</sup> (5 comparing with 2019). According to the RSF assessment, the media and journalists of the country are "extremely vulnerable" to political and economic pressures, free access to information is not guaranteed and self-censorship prevails in addressing government failures, organised crime, and the military's influence on society<sup>8</sup>.

In October 2016, these various problems were identified at the National Media Forum, supported by UNIOGBIS in consultation with journalist's associations and Ministry of Social Communication. According to the project document, the conclusions of the forum informed the design of this project.

## ii. The project objective and intervention rationale

This report addresses the evaluation of the project entitled "Boosting the media sector for greater Peace and Stability in Guinea-Bissau". As defined in the Project Document, its major goal was to contribute to institutional stabilization of the media sector in Guinea-Bissau by supporting the creation of better conditions for journalists to play a positive role in a democratic society, promoting professional accountability, responsibility and conflict-sensitive reporting.

The project was financed by the Peacebuilding Fund (PBF) and implemented by the United Nations Integrated Peacebuilding Office in Guinea Bissau (UNIOGBIS) Public Information Unit (PIU). The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) acted as the Project's financial administrator. The project ran from January 2018 until May 2020, including an additional 9 months no-cost extension (NCE). The approved PBF budget for the project was \$801,877.

The main project strategy was to use a multidimensional approach to tackle the issues preventing the media from playing its positive role in democracy and sustaining peace. The project intended to reinforce individual and institutional capacities within the media sector and its main players, to ensure that professionals and institutions are better skilled and equipped to promote self-initiative, responsibility and accountability. Also, the media would be able to defend against attacks and dynamics of instrumentalization that further destabilize and undermine the central role that journalism plays in democratic systems. The project also aimed to foster a sense of pride and self-esteem among journalists to encourage them to follow their ethics code.

To achieve the objective, the project identifies three main outcomes:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>*The media in Guinea-Bissau,* Tony Tcheca, 2015; Final Report, *Media Law in Guinea-Bissau,* UNIOGBIS ; the *National Media Forum* in 2016 ; and the *V Meeting of the Platform of the Portuguese Speaking Countries and Territories' Media Regulators* in 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Reporters without Borders, 2020 *World Press Freedom Index*, https://rsf.org/en/ranking <u><sup>8</sup>https://rsf.org/en/guinea-bissau</u>

- <u>Outcome 1:</u> An improved and universally applied legal framework regulating the media sector and the journalistic profession contributes to enhanced professionalism and accountability as well as a decrease of tensions between media professionals and state actors.
- <u>Outcome 2</u>: Journalists, media professionals, outlets and associations organize more effectively and exercise greater professional and economic autonomy due to improved governance of the media sector.
- <u>Outcome 3:</u> Established and young media professionals produce quality, impartial and conflict-sensitive content.

To achieve the expected outcomes, the project designed a range of activities that impacted the media sector in different areas, achieving a high level of complementarity between them throughout the project life. The project activities were implemented at the national level, through media actors based in Bissau and located in the 9 country regions (see Figure 1: *Map of Guinea-Bissau*).



Figure 1: Map of Guinea-Bissau

Other (non-UN) project implementing partners are: National Community Radio Network (RENARC), composed of 23 Community Radios; Union of Journalists (SINJOTECS); Guinea-Bissau Journalists Association (OJGB), Association of Women Professionals of the Media (AMPROCS), NGO Action for Development (AD), Media Innovation Consortium (CMICS) and the Writers Association of Guinea-Bissau (AEGUI) that later joined the project.

The direct beneficiaries of the project are the private media organizations and journalists' associations (see **Erro! A origem da referência não foi encontrada.** List of targeted media actors and regions)

### Table 1 - List of targeted media actors and regions

Media Actors	Region
National Council of Social Communication	Bissau
Media owners and managers	Bissau
Independent Media Consortium	Bissau
Union of Journalists	Bissau
Association of Women Journalist	Bissau
Network of Community Radios (RENARC)	All country regions
Guinea-Bissau Journalists Association (OJGB)	Bissau
Ministry of Social Communication (General-Director)	Bissau
Bafata Women's Radio (RMB)	Bafata

The indirect beneficiaries are the Bissau Guinean citizens in general, which will benefit from more accountable and accurate information.

### iii. Project Theory of Change

The Theory of Change (ToC) stated in the project document reads:

If the legal framework and statutes which regulate the media sector and the profession of journalism are improved, approved by the Parliament and/or Government (decree-laws), disseminated and implemented, media will be less vulnerable to political manipulation and the information it produces will be seen as more credible in the eyes of the public.

If a new code of conduct for journalists and for politicians and political party engagement with the media were developed and disseminated, this would help prevent and reduce instrumentalization of media actors, enabling more credible reporting. This is particularly important in the face of the upcoming election cycle.

If key journalists and media professionals' associations are strengthened and their internal governance structures are fortified, these actors and groups would be better able to build stronger coalitions to exert greater influence and advocacy for solutions that will enhance the economic sustainability and political independence of the media sector. Specifically, if the organization of the journalist's congress and the community radio national meeting are supported, and media managers are able to create their own association, they will be able to address their common problems, in particular those related to economic sustainability. They will be able to share costs for building the capacity of media managers, set up a purchase center to reduce their operational costs, and advocate with decision-makers in government and parliament for the needs of the sector – in particular for its autonomy – both politically and economically.

If a coalition of media associations has the initial influx of equipment that they can then rent, they will have a sustainable means of generating income to support advocacy efforts and maintain a coalition. Sector actors have long devised what they believe is viable scheme for financing the media sector that would afford the media sector greater autonomy but are in need of developing a collaborative advocacy strategy to realize this idea.

If the 5 community radio stations can avoid spending 90 per cent of their resources on energy consumption, they will have the ability to strategically dedicate greater resources to pay their

*journalists' wages, develop relevant and independent reporting and programming, expand broadcast hours and make more broadcast time available to different constituencies and vulnerable groups.* 

While strengthening legal frameworks and fortifying the governance structures of the sector will contribute to the stabilization of the sector and its relationship with political actors, journalists and young aspirants to the profession, in particular young women, require training in conflict-sensitive reporting and peacebuilding and multimedia production to enable them to be active agents of peace and stabilization. If such training and mentorship is facilitated and supported by enhanced collaboration amongst journalist professionals and sector bodies, then there is a greater likelihood that an overall reduction the incidents whereby journalists willingly or unwittingly contribute to political and institutional destabilization by unethical and biased reporting.

If a new curriculum is embedded in the oldest professional schools in the country – Escola de Artes e Ofícios de Quélélé (run by NGOAction for Development) and Action for Development has an equipped multimedia centre, journalists will have the requisite training and equipment to develop quality media products and reports that will have a positive impact in public debate, contributing to strengthening democracy and rule of law. If given an incentive to produce peace-related media products through small grants and contracting effort and these reports are broadcast on radio and TV, this will help cement their peacebuilding and conflict-sensitive understandings and skills in a practical and rewarding manner that will contribute to public understanding of peace-related issues and build public support for institutional and political stabilization efforts.<sup>9</sup>

From the conception of the project, it was assumed that the media sector has complex and wide-ranging shortcomings, which required a multidimensional intervention, different from the past ones. An intervention that would combine both approaches: to improve the journalist's capacity and to support the media infrastructures. The project ToC was designed around three outcomes contributing to four dimensions of change. These four dimensions are media policies and governance; journalist's professional regulation; media actors' capacity; empowerment and collective values related to conflict response, peace and stability.

The assumptions presented in the Theory of Change remained valid throughout the implementation period of the Project. Unexpected events, such as the COVID-19 pandemic, did not alter or weaken the ToC. It promoted the competencies reinforcement in areas such as the production of quality contents out of the scope of current political events, the enforcement of the Journalist's Deontological Code, among others. This unforeseen aspect forced the project to successfully reinvent itself without, however, modifying the anticipated results in the theory of change.

The Project implementation faced several challenges caused by political instability. In 2019, Guinea-Bissau had three elections, multiple government reshuffles and a non-functional parliament that lasted for several months. Such context contributed to weakening the theory of change in a specific point related to the first project outcome: the approval of the legal framework by the Council of Ministers and/or Parliament. Although the draft law on the establishment of a professional regulatory body to issue press-card for journalists was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Project Document

approved, there are still two laws pending approval after the project closure. This means that the first expected result hardly leads to the expected impact.

# **II. Evaluation Approach and Findings**

The evaluation's primary purpose was to conduct a final external and independent evaluation of the project to provide accurate recommendations and lessons learned for future and ongoing PBF funded projects. It followed the UNEG's Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation<sup>10</sup>.

The methodology was designed to fulfil the expectations of PBF, UNIOGBIS, UNDP, and the National Implementing Partners. It is expected that it will be a useful tool for all the players involved, identifying lessons learned and ways forward. The different analyses were carried out based on the initial approach set in the Terms of Reference (ToR).

Before the field mission, an Inception Report was submitted and approved by PBF, UNIOGBIS and UNDP, containing project information, strategy and evaluation focus, key evaluation questions and a draft list of people to be interviewed. The field mission plan had to be adapted to the pandemic situation. In this context, the evaluator subcontracted a national consultant to conduct the field data collection *in loco*– when it was not possible for the evaluator to do them at distance - and focus groups discussion in the field, under the evaluator coordination.

The evaluation strategy was implemented using a participatory and people-centred approach, where the data collection process targeted the project direct beneficiaries. The evaluation applied a mixed method composed by a desk review, on-line surveys, remote and face to face interviews, focus group discussions and field visits to community radio and TV stations, representing project target groups (see ANNEXE 5: LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED

The evaluator answered the evaluation questions by drawing the best available evidence coming from the following evaluation tools:

- **Desk review:** UNIOGBIS provided a large body of project documentation which were examined, alongside other relevant contextual and background materials on issues around media situation and features in Guinea-Bissau. (see DOCUMENTS REVIEWED).
- Online Survey: Two online surveys were carried out. The first targeted the main project beneficiaries (the implementing partners and the media actors), aiming at collecting data revealing their assessment of the project's activities, outcomes, and impact. The second survey was aimed at the participants of the project training activities (online and on-site). The purpose of this questionnaire was to collect data on the participants' assessment on knowledge acquisition, the pertinence, and the value of the training content for their day-to-day activities. Twenty-nine questionnaires were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> March 2008. See http://www.unevaluation.org/document/detail/102.

answered in total (fifteen answers to the survey targeting the project beneficiaries and fourteen answers to the survey targeting the training participants).

- In-depth informant interviews and focus groups: All the data collection tools were developed by the evaluator. The national consultant was briefed about the project and the evaluation methodology and followed the guidelines in the field activities. The evaluator and the national consultant conducted semi-structured interviews (face to face or through WhatsApp) and organised two focus groups with key stakeholders that participated at the central or local levels in the project implementation. In Inception Report submitted by the evaluator prior the field mission X interviews were planned. The unexpected participation of a national consultant in the field mission allowed the number of interviewees to be greatly expanded beyond what was foreseen in the inception report, since it allowed for simultaneous remote interviews (conducted by the evaluator) and face-to-face interviews (conducted by the national consultant). A total of 42 interviews and 2 focus groups were conducted. (see ANNEXE 5: LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED
- Sites visited: The field mission occurred between 2<sup>nd</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> November. The National Consultant visited the following country regions - Bissau, Bafatá, Cambadu. The mentioned geographical areas were selected taking into consideration the following aspects: locations where the project built infrastructures, regions where the radios that benefited from solar panels are located, regions where trainings were conducted. The regions of Cantanhez and Formosa Island, where 2 radios and a TV had benefited from solar panels were not visited due to logistical constraints, such as lack of sea transport to the islands and road in bad conditions.

The evaluation tools reflected a gender mainstreaming approach. The impact achieved with the active participation of women in the project activities was verified.

## i. Relevance

## Adequacy

Main question - Were the objectives of the project in line with the needs and priorities of the target beneficiaries?

Related questions – Why was this project needed? How does this project address the identified conflict/tension factors in the country?

The evaluator gathered substantial evidence that the project objectives addressed a real need, by generating better conditions for journalists and media to play their central role in democratic processes and promoting peace and stability in Guinea-Bissau through responsible and conflict-sensitive reporting.

In October 2016, the main problems and needs of the media sector were identified at the National Media Forum, supported by UNIOGBIS. Those needs were: i) improve the media legal framework (namely the establishment of a professional regulatory body to issue press-

cards for journalists, and the regulation of the online communication); ii) develop a national policy for the media sector that ensures its financial sustainability; iii) establishment of a professional journalism school<sup>11</sup>. The project addressed all these needs.

Through a wide range of activities, the project aimed at and reinforced the journalists reporting capacities, deontological knowledge, and expected performance. This has contributed to improving journalist's sense of responsibility and recognition of their fundamental role in peacebuilding. As a result, the identified negative factors, such as the linkage between journalists and political powers in the country, hate speeches or social instability produced by journalist's behaviour, have been addressed by the project.

Several stakeholders, including beneficiary groups, journalists and project consultants highlighted that the project was created at the right moment, as there were, by then, several enabling conditions such as a professional movement and a will from the media actors to regulate the sector and to achieve a greater professionalisation.

The project responded to the need for building and strengthening the media associations and the journalist's capacities. Creating, on one hand, synergies among players to promote sector sustainability. And, on the other hand, improving the journalist's independence and resistance to external influence. Therefore, the efforts to empower media associations and professionals, promoting the establishment of dialogue and partnerships between them, were considered adequate and relevant.

# Alignment

Main question - Was the project clearly within stakeholders' mandate and congruent with their strategic framework?

Related questions - How does the project aligns with the strategic guidelines and priorities of your organisation?

The project is aligned with the mandate and the strategic aims of the donor (PBF), the international implementing partners (UNIOGBIS and UNDP) and the national implementing partners (SINJOTECS, RENARC, AD, OJGB, AMPROCS). It was unanimously acknowledged by the national implementing partners, during the evaluation, that the project was crucial to consolidate their network and their intervention strategy for the coming years.

The UN Secretary-General's Peacebuilding Fund (PBF) main objective is to sustain peace in countries or situations at risk or affected by violent conflict, seeking to foster democracy from the bottom *up*. This project is particularly aligned with the PBF focus area of *dialogue and coexistence* and with its Strategic Plan 2017-19 window of investment youth and women's empowerment to foster inclusion and gender equality<sup>12</sup>.

The project was also aligned with UNIOGBIS mandate (2019-2020), which included: to assist, coordinate and lead international efforts in supporting the national authorities and stakeholders in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Media Law in Guinea-Bissau, Carmelita Pires, UNIOGBIS, Public Information Unit.

https://www.un.org/peacebuilding/sites/www.un.org.peacebuilding/files/documents/pbf\_sp\_2017-19\_final\_180327.pdf

strengthening democratic institutions (...); promotion and protection of human rights as well as undertaking human rights monitoring and reporting; (..); and to implement the National Action Plan on Gender in order to ensure the involvement, representation and participation of women at all levels<sup>13</sup>.

Also, the project is aligned with 2016 - 2020 Partnership Framework between Guinea-Bissau and the United Nations, where outcome 1 is to "consolidating stability and rule of law, democratic participation and equal opportunities for all"<sup>14</sup>.

All the national implementing partners are non-governmental organisations that represent and defend the rights and the interests of the media professionals and promote the use of the media as instruments for development, peace, justice, and solidarity. The evaluation found substantial evidence suggesting that Associations such as AD, RENARC or AMPROC are well-known and well-regarded by the public opinion and the authorities. The work carried out in the field of media for more than 20 years, has established them as credible voices on the matter.

# **Project Design**

Main questions - Were the project activities/outputs adequate to make progress towards the project outcome? Were the risks appropriately identified by the project?

Related questions - Were the outputs well designed to achieve the intended outcomes? Would you change any of these outputs? Was there any verified risk that was not initially foreseen?

The **project outputs and activities were well designed in general and significantly contributed to the outcomes.** Nevertheless, most indicators and targets were vague and ambitious, hindering an accurate measurement of the intended outcomes and the activities progress. In most cases, the project risks were adequately identified during the project design. The selection of the beneficiaries was entirely adequate and decided in a participatory and consultative fashion with the local partners.

The project design had several notable aspects of which the evaluation highlights: the multidimensional approach (see *supra* Theory of Change section) and the inclusion of key local partners. This was revealed through a detailed analysis of the project document, the progress reports, and the testimonies of stakeholders, from both implementing partners and beneficiaries.

The initial results logical framework set up in the project document was successfully reviewed and adapted by the PBF secretariat a few months after the project began, and a monitoring and evaluation plan was established.

In general, the Outcome indicators were not SMART and were difficult to achieve, and in some cases depended exclusively on governmental structures. No baselines or targets were defined for Outcomes 2 and 3 in the Project Document, nor in the Monitoring and Evaluation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> <u>https://uniogbis.unmissions.org/en/background</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Partnership Framework between Guinea-Bissau and the United Nations, in <u>https://unsdg.un.org/un-in-action/guinea-bissau</u>.

Plan. This situation hindered the measurement and evaluation of the range of changes and impact to which the project contributed.

As an example, in the Outcome 1, the outcome indicator (number of regulatory texts reviewed and approved) and related target (3) were ambitious and dependent exclusively on the National Assembly or Council of Ministers. Given the fragility of the country's political situation and the presidential and legislative elections foreseen during the project life cycle, the outcome indicator should measure something that could be (at least partially) driven by the project. A possible indicator to measure this outcome would be the number of regulatory texts approved by the media sector organizations and submitted to the government. Another possible indicator would be the number of journalists/media institution that signed the Journalists Deontological Code.

In Outcome 2, the related indicator (financial autonomy of the media sector strengthened) is also not specific and difficult to measure. Possible indicators, in this case, would be: i) financial savings resulting from partnerships made among media associations; ii) the number of new journalists hired by community radios that have benefited from solar panels; iii) changes in the media outlets business plans that generated greater financial sustainability verified during the project.

Output indicators could also have been more specific in terms of quantity and quality to allow an accurate measurement of the activities progresses during the project. Example, indicators 2.2.1 (representatives elected in democratic elections); or 2.6.1 (women more confident to voice concerns on the radio) would express more explicit results if they were more specific (% of journalists that have voted to elect representatives; % of journalists that have reported that the election of representatives was free and fair; % of women journalists hired by the media during the project).

Furthermore, Guinea-Bissau has a structural lack of available data (the last Census was carried out in 2009), which stresses the importance of conducting baseline studies at the beginning of projects to allow an accurate evaluation of the results. It is important to state that the project conducted, in parallel with the evaluation mission, two socio-economic studies: "Media habit of Bissau-guineans" and "financial and social situation of media institutions". The results of this study may represent relevant contributions in terms of quantitative data for future projects.

The project should have established gender-specific indicators, such as: % of target women who have increased their capacities in organisational development, financial and project management; % of young women who have participated in a training course; % of quality media projects presented by women journalists.

In most cases, the risks were adequately identified during the project design. However, the project team identified additional risks which were not foreseen in the design phase. It was the case of:

- Slow and heavy UNDP administrative procedures. According to the information provided by key stakeholders, UNDP was understaffed to respond effectively and promptly to project needs. This caused important delays in the procurement of materials, payment of Grants,

hiring and payment of consultants. Several project partners, beneficiaries, and consultants reported that this was a hindrance to the implementation of the activities.

- **Difficulty in building joint media organizations**. The project team felt some difficulty in motivating cooperative work among the different beneficiaries. Networking is something rarely verified in the media organizations in Guinea-Bissau. This risk was successfully mitigated with the creation of the Innovative Media Consortium.

- Low investment from the local partners. The presidential and legislative elections that took place during the project kept journalists busy during a long period, which decreased their availability to participate in the project activities. On the other hand, the project team reported that the implementing partners demonstrated a low level of autonomy and an acute dependence on project assistance to carry out the activities.

- **Financial support from international actors to the media.** The international agencies and organizations need to publish their activities and to have visibility in the national media. As such, some international agencies pay journalists to cover their events. This situation contributes to a lack of clarity regarding the role of the journalist and impoverishes the work. The project team tried to mitigate this risk, by creating a code of conduct to regulate the relationship between international agencies and the media.

Most of the risks identified in the PD have not occurred, except "deterioration of the political situation". In this case, the proposed risk mitigation measures – *strengthening the consortium and a two-way communication flow between it and all stakeholders* – were not enough to annul the negative impact in the project outcome achievement. Nevertheless, the evaluation found evidence that other strategies, such as promoting the partners' engagement in the lobbying strategy were successfully used to help mitigate the risk. The early involvement of different representatives of political parties in the Project design might also have helped to tackle such issues (see recommendation section).

According to the data and evidence gathered by the evaluator, overall, **the activities were implemented as planned**, **with some delays and minor changes approved by PBF**. These changes were mostly related to the Covid-19 pandemic and showed a high level of ability of the project team to adapt to unforeseen events (see infra). A 9-month extension (until May 2020) was approved, to allow the execution of monitoring activities.

## ii. Effectiveness

Main question - Was the project, as implemented, able to achieve its objectives and goals? Did the achievement of the outcomes result in peacebuilding change?

Related questions - Was the project implemented as envisaged by the project document? Were the project activities adequate to make progress towards the project objectives?

The data and the testimonies collected during the evaluation demonstrate that the expected results of all the Project outcomes were partially accomplished. Annexe 1 provides a table with details at the output level on the indicators, targets, and results for the project

implementation period; additional comments are provided by the evaluator in the last column of the table in Annexe 1.

The project faced significant challenges during its implementation, including strong political instability, inoperative government structures, and the covid19 pandemic. These events made it impossible to achieve some main results. However, it is worth mentioning the remarkable adaptation capacity of the project team, that constantly readjusted the activities to the situation. In Outcome 3 activities were added to respond to the pandemic, such as: support to local fact checking team to debunk COVID-19 related fake news; training to journalists on COVID-19 and pandemic news coverage, and training on combating fake news. These activities were not foreseen in the project document and contributed to a range of results that exceeded initial expectations.

Based on the assessment and results reported at the Output level – and following the specific Outcome indicators established (see the section on project design) - the evaluator concluded on the Outcome effectiveness as it follows:

Outcome 1 - An improved and universally applied legal framework regulating the media sector and the journalistic profession contributes to enhanced professionalism and accountability as well as a decrease of tensions between media professionals and state actors.

Overall, the Outputs foreseen in Outcome 1 were effective in progressing towards the project objectives. **The evaluator concluded - through the analysis of the project documents, online survey and interviews with stakeholders and beneficiaries – that the expected results of Outcome 1 were partially achieved**. The Outputs 1.2 and 1.3 were fully achieved<sup>15</sup>. The output 1.1 is assessed as partially achieved, since the draft laws were not approved during the life cycle of the project.

Both implementing partners and project beneficiaries recognised the importance and the added value of a legal framework regulating the media sector. However, they warn that there is a need for some institutional mechanism to monitor media compliance with the legislation. This lack of institutional and reliable state structures undermines the medium and longterm impact of projects in general.

None of the laws was approved during the project life cycle. Nevertheless, local partners

"This project represents a change of chapter in the history of journalism in Guinea-Bissau. This legislation will allow the journalists to understand the difference freedom between of expression and freedom of the press; social facts, and opinion... It is a step towards the strengthening of democracy." (António Nhaga, President of Journalists Association)

reported that the lobbying strategy improved the chances of such approval. The law establishing a commission to issue press-card for journalists was formally approved during the evaluation exercise in November 2020. The approval of the draft law on a new public fund

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Even though indicator stablished for output 1.2 (Budget allocation to media Sector approved by the government) was not achieved, the output per se (A lobbying strategy to advocate for the adoption of this new regulatory framework is implemented) was achieved.

for financing media would be extremely important to ensure the media economic stability, and consequently break the cycle of dependency between journalists and public and private institutions. The Union of Journalists revealed to be strongly sensitized to promote the new media legal framework.

It is important to note that according to RENARC point of view, sustained by several journalists interviewed, the draft laws did not meet the expectations of establishing specific regulation for the community media sector. The community radios are non-profit organizations,

"There is an urgent need to adopt a law that is suited to the specific characteristics of community radio". (Mussa Balde, Journalist)"

operating in self-management, often with funds from international organizations. In general, their human resources are community citizens. Many of them do not have specific training in journalism. In legal terms, they are equated with private radio stations, without, however, being ruled by the same financing principles<sup>16</sup>. The need to create a specific legal framework for the community radios was also identified in the document "Media Law", financed by UNIOGBIS.<sup>17</sup>

One of the strong points of the project was the consolidation of the media associations network. Interviews with key stakeholders, namely with the direct beneficiaries, reported that the reinforcement of this network promoted cooperation that was crucial for the sector approval of the draft laws, the deontological code and the code of conduct for the elections. Those last two were signed by 23 media outlets.

The fact-checking team created to ensure journalistic integrity during the elections was considered, by all the stakeholders, as an innovation in the country. Although the result of these activities was not published by the responsible entity (CNCS)<sup>18</sup>, this activity was a positive step in establishing the boundaries of the journalists' conduct.

Outcome 2 - Journalists, media professionals, outlets and associations organize more effectively and exercise greater professional and economic autonomy due to improved governance of the media sector.

Overall, the Outputs foreseen in Outcome 2 were effective in progressing towards the project objectives.

The evaluator concluded - through interviews with the main partners and beneficiaries and the online surveys sent to the project beneficiaries and the participants of the training courses – that the expected results of Outcome 2 were largely achieved. Although the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Miguel de Barros and Fatima Camará, in <u>Community radios and recreation processes of active citizenship</u> <u>in Guinea-Bissau.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> "It seems incomprehensible to us that there is no legal framework for community radios, and that they are treated as private radios, in a monetarist logic that seems to us to be entirely disproportionate to the social added value they embody." Carmelita Pires, in, Media Law in Guinea-Bissau, p.74 UNIOGBIS, Public Information Unit, 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>Following the Project Team this happened because the report would be damaging to one of the camps in the political struggle. The president of the CNCS became the prosecutor general and the parliament never replaced him.

indicator defined for Output 2.1 is too vague, difficult to measure and with no established target, according to the testimonies received throughout the evaluation, we can say that this output successfully contributed to Outcome 2. Outputs 2.2, 2.3, 2.4 were achieved; Outputs 2.5 and 2.6 were exceeded.

According to the testimonies, the project successfully enhanced partnerships among media owners and strengthened their management skills. As confirmed by interviews and an online survey, the quality of the training in media management was excellent in terms of pedagogical content, the language employed, manuals and trainers. Participants in the training also emphasized that it allowed for an important exchange of experience and the establishment of partnerships between the various media managers.

"This training was particularly important. I managed a community television for many years without having access to such training. Now I feel much more skilled to run a media company." (Demba Sanhá, RENARC).

The most noteworthy results in Outcome 2 are the three entrepreneurship grants offered to three media professional women; the election of the Union of Journalists' Representative; and, the consolidation of the Bafatá Women Radio. The evaluation found strong evidence that the project contributed significantly to the empowerment of women journalists and, also to women's leadership in the media sector.

The three entrepreneurship grants had an impact on two of the country's best-known newspapers - *Democrata* and *Donos da Bola* - and contributed to set up and legalise a new media company led by a woman - *Protoline* (see impact section). Nevertheless, the 3 beneficiaries experienced delays in receiving their grants. In the case of the newspaper *O Democrata*, given these delays, the project was not yet fully implemented at the time of the evaluation. As an example, the grant included the construction of small sales kiosks in different country locations. These kiosks had not yet been built (although the materials had been purchased). Newspapers were being sold in places such as grocery stores.

The Bafata Women Radio - the first radio for women and made only by women of the country - has gained a prominent place at the national level, with the support of the project which included training, equipment, and salaries paid for 1 year and a half. The radio was created by a Spanish NGO (*Periodistas Solidários de Sevilla*) and received the support of ONU-Women that financed training activities for journalists. The Bafata Women Radio was considered by the main stakeholders as the most successful output of the project.

Another important result in this outcome was the creation of the Innovative Media Consortium (CMICS), composed by members of the local implementing partners organizations, which promoted the cooperation between the different players and improved team-building capabilities. It was mentioned by national partners that this cooperative working structure was an innovation when compared to past projects. The media consortium has a fully equipped multimedia centre

"The consortium will undoubtedly improve the production of content and solve journalists' transport problems. Difficulties in traveling are one of the factors that make journalists vulnerable to manipulation and not independent". Tomane Camará and a car. The partners also praised the inclusive and democratic way in which the statutes of the consortium were created.

The equipment of 5 radios and 2 community TVs with solar panels has achieved the expected result: saving costs on electricity and paying journalists. The radios have increased broadcasting time due to solar panels. One beneficiary (Radio Kossena from Formosa) reported having had some technical problems with the use of the panels and felt a lack of follow-up in its maintenance.

# Outcome 3 – Established and young media professionals produce quality, impartial and conflict-sensitive content.

Overall, the Outputs foreseen in Outcome 3 were effective in progressing towards the project objectives.

The evaluator concluded - through the analyses of project documentation and interviews with partners and project beneficiaries – that the expected results of Outcome 3 were partially achieved.

Several outputs in this outcome were not achieved during the project lifecycle due to delays caused by the COVID-19 pandemic (such as the Journalist Professional School opening). Also, the project had too many activities, something which was imposed to the project team by the Peacebuilding Fund Support Office (PBFSO) at the project designing phase. For example, the project team wanted to give solar panels to at least 20 community radios, but instead, they were required to reduce to five and use the funds for small grants which are much more time-consuming in its implementation. Output 3.1 was achieved. Although no target was set for output 3.2 the evaluation found that the output was achieved. Indicator 3.3 and respective target were not specific regarding the multiple activities included in this output. Despite the lack of criterion, the evaluator considers that the Output was fully achieved. Indicator and targets set for Output 3.4 were partially achieved. Indicator and target set for Output 3.5. were not achieved.

The Outputs in Outcome 3 were hard to accomplish due to the sanitary situation faced in the entire world. Guinea-Bissau authorities declared a state of emergency on 16 March 2020. The measures imposed by the government (closing schools, borders, etc.) prevented the implementation of some of the project's activities on time. Nevertheless, the project adapted to the new context, having integrated new activities related to Corona Virus prevention.

Important results were accomplished in Outcome 3: the creation of the first professional journalism course in the country (2 years and a half, certified by the Ministry of Education); and the construction of a fully equipped multimedia centre (with a TV room, radio room, press room, library) placed in the Journalism School and managed by the Innovative Media Consortium established in outcome 2 (CMICS).

The Journalism School started its activities in September 2020, with 40 students enrolled (from those 5 women from vulnerable life conditions received a scholarship), teachers were hired, and pedagogical manuals developed and printed. It is noteworthy, that the professional profile of the consultant who created the curricula and the manuals was well suited to the needs of the project. Both project team, school director, teachers and students mentioned the

high quality of the course curricula and manuals. However, both trainers and students mentioned the lack of a Portuguese language module in the course curriculum.



Picture 1 – Multimedia Centre

Picture 2 – Journalism Professional School

The members of the consortium, with UNIOGBIS assistance, have set up a business plan for renting out the multimedia centre's infrastructure and materials, intending to improve the CMICS financial autonomy. Due to COVID-19 preventive measures, the journalism school reduced the number of students per class. The class of 40 students was divided into 2 groups, and the centre is now being used as a classroom for one of the groups. The materials of the centre have not yet started to be used nor rented. Some issues regarding the centre material were reported: the printer is not being used due to the high cost of its cartridges, and the car for the mobile radio is not yet legalized. The project team stated that some of the difficulties with equipment was due to UNDP procurement challenges in acquiring the equipment (this process took over one year as UNDP decided to acquire everything from one single provider).



Picture 3 – Radio Studio Multimedia Centre

Picture 4 – Radio Studio Multimedia Centre

Although the project team has made a great effort to ensure sustainability, assisting on the elaboration of the business plan and sensitizing for its implementation, the local partners expressed some concern about the sustainability of the multimedia centre in the future (see sustainability section).

Several training modules were conducted in this Outcome (training in Conflict Prevention; Law; Investigative Journalism; Corona Virus and Fake News). From the 15 beneficiaries who answered the questions: *How do you evaluate the pedagogical content of the training in which you participated*? and *Has the training in which you have participated increased your journalistic skills*? 100% answered "good or excellent" to the first question, and 71,4% answered "very much" to the second question.

According to testimonies, the grants received to develop investigative journalism projects, and the personal coaching provided by the project external consultant contributed significantly to improving journalists' skills. Nevertheless, journalists reported a lack of role models at the national level. Following their statements, local trainers are often out of date. There are no sources of inspiration in the country and the training is often not adapted to the reality of community radio journalists.

"The training was interesting and innovative. Important topics were addressed, selection such as: of informants. conducting interviews: ethical and deontological code; etc. We learned to work rigorously, according to standards, without labelling ethical people or institutions". Diamantino Lopes (Investigative Journalism grantee)

Although the first step towards the first national soap opera has been taken, output 3.4 has not been fully achieved. Forty-two episodes were written (28 financed by the project and 12 by own funds of the Writers' Association of Guinea Bissau – AEGUI - the local partner responsible for this output). The production agreements for the soap opera have been suspended due to the pandemic and have not yet been resumed. With the change of the Government, the National Television did not produce the pilot episode as agreed. The fund foreseen for the soap opera production was though allocated to pandemic response activities. AEGUI will try to find additional funds to continue this activity.

The output 3.5 had to be postponed due to the Pandemic. Nevertheless, the funds for the organisation of the ceremony and distribution of the prizes have been transferred to the Union of Journalists.

In addition to that, in the scope of the project activities related with the pandemic, a Civil Society Organization – Innovalab - was supported to implement the first fact-checking website of the country; and, E-training in topics such as State of Emergency, Fake-news, Protection, Prevention, was delivered.

It is worth noting that fact-checking on issues outside of country political agenda (such as Covid-19) proved to be a winning strategy to initiate a change in mentality regarding the reporting of misinformation and the publication of research results in this area.

A grant for protection of journalist's rights to provide assistance to journalists (legal and humanitarian) when they are victims of persecution, was transferred to the SINJOTECS, following the recommendation of the international consultant responsible by training and the coaching in Investigative Journalism.

### iii. Efficiency

Main question – To what extent was the management and administrative arrangements sufficient to ensure a cost-efficient and accountable implementation of the project

Related questions – To what extent has the project encouraged inclusiveness? To what extent has the project promoted ownership, alignment, harmonization, and mutual accountability among all relevant stakeholders?

This section focuses on the evaluation of the value for money of the project, accurately assessing how did the various activities transform the available resources into the intended results. Besides, it also evaluates the partnerships established, the project coordination and the level of inclusiveness encouraged by the project.

### Value for money

Overall, the project's efficiency and cost-benefit ratio were highly satisfactory. Both international and national partners were able to optimize the existing resources and reduce costs. For example, UNIOGBIS has offered several logistical resources such as offices, cars, drivers, expertise, conference rooms for training activities and meetings. Local partners used their infrastructure for meetings and internal activities. This has saved significant costs. From an administrative and financial standpoint, prudent and transparent management were observed.

The approved PBF budget for the project was \$801,877, and the implementation rate (delivery rate) was 100%. The project received USD 6,000 of non-PBF funding, namely from UNIOGBIS regular budget (USD 3,000 for a consultant and USD 3,000 for printing the journalism school manuals). UN Women (through another PBF project, so I believe it it still PBF) also contributed with a grant to Bafata Women Radio for training activities.

The project has had a high number of activities, and some were difficult to implement in the timelines set in the project document. Nevertheless, the evaluator acknowledges that in general, the human and financial resources allocated to the project were suitable. The only exception, reported by the project team, is related to the UNDP human resources, which was understaffed and struggling to meet the procurement and finance deadlines.

The project's budget was spent with some deviations from the original plan set out in the project document<sup>19</sup>. The reasons mentioned for these changes in budget allocation between outcomes were related to:

- The persistence of a political crisis and institutional stalemate at the National Assembly;
- Lengthy and complicated procurement procedures;
- Delayed disbursement of funds and payments to Project grant recipients;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Expenditure planning and deviations were analyzed on the following documents: *Financial projection and activities planning;* and *NCE– No Cost Extension Document.* 

• Redistribution of funds to support Covid-19 response activities. After following the noncompliance of the National Television board with the activities related to the production of the soap opera.

According to local partners, some of the materials purchased with the project funds were not the best choice in terms of cost-benefit. This is the example of the printer/photocopier installed in the multimedia centre (the ink cartridges are too expensive to compensate for the use of the machine); the newspaper printing machine ( was bought in Senegal and arrived with technical problems that until the evaluation exercise could not be solved); the solar panels were also installed without leaving any manual or user guide to the community radios staff. It is important to note that following the project reports, and the project team statements, the local partners received a grant and were themselves in charge of buying and choosing the equipment. Many meetings were organized to decide the material details. The solar panel installation was all managed by RENARC after the reception of a grant.

# **Project management**

The project was led by a qualified team known for its expertise in the field and solid experience in the country. The project had many activities running in parallel, which required effective coordination and synchronisation, this was successfully achieved by proactive leadership of the Project Manager and the Responsible of the Public Information Unit.

National partners reported that the institutional relationship with the project team was collaborative, on a democratic and horizontal style, promoting a clear and efficient distinction of roles and a decision-making flow. This type of management system positively contributed to project ownership. The partners also highlighted the importance of the participatory approach used throughout the project in decision-making processes.

According to the information collected, the Project team and PBF used to meet, at least every two months. The Project Manager and UNIOGBIS Public Information Unit carried a close follow up with the beneficiaries, maintained almost daily contact, either face to face, through telephone or WhatsApp groups, and was always readily available for any support.

The Project Team performance was evaluated as excellent by all the interviewees. In the online survey, 70% of the respondents assessed the UN's project management performance as *Good* or *Excellent*.

# **Partnerships and synergies**

The partnership between UNIOGBIS and the local partners, mainly AD and RENARC, which also have considerable expertise in the field, facilitated the project's anchoring at the local level. At the same time, it helped strengthen the network and the synergies between the media institutions through the creation of the Media Consortium (CMICS).

According to the testimonies of local partners, the decision-making process throughout the project

"The involvement and partnerships established between UNIOGBIS and local partners in the needs assessment and design of the project was a path to success. It helped to better identify needs, facilitated the involvement of the different stakeholders, and created synergies. " Jorge Handem AD was highly participatory. The involvement of local partners and the establishment of partnerships with civil society organisations were prioritised. Ownership was successfully promoted.

The quality of the institutional relationships between the UNIOGBIS Public Information Unit and the local media institutions and journalists enabled to develop partnerships and synergies at the national level. This highly contributed to the project's efficiency.

The project also fostered partnerships with international organizations that improved the quality of the activities, such as the University of Dortmund that provided training in Migration; the Association of Solidarity Journalists of Seville that created Bafata Women Radio, the Portuguese News Agency *LUSA* that provided training on fake news, among others.

## iv. Impact

Main question - To what extent has the project contributed to the three outcomes?

Related questions – Provide us with some examples that show that media actors are more empowered and have improved their skills? How would you evaluate the project impact on the journalist's peacebuilding and conflict reporting skills? To what extent has the project caused changes and effects, positive and negative, foreseen and unforeseen, on democratization and on sustaining peace objectives?

As previously explained,<sup>20</sup> the Project Document does not include SMART indicators at the Outcome level that would enable a straightforward preliminary analysis of the project impact. In addition to that, most indicators established on the PD are designed to measure the outputs and the activities progress. In that context, the evaluator gathered evidence – through interviews, desk review and other tools - to assess, with a degree of confidence, to what extent the project has generated positive effects at different levels. This chapter analyses three levels of impact in each of the three project outcomes.

## Legislative and regulatory impact (media policies and professional regulation)

The project **improved the legal framework**, **increased the media corporative solidarity and professional responsibility**, **including during the elections campaign**. This impact must be sustained by the approval and enforcement of the remaining draft-laws and the media financial autonomy.

The three draft laws were recognized as positive and important measures by both local media actors and the Government, but only the law "establishing a commission to issue press-card for journalists" was approved by the National Assembly (after the project closure). Thus, the final impact of this new legal framework, in particular, the level of independence of the media vis-à-vis the political sphere, and its public credibility, cannot be assessed at this stage. Despite that, all interviewees expressed that a major step towards class professionalization was taken.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See section on design.

Evidence suggests that the project contributed to changes in terms of journalists' corporative solidarity and increasing awareness of its importance for the public accountability of the state actions and democracy functioning. The fact that all journalists and media associations supported and lobbied in favour of the draft laws, is a sign of the structural strengthening of the class, which has long been characterised as disunited and politicised.

Although it cannot be proved, it is a safe assumption that the drafting of the 3 draft-laws, the adoption of the deontological code and the code of conduct for elections, together with other project activities, lessened tensions between media professionals and political actors. The evaluation documented some cases in which the code of conduct for elections had an impact on the journalist coverage of the electoral campaign. Some journalists reported that they refused to join the party caravan to writing articles. And, stated that they were increasingly aware of what is right/legal and what is not right/legal for journalists to do.

### Institutional impact (media associations and journalists' empowerment)

According to beneficiaries and other stakeholders, **the project contributed significantly to strengthening the journalist's professional skills and organizational capacities**, **causing a positive impact in the main media institutions (**SINJOTECS, RENARC, AD, OJGB, AMPROCS).

The project beneficiaries increased their knowledge about journalists and media rights, national legislation, entrepreneurship, investigative journalism, fake news and networking. In line with beneficiaries' declarations, the training was extremely empowering and crucial to the success of the project. The pedagogic content was evaluated as relevant or extremely relevant by 100% of the respondents of the online survey. The points highlighted by the participants were: the adequacy of the structure of the training, particularly the balance between theory and practice associated with the grants in entrepreneurship and investigative journalism.

Media management training produced tangible impacts on specific media. For instance, the newspaper *O Democrata*, now distributed nationwide, dropped the price as a business strategy. Citizens interviewed confirmed the importance of this price reduction, making the newspaper more accessible to everyone and every social group. The newspaper *Donos da Bola* created its website. And a new communication company – *Protoline* - led by a woman was legalised and entered the market.

The local implementing partners stated that one of the most significant impacts achieved by strengthening media associations was the improvement of the journalist's protection. The Union of Journalists (SINJOTECS) positioned itself as one of the key players in the claim of the journalists' rights, supporting national journalists fight against censorship and political pressure during the elections period. For the first time, the Union developed a financing proposal to support the deployment costs for journalists reporting in the field. It also organized debates among the different candidates in an independent and nonpartisan manner, allowing all political parties to express themselves publicly. This was seen as extremely innovative and positive.

The project brought new institutions into the media sphere – the Media Innovation Consortium and the Journalists Professional School - which had a transforming effect, on a structural and relational level for each implementing partner organisations.

The project also had a remarkable impact at the community level in two different aspects: women empowerment and leadership (see section vi) and increase of community radio broadcasting capacity. The community radios supported with solar panels reported the increment of the broadcasting time, which represents an added value to the rural communities, where the radio is the single mean of communication.

### SUCCESS STORIES

**Bafata Women Radio** – This is the first radio in the country that targets specifically women and that brings women voices to public debate. This radio was created in 2008 by a Spanish NGO (Periodistas Solidários) with the aim of increasing female representation in the media. The project supported this initiative and Radio has earned a prominent place in Guinea Bissau society. Topics such as gender equality, sexual education, women rights and child protection have been brought up for discussion in Bafatá communities. The Radio has produced an investigative work about Talibe Children. which published international was by an newspaper (https://drive.google.com/a/periodistassolidarios.org/file/d/1Z001glx1Mz0jx u2XRcX U0KC2sO0Kxog/view?usp=drive web). Its success has inspired the other radio station that started hiring female journalists (it is the case of the Bafata Community Radio). Moreover, the director of the Bafata Women Radio stated that as a consequence of its programs on sexual education, women empowerment has decreased early marriage in the region.

\_--

## Social impact (peacebuilding and democratization)

The direct contribution of the project to sustaining peace and democratization processes is not easily tangible. However, according to the testimonies of stakeholders, and some national journalists, we can say that **the project has left important seeds that may contribute to conflict resolution and peace in the medium-term.** 

One of the project main objectives, as described in its ToC, was improving the journalists' role as a civic educator. Journalists interviewed during the evaluation stated that this had occurred. A few pieces of evidence were found showing that in some cases journalists contributed to conflict resolution and decrease of political tensions. Some examples of journalists' opposition to undue influence by state bodies were reported.

It is unanimously endorsed by the partners that the project effectively encouraged journalists to defend their profession, to regulate it and to aspire to produce quality content. Class consciousness was strengthened as well as the importance of independent media for democracy and state accountability. The soap opera is the project activity most likely to generate changes with an impact on the social level. According to the testimonies of the team responsible for writing the scripts, the soap opera addresses fundamental issues of peace consolidation, national identity and reconciliation, with the specific aim of changing behaviours and mentalities. Unfortunately, none of the episodes was yet produced.

## Testimonies

"By putting the different media on the same table, the project changed the paradigm of thinking. We started working in partnership. This was extremely innovative and had a great impact on our organisations" (António Nhaga, Ordem dos Jornalistas)

"After this project, I think journalists have more freedom. Now they know better the boundaries of their work, what they should do, what they can and cannot do. Knowing these limits gives freedom and freedom brings independence." (Demba Sanhá, RENARC

"As a journalist I have already been to seminars outside of Guinea Bissau. And in those seminars, I always felt behind other journalists in terms of knowledge, background, etc. Now, that I am attending the Journalism Professional Course I feel that I am becoming more prepared, at the level of professionals from other countries. This gives me a lot of confidence to do my job as journalist." Professional Journalism Course Student

### v. Sustainability

Main question – To what extent has the project, as designed and implemented, created what is likely to be a continuing impetus towards democratic development?

### Related question – Will the project results be able to be sustained?

The Project Team has made a notable effort to ensure project sustainability, focusing the whole intervention on it. The drafting of business plans and the trainings in media management are some practical examples. Nevertheless, the evaluation considers the implementation of the medium- and long-term financial sustainability strategy as the main threat to the sustainability of the project. The beneficiary groups expressed the desire to continue the project activities but expressed concern about the resources needed to continue the several initiatives.

The project design focused on the financial sustainability of the media institutions after the project closure, but this was partially achieved mainly due to external factors such as the political instability and the Covid-19 pandemic. One of the major solutions for this problem would be the approval of the draft law on a new public fund for financing media. Even though SINJOTECS continues its lobbying strategy, the adoption of the law depends exclusively on

the Nacional Assembly. In addition to that, there is a capacity gap to mobilise resources at the community level<sup>21</sup>.

The sustainability of the project's achievements depends on the partner organizations' capacity to implement the strategy and the tools designed together with the project team. A business plan was developed, using participatory approaches. Nevertheless, at the time that the evaluation exercise was conducted, the business plan was not being implemented. The local partners stated that the main reason was the COVID-19 restrictions, which was hindering the rental of the multimedia centre and materials. Moreover, sustainability relies also on the local partners' ability to find new sources of funding to ensure media autonomy. As such, they reach out to other donors to finance the Media Consortium, the Journalism School and more solar panels to the community radio, but until the present, there is no new projects insight.

The national partners stressed the need to support the Journalism School and the Media Consortium activities, at least in its first year, to ensure autonomy in the future. Although the student fees can provide some funds, the school director was concerned about the sustainability of the school. Despite there is a noticeable lack of confidence in their capacities, by national partners, to ensure the continuity of these new institutions, the evaluator considers that the foundations for ensuring the Journalism School and the Media Consortium sustainability have been laid and relevant strategies defined.

Despite the good performance of the Civil Society organization - Innovalab - supported to implement the first fact-checking website of the country, it is not producing any content since August 2020.

Bafata Women Radio is the only initiative that seems to escape this risk since it continues to be supported by an international organization (the NGO Solidary Journalists from Seville). The whole process of soap-opera writing training has enabled the establishment of a core of people capable of writing conflict resolution-oriented scripts. If there is financial sustainability, the conditions have been created to continue this work.

### vi. Cross-cutting issues

Based on the data collected and their analysis, the evaluation recognized that gender mainstreaming, environment and democracy are three cross-cutting thematic areas consistently approached by this project.

Gender equality, female leadership and women empowerment were considered in all outcomes, directly, through the following: i) Creating safe spaces in the existing media institutions where women can take the lead and express their voice (SINJOTECS and Bafata Women Radio); ii) inclusion of gender parity in the Journalists deontological code approved and signed by 23 media; iii) training of women journalists and media managers; parity in the project grants awarding; iv) scholarships for Journalism School for 5 girls from vulnerable social environments.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Recognised by the representant of RENARC.

The project budget was gender-sensitive. Initially, 33% of the total budget was foreseen for women empowerment. And 31% was effectively allocated to gender-related activities: 3 entrepreneurship grants to implement innovative ideas in media; 5 scholarships to study journalism; procurement of equipment and operating expenses for Bafata Women Radio; training activities for women journalists; and to organize the women journalists network congress.

The support gave to Women Radio Bafata in training, equipment and staff salaries, enabled this radio to become a national reference in the media sphere. Some of the most significant changes reported were: i) increased number of women journalists working on other community radio stations; ii) increased number of young women willing to study journalism; iii) increased in situations where women feel safe to speak in public (in radio programmes in which the public participates women are increasingly more participatory).



Picture 5 – Bafata Women Radio

The evaluation found strong evidence that the project contributed significantly to the empowerment of women journalists and, also to women's leadership in the media sector (see outcome 2 – effectiveness section). The election of the representative of the Union of Journalists' has been described as the first fair and democratic election, and it is also the first time that the Union is led by a woman. The Bafata Women Radio was considered by the main stakeholders as the most successful output of the project.

The project included targets for women participation, though the progress reports do not present disaggregated data by gender for some specific project outputs; for instance, the training activities, or participation in the national meetings. This would facilitate comprehensive monitoring of the gender impact at all project levels.

# WOMEN EMPOWERMENT

**Protoline Media Company** is a communication company, managed by a woman who had the dream of creating her own business. It was set up and legalized thanks to the project entrepreneurship and it has already signed contracts with other UN agencies and international organizations. (Protoline Comunicações & Eventos - Bissau, Guinea-Bissau | Facebook)

Monde Balde, President of the **Bafata Women Radio Association** : "In this community as soon as a girl gets her period the father says it's time to get married. To change this is very difficult, but with Radio Mulher Bafata we have been able to change some things, namely fighting early marriage".

Democracy was also a cross-cutting theme throughout the project. Local partners agreed that the decision-making process regarding the project activities always privileged justice and democracy. As examples: i) the election of SINJOTECS and RENARC representatives; ii) the drafting of the Consortium statues and the establishment of its board; iii) the development of the journalist course curriculum.

Finally, the project also contributed to sustainable environmental practices through the equipment of the community radios and televisions with solar panels, reducing the use of fossil source energy and the emissions of carbon to the atmosphere.

# III. Conclusions and recommendations

The main conclusions and recommendations observed by the evaluator can be summarised as follows:

Conclusions	Recommendations <sup>22</sup>
i. Relevance	
The project objectives addressed a real need to improve structural and financial conditions for journalists and media in Guinea-Bissau so they can play a central role in democratic processes, contributing to the country stability through responsible and conflict-sensitive reporting.	N/A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> For the Implementing Partners, if not otherwise mentioned.

The project responded to the need for building and strengthening the media associations and the journalist's capacities.	N/A
Existing conflict root causes, such as the linkage between journalists and political establishment, hate speeches or social volatility produced by journalist's behaviour, have been addressed by the project.	N/A
The project is aligned with the mandate and the strategic aims of the donor (PBF), the international implementing partners (UNIOGBIS AND UNDP) and the local implementing partners (SINJOTECS, RENARC, AD, OJGB, AMPROCS).	N/A.
The project outputs and activities were well designed and significantly contributed to the outcomes.	N/A.
In general, the Outcome indicators were not SMART and were difficult to achieve. Most targets were ambitious, and indicators only allowed an accurate measurement of the activities progress during the project's implementation.	(UNIOGBIS) Identify qualitative and quantitative SMART indicators to measure the impact, the outcome, and the outputs of the project.
Guinea-Bissau has a structural lack of available data, which hinders the establishment of baseline data.	
	and social situation of media institutions" to have quantitative baseline data.
In most cases, the risks were adequately identified during the project design. However, some mitigation measures established in the project document were not sufficient to relieve the impact of the risk. The project team identified additional risks which were not foreseen in the design phase. In these cases, mitigation measures were successfully implemented.	(UNIOGBIS) When designing project activities, conduct a participatory risk assessment that establishes their inherent risks and the risks' underlying reasons. Then, establish reliable risks' mitigation measures.

Despite targeting women's participation and empowerment, the project document only defined 1 gender-specific indicator, and the project reports did not nor present the data disaggregated by gender.	(UNIOGBIS) Include a gender mainstreaming approach on the project intervention. Identify gender-related indicators and targets and present disaggregated data in the reports.
ii. Effectiveness	
Overall, the expected results of all the Project outcomes were partially accomplished. The planned activities were implemented, some of it with a delay regarding what was planned, due to the political and sanitary contexts. New activities were added to respond to the pandemic and contributed to a range of results that far exceeded initial expectations.	(UNIOGBIS) Consider using a participatory approach in project designing phase, including political parties' representatives. It would promote project ownership and might mitigate the risks of jeopardising the results achieved due to Government changes.
Implementing partners and project beneficiaries recognised the importance and the added value of a legal framework to regulate the media sector. However, it is recognised the need for institutional mechanisms to monitor media compliance with the legislation. (Outcome 1)	<ul> <li>(National Partners) Establish partnerships with national organisations to monitor the actors' compliance with the laws and professional regulations. The Union of Journalists or a Civil Society Organisation (OSC) could play this oversight role.</li> <li>(PBF) In future Projects invest in building</li> </ul>
	OSC monitoring skills to control the implementation of the media legal framework.
The draft laws did not meet the specific expectations of the community media.	(UNDP/UNIOGBIS/ National Partners) Consider a lobbying strategy for the drafting of a specific law to regulate the community media sector.
One of the strong points of the project was the strengthening of the media associations network. It successfully enhanced the partnerships among media owners, strengthened their management skills and promoted relevant empowerment and cooperation (Outcome 2). Nevertheless, both implementing agencies and beneficiaries recognized that the cooperative work and synergies between the media institutions still need to be improved.	<ul> <li>(National Partners) Maintain cooperative work among media institutions. Start implementing the new business plan for the Media Consortium, in respect of the sanitarian safety rules.</li> <li>(PBF/UNDP) Capacity building in resource management skills and strengthening professional networks at the regional level should be improved in future projects</li> </ul>
The project contributed to boosting the Union of Journalists (SINJOTECS) and RENARC by	(RENARC) Consider organizing meetings using online platforms such as zoom or

holding its national meetings and the free and fair election of new representatives. Nevertheless, RENARC's representative stated that without project support, it is impossible to organize the national meetings, which costs around 5 million XOF.	Microsoft teams instead of organising in- site meetings. Costs of travelling, accommodation and food are much higher than the costs of providing internet packs and/or a tablet to each community radios to attend the meeting. The regular holding of these meetings would strengthen the network.
The project contributed significantly to women empowerment and leadership in the media sector (Outcome 2).	(PBF/UNDP/UNIOGBIS) Continue investing in women journalists training and in promoting safe spaces for women to express, such as the Bafata Women radio.
Important results were accomplished in Outcome 3 - the creation of the first professional journalism course in the country and, the construction of a fully equipped multimedia centre.	(National Partners) Use the resources and knowledge provided by the project to create a sustainability strategy. Implement the business plan designed and establish other partnerships to support the first years of Journalism Professional School.
The project stakeholders described significant limitations in journalists' capacities to write and report in the Portuguese language.	(CMICS) Consider introducing a a Portuguese as non-native language module (written and spoken) in the Journalism course curriculum.
The project substantially contributed to improving journalists' skills in different areas, such as media management and entrepreneurship, investigative journalism and fake news. Nevertheless, journalists reported that they lack role models and specific and practical training in their day to	(National Partners/UNIOGBIS) Establish media partnerships at the regional and international level to provide in-site training in newspaper, radio and television newsrooms, traineeships and exchanges programs.
specific and practical training in their day-to- day activities. Community Radio Journalists also lack specific training.	Lusa News Agency could be a good partner at this level, once it has similar exchange projects in Cape Vert.
iii. Efficiency	
Overall, the project's efficiency and cost- benefit ratio were highly satisfactory. The input-output relationship of the project components was efficient.	N/A
In general, the human and financial resources allocated to the project were suitable, except in the case of UNDP Procurement Unit human resources which was understaffed.	(PBF/UNDP) In the future, consider hiring a staff member who is exclusively responsible for PBF projects.

Some of the materials purchased by the project were not the best choice in terms of cost-benefit. For instance, the printer/photocopier installed in the multimedia centre and the newspaper printing machine.	(UNDP/UNIOGBIS/National Partners) When possible, purchase project material in the country. Even though costs would be higher, monitoring and maintenance could be done more effectively.
The project was led by a qualified team known for its expertise and experience in the project field.	N/A
Project inclusiveness and participatory approaches were promoted throughout the project in major decision-making processes. The involvement of local partners and civil society organisations were prioritised. Ownership was successfully promoted.	N/A
The project fostered partnerships with international organizations that improved the quality of the activities.	(UNDP/National Partners) Continue to invest in setting-up partnerships with international organizations and private sector. When possible, get them involved in the project design phase to facilitate collaboration during the implementation.
iv. Impact	
The project generated impact and positive effects at different levels (legal, institutional, and social). However, the Project Document lacked SMART impact indicators that enable to corroborate this assessment.	(UNIOGBIS) Include SMART indicators per Outcome that enable to measure the project impact. For instance: i) the number of regulatory texts approved by the media sector organizations and submitted to the government; ii) the financial savings resulting from partnerships made among media associations; iii) the number of new journalists hired by community radios; iv) the number of activities implemented by local media during the election period to promote democracy and multiple parties'
	inclusiveness.
The project improved the media legal framework, increased the media corporative solidarity and professional responsibility.	inclusiveness. (National Partners) Continue to implement the lobbying strategy for the approval of the remaining laws in the Parliament.

(SINJOTECS, RENARC, AD, OJGB, AMPROCS).	and after the capacity building activity, could be an option).
The project brought new institutions into the media sphere (the Media Innovation Consortium and the Journalists Professional School).	(National Partners) Use the Innovative Media Consortium as a common headquarters for its member organisations.
The project had a remarkable impact at the community level through the enhancing of radio broadcasting capacity.	(PBF) In future projects consider funding solar panels to other community radios.
The project has left important seeds that may contribute to conflict resolution and peace in a medium-term.	(PBF) In future projects, continue investing in activities to promote citizenship and change behaviour (such as radio and television programs).
Soap Opera scripts for forty-two episodes addressing fundamental issues of peace consolidation, national identity and reconciliation were written, but it was not produced.	(PBF/UN agencies) If possible, support the production of the soap opera.
v. Sustainability	
The implementation of the medium-term and long-term financial sustainability strategy, designed in the project document was partially achieved.	<ul> <li>(PBF) Consider funding a second phase of this project, with a focus on:</li> <li>Including a post project technical assistance to ensure the follow up of the project infrastructures sustainability.</li> <li>Support the lobbying strategy for the implementation of the media financial law, after approval.</li> <li>Enhance National Partners capacity development in resource management skills.</li> <li>Support the development of a specific legal framework for community media.</li> <li>Boost community radios with sustainable infrastructure and capacity building.</li> <li>Finance the Soap Opera production and transmission.</li> </ul>

	• Enhance journalists capacity trough supporting international exchange programs and internships.
The foundations for ensuring the Media Consortium and the Journalism school sustainability have been laid and relevant strategies defined.	<ul> <li>(CMICS) Local partners should take ownership and leadership in implementing sustainability strategies.</li> <li>Implement the drafted busines plan.</li> <li>Design a strategic plan for at least one year, focused on results and activities to be carried out to achieve those results.</li> <li>Establish Terms of Reference for each Consortium member and plan each member tasks.</li> </ul>
vi. Cross-cutting issues	
The evaluation recognized that gender mainstreaming, environment and democracy are three cross-cutting thematic areas consistently approached by this project.	(PBF) Continue to invest in women journalist's empowerment, specifically on topics such as women leadership in media institutions.

## IV. Lessons Learned

Based on this evaluation, the following key lessons learned from this project could be applied to future projects with a similar focus on institutional stabilisation of the media sector:

- For an objective assessment of the project impact, the results frameworks must contain baseline, indicators and target that are specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound (SMART) at all levels (activities, outputs, outcomes and impact).
- When the accomplishment of specific outcomes is contingent on the collaboration of an external party, such as the governmental authorities, it is essential to make additional efforts setting up partnerships from the onset of the Project. Incorporate different Political parties' representatives on the project design might decrease the risks related to government changes.
- Avoid planning an excessive number of activities. It makes the project more vulnerable to unforeseen external conditions.
- When establishing contracts with project beneficiaries clearly describe each part of their responsibility.
- Avoid disbursing funds before the beneficiary presents the expected deliverables.
- The local partners' self-assessment concluded that the project should have supported follow-up strategies for the Journalism School and Media Consortium first-year activities.

- Include in the project planning and activities the implementation of the sustainability strategies, such as business plans. For a tailor-made capacity-building intervention for the media sector players, it is important to have different approaches towards public/private media and community media.
- The international agencies and organizations should foster the journalists and media companies' behaviour change, and compliance with the deontological code. The international organisations must follow a code of conduct to regulate their relationship with the media (do not pay journalists *perdiem* for covering the organisations' activities is one example).
- Fact-checking on issues outside of country political agenda (such as Covid-19), proved to be a good strategy to create a change in mentality regarding the reporting of misinformation and the publication of research results. This type of intervention has great potential to contribute to citizen and journalists change behaviour.

# ANNEXE 1: PROJECT WORK PLAN AND BUDGET

Decilie	Development and the	A statute	2017	20	)18		201	.9	Responsible	Durlant description	Budget 2018	Budget 2019	TOTAL
Results	Baseline and targets	Activities	Q4	Q1 Q2	Q3	Q4 Q	1 Q2	Q3 Q4	partners	Budget description	·		
utcome 1: An improved and	universally applied legal fran	nework regulating the media sector and the journali								accountability as well	as a decrease of tens	ions between	
nedia professionals and state													
utput 1.1: Technical input to dr											10 000	0	10
ndicator 1.1.1: Licensing	Baseline 0	A 1.1.1: - Recruit consultant to draft the Statutes of	Х	ХX	χ	XX	X		UNIOGBIS		2 500		
ndicator 1.1.2: Statute of	Baseline 0	A 1.1.2: Recruit consultant to review the Statutes of	X	XX		X			UNIOGBIS	Staff Salaries	2 500		
ndicator 1.1.3: # of	Baseline 0	A 1.1.3: Organize - A forum of journalists, in				XX			UNIOGBIS		5 000		
Output 1.2: A lobbying strategy							<u> </u>				10 000		17
ndicator 1.2.1: Budget	Baseline: TBD	A 1.2.1: Recruit consultant in advocacy will be				XX	X				10 000		
Dutput 1.3: Key stakeholders are	e sensitized on the regulatory						1 1	_ [ _ ]			(	7 500	7
ndicator 1.3.1: # of	Baseline 0	A 1.3.1: Organize lobbying and public information						ХX				7 500	
Dutcome 2: Journalists, media	professionals, outlets and as	ssociations organize more effectively and exercise gre	eater profe	ssional	and e	econor	nic au	tonom	due to improve	d governance of the m	edia sector.		
)utput 2.1: Media owners and r	nanagers' come together in a f	forum to discuss the terms and goals of a new association	n								7 750	0	7
ndicator 2.1.1: Relationship	Baseline:TDB	A 2.1.1: Organization of a national meeting of all			Х		Y	хx		Contract	7 750		
		k elect representatives and improves upon self-sustaina	hility		۸		^	^ ^		CUILIACI	9 1 1 9	7	
			ionity	V			1 1						9
ndicator 2.2.1: Representatives		A 2.2.1: Organize Journalist's congress,( women		X X			+			Contract	9 098 8 327		
ndicator 2.2.2: Representatives Dutput 2.3: Independent Media		A 2.2.2: Organize national meeting of community		Ā						Contract			
											115 000		115
ndicator 2.3.1:Consortium	Baseline 2.3.1: 0	A 2.3.1: Form a working group gathering the above		X			Х				115 000		
	<u> </u>	for public service designed and implemented			- T						(		5
ndicator 2.4.1: Budget	Baseline 2.4.1: 0	A 2.4.1: The Media Consortium will design an										5 000	
llocation to media Sector	Target 2.4.1: 3	advocacy strategy, supported by a legal expert, to											
pproved by government		lobby MPs, in particular the parliamentary											
		commission on Human Rights and Fundamental				X	X	XX		Contract			
		freedoms, and to come up with a new draft law on a											
		financial scheme to support media public service to											
Output 2.5: Community radios e	guinned with color nanols	be approved in parliament and included in the state									05.000		
				<u> </u>	v	v   v		v v		Contract.	95 028		95
ndicator 2.5.1:Solar panels	Baseline 2.5.1: 0	A 2.5.1: Acquisition and installation of solar panels,			Х	XX	X	XX		Contract	95 028		
Dutput 2.6: Bafata Women's Rad							11				20 000		20
	Baseline 2.6.1: 0	A 2.6.1: Recruitment of trainers an mentors for the		XX	X	XXX	X	Х		Contract	20 000	)	
Dutcome 3: Established and yo	oung media professionals pro	oduce quality, impartial and conflict-sensitive conten	it.										
											2		
Dutput 3.1:Journalists and aspira	ants to the profession are train	ned on ethics and conflict-sensitive reporting as well as r	multi-media	a product	tion s	kills					85 000	300 000	385
ndicator 3.1.1: # of Journalist	Baseline: TBD	A 3.1.1: Recruit consultant to assist the Media		ХХ	χ	ХХ	Х	Х		Contract	25 000	)	
Dutput 3.2:AD Multimedia Centi	re equipped												
ndicator 3.2.1: Equipment	Baseline: TBD	A 3.2.1: Acquisition of essential equipment for			χ	ΧХ	Х			Contract, Supplies	60 000	)	
Output 3.3: Educational TV and r	adio series produced through	small grants program									(	150 000	150
ndicator 3.3.1:# of reports	Baseline: 0	A 3.3.1: The UN will launch a public competition -				X	X	XX		Contract		150 000	
		nd peace produced and broadcasted at national level										) 74 140	74
ndicator 3.4.1: # of episodes	Baseline: 0	A 3.4.1: Launch of public competition among				Y	X	XX		Contract		74 140	/4
Dutput 3.5: Establishment of a N				<u>.  </u>		^		<u> </u>			10 000		20
ndicator 3.5.1: # of prizes given	1	A 3.5.1: Transfer of funds to the journalist						X		Contract	10 000		20
nuicator 3.3.1. # or prizes given	Dascille. V	A 2.2.1. Italister of futius to the journalist						Λ		contract	10.000	TOTAL	749 16
												ISC 7%	749 10
												IJC 7/0	JZ

TOTAL 801 610

# ANNEXE 2: DETAILED OUTCOME-LEVEL TARGETS, BASELINES AND RESULTS FOR THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION PERIOD

Planned outcomes, targets and indicators	Grantee's Self-Assessment (achievement)	Evaluator assessment and comments
Outcome 1: An improved and universally applied legal framework regulating the media sector and the journalistic profession contributes to enhanced professionalism and accountability as well as a decrease of tensions between media professionals and state actors.	Overall assessment: ACHIEVED	Outcome Partially Achieved
Indicator 1.1.: Number of regulatory texts reviewed and approved Target 1: 3	Target 1.1 - Achievement: Achieved A study on the media sector legal framework was conducted. Two forums between journalists and government occurred. Three draft laws were written: draft law establishing a commission to issue press-card for journalists; draft law on a new public fund for financing media which respect the ethics code; draft law on online communication.	None of the three draft laws was approved during the project life cycle. The law establishing a commission to issue press-card for journalists was approved after the project closure. The remaining two laws are pending approval.
Indicator 1.1.1 - Licensing statutes of the Commission for Journalist revised, approved, published, and disseminated. Target 1.1.1 : 1	Target       1.1.1       -       Achievement:         Achieved	This target was not achieved during the project lifetime. Evaluation could document that lobbying strategy to achieve this output continued to be implemented after the end of the project.
Indicator 1.1.2 - Statute of National Council of Social Communication revised and harmonized with media laws. <u>Target 1.1.2:</u> 1	Target 1.1.2: Achievement: Achieved The Statutes of the Nacional Council for Social Communication (CNCS) were revised.	A fact-checking team was created during the elections. CNCS coordinated it. Nevertheless, the report with the fact-checking results never has been published by the beneficiary institution.
Indicator 1.1.3: Number of sensitizations discussions held to socialize the Code of Conduct with government and politicians and other relevant stakeholders. Target 1.1.3: -	<u>No target was set for indicator 1.1.3</u>	The Deontological Code for Journalists and the Conduct of Conduct to cover elections were approved and signed by 23 media.

Planned outcomes, targets and indicators	Grantee's Self-Assessment (achievement)	Evaluator assessment and comments
Indicator 1.2.1: Budget allocation to media Sector approved by the government.	<u>No target was set for indicator 1.2.1</u>	Lobbying campaign/strategy for adoption of the new regulatory framework was designed, and it has been successfully implemented
Target 1.2.1: -		
Indicator 1.3.1: Number of sensitizations discussions held to socialize the Code of Conduct with government and politicians and other relevant stakeholders. Target: 5	Target 1.3.1.: Achievement: Achieved The Union of Journalists started to implement the advocacy campaign and lobbying decision-makers strategy.	The inoperativeness of the Parliament caused limitations on the implementation of the lobbying campaign on the planned timeline.
Outcome 2: Journalists, media professionals, outlets and associations organize more effectively and exercise greater professional and economic autonomy due to improved governance of the media sector.	Overall assessments: ACHIEVED	Outcome Achieved
Indicator 2: Financial autonomy of the media sector strengthened	<u>No target was set for indicator</u>	The indicator established does not allow for specific outcome measuring.
Indicator 2.1.1: Relationship between media owners and media managers improves. Target 2.1.1: <i>TBD</i>	<u>No target was set for indicator</u>	Workshop in media management for 34 media owners; 30-days certified training in media management were conducted. 3 media entrepreneurship grants and coaching were offered to 3 women managers.
Indicator 2.2.1: Representatives elected in democratic elections.	Target 2.2.1 - Achievement: Achieved	100 persons attended the Union of Journalists National Meeting. The
Target: Democratic election	SINJOTECS and RENARC elected its representatives in free and fair elections.	president was elected with 57 votes. RENARC held its national meeting. 74 participants attended.
Indicator 2.3.1: Consortium Legalized.	Target 2.3.1 - Achievement: Achieved	Consortium Media Innovation of Social Communication is
Target: 1	Consortium Media Innovation of Social Communication was legalized and established. It is formed by 5 journalists associations: Union of Journalists, Community Radios Network, Women journalist association, Action for Development association and the Order of Journalists. A Business Plan was set to ensure auto-sustainability. First training for journalists was held in the Consortium multimedia centre.	successfully established. Statutes were drafted, and the governing body was selected. The business plan was set but not yet started to be implemented.

Planned outcomes, targets and indicators	Grantee's Self-Assessment (achievement)	Evaluator assessment and comments
Indicator 2.4.1: Budget allocation to media Sector approved by the government. Target: 3	Target 2.4.1 - Achievement: Partially <u>Achieved</u>	The law on a new financing model for the media sector was drafted and approved by the media class. But it is still pending approval by the National Assembly.
Indicator 2.5.1: Solar panels installed with security mechanisms. Target: 5 radios equipped	Target 2.5.1 - Achievement: Exceeded	5 Five community radios and 2 TV in remote areas equipped with solar panels (target exceeded).
Indicator 2.6.1: Women more confident to voice concerns on the radio. Target: 25 women	<u>Target 2.6.1 - Achievement: Exceeded</u>	Bafatá Women Radio operational with 10 staff (trained, equipped, salaries paid for 1 year and a half). 25 women trained in journalism. Great impact was achieved at this level, but no Smart indicators were correctly established to measure such impact.
Outcome 3: Established and young media professionals produce quality, impartial and conflict-sensitive content.	Overall assessments: PARTIALLY ACHIEVED	Outcome partially achieved
Indicator 3: Established media professionals and young people produce quality, impartial and conflict-sensitive content Target 3: -	<u>No target was set for indicator</u>	The indicator established does not allow for accurate outcome measuring.
Indicator 3.1.1: # of journalists and aspirants trained Target 3.1.1: 60.	Target 3.1.1- Achievement: Partially AchievedJournalism School equipped, teachers hired, curriculum defined for 2.5 years, and 40 students registered; Five women received scholarships to study journalism; 50 journalists from Bissau and regions trained on Conflict Prevention; 50 journalists trained on Law (July 2019), 30 students journalists trained on Migrations and Journalism; 15 journalists trained on a multimedia session. E-training on Coronavirus with experts on 4 topics (State of Emergency, Fake-news, Protection, Prevention)	The indicator does not specify the different training modules implemented in this output. Journalism School was built. The school has started its activities after project closure (in September 2020).
Indicator 3.2.1: Equipment purchased.	No target was set for output 3.2	Multimedia Centre was fully equipped with radio room, TV room, Pressroom, Library,

Planned outcomes, targets and indicators	Grantee's Self-Assessment (achievement)	Evaluator assessment and comments
Target: -		conference room. The multimedia centre has been used as a classroom for a group of 20 students due to the security measures to fight against Covid-19 imposed by the government. Newspaper printer arrived with technical problems that have not been solved yet. Car for mobile radio is in place, but legal documents are missing
Indicator 3.3.1: number of reports broadcast. Target: 25	One-week training on investigative journalism was conducted; 9 journalists received grants for investigative reports on taboo issues as well as personalized coaching from the International Consortium of Investigative Journalists (ICIJ). A Civil society organization (Innovalab) was supported to implement the first fact-checking website of the country, demystifying fake-news about Coronavirus.	8 investigative reports were published. One was published by an international newspaper; other report participated in the Ivory Coast film festival.
Indicator 3.4.1: number of TV and radio program focused on civic education and peace produced. Target: 64 episodes	25 young scriptwriters were trained in conflict resolution. Synopsis and 28 episodes written by the Writers Association of Guinea-Bissau showcasing effective conflict resolution on issues of national importance and promoting	42 episodes were written (28 under the contract signed with UNIOGBIS and 10 the association resources). A Portuguese scripter (Joao Nunes) produced a document attesting the quality of the soap opera scripts and recommending its production.

DAC criterion	<b>Evaluation Question</b>	Related sub-questions
Relevance:	Adequacy: Were the objectives of the project in line with the needs and priorities with the target beneficiaries? Alignment: Was the project clearly within stakeholders' mandate and congruent with their strategic framework? Design: Were the project activities/outputs adequate to make	Why was this project needed? How does this project address the identified conflict/ tensions factors in the countryHow does the project is aligned with the strategic guidelines and priorities of your organization?Were the outputs well designed to achieve the intended outcomes? Would you change
Effectiveness:	progress towards the project outcome? Were risks appropriately identified by the project?	any of these outputs? Was there any verified risk that was not initially foreseen?
Effectiveness:	Was the project, as implemented, able to achieve objectives and goals? Did the achievement of the outcomes result in peacebuilding change?	Was the project implemented as envisaged by the project document? (If not, why not?) Were the project activities adequate to make progress towards the project objectives?
Efficiency	<b>Governance (internal coordination):</b> To what extent was the management and administrative arrangements sufficient to ensure a cost-efficient and accountable implementation of the project?	How the decisions were made in the project (both substantive and administrative). What worked and what could be improved? To what extent has the project encouraged inclusiveness?
	Partnership and alliances (external coordination): to what extent has the project promoted ownership, alignment, harmonization, and mutual accountability among all relevant stakeholders?	How would you evaluate the level and quality of associativity among organizations and sectors between the project and other organizations working on this issue?
Impact	(Outcome 1) To what extent has the project contributed to the regulation of the media sector and the journalistic profession, enhancing the sector professionalism and accountability, as well as the decrease of tensions between media professionals and state actors?	Provide us with some examples that show that media actors are more empowered and have improved their skills?
	(Outcome 2) To what extent has the project contributed to a more effective organisation of journalists, media professionals, outlets, and associations and a greater professional and economic autonomy? (Outcome 3) To what extent has the project contributed to the production of quality, impartial and conflict-sensitive	How would you evaluate the project impact on the journalist's peacebuilding and conflict reporting skills? To what extent has the project caused changes and effects, positive and negative, foreseen and unforeseen, on democratization and on sustaining peace objectives?"
Containability	content by Established and young media professionals?	
Sustainability	To what extent has the project, as designed and implemented, created what is likely to be a continuing impetus towards democratic development?	Will the project results be able to be sustained?

# **ANNEXE 3: EVALUATION QUESTIONS**

#### **ANNEXE 4: DOCUMENTS REVIEWED**

### **Project Specific**

- PBF GB Media Project Project Document
- Project Document Annexe A Budget 2018
- PBF GB Media Project No Cost Extension New Project Document
- PBF Media Project Work Plan (2018 / 2019)
- Project Document Annexe D Budget 2019
- PBF GB Media Project Final Report November 2018
- PBF GB Media Project Semi-Annual Progress Report 2018
- PBF GB Media Project Semi-Annual Report 2019
- PBF GB Media Project Semi-Annual Financial Report 2019
- PBF GB Media Project Annual Narrative Report 2019
- PBF GB Media Project Annual Financial Report 2019
- PBF GB Media Project Financial Projection and Activities Planning
- PBF monthly meetings minutes (April March 2019)
- PBF GB Media Project Activities to Date

#### Materials published in the framework of the project

- Media Law in Guinea-Bissau, UNIOGBIS, Public Information Unit, 2018.
- *Journalists Training and Media Financing in Guinea-Bissau,* Final Report, Vasco Biague, 2019.
- *Training on Radio Methodologies for Bafata Women Radio,* Final Report, Azi Beifa, 2018.
- *Nobas Checker*, Final Report, Innovalab, 2020.
- <u>https://uniogbis.unmissions.org/en/community-radio-stations-guinea-bissau-</u> <u>convert-solar-energy-and-gain-more-broadcast-time</u>
- Children Talibe, a childhood without rights, https://www.publico.es/internacional/escuelas-coranicas-ninos-talibanes-infanciaderechos-investigacion-radio-hecha-mujeres-guineabissau.html?utm source=whatsapp&utm medium=social&utm campaign=web

#### Other sources

- Constitution of the Republic of Guinea-Bissau, in <u>https://www.stj.pt/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/guine constituicao.pdf</u>
- *Community radios and recreation processes of active citizenship in Guinea-Bissau,* Miguel de Barros and Fatima Tchuma Camara, Centre for International Studies of the University Institute of Lisbon (ISCTE-IUL), 2015.

- Media Laws Practical Guidelines, EU-PANNE, Guinea-Bissau's Media Capacity Building Program, 2016, in
- National Day on Gender Equality and Equity at the Media Sector in Guinea-Bissau, EU-PANNE - Support programme for non-state actors, IMVF, 2017.
- Online editorial regulation, Meeting of the Platform of the Portuguese Speaking Countries and Territories' Media Regulators, 25 October 2016, in https://www.plataforma-per.org
- *Partnership Framework Between Guinea-Bissau And The United Nations* 2016 2020, *April 2016, in <u>https://unsdg.un.org/un-in-action/guinea-bissau</u>.*
- *The media in Guinea-Bissau*, Tony Tcheka, Bissau 2015, in <u>https://www.imvf.org/wp-</u>content/uploads/2017/12/mediaguinebissau\_net.pdf
- The Media and Human Rights in Guinea-Bissau: the newspapers Nô Pintcha, Diário de Bissau and Gazeta de Notícias cases, Miguel de Barros, African Media Magazine, Vol. 20, N. 1 and 2, 2012.
- World Press Freedom Index 2020, NGO Reporters Without Borders, 2020, in
- Sun and sweat Soup Opera Scripts, analyses and recommendation, João Nunes, 2020
- *The Road to Results, Designing and Conducting Effective Development Evaluations,* Linda G. Imas, Ray Rist, The World Bank editions.

Name	Organization	Position
Face to Face and Ren	0	I USHION
Janet Murdock	PBF Secretariat	Peace and Development Specialist
Julia Alhinho	UNIOGBIS	Public Information Unit Coordinator
Sophie Pereira	UNIOGBIS	Project Manager
Esperance Alfama	UNDP	Assistant to the Deputy Representative
Jorge Handem	AD	Director of Journalism Professional
jerge manaem		School
Indira Balde	SINJOTECS	President
Demba Sanhá	RENARC	President
Pedro Vesnam	RENARC	Vice-President
Tomane Camara	AD/ CMICS	Board of Directors of CMICS
Antonio Nhaga	OJGB	President
Fatima Camara	AMPROCS	Vice-President
Abdulai Sila	AEGUI	Director
Edson Incopte	AEGUI	Member of the soap opera script team
Tchutcho Barbosa	Community Radio of Formosa	Director
Tenucito Burbosu	Island	Director
Braima	Community Radio of Cambadju	Director
Yannick Vieira	Journalism School	Professor
Djenane Pereira	Protoline	Entrepreneurship innovative projects
		grantee
Tarcila Gomes	Newspaper O Democrata	Entrepreneurship innovative projects
		grantee
Pedro Lucas	Newspaper Donos da Bola	Director
Lelito Quade	ENGIM	Trainer (Media Management)
Florença Yere	National Blogger	Training participant (Media
		Management)
Mariama Balde	Bafata Women Radio	Journalist/Student of Journalism P. School
Braima	Community Radio of Bafata	Director
Samba Muhamed	Newspaper Donos da Bola	Journalist (Investigative Journalism
		Grantee)
Laurena Carvalho	Newspaper Donos da Bola	Journalist (Investigative Journalism
		Grantee)
Diamantino Lopes	SINJOTECS	Journalist (Investigative Journalism
		Grantee)
Claudinecia Cabral	Inovalab	Fact checking Team
Mussa Balde	LUSA	Journalist
Malan Biai	RTP	Reporter of image
Carmelita Pires	National Assembly	Project Consultant
Micael Pereira	ICIJ	Project Consultant (Investigative
		Journalism Trainer and Coach)
Jorge Queta	Lobby Strategy Specialist	Consultant (Lobby strategy)
Vasco Biague	Law Specialist	Trainer (Law)
Monica Lenguer	Dortmund University	Trainer on Migrations (Consultant)
Johanna Mack	Dortmund University	Trainer on Migrations (Consultant)

## ANNEXE 5: LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED

Silvino Evora	University of Cape Vert	Project Consultant (Journalism
		Professional School : course curricula
		and manuals)
Sofia Branco	LUSA	Trainer on Fake News (Consultant)
Jose Bejarano	Periodistas Solidarios Sevilla	Bafata Woman Radio Supporter
Maximiana Balde		Citizen from Bafata
Fatumata Camara		Citizen from Bafata
Carla		Citizen from Bafata
Joao Pereira		Citizen from Cambadju
Focus Groups Partic	cipants	
Carla Mendes	Journalism Professional Course	Student
Vagner Barbosa	Journalism Professional Course	Student
Isac Cá	Journalism Professional Course	Student
Monde Balde	Bafata Women Radio Association	President
Lolita Cande	Bafata Women Radio	Radio Director
Rugui Balde	Bafata Women Radio	Journalist
Dejenabu Djalo	Bafata Women Radio	Journalist
Djenabu Djau	Bafata Women Radio	Journalist