

# MDG-F 1792 : Alliances for Culture Tourism (ACT) in Eastern Anatolia

## 1. Cover Page

**Country: TURKEY**

**UNDAF Outcome:** By 2010, social and economic policies for poverty and disparity reduction implemented effectively and quality basic social services reaching vulnerable groups ensured (Outcome 2, UNDAF-Turkey)

**Outcome of Joint Program (from UNDAF-Turkey):** Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by recognizing pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighboring countries

**Outcome Indicator (from UNDAF-Turkey)** Contribution to MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1- Percentage of population below the poverty line; Indicator 3- Income distribution by population, by gender (UNDAF, 2.1.2)

**Baseline:**

- Disparities between regions measured through inequalities in HDI between provinces of Eastern Anatolia and national averages (HDI, Kars: 0.644 and Turkey 0.742, year 2000, HDR and NHDR)
- Disparities in share of income between quintiles of income brackets: lowest 20%: 6; highest 20%: 48 (UNDAF, 2.1.2)

Joint Program Title: Alliances for Cultural Tourism (ACT) in Kars

Program Duration  
(Start/end dates): February 2008-March 2010

Fund Management Option(s): Pass Through

Managing or Administrative Agent: UNDP

Total estimated Program  
Budget: 3.784.600 USD

UN Organizations	National Partners
UNDP	<i>Ministry of Culture and Tourism Republic of Turkey</i>
UNESCO	
UN World Tourism Organization	<i>Ministry of Foreign Affairs Republic of Turkey</i>
UNICEF	

## 2. Executive Summary

The Joint Program will mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia region. It will result in a model of participatory governance model **for strategic direction, prioritization and coordination of cultural heritage protection and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions in general and** increased incomes for the people of Kars in particular where implementation will take place. As such the UN Joint Program will contribute to the realization of MDG-1 at a localized level by addressing Turkey's regional developmental disparities. In specific, the joint program will develop the cultural tourism sector in Kars contributing to social cohesion by recognizing pluralism and by reducing income disparities between the people of Kars and the rest of the country. The Joint Program will be geographically concentrated in the province of Kars in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia region and on the country's border with Georgia and Armenia. This region of Turkey is home to cultural and natural heritage. Kars, in particular, is home to the ancient city of Ani, which is one of the richest areas of medieval art and architecture. The Arpa River on the eastern and southern part of the ancient city of Ani separates Turkey and Armenia. Ani is culturally significant as the capital of Armenian Baghratid Kingdom. It was also home to Seljuk Turks, Sheddadids, Georgians and others who left their traces in this site throughout history. Mobilization of the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia region, and in specific in Kars, is significant in terms of establishing good models for Turkey and at the local level on management of tangible and intangible assets in a way which heeds the significance ascribed to such assets by multiple traditions and cultures and in a way which leverages them for sustainable local area development. The Joint Program is based on lessons learned from prior programming in Turkey and relies on national ownership and coordination as guiding implementation strategies. The proposed Joint Program will utilize the respective capacities of four UN agencies (UNDP, UNESCO, UNWTO and UNICEF) in coordination with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism of Turkey to implement the Joint Program based upon existent national strategies, including the Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013)<sup>1</sup>, the Government's Tourism and Strategy Action Plan of 2007-2013 and the 2023 Tourism Strategy in mobilizing cultural values as a complementary asset for promotion of tourism. The proposed Joint Program will ensure national ownership through the effective cohesion of program outputs with the institutional set up of management of cultural policy and cultural tourism in the country and of program targets with those of the relevant national authorities.

## 3. Situation Analysis

Provinces of Eastern Anatolia are the poorest in Turkey with human development (HDI) levels far below national averages. Policy options are limited for the people of the region to attain economic and social opportunities: "In the short and middle term, the important economic potential of the region appears to be in the commercial and tourism sectors...The region has highly valuable cultural assets that are little known in the world. Incentives in these areas have a high chance of success (for poverty reduction)" (UNDP-Turkey, 2006).

Kars is situated at the northern tip of the Eastern Anatolia region and lies in the heart of the South Caucasus at a strategic position of the Turkey's border, which intersects with Armenia, Georgia and Iran. It has an HDI value of 0.644 compared to the national average of 0.757.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://ekutup.dpt.gov.tr/plan/ix/9developmentplan.pdf>, paragraphs 636-642

Poverty rates in Kars are estimated to be around 30 percent (31 percent based on poverty certificates issued) compared to 17 percent for national averages.

Kars is home to the ancient city of Ani which is one of the richest areas of medieval art and architecture. The Arpa River on the eastern and southern part of the ancient city of Ani separates Turkey and Armenia. Ani is culturally significant as the once capital of the Armenian Bagratid Kingdom. It was also home to Seljuk Turks, Sheddadids, Georgians and others who left their traces in this site throughout history. The monuments standing in the city show the cross cultural exchange between different cultures. With Kars and Ani at its northern tip, a string of monuments and sites of multiple cultural and religious significance mark Eastern Anatolia. They include Mount Ararat, a site of significance shared by the three big monotheist religions, and Ishakpasa (<http://whc.unesco.org/en/tentativelists/state=tr>), a 17<sup>th</sup> century monument which is a unique mix of Anatolian, Iranian and North Mesopotamian architectural tradition and Van in the south. Turkey is committed to the highest standards of conservation and protection of these areas in line with the applicable conventions. However, national to local policy linkages are weak. Best practices in the governance of cultural heritage protection and promotion do not exist. Despite the availability of expertise, conservation and protection, site management and public use of cultural heritage in poor, remote areas such as Kars and Eastern Anatolia suffer from lack of effective implementation and from lack of good governance practices.

Tourism is a major economic force in Turkey. International arrivals amount to some 20 million per annum, generating receipts of over \$18,000m<sup>2</sup>, making Turkey the leading tourism destination in the southern Mediterranean. However, the vast bulk of this activity occurs in the west and south of the country, with receipts in north eastern Anatolia estimated at under 1% of the national total. Cultural tourism currently accounts for around 8-12% of incoming tourism in terms of motivation of visit, but it is anticipated that this market share may expand to around 20% or more in the next ten years. In Eastern Anatolia, cultural assets can provide a catalyst for this process, with sustainable tourism providing a link between them and poverty reduction. The challenge lies in linking the cultural and tourism potentials of this region to local economic growth and to ensure that these assets are leveraged in the national and regional development plans targeting the region.

Another challenge lies with strengthening social cohesion and pluralism in the cultural realm. Due to the human development challenges, the people of the Eastern Anatolia region have little opportunity to benefit from and to appreciate the wealth of cultures and traditions that surround them. The tangible vestiges of culture such as the Ani ruins cannot be appreciated in their own right but in relation to others and through an understanding of their interactions with their physical and non-physical environment, both natural and human. Such appreciation of tangible and intangible cultural assets that derive from plurality of traditions and cultures promotes cohesion between people of different cultures as called for in the UN Secretary-General's initiative for an **Alliance of Civilizations**, which aims to counter the forces that fuel polarization and extremism.

Collaborative efforts between the national and local authorities, the civil society and the private sector in Eastern Anatolia and in Kars are helpful for fostering this type of appreciation and will contribute to social cohesion, especially among young people, with regard to matters of

---

<sup>2</sup> 2005 figures, from UNWTO Tourism Facts

culture. The very good initiatives of local authorities and civil society in fostering this appreciation lack strategic outlook and suffer from lack of resources and expertise.

#### **4. Strategies including lessons learned and the proposed Joint Program**

##### **Background and Context**

Turkey is on track towards attaining the MDGs. Despite the country's remarkable economic progress, regional and gender based inequalities constrain the attainment of the MDGs in the country's East Anatolia region. In response, the UNCT in Turkey has included outcomes in Turkey's UNDAF 2006-2010 that address the reduction of regional disparities through social development. The proposed Joint Program will utilize the respective capacities of four UN agencies (UNDP, UNESCO, UNWTO and UNICEF) in coordination with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism of Turkey to implement the Joint Program based upon existent national strategies, including the Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013)<sup>3</sup> and the Government's Tourism and Strategy Action Plan of 2007-2013 and the 2023 Tourism Strategy in mobilizing cultural values as a complementary asset for promotion of tourism. The proposed Joint Program will ensure national ownership through the effective cohesion of program outputs with the institutional set up of management of cultural policy and cultural tourism in the country and of program targets with those of the relevant national authorities.

##### **The Proposed Joint Program**

The joint program will mobilize the culture sector in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia. It will result in increased incomes for the people of Kars contributing to the realization of MDG-1 at a localized level. In specific the joint program will develop the cultural tourism sector in Kars contributing to social cohesion by recognizing pluralism and by reducing income disparities between people of Kars and the rest of the country. This objective will be obtained through a set of mutually supportive Joint Program Results:

- A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding tangible and intangible heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions will be produced and implemented in Kars, resulting in a site and tourism development strategy which can be implemented in other provinces of the region, the success of which will be measured by a top quality site management plan for safeguarding heritage and the increase in number of tour operations featuring this heritage.
- Capacities of communities and enterprises in Kars will be increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism sector, measured by the number of economic enterprises (businesses and unions of business actors) benefiting from the growth of the culture and tourism sectors. Whether income generation is created will be best estimated and tested by the increase in the number of overnights in Kars that are attributable to the Joint Program.
- Local authorities and civil society in Kars and its environs and other relevant provinces will have the conceptual tools, the partnerships and the governance mechanisms in place to sustain and promote social cohesion and dialogue through recognizing of pluralism, measured ultimately by the number of civil society partnerships that feature these objectives that are attributable to the Joint Program.

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://ekutup.dpt.gov.tr/plan/ix/9developmentplan.pdf>, paragraphs 636-642

### **Lessons Learned and Strategies**

The key strategy for obtaining these results is national ownership and coordination with strong local participation and civic engagement. These strategies build on the lessons learned from previous programming in regional development, tourism and enterprise competitiveness promotion in Turkey's East and Southeast Anatolia regions.

Notable in this regards is UNDP's ongoing programs in Eastern Anatolia targeting tourism for local economic development. The Coruh Valley-Eastern Anatolia Rural Tourism Project implemented in cooperation with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism indicates that linkage of local level project inputs (such as support to local action planning, capacity development and training) need to be linked to national policy instruments and investment plans in order to generate impact in terms of poverty reduction and overall human development benefits. Furthermore, experience demonstrates that local authorities and civil society in the Eastern Anatolia region often have limited capacity for strategic direction and ensuring coherence among themselves as well as for bolstering civic engagement in order to obtain such coherence.

The Coruh Valley-Eastern Anatolia Rural Tourism Project and the proposed Joint Program in Kars-Eastern Anatolia will together form a model for the Government to effectively implement the Tourism Strategies (i.e. the 2023 Tourism Strategy and 2007-2013 Tourism Strategy and Action Plan)<sup>4</sup> in a way which can mainstream regional development disparities reduction objectives in the tourism sector at a national level. Benefiting from the experience of Coruh Valley, the proposed joint program will prioritize the following strategies for obtaining the above mentioned results:

**National Leadership and Coordination** - The UNCT experience in Turkey underlines that leadership from central ministerial units is required for local authorities to contribute to project results effectively. The leadership of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism for the joint program will be provided through **General Directorate of Foreign Affairs** of the Ministry which will ensure that the multiple central directorates of the Ministry provide the necessary inputs and guidance to joint program results. Although the partnerships of the program are interlinked in a mutually supportive manner, each UN agency has its primary partner within the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. Each of the agency outputs of the Joint Program are aligned to the mandates and plans of a particular unit within the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. In broad strokes, the UNESCO contributions to project objectives in promoting sound management of tangible heritage (Outputs 1.1 and 1.2) and identification and definition of intangible heritage (Output 3.1) are linked to the mandates of the **General Directorate of Cultural Heritage and Museums** and the **General Directorate of Research and Training**, respectively. Similarly, these UNESCO results bolster Turkey's action plans to operationalise follow up to UNESCO conventions on world heritage. The UNWTO contributions in underscoring Kars as a tourism destination within Eastern Anatolia and in promoting culture tourism for job creation are partnered to the **General Directorate of Investments and Enterprises** and to the **General Directorate of Promotion**, the latter being more with to foreign tourist attraction. Enterprise based support in the tourism sector is indexed to Turkey's increased emphasis on applying European Union competitiveness agendas in regional development planning and investments (Outputs 2.1 and 2.2). UNDP contributions (Output 3.2) to strengthening the local governance structures for cultural tourism management and social cohesion promotion are indexed to the reform policies of the Government of Turkey in strengthening local authorities

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.kulturturizm.gov.tr/genel/text/eng/TST2023.pdf>

and civil society. Similarly UNICEF's work with children (Output 3.3) is within the context of its partnership with the Social Services and Child Protection Agency (SHCEK), Ministry of National Education (MONE), Ministry of Interior (MoI), as well as Governorates of Kars and other provinces within their country program.

**Vertical Policy Coherence and Access to Resources-** Prior experience from local level initiatives for reduction of poverty in Turkey underscores the need to ensure that local level results are not isolated. Joint program results (Outputs 1.3 and 1.4) contribute to laying the ground work for investments in Kars as per the Tourism Strategy Action Plan of 2007-2013 and the "brand cities" initiative of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, where Kars is selected as one of the ten brand cities. This will ensure that the capacity development, local level support of the joint program in Kars is backed up with appropriate funding for conservation, promotion and tourism development investments. This is fully in line with the alignment to the Strategies as mentioned above and will provide opportunities for developing comprehensive policies for a selected region.

**Horizontal Operational Coherence-** National and international NGOs have all shown interest in Kars due to its unique cultural assets and developmental problems. However, there has also been fragmentation, diffusion of impact and duplication of efforts. In order to ensure operational coherence and maintain its local drive, the Joint Program will establish a presence in Kars within the context of supporting local governance structures (Output 3.2) and establish a project office staffed by at least two professionals. The Joint Program office will serve as "one stop shop" support to the increasing national and international civil society interest in the Kars area. The project office will also be the repository of Joint Program partners' activities, in terms of providing secretariat and information services to project partners and external project partners. The Joint Program Office in Kars will reflect the multi actor nature of the program and will be housed in a collaborative scheme involving the Governorate of Kars, the Municipality of Kars and the City Council (the latter being the civil society umbrella platform). Most significantly, the Joint Program will help coordinate the interests, energy and resources of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, its local directorates, the Governorate of Kars, Kars Municipality and the City Council and civil society in the delivery of cultural tourism. Coordination structures will be established between these interests, which will have a life beyond the project.

**Engagement of the Commercial Sectors-** An objective of income raising and poverty reduction through cultural tourism can only be met if visitor numbers and visitor spending are increased. The current level of tourism to Kars is very low. Almost all visitors to the Province will visit Ani, which receives only around 15,000 visitors per annum, half of which are from foreign countries. Many of these stay up to two hours in Ani only and do not overnight in Kars. Although there is potential to increase the number of staying visitors, this will take time. This challenge underlines the need to understand and to engage the market, through tour operators, media and in other ways, throughout the course of project. Similarly, as the experience from other programs show, quality accommodation facilities need to be built to create and address the market demand and increase overnights. In this context, it is critically important that the UN agencies collaborate also on promotion of other areas of economic activity such as commerce and trade, in order to increase the economic viability of this potential tourism destination.

**The United Nations** is the only entity which can provide the totality of services described above to the national partners of the project in a way which converges global standards and

norms encapsulated in the relevant UN conventions with the priorities, opportunities and constraints of the developmental and social milieu in Kars. As the politically neutral international partners of the Government, the UN organizations of the Joint Program are uniquely able to support the local authorities in planning and management of tangible and intangible heritage and provide advisory services to local and national civil society in priorities for conservation and safeguarding in line with international standards. The linkages between UN agency support to local and national authorities and civil society follows from this broad nature of support:

- UNDP and UNWTO will incorporate the results of UNESCO supported exercise of assistance with site management and public use planning at Ani in their work with regard to engaging the local community in interpretation, security and maintenance, guiding, and provision of catering, retailing and other services related to the site, as well as UNESCO's guidance and defining the intangible heritage of Kars.
- UNWTO will incorporate UNESCO recommendations with regard to site management and public use planning for the strategy and action plan which will be agreed to by national authorities within the context of the "Brand City" program of the Government for Kars, as well as UNESCO's recommendations with regard to access to intangible cultural heritage.
- The activities of this program are designed during the joint program preparation process, and the activities with regard to Kars are expected to be launched in May 2008. The activities planned in this framework are very much in line with the proposed program and the activities will be carried out in cooperation. UNWTO will also provide technical support as per the demand from the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (General Directorate of Investments and Enterprises)
- Similarly, the joint work of joint UN Agencies in provincial level planning of Kars province will provide a strategic framework for cultural tourism development building on the existing initiatives such as Restoration of Kars Fortress and tourism development, promotion of the tangible and intangible cultural heritage of the province through publications, establishment of City Museums and accommodation facilities, etc.
- UNDP will rest its local governance support including seed funding for local initiatives on the joint recommendations of UNESCO and UNWTO in content and strategy, respectively for generating destination attractions for Kars
- UNWTO will utilize inputs from UNESCO supported experts in the handicraft sector, including design elements, relating to production and retail sales to tourists.
- UNWTO will feed into UNDP supported delivery of enterprise support services, including enterprise clustering, supply chain development, business support, training delivery and indirect support to enhanced financial services to enterprises.

## 5. Results Framework

The Joint Program contributes to the achievement of MDG 1 (poverty reduction) in Kars and its environs through leveraging the cultural tourism sector in a way which fosters social cohesion and creates income opportunities for the poor. The Joint Program will create a developmental change at the level of MDGs, albeit confined to the province of Kars. The Joint Program result is thus the same as the UNDAF joint country outcome related to poverty reduction.

The results framework log frame contains the hierarchy of UNDAF outcome, the joint program outcome (which is derived from the relevant UNDAF outcome) and the three joint program outputs along with indicators and baselines (**Table 1**). The three joint program outputs are related to capacity development. In terms of sustainability all three outputs are supported by

governance and management structures that will have a life beyond the duration of the Joint Program. The three joint program outputs are:

- **A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars**
- **Capacities of communities and enterprises in Kars increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism sector**
- **Local authorities and civil society in Kars and its environs and other relevant provinces, promote social cohesion and dialogue through recognizing of pluralism**

Annual targets at the level of joint program outputs and the activities that will be carried out to reach those are presented in the **Annual Work Plans for Years 1 and 2** along with detailed list of activities. (**Annex A**)

The Program Monitoring and Evaluation Framework elaborates on the results framework by presenting means of verification and collection methods for indicators along with risks and assumptions associated with delivery of results. (**Table 2**)

**Annual reviews:** The implementing partners and the participating UN Organizations shall jointly conduct a planning meeting at the outset of the project in Month 1. A review meeting with relevance to all project outputs is scheduled for the final quarter of year 1. As Administrative Agent, UNDP will call the planning and review meetings together with the coordinating department of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Department of Foreign Relations and EU Coordination. The pertinent inputs required (including experts and organizational costs) of such planning and review is budgeted against UNDP outputs of the Joint Program. Revisions to the Annual Work Plan that may be required as a result of the planning and review meetings will reflect necessary adjustments made based on the lessons learned and new risks and assumptions as may be the case, as well as implementation progress achieved. Revisions to the Annual Work Plans will be approved in writing by the National Steering Committee.



**Table 1: Summary Results and Resources Framework**

<p><b>UNDAF Outcome 2:</b> By 2010, social and economic policies for poverty and disparity reduction implemented effectively and quality basic social services reaching vulnerable groups ensured. <i>(Outcome 2, UNDAF)</i></p>						
<p><b>Outcome of Joint Program (from UNDAF):</b> Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by fostering pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighboring countries</p> <p><b>Outcome Indicator (from UNDAF)</b> Contribution to MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1- Percentage of population below the poverty line; Indicator 3- Income distribution by population, by gender (UNDAF, 2.1.2)</p> <p><b>Baseline:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Disparities between regions measured through inequalities in HDI between provinces of Eastern Anatolia and national averages (HDI, Kars: 0.644 and Turkey 0.742, year 2000, HDR and NHDR)</li> <li>Disparities in share of income between quintiles of income brackets: lowest 20%: 6; highest 20%: 48 (UNDAF, 2.1.2)</li> </ul>						
Joint Program Outputs	SMART Outputs and Responsible UN Organization	Reference to Agency priority or Country Program	Implementing Partner	Indicative activities for each Output	Resource allocation and indicative time frame*	
					Y1	Y2
<p><b>1- A model for strategic direction, prioritization and coordination of cultural heritage protection and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars</b></p> <p><b>Indicators:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Qualitative improvement in management of the Ani site in Kars</li> </ul> <p><b>Baseline:</b> Site management plan not available</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increase in the number of tour operations</li> </ul>	<p>1.1 Policy for the protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars and environs developed and presented for adoption by national authorities <b>(UNESCO)</b></p>	<p><b>UNESCO Culture Sector Biennial Sectoral Policy 1 for 2008-2009:</b> Development of technical and managerial skills at the national level to safeguard and enhance cultural and natural sites (1972 World Heritage Convention)</p>	<p><b>UNESCO</b> with General Directorate of Cultural Assets and Museums. At local levels: Directorates of culture and museums in Kars, Governorate of Kars and Municipality of Kars.</p> <p>General Directorate of Investments and Enterprises in terms of Activity 5 inputting UNWTO outputs</p>	<p>1. Mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs</p> <p>2. Mapping of intangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and environs (Cross referenced to Output 3.1 for arrangements)</p> <p>3. Assessment of the institutional and regulatory frameworks (urban regulations, tangible heritage protection) in Kars and its province</p> <p>4. Identification of the urban and architectural needs for enhancement of the physical conditions in Kars and its province</p> <p>5. Recommendations for ensuring cultural assets protection and management in the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" program – linkage and input to UN WTO</p>	<p><b>180.000</b></p>	<p>-</p>

featuring Kars area <b>Baseline: 0</b>	1.2 Site and tourism management planning and implementation capacities of local and national managers of cultural assets in Eastern Anatolia, particularly World Heritage sites, developed <b>(UNESCO)</b>	<b>UNESCO Culture Sector Biennial Sectoral Policy 1 for 2008-2009:</b> Development of technical and managerial skills at the national level to safeguard and enhance cultural and natural sites (1972 World Heritage Convention)	<b>UNESCO</b> with General Directorate of Cultural Assets and Museum. At local levels: Governorate of Kars, Municipality of Kars and Divrigi	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Assessment of site management capacities focusing on institutional stakeholders of Divrigi and Ani</li> <li>2. Training Workshop in site management methodology with case studies focusing on Divrigi and Ani (25 participants duration 15 days)</li> <li>3. Technical assistance in establishing site management committees for Divrigi and Ani and launching their respective activities</li> <li>4. Technical assistance to the site management committees throughout the first year of existence</li> <li>5. Recommendations for ensuring site management planning priorities are incorporated in the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" program – linkage and input to UN WTO</li> </ol>	<b>91.500</b>	<b>144.500</b>
	1.3 A cultural tourism strategy and action plan agreed to by national authorities within the context of the "Brand City" program and the Tourism Strategy 2023 <b>(UNWTO)</b>	<b>UNWTO Development Assistance Mission:</b> Develop and promote the tourism industry as an engine for socio-economic growth and poverty alleviation through the creation of employment.	<b>UNWTO</b> with General Directorate of Investments and Enterprises. At local levels: Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality (linkage to UNESCO outputs)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Inventory of tourism facilities and services and assessment of tourism facility performance, quality, capacity and needs (cross reference Activity) in Kars Province</li> <li>2. Assessment of tourism potential of cultural tourism assets – tangible and intangible – based on UNESCO's identification and evaluation</li> <li>3. Assessment of institutional capacity of Governorate, Municipality and stakeholder structures in destination management, development and</li> </ol>	<b>170.400</b>	-

				<p>promotion</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Stakeholder consultation (tourism sector, civil society, others) on aspirations/options for tourism and preparation of development options</li> <li>5. Assessment of market profile, trends and opportunities – assessment of visitor monitoring</li> <li>6. Survey of international tour operators on current and potential interest in East Anatolia and Kars</li> <li>7. Meetings/workshop with Turkish (incoming) tour operators on above</li> <li>8. Conceptual positioning of Kars with respect to themes, circuits etc in East Anatolia – location/access assessment</li> <li>9. Kars brand – identity and visioning</li> <li>10. Preparation of draft – presentation, review, revision – leading to final strategy and action plan.</li> </ol>		
	1.4 New information delivery and marketing system established in Kars (UNWTO)	<p><b>UNWTO Development Assistance Mission:</b> Develop and promote the tourism industry as an engine for socio-economic growth and poverty alleviation through the creation of employment.</p>	<p>UNWTO with General Directorate of Promotion. At local levels: Kars Governorate, Kars Municipality. Partnership inter alia with TURSAB.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Relocated and improved tourist information centre in Kars</li> <li>2. Capacity building with Province staff and others on promotion and information delivery and support for improved information outlets and material</li> <li>3. Awareness training on cultural heritage and visit opportunities within tourism sector</li> <li>4. Improved linkage of Kars to E Anatolia promotion and itineraries</li> <li>5. Identification and promotion of itineraries/circuits within Kars Province and</li> </ol>	-	125.840

				surrounding area 6. Strengthened promotion of cultural events 7. Improved Kars website and linkages 8. Tour operator and media familiarization visits 9. Support for promotional campaigns		
<p><b>2- Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in the culture based tourism sector</b></p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <p>Number of sector analysis reports generated and distributed in Eastern Anatolia Region by end 2009, (UNDAF Indicator 2.1.6)</p> <p><b>Baseline:</b> 10</p> <p>Percentage increase in the number of arrivals and overnights to Kars  <b>Baseline (2006, arrival):</b> 27.000  <b>Baseline (2006, overnight):</b> 40.431</p>	2.1 Capacities of existing enterprises strengthened and community initiatives started ( <b>UNWTO</b> )	<p><b>UNWTO Development Assistance Mission:</b>          Develop and promote the tourism industry as an engine for socio-economic growth and poverty alleviation through the creation of employment.</p>	<p><b>UNWTO</b> with General Directorate of Investments and Enterprise and the private sector.</p>	1. Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers 2. Feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets 3. Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, women’s groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events 4. Study tours within Turkey and international 5. Specific focus on tourism/community enterprise delivery with respect to Ani site – guiding, handicrafts, retail, catering – including provision of space for this	<b>116.440</b>	<b>149.320</b>
	2.2 Systems for enterprise support and development established in line with applicable EU regional development and competitiveness strategies ( <b>UNDP</b> )	<p><b>UNDP Country Program Output 2.1.6, 2006-2010:</b>          Increased integration of SMEs in national and global value chains through entrepreneurship and business development services, clustering, use of appropriate technologies and vocational training.</p>	<p><b>UNDP</b> with General Directorate of Investments and Enterprise and the private sector.</p>	1. Based on UNWTO training and capacity assessments, draw up a plan of business development services provision for enterprise development in Kars and environs 2. Identify and address the capacity shortcomings of local institutions for non-financial and financial business development services 3. Identify women’s	<b>280.000</b>	<b>320.000</b>

				<p>entrepreneurship entry points and strategies for non-financial services for promoting women's entry into the cultural heritage industries</p> <p>4. Organize roundtables and fairs on commercial opportunities that are created around creative industries</p> <p>5. Undertake clustering of enterprise in tourism and wider sector in line with applicable EU competitiveness strategies</p> <p>6. Based on UNWTO assessment, design and fund small scale income-generation activities for the population of Ocakli village, next to Ani site</p>		
<p><b>3 - Local authorities and civil society in Kars and its environs and relevant provinces promote social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</b></p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Number of intangible cultural heritage practices registered from Kars, number of those carried by women</li> </ul> <p><b>Baseline:</b> 0</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increase in the</li> </ul>	<p>3.1 Capacities of local authorities, civil society and youth on the role of culture in building identity, social cohesion and dialogue built (UNESCO)</p>	<p><b>UNESCO Culture Sector: Biennial Sectoral Policy 2, 2008-2009:</b> Promoting social cohesion by fostering pluralism, the dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace; and, follow up to <b>1972 and 2003 UNESCO Conventions</b></p>	<p><b>UNESCO</b> with General Directorate of Research and Training, Municipality of Kars, Kars City Council and civil society</p>	<p>1. Translation in Turkish of the "World Heritage in Young Hands" Kit</p> <p>2. Training workshop for teachers</p> <p>3. Training workshop for school children</p> <p>4. Identification of the handicrafts sector in Kars and its environs</p> <p>5. Training course in crafts design and production</p> <p>6. Training course in marketing of handicrafts</p> <p>7. Technical assistance and support to mapping of intangible culture in Kars (budgeted under Output 1.1)</p> <p>8. Capacity building workshop to identify and define the Intangible Cultural Heritage of the Kars Province (2003 Convention)</p> <p>9. Technical assistance for the preparation of nomination files for inscription of Intangible</p>	<p><b>60.000</b></p>	<p><b>300.000</b></p>

<p>number of civil society-government partnerships in cultural heritage promotion, number of those supporting gender equality objectives</p> <p><b>Baseline: 1</b> Municipal Festival every two years</p>				<p>Cultural Heritage from the Kars' Province (2003 Convention).</p> <p>10.Round table of academics for promoting intercultural/inter religious dialogue</p> <p>11.Presentation of the results of Output 1 (Outcome 2) to the local authorities and civil society and establishment of joint recommendations and publication of proceedings</p>		
	<p>3.2. Local participatory governance structures enhanced to promote and manage social cohesion programs through fostering of pluralism (<i>UNDP</i>)</p>	<p><b>UNDP Country Program Output 2.1.7, 2006-2010:</b> Local level poverty initiatives with government and civil society to in Eastern Anatolia</p>	<p><b>UNDP</b> with Governorate of Kars, Municipality of Kars, City Council of Kars, and Kars Civil Society</p>	<p>1. Identify local and national stakeholders for a participatory governance structure to promote social cohesion and MDG goals</p> <p>2. Technical assistance and support to localized MDG target setting</p> <p>3. Technical assistance and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will provide secretariat for this governance structure (one stop shop-umbrella international presence in Kars)</p> <p>4. Seed funding provided to municipal and youth, women and children committees' proposals to organize festivals, events for visibility of Intangible and Tangible Cultural Heritage of the Kars region (based on mapping activities of UNESCO)</p> <p>5. Establish linkages and</p>	<p><b>395.000</b></p>	<p><b>577.000</b></p>

				platforms for interaction of practitioners from different sectors (e.g. tourism, agriculture, crafts) to identify shared solutions to shared problems with their counterparts other countries 6. Conduct ex ante and ex post values survey to gauge change in appreciation of the role of culture in building identity		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Number of children within six selected provinces knowing at least three ways of solving conflicts and able to explain cultural differences</li> </ul> <p>Baseline: none</p>	<p>3.3 Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of Kocaeli, Eskisehir, Kirsehir, Sivas, Erzurum and Kars .</p> <p><b>(UNICEF)</b></p>	<p><b>UNICEF Country Programme Output:</b></p> <p>1.1.1. Increased number of provinces with platforms of action for children</p> <p>3.1.1 Social policies on children rights developed</p> <p>3.1.4 Policy and decision makers, civil society, media, parents, adolescents and children's knowledge on children's rights increased</p>	<p><b>UNICEF</b> with Provincial Child Rights Committees, MoI Provincial Administration DG, SHCEK Ministry of Culture, Governorates, NGOs, Media</p>	<p>1. Children develop their own cultural and LSBE training and communication materials and conduct peer training within their respective six Child's Rights Committees</p> <p>2. with the support of local communities, three selected Child's Right Committees establish one Children Cultural Diversity Room within their provincial museum and conduct LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities (seminars, photo exhibitions handicraft etc).</p> <p>3. Child's Rights Committees within three provinces develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding</p> <p>4. Thirteen Child Rights committees travel on board of the "Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train" from Istanbul to Kars</p> <p>5. Kars Child's Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of</p>	<b>260.000</b>	<b>367.000</b>

				children from twelve other provinces and neighboring countries (Armenia, Georgia, Russia, Iran, Azerbaijan etc.).		
<b>Totals</b>					<b>1,553.24</b>	<b>1,983.66</b>



## 6. Management and Coordination Arrangements

The management and coordination arrangements will follow the guidelines of the Multi Donor Trust Fund Operational Guidance Note for the Participating UN Organizations (MDG-F, 2 October 2007). The UN Resident Coordinator is ultimately responsible to facilitate collaboration between participating UN Organizations to ensure that the Joint Program is on track and that the Joint Program results are being delivered.

By way of support to the UN Resident Coordinator's facilitation of collaboration between the participating UN Organizations, the UNDP will assist oversight and coordination among the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program, notably for UNESCO and UNWTO which are non-resident in Turkey. This UNDP support includes, among others, the staffing of Joint Program positions such as Program Manager and Site Manager as well as other support staff who will be providing services to all the UN agencies of the Joint Program. UNDP will however ensure that UNESCO and UNWTO are adequately represented in recruitment decisions and will ensure impartiality of management staff assigned to the project. Furthermore, Joint Program review, monitoring and evaluation missions will be hosted by UNDP. Finally, UNDP will provide support to the agency partners of the Joint Program by systematic dissemination of Joint Program objectives and strategies to stakeholders as well as sharing of lessons learned from community based pilot projects.

The Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MoCT) is the leading executing agency for the technical components of the program. The State Planning Organization (SPO), which is the purveyor of the national strategies to achieve MDGs in Turkey, will be responsible for overall coordination and execution of the policy related components. Other relevant agencies may be called in to support Joint Program results as needed and as per the recommendations of the MoCT to do so.

Each output of the Joint Program will be managed by a designated UN agency. UNDP will act as the Administrative Agent (AA) of the Joint Program and UNDP Turkey will support the executing agency in the overall coordination of the outputs and management of administrative, financial and procurement issues related to project implementation. However, each designated UN Agency will be solely responsible for the implementation of their respective activities.

The Joint Program is foreseen to have replication value for countries of the region of Turkey including in the Balkans and the Caucasus regions. International dissemination of project results will be conducted by the knowledge networks of the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program.

The National Steering Committee (NSC) is already established in Turkey within the context of MDG-F and other joint programs operating in Turkey. The NSC membership is small, consisting of non-implementing parties to allow for independence. The NSC includes a representative of the Turkish Government, a representative from the Government of Spain and the UN Resident Coordinator (RC). The RC and the representative from the Government co-chair the NSC, and may invite other NSC members from civil society and appropriate institutions. The NSC meets semiannually and makes decisions by consensus. The detailed composition and responsibilities of the NSC are presented in **Annex B**.

A Program Management Committee (PMC) will be established to provide operational coordination to the Joint Program. The PMC is composed of the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program and the **Department of Foreign Relations and EU Coordination of the Ministry of Culture**

**and Tourism.** The UN Resident Coordinator (RC) or his/her representative will chair the PMC. Other participating General Directorates of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, local authorities and private sector organizations will be invited to the PMC meetings as needed.

The PMC meets quarterly, but may have to meet more often depending on the need to address issues related directly to management and implementation of the program.

All participating UN Agencies of the Joint Program are responsible for:

- Ensuring professional and timely implementation of the activities and delivery of the reports and other outputs identified in this project document;
- Contracting and supervise qualified local and international experts; manage and be responsible of all financial administration, monitoring, reporting and procurement to realize the targets envisioned in the activities for which the respective UN agencies are responsible for;
- Carrying out all the necessary tasks and responsibilities to assist the UN Resident Coordinator;
- Appointing a responsible Joint Program Focal Point from its own agency (who is not paid from the project) who will co-manage the project on behalf of the relevant UN agency.

The Program Manager of the Joint Program, with appropriate support, will facilitate project implementation at the national level. He/she will update the Annual Work Plans, as necessary, and oversee the execution of activities, be responsible for technical and methodological issues, carry out any reporting functions required for monitoring and evaluation of the project, and coordinate with governmental institutions, universities, NGOs, private sector partners, and other relevant stakeholders which will be identified at the beginning of the project. During project execution, the functions of the Program Manager will be progressively integrated into the regular programs of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism to ensure sustainability. The Program Manager, although remunerated by UNDP, is a function that services all participating UN agencies and the Government part with equal due attention and managerial integration with each one of the UN agencies.

The program duration is 24 months. Therefore, the inception period of the project is limited essentially to the first month, during which the annual work plan for year 1 will be reviewed and the staffing plan will be prepared. Also during the inception phase (month 1-2), key Joint Program staff will be recruited. They include the Program Manager (Ankara), the Site Manager (Kars) and at least one support staff. Also during the inception phase the Joint Program premises in Kars and in the UN House will be set up and made functional.

In light of the Joint Program's strong alignment of mandates and programs of the departments of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, milestone implementation events will be scheduled together with the events of the Ministry. Notable in this context is the launch of the Brand City program of the Government in Kars in May 2008 (month 3 of the Joint Program).

Exit strategy is also linked to the programs and plans of the national counterparts of the program. During the final quarter of implementation, hand over of program results (such as plans, documentation) will be made to the governance structures in Kars and in Ankara that will have been supported by the Joint Program and that have a life beyond the duration of the Program. Notably, the contribution of the Joint Program to economic growth in Kars, measured through increase in overnights, and the model through which this has been achieved will be documented in project final reports for consideration for replication and up-scaling by the planning authorities of the State Planning Organization and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. At local levels, the

governance structures supported by the Joint Program, such as the municipality, civil society and City Council structures will be the target of the exit strategy.

#### **Cash Transfer Mechanism:**

UNESCO, UNWTO, UNICEF and UNDP are the implementation/execution partners for this Joint Program. UNDP and UNICEF are Ex-Com Agencies. Among the cash transfer mechanisms stated through Harmonized Approach to Cash Transfer (HACT), namely "Direct Cash Transfer to Implementing Partner", "Direct Payment to Vendors", "Reimbursement of Costs Advanced by Implementing Partner", "Direct Agency Implementation", UNDP shall opt for "Direct Payment to Vendors" or "Direct Agency Implementation" as appropriate.

Based on reviews and micro-assessment vis-à-vis the different units of the Ministry of Culture and local authorities with implementation responsibilities, different cash transfer approaches may be adopted during the course of implementation as needed.

## **7. Fund Management Arrangements**

The fund management arrangements will follow the guidelines of the MDG-F Operational Guidance Note for the Participating UN Organizations (MDG-F, 2 October 2007). The administration of the program follows the "Pass-Through" fund management option, in accordance with the planning and financial procedures as explained in the United Nations Development Group (UNDG) Guidance Note on Joint Programming. As per these guidelines, the arrangements for management, review and coordination should be documented, including the roles and responsibilities of the Administrative Agent (AA).

UNDP will act as AA for the Joint Program in accordance with the policy of 26 June 2007 on "Accountability when UNDP is acting as AA in UNDP Multi-Donor Trust Funds and/or UN Joint Programs". As per this policy, accountability for UNDP's AA function rests with the Executive Coordinator of the Millennium Development Trust Fund (MDTF) Office. However, specific tasks related to the Administrative Agent role can be performed by UNDP Resident Representative with explicit delegation and authorization from the Executive Coordinator of the MDTF Office.

The AA is responsible for:

- Disbursing approved resources to the participating UN organizations;
- Consolidating the Joint Program narrative report with financial reports from participating UN Organizations (including analysis of financial and narrative data);
- Providing narrative reports to the National Steering Committee;
- Providing the Consolidated Joint Program Progress Reports, and other reports as appropriate to the donor, i.e. the Fund Steering Committee through the Secretariat;
- Streamlining the reporting systems and harmonizing reporting formats based on joint programming best practices;
- Facilitating the work of the participating UN organizations to ensure adherence to a results based reporting structure around outcomes and outputs;
- Ensuring that fiduciary fund management requirements are adhered to

This notwithstanding, each participating UN Organization (PO) assumes complete programmatic and financial responsibility for the funds disbursed to it by the AA and can decide on the execution process with its partners and counterparts following the organization's own applicable regulations. Each PO establishes a separate ledger account for the receipt and administration of the funds

disbursed to it by the AA. POs are requested to provide certified financial reporting according to the budget template provided in the MDG-F Operational Guidance Note and are entitled to deduct their indirect costs on contributions received not exceeding 7 per cent of the Joint Program budget. Subsequent installments will be released in accordance with the Annual Work Plans approved by the National Steering Committee. The release of funds is subject to meeting a minimum commitment threshold of 70% of the previous fund release to the POs combined. If the 70% threshold is not met for the program as a whole, funds cannot be released to any organization, regardless of the individual organization's performance. On the other hand, the following year's advance can be requested at any point after the combined commitment against the current advance has exceeded 70% and the work plan requirements have been met. If the overall commitment of the program reaches 70% before the end of the 12 month period, the participating organizations may after the endorsement by the National Steering Committee, request the Millennium Development Trust Fund Office through the Resident Coordinator to release the next installment ahead of schedule.

## **8. Feasibility, risk management and sustainability of results**

The current level of tourism to Kars is very low. Almost all visitors to the Province will visit Ani, which receives only around 15,000 visitors per annum, half of which are from foreign countries. Many of these stay up to two hours in Ani only and do not overnight in Kars. Although there is potential to increase the number of staying visitors, this will take time, and the current low baseline suggests that targets for new job creation will be difficult to achieve. This challenge underlines the need to understand and to engage the market, through tour operators, media and in other ways, throughout the course of project. This approach will build the basis of the cultural tourism strategy and action plan prepared with the support of UNWTO and agreed by local/national partners.

### **Risks:**

Kars is a remote city in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia region. Enhancing the current level of tourism to this city requires the full fledged implementation of the large scale national plans including the Tourism Strategy of 2007-2013 and the "Brand City" programs. The political will, institutional support and maintaining the resource allocations from the Government to these programs is essential for project success. The Joint Program is designed in a way which is fully embedded in the national policies mentioned above. This is the strength of the Joint Program in that the institutional capacities and the governance structures it leaves behind will have a life time beyond the duration of the project. The same strength however poses the risk because the program objective of bringing the development levels of Kars province to national averages – through income generated in the cultural tourism sector- is fully contingent on the success of national policy.

On the political front, local elections are currently scheduled in early 2009, if early elections are called, they may be even sooner. This in turn implies that the current year and the first quarter of the second year of the Joint Program will be "election" years, with potential risks in terms of efforts of partisan interests to appropriate Joint Program successes. The prospects of elections may also lead to reluctance of some local actors to engage actively in project results because of their commitment (time and energy) to the elections. The Joint Program will overcome this risk by a strong local presence in Kars, led by a Site Manager remunerated from Joint Program funds. Furthermore, the Program will employ a clear communication strategy that marks the independence of the Program results from the partisan programs at local levels. In this context, as well, the high level of coherence between the Joint Program results and the national policy

instruments (e.g. the Tourism Strategy 2023 and Tourism Action Plan 2007-2013) will provide the grounding.

As mentioned above, Kars is a remote city in Turkey's Eastern Anatolia. Climatic conditions in winter tend to be severe and living conditions deteriorate. The climatic conditions and standard of living during winter in Kars have implications for the UN to maintain high quality staff in Kars for long periods. This risk will be managed by the Joint Program by prioritizing local recruitment in Kars.

## **9. Accountability, Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting**

The Multi Donor Trust Fund Office is ultimately responsible for the annual Consolidated Joint Program Progress Report which will consist of three parts: (1) Administrative Agenda Management Brief; (2) Narrative Joint Program Progress Report, submitted at end February of 2009 and 2010 by the Joint Program having been reviewed by the Program Management Committee; (3) Financial Progress Report at end March 2009 and 2010, prepared by each participating agency. Each participating agency is responsible for providing inputs into these three components of the Joint Program report. Each agency will be responsible also for completing the common format for reporting based on results-based annual program level reporting<sup>5</sup>. The Program Manager will have the overall responsibility for compiling these components for the ease of submission to the Multi Donor Trust Fund Office and ensuring that this annual reporting exercise based on the indicators and targets presented in the Program Monitoring Framework table below as well as the annual targets set forth in the AWP.

Project monitoring and evaluation will be conducted in accordance with established UN MDG-F operational procedures and provided by the PMC and the UNDP Country Office with support from the responsible agencies. The Program Monitoring Framework provides a summary of outcomes, outputs, activities, indicators, and means of verification to be performed by the project. These form the basis on which the project's monitoring and evaluation system will be built and will be further refined during the inception phase of the Joint Program.

The PMC, led by the Joint Program Manager, will be responsible for monitoring the progress of the activities in the Program Monitoring Framework and of overseeing the collection of information against indicators. These will be reported on annually to the National Steering Committee. These annual reports will include a collection of lessons learned, risks and a mitigation plan (adaptive management) for activities that are not on track.

Workshops held during the inception phase of the program will assist the PMC and relevant stakeholders to understand and take ownership of the program goals and objectives, as well as to finalize the project's first Annual Work Plan (AWP) on the basis of the framework. The Annual Review mechanism is also a key monitoring benchmark.

In addition, updates and program briefs will be made available to the Donor and partners of the Joint Program. A final evaluation, employing impact assessment methodologies, will be conducted.

---

<sup>5</sup> The [Standard Progress Report](#) used by the Ex-com agencies or any other reporting format used by any other agency may be adapted for the purpose. Donor requirements should also be kept in mind. The reporting format should be approved by the JP steering committee.

A Joint Program Inception Report will be prepared immediately following the inception workshops. The report will include: i) a detailed first year AWP divided in quarterly timeframes detailing the activities and progress indicators that will guide implementation during the first year of the program; ii) dates of specific field visits, support missions from the PMC or consultants; iii) the detailed budget for the first full year of implementation, prepared on the basis of the AWP; iv) time-frames for meetings of the PMC and NSC; v) monitoring and evaluation requirements to effectively measure performance during the targeted 12 month time-frame; vi) a more detailed narrative on the institutional roles, responsibilities, coordinating actions and feedback mechanisms of program partners; vii) progress to date on program establishment and start-up activities and; viii) an update of any changed external conditions that may effect program implementation. When finalized, the report will be circulated to program partners who will be given a period of one calendar month in which to respond with comments or queries.

Day-to-day monitoring of implementation progress will be the responsibility of the Joint Program Manager. The PM will inform the PMC of any delays or difficulties faced during implementation so that the appropriate support or corrective measures can be adopted in a timely fashion. Periodic monitoring of implementation progress will be undertaken by the PMC through quarterly meetings with the PM, or more frequently as deemed necessary. The PMC, as appropriate, will conduct at regular visits to Kars, based on an agreed upon schedule to be detailed in the Inception Report. Site visits of the PM will be documented and shared with the PMC members regularly.

As Administrative Agent, UNDP will procure the services of a qualified external consultant(s) who will review the Program Monitoring Framework. This will include reviewing the Program Monitoring Framework (specifically the indicators, and means of verification), imparting additional detail as needed, and on the basis of this exercise finalizing an AWP with precise and measurable performance indicators that are consistent with the expected outcomes for the project. The monitoring of the Joint Program is devised to follow the program performance and achievement of expected results, and provide external input. The Joint Program will also undergo a final evaluation to assess the achievement of results and impact of the program in view of the overall development objective and outcomes identified. The evaluative functions required for the Joint Program are split into two years to ensure that corrective evaluative knowledge can benefit the second year of program operations.

**Table 2: Program Monitoring Framework (PMF)**

Expected Results	Indicators	Means of verification	Collection methods	Responsibilities	Risks & assumptions
<b>Outcome</b>					
Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by	Contribution to MDG 1-Target 1, Indicator 1- Percentage of population below the poverty line; Indicator 3- Income distribution by population, by gender (UNDAF, 2.1.2) <b>Baseline:</b> Disparities between regions	Statistical Agency of Turkey and the Updated MDG Report; UNDAF evaluation; National Human Development Reports, HDI data disaggregated by province and by gender	Review and analysis of Human Development Data and of national statistical data basis	<b>UNDP</b> and Joint Program Manager to report on changes in income distribution and regional disparities.	The GDP per region data pertains to 2001. Updated household poverty surveys by region, province and gender will be available. The most important risk is localizing MDG targets for Kars. This will be

fostering pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighboring countries by 2010	measured through inequalities in HDI between provinces of Eastern Anatolia and national averages (HDI, Kars: 0.644 and Turkey 0.742, year 2000, HDR and NHDR) Disparities in share of income between quintiles of income brackets: lowest 20%: 6; highest 20%: 48 (UNDAF, 2.1.2)				overcome by assigning top level expertise and by deploying participatory processes for localized MDG target setting
<b>Outputs</b>					
<b>A model for strategic direction, prioritization and coordination of cultural heritage protection and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars</b>	Qualitative improvement in management of the Ani site in Kars by end 2009 <b>Baseline:</b> Site management plan not available	Ministry of Culture and Tourism reports to UNESCO	Reporting in final quarter of Joint Program	<u>UNESCO</u> : Joint review with the General Directorate of Cultural Assets and Museums	Ministry of Culture provides full account of the adoption of UN supported strategies and maintains political will around issues of site management.
	Increase in the number of tour operations featuring Kars area, by end 2009 <b>Baseline:</b> 0	TURSAB records and tour operator feedback.	TURSAB records publicly available.	<u>UNWTO</u> experts and Joint Program Manager review of TURSAB records and verification in consultation with local directorate of Tourism in Kars	None
<b>Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in the culture based tourism sector</b>	At least two sector analysis reports generated and distributed in Eastern Anatolia Region by end 2009, identifying how sectoral development will impact gender equality (UNDAF Indicator 2.1.6) <b>Baseline:</b> 10	Annual progress reports and verification with chambers of commerce in Kars.	Reports provided in end 2008 and 2009 and uploaded in UNDP Strategic Plan reporting system in ATLAS	<u>UNDP</u> and Joint Program Manager review of Annual Progress Reports	None
	Percentage increase in the number of arrivals and overnights to Kars <b>Baseline (2006, arrival):</b> 27,000 <b>Baseline (2006,</b>	Ministry of Culture and Tourism	MoCT statistics publicly available on the Internet	<u>UNWTO</u> experts and Joint Program Manager obtain records and check comparability and compatibility	Robust visitor registry mechanism in place, accuracy of data provided from local authorities are assumed. Media

	overnight): 40.431				scrutiny and visitor surveys will overcome such risks
<b>Local authorities and civil society in Kars and its environs and other relevant provinces promote social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</b>	At least one intangible cultural heritage practices presented from Kars, preferably one carried out by women. <b>Baseline:</b> 0	UNESCO cultural heritage inscription records	UNESCO contributions to Joint Program review	UNESCO experts and Joint Program Manager obtain records	None
	Increase in the number of civil society-government partnerships (at least 6 new partnership initiatives, 3 of which are focused on women or help gender equality) ) in cultural heritage promotion by end 2009 <b>Baseline:</b> 1 Municipal Festival every two years	Records kept of community meetings and Joint Program progress reports	Local civil society testimonials and reports.	UNDP experts and Joint Program Manager obtain information	None
	Number of children within six selected provinces knowing at least three ways of solving conflicts and able to explain cultural differences <b>Baseline:</b> none	Pre and post-training evaluations/questionnaires	Training evaluations	UNICEF experts and Joint Program Manager to obtain information	None

## 10. Ex Ante Assessment of Cross-cutting Issues

**Human Rights Based Approaches:** The UN in Turkey has conducted a set of analytical and prescriptive work with regard to linking human rights to the pursuit of Millennium Development Goals at local levels through local governance networks. A Turkish language toolkit, reflecting the legal, regulatory and institutional framework for applying human rights to civil society and municipal efforts to reduce poverty and to make the MDGs a reality in the lives of people has been published by UNDP and its partners in the Local Agenda 21 City Councils. UNDP's work throughout 2007 demonstrates that the concept and tools of human rights are not well known among local authorities and civil society, even in areas with much higher development levels than in Kars. Often civil society considers human rights to be controversial issue which should be kept apart from efforts in poverty reduction. Kars is home to a dynamic City Council. The UNDP will provide technical guidance to the City Council and Civil Society in Kars (Output 3.2) to ensure that the



international and national normative frameworks and legal tools strengthen the civil society-local government initiatives in the realm of promoting social cohesion and in contributing to target setting and realization within the context of MDG 1 in Kars.

**Gender Equality:** The UN Country Team in Turkey is implementing a UN Joint Program on gender equality. Kars is one of the six pilot programs of this Joint Gender Program where women have established priorities and an action plan for gender equality. Within the cultural heritage realm, the women of Kars have put forth a target in the Gender Equality Action Plan of the Governorate, Municipality and the Civil Society. As per this target, the Municipality is requested to make financial and technical support for women's groups to participate in cultural heritage protection. Consequently, the Joint Program at hand is supportive of this local action planning with regard to UNDP financial and technical assistance support to civil society-local government initiatives with gender equality objectives. Furthermore, the role of women in intangible cultural heritage transmission will be an important consideration in supporting efforts of local authorities and civil society towards inscription of such practices in line with the 2003 Convention on Safeguarding Intangible Heritage.

**Environmental Considerations:** As per applicable UNESCO guidelines for site management and public use planning, measures for protection of the natural habitat and the environment will be taken in the proposed strategies for Ani and Kars cultural tourism development by UNESCO and UNWTO. In addition, the geographical focus of the Joint Program is in Kars which is a unique habitat for biodiversity. In addition to Kars, the region is host to several micro-habitats. Most notable, in this context is the work supported by UNDP under its environmental portfolio in mapping and promoting this diversity through partnerships with Governorate, the Municipality and local civil society. The Joint Program will make particular emphasis especially in document intangible cultural heritage on linkages between biodiversity and natural conservation and traditions and cultural practices as well as ensure that the biodiversity concerns are well built into the site and public use plans of the Tourism strategies for Kars.

## **11. Legal Context or Basis of Relationship**

The cooperation or assistance agreements<sup>6</sup>, which are the legal basis for the relationships between the Government and each of the UN Organizations participating in this Joint Program, will apply. Each agency's activities under this Joint Program will be governed by their respective applicable basic and other agreements.

---

<sup>6</sup> Basic Cooperation Agreement for UNICEF; Standard Basic Assistance Agreement for UNDP,

## 12. Annex A-Annual Work Plans for Year 1 and Year 2

Work Plan for: Alliance for Cultural Tourism in Kars (ACT in Kars) Period: Y1

JP Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars									
Annual Targets Year 1	Activities	TIME FRAME				UN AGENCY	Responsible Party (detailed in TABLE A)	PLANNED BUDGET	
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4			Budget Description	Amount
Policy for the protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars presented for adoption by national authorities	Mapping of tangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and its environs	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT	Personnel (I)	25.000
	Mapping of intangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and environs (Cross referenced-refer to ... for arrangements)	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT	Personnel (N)	75.000
	Assessment of the institutional and regulatory frameworks (urban regulations, tangible heritage protection) in Kars and its province	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT	Contracts (I)	-
	Identification of the urban and architectural needs for enhancement of the physical conditions in Kars and its province	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT	Contracts (N)	40.000
	Recommendations for ensuring cultural assets protection and management in the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" program – linkage and input to UN WTO			X		UNESCO	MoCT	Training – Conf.	15.000
Training program for site management capacity development commenced.	Assessment of site management capacities focusing on institutional stakeholders of Divrigi and Ani		X			UNESCO	MoCT	Supplies	6000
	Preparation for and providing training workshop in site management methodology with case studies focusing on Divrigi and Ani (25 participants duration 15 days)			X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	Equipment	13.000
A cultural tourism strategy and action plan agreed to by national	Inventory of tourism facilities and services in Kars Province	X				UNWTO	MoCT	Travel	6000
	Assessment of tourism potential of cultural tourism assets – tangible and intangible – based on UNESCO's identification and evaluation	X				UNWTO	MoCT	Miscellaneous	180.000
								<b>Total</b>	<b>91.500</b>

authorities within the context of the "Brand City" program	Assessment of institutional capacity of Governorate, Municipality and stakeholder structures in destination management, development and promotion	X				UNWTO	MoCT	Training - Conf Supplies Equipment Travel Miscellaneous  Total	12.000 - - 15.000 3.000  <b>170.400</b>
	Assessment of tourism facility performance, quality and needs (cross referenced activity)	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Stakeholder consultation (tourism sector, civil society, others) on aspirations/options for tourism	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Assessment of market profile, trends and opportunities – assessment of visitor monitoring	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Survey of international tour operators on current and potential interest in East Anatolia and Kars		X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Meetings/workshop with Turkish (incoming) tour operators on above		X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Conceptual positioning of Kars with respect to themes, circuits etc in East Anatolia – location/access assessment		X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Kars brand – identity and visioning		X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Stakeholder workshop on options etc.		X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Preparation of draft – presentation, review, revision – leading to final strategy and action plan.			X		UNWTO	MoCT		
<b>JP Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism</b>									
Enterprise and community needs for income generation in tourism sector identified.	Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers		X	X	X	UNWTO	MoCT	Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Contracts (I) Contracts (N) Training (ST) Supplies Equipment Travel Miscellaneous Total	14.200 12.240 40.000 2.500 40.000 - - 3.750 3.750 <b>116.440</b>
	Initiation of feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets			X	X	UNWTO	MoCT		
	Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, womens groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events		X	X	X	UNWTO	MoCT		
	Study tours within Turkey and international				X	UNWTO	MoCT		
	Specific focus on tourism/community enterprise delivery with respect to Ani site – guiding, handicrafts, retail, catering – including provision of space for this.			X	X	UNWTO	MoCT		
Business development services strategy in place	Identify and design a communication and dissemination strategy for enterprise support activities in line with EU competitiveness agenda requirements for regional development	X	X	X		UNDP	MoCT	Personnel (I) Personnel (N) Contracts (I) Contracts (N) Training – Conf Supplies Equipment	40.000 100.000 20.000 30.000 10.000 10.000 15.000
	Identify and address the capacity shortcomings of local institutions for non-financial and financial business development services		X	X		UNDP	MoCT		

	Identify women's entrepreneurship entry points and strategies for non-financial services for promoting women's entry into the cultural heritage industries				X	UNDP	MoCT	Travel Monitor Mission Total	15.000 40.000 <u>280.000</u>
	Based on UNWTO training and capacity assessments and dissemination , draw up a plan of business development services provision for enterprise development in Kars and environs in line with EU competitiveness agenda				X	UNDP	MoCT		
	Organize roundtables and fairs on commercial opportunities that are created around creative industries			X	X	UNDP	MoCT		
	Based on UNWTO assessment, design small scale income-generation activities for the population of Ocakli village, next to Ani site			X	X	UNDP	MoCT		
<b>JP Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</b>									
2003 Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage follow up initiated in Kars and Eastern Anatolia	Capacity building workshop to identify and define the Intangible Cultural Heritage of the Kars Province (2003 Convention)	X		X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	Personnel (I)	10.000
	Mapping of intangible cultural heritage assets in Kars and environs (budgeted under output 1)	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT	Personnel (N)	10.000
	Technical assistance and support to mapping of intangible culture in Kars		X	X			MoCT	Contracts (I)	-
	Technical assistance for the preparation of nomination files for inscription of Intangible Cultural Heritage from the Kars' Province (2003 Convention).			X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	Contracts (N)	-
								Training	- 20.000
								Conf	5.000
								Supplies	-
								Equipment	-
								Travel	15.000
								Miscellaneous	-
								Total	<u>60.000</u>
The governance structure involving civil society, authorities and experts established in Ankara and Kars by end of year 1	Identify local and national stakeholders for a participatory governance structure to promote social cohesion and MDG goals	x	x	x	x	UNDP	MoCT	Personnel (I)	20.000
	Technical assistance and support to localized MDG target setting	x	x			UNDP	MoCT and SPO	Personnel (N)	200.000
	Dissemination of all project activities on behalf of non-resident other participating agencies in Kars and Ankara							Contracts (I-Monitor)	40.000
	Design of a communication and outreach strategy addressed at stakeholders based on site management and urban conservation priorities established by UNESCO						MoCT	Contracts (N)	30.000
	Organization of interim Monitoring and Evaluation Mission on behalf of the program, including drawing up of M and E criteria and strategies for joint program			X	X			Training	- 25.000
								Conf	20.000
								Supplies	-
								Equipment	-
								Travel	20.000
								Premises	40.000
								Total	<u>395.000</u>

	Technical assistance and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will provide secretariat for this governance structure (one stop shop-umbrella international presence in Kars)	x	x	X	X	UNDP	MoCT		
Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of Kocaeli, Eskisehir, Kirsehir, Sivas, Erzurum and Kars.	Children develop their own cultural and LSBE training and communication materials and conduct peer training within their respective three Child's Rights Committees	x	x	x	x	UNICEF	MOCT, SHCEK MOI MONE	Personnel (N) Contracts Travel Supply  Total	80.000
	With the support of local communities, two of the selected Child's Right Committees establish a Children Cultural Diversity Room within their provincial museum and conduct LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities (seminars, photo exhibitions handicraft etc)	x	x	x	X	UNICEF			125.000
	Child's Rights Committees in two provinces develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding	x	x	x	x	UNICEF			10.000
	Capacity Building among thirteen Child's Rights committees on cultural wealth, heritage etc. for preparation of the Friendship Train	x	x	x	x	UNICEF			45.000
<b>Total Planned Budget Year 1</b>									<b><u>260.000</u></b>
									<b>1.553.240</b>

**Work Plan for: Alliance for Cultural Tourism in Kars (ACT in Kars)**

**Period: Y2**

JP Output 1: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars									
Annual targets	Activities	TIME FRAME				UN AGENCY	RESPON-SIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET	
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q 4			Source of Funds Budget Description	Amount
Site management processes for Ani and Divrigi launched.	Technical assistance in establishing site management committees for Divrigi and Ani and launching their respective activities	X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT	<b>Personnel (I)</b> <b>Personnel (N)</b> <b>Contracts (I)</b> <b>Contracts (N)</b> <b>Training - Conf</b> <b>Supplies</b> <b>Equipment</b> <b>Travel</b> <b>Miscellaneous</b> <b>Total</b>	<b>35.000</b> <b>60.000</b> <b>-</b> <b>17.000</b> <b>5.000</b> <b>-</b> <b>20.000</b> <b>7.500</b> <b>144.500</b>
	Technical assistance to the site management committees throughout the first year of existence	X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT		
	Site management planning priorities are updated and feed into the cultural tourism strategy within the context of the "Brand City" program – linkage and input to UN WTO		X	X		UNESCO	MoCT		
New information delivery and marketing system established in Kars	Relocated and improved tourist information centre in Kars	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT	<b>Personnel (I)</b> <b>Personnel (N)</b> <b>Contracts (I)</b> <b>Contracts (N)</b> <b>Training - Conf</b> <b>Supplies</b> <b>Equipment</b> <b>Travel</b> <b>Miscellaneous</b> <b>Total</b>	
	Capacity building with Province staff and others on promotion and information delivery	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		<b>28.400</b> <b>27.200</b> <b>50.000</b> <b>5.000</b>
	Awareness training on cultural heritage and visit opportunities within tourism sector		X			UNWTO	MoCT		<b>-</b> <b>-</b> <b>-</b>
	Improved linkage of Kars to E Anatolia promotion and itineraries	X				UNWTO	MoCT		<b>-</b> <b>-</b> <b>8.000</b>
	Identification and promotion of itineraries/circuits within Kars Province and surrounding area	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		<b>7.240</b> <b>125.840</b>
	Strengthened promotion of cultural events	X	X	X		UNWTO	MoCT		
	Improved Kars website and linkages		X	X		UNWTO	MoCT		
	Tour operator and media familiarization visits			X	X	UNWTO	MoCT		
Support for promotional campaigns	X	X	X	X	UNWTO	MoCT			
JP Output 2: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism									
Community initiatives started for enterprise development in cultural tourism in Kars	Training needs assessment of existing tourism service providers	X				UNWTO	MoCT	<b>Personnel (I)</b> <b>Personnel (N)</b> <b>Contracts (I)</b> <b>Contracts (N)</b> <b>Training - Conf</b> <b>Supplies</b> <b>Equipment</b> <b>Travel</b> <b>Miscellaneous</b> <b>Total</b>	<b>42.600</b> <b>36.720</b> <b>40.000</b> <b>7.500</b> <b>9.000</b> <b>-</b> <b>-</b> <b>11.250</b> <b>2.250</b> <b>149.320</b>
	Training programmes designed based on above.	X				UNWTO	MoCT		
	Feasibility studies on tourism use of cultural assets – buildings, sites, other assets	X	X	X		UNWTO	MoCT		
	Work with identified communities and groups (rural communities, womens groups etc.) on identification of enterprise opportunities and capacity building needs – handicrafts, produce supply, accommodation, catering, retail, events	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		
	Study visits within Turkey and international.	X				UNWTO	MoCT		

	Specific focus on tourism/community enterprise delivery with respect to Ani site – guiding, handicrafts, retail, catering – including provision of space for this.	X	X			UNWTO	MoCT		
Culture tourism and wider sector enterprise cluster established	Provide business development services for enterprises in Kars and environs	X	X	X		UNDP	MoCT	<b>Personnel (I)</b> <b>Personnel (N)</b> <b>Contracts (I)</b> <b>Contracts (N)</b> <b>Training – Conf</b> <b>Supplies</b> <b>Equipment</b> <b>Travel</b> <b>Monitor Mission</b> <b>Total</b>	<b>30.000</b> <b>140.000</b> <b>20.000</b> <b>40.000</b> <b>10.000</b> <b>10.000</b> <b>15.000</b> <b>15.000</b> <b>40.000</b> <b><u>320.000</u></b>
	Organize roundtables and fairs on commercial opportunities that are created around creative industries		X			UNDP	MoCT		
	Technical assessment and sector analysis for establishment of a culture tourism cluster of enterprises	X	X			UNDP	MoCT		
	Build operational links between Kars cluster and others in Turkey through vertical and horizontal integration and document experience			X		UNDP	MoCT		
	Seed funding to small scale income-generation activities for the population of Ocakli village, next to Ani site and document experience	X	X		X	UNDP	MoCT		
<b>JP Output 3: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism</b>									
Awareness raising on diversity of Cultural Heritage, Empowerment in Cultural Industries and fostered intercultural dialogue	Translation in Turkish of the “World Heritage in Young Hands” Kit		x	X		UNESCO	MoCT	<b>Personnel (I)</b> <b>Personnel (N)</b> <b>Contracts (I)</b> <b>Contracts (N)</b> <b>Training – Conf</b> <b>Supplies</b> <b>Equipment</b> <b>Travel</b> <b>Miscellaneous</b> <b>Total</b>	<b>90.000</b> <b>56.000</b> <b>-</b> <b>=</b> <b>110.000</b> <b>15.000</b> <b>-</b> <b>25.000</b> <b>4.000</b> <b><u>300.000</u></b>
	Training workshop for teachers		X	X		UNESCO	MoCT		
	Training workshop for school children		X	X		UNESCO	MoCT		
	Identification of the handicrafts sector in Kars and its environs	X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT		
	Training course in crafts design and production	X	X	X	X	UNESCO	MoCT		
	Training course in marketing of handicrafts			X		UNESCO	MoCT		
	Preparation for and organization of round table of academics for promoting intercultural/inter religious dialogue	X	X	X		UNESCO	MoCT		
	Presentation of to the local authorities and civil society and establishment of joint recommendations and publication of proceedings			X	X	UNESCO	MoCT		
The governance structure involving civil society-government partnerships in cultural heritage promotion functional	Support the participatory local governance structure for promotion of social cohesion and dialogue in Kars	X	X			UNDP	MoCT	<b>Personnel (I)</b> <b>Personnel (N)</b> <b>Contracts (I-Mon)</b> <b>Contracts (N)</b> <b>Training – Conf</b> <b>Mon. Conf.</b> <b>Supplies</b> <b>Equipment</b> <b>Travel</b>  <b>Premises</b>  <b>Total</b>	<b>10.000</b> <b>200.000</b> <b>70.000</b> <b>200.000</b> <b>20.000</b> <b>15.000</b> <b>-</b> <b>5.000</b> <b>20.000</b>  <b>37.000</b>  <b><u>577.000</u></b>
	Technical assistance and support to civil society to monitor localized MDG targets and the contribution of the cultural tourism sector to these	X	X	X					
	Implementation of the communication and outreach strategy addressed at stakeholders	X	X	X			MoCT		
	Technical assistance, financial and coordination to support to national and international civil society initiatives in Kars through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and UN project office in Kars which will	X	X	X		UNDP	MoCT		

	provide secretariat for this governance structure (one stop shop-umbrella international presence in Kars)								
Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of Kocaeli, Eskisehir, Kirsehir, Sivas, Erzurum and Kars	Children develop their own cultural and LSBE training and communication materials and conduct peer training within three additional Child's Rights Committees adding up to a total of six committees	x	x	x	x	UNICEF	MOCT SHCEK MOI MONE	Personnel (N) Contracts Travel Supply Meetings  Total	80.000
	With the support of local communities, an additional Children Cultural Diversity Room is established by the Child's Right Committees within the third selected provincial museum and LSBE peer education sessions and cultural activities conducted (seminars, photo exhibitions handicraft etc)	x	x	x	x	UNICEF			125.000
	Child's Rights Committees in one province (third province in total) develop their respective project on cultural diversity and mutual understanding	x	x	x	X	UNICEF			17.000
	Thirteen Child Rights committees travel on board of the "Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train" from Istanbul to Kars	x	x	x	X	UNICEF			45.000
	Kars Child's Rights Committees organizes a cultural exchange and harmony fair in Kars with the participation of children from twelve other provinces and neighboring countries (Armenia, Georgia, Russia, Iran, Azerbaijan etc.)			x	x				100.000
<b>Total Planned Budget Year 2</b>									<b>367.000</b>
									<b>1.983.660</b>

Y1 UNDP	675	Y2 UNDP	897
Y1 UNESCO	320	Y2 UNESCO	456
Y1 UNWTO	286.84	Y2 UNWTO	275.16
Y1 UNICEF	260	Y2 UNICEF	367
TOTAL YEAR 1	1553.24	TOTAL YEAR 2	1983.66



## 13. Annex B: Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure for the National Steering Committee and Terms of Reference of Programme Management Committee

### *Part I: Terms of Reference - National Steering Committee*

#### 1. Introduction

The National Steering Committee in Turkey (the "NSC") is established to oversee and coordinate the operations of the MDGF 1680: Enhancing the Capacity of Turkey to Adapt to Climate Change in and MDGF 1792: Alliances for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia' in accordance with the Terms of Reference of the Fund.

#### 2. Role of the NSC

The NSC will have overall responsibility for Programme activities. It will provide strategic guidance and oversight and approve the Programme Document including subsequent revisions and Annual Work Plans and Budgets. The NSC will be co-chaired by the UN Resident Coordinator (RC) and a Government Representative. To the extent possible, the NSC will use existing coordination mechanisms in Turkey to undertake the process of planning and stakeholder consultation that the programme operations will require.

#### 3. Structure and Composition

- **Membership:** The members of the NSC will include:
  - A representative of the Government of Turkey as Co-chairperson: Mr. Nuri Duman, Under secretariat of State Planning Organization (SPO).
  - The United Nations Resident Coordinator (RC), as Co-chairperson: Mr. Mahmood A. Ayub, UN Resident Coordinator.
  - A local representative from Government of Spain: Ms. Maria Molina Alvarez de Toledo, Embassy of Kingdom of Spain.
- **Frequency of meetings:** The NSC will normally meet semi-annually. Additional meetings based on the requirements of the Programme may be convened exceptionally. The meetings will be convened by the Chairperson. For emergency issues the NSC may conduct its business electronically.
- **Agenda:** The agenda and supporting documentation will be prepared and disseminated by the Resident Coordinator's office. NSC members may make requests for items to be included on the agenda.
- **Quorum:** A quorum of the NSC will consist of all the committee members.
- **Observers:** Non-governmental, civil society and other organizations may be invited to participate in NSC meetings as observers, based on the following two primary criteria: (a) Involvement of the organization in projects financed or to be financed from the Programme; and (b) Impact of projects financed from the Joint Programme on the activities of the organisation. Decisions to invite observers or representatives of the relevant participating UN organisation will be made by the Co-chairs.

#### **4. Responsibilities of the NSC**

The primary responsibilities of the NSC will be to:

- Review and approve these Terms of Reference (TOR) and Rules of Procedure, based on the generic TOR, and amend them, as necessary, in consultation with the AA.
- Review and endorse the Programme Document and Annual Work Plan and Budget submitted by participating UN organisations; ensure their conformity with the requirements of the Fund and in particular decisions of the MDG-F Steering Committee; ensure the quality of programme documents to receive funding from the Fund. Minutes of meeting to be sent to MDG-F Secretariat with final programme submission.
- Discuss the Joint Programme requirements and priorities concerning, *inter alia*:
- programme management, including consistent and common approaches to project costing, cost recovery, implementation modalities, results-based reporting and impact assessment,
- information management, including appropriate Fund and donor visibility.
- Ensure that appropriate consultative processes take place with key stakeholders at the country level in order to avoid duplication or overlap between the Fund and other funding mechanisms.
- Approve the reporting mechanism for the programme.
- Review findings of the summary audit reports consolidated by the Administrative Agent; highlight lessons learned and periodically discuss follow-up by participating UN organisations on recommended actions with programme-wide impact.
- Approving the strategic direction for the implementation of the Joint Programme within the operational framework authorized by the MDG-F Steering Committee
- Approving the documented arrangements for management and coordination
- Approving the annual work plans and budgets as well as making necessary adjustments to attain the anticipated outcomes
- Reviewing the Consolidated Joint Programme Report from the Administrative Agent and provide strategic comments and decisions and communicate this to the Participating UN Organizations
- Suggesting corrective action to emerging strategic and implementation problems
- Creating synergies and seeking agreement on similar programmes and projects by other donors
- Approving the communication and public information plans prepared by the PMCs.

#### **5. Decisions**

The NSC should make decisions by consensus. The decisions of the NSC will be duly recorded. Prior to presenting a position on an issue to the NSC, the participating UN organisation will ensure that this is in line with their regulatory requirements. Any decision by the NSC which deviates from a previously endorsed position has to be referred back to the participating UN organisation for endorsement in order to be binding.

Decisions on programme documents, including revisions and Annual Workplans and Budgets will only be taken upon completion of a review by the Programme Management Committee (PMC).

#### **6. Support to the NSC**

The NSC will establish a support function, which reports to the Chairpersons of the NSC. The support function will facilitate the work of the NSC. The RC's office will provide the primary support to the NSC.

Under the direct supervision of the Chairpersons of the NSC, the NSC Support Office will be responsible for, *inter alia*:

- Periodically reviewing the Rules of Procedure of the NSC, and in consultation with the Co-chairs, recommend changes or revisions to the NSC.
- Liaising with the PMC on programme review and analysis.
- Calling and organising meetings of the NSC.
- Developing and circulating meeting agendas and minutes.
- Documenting, communicating and ensuring follow-up of the NSC's decisions particularly ensuring the submission – no later than one business day after the NSC meeting – of appropriately signed and complete documentation on approved programme related documents to the Administrative Agent (the UNDP Multi-Donor Trust Fund Office in New York).

## **7. Public Disclosure**

The NSC will ensure that decisions regarding programme approvals, periodic reports on the progress of implementation of the programme and associated external evaluations are made available for public information. Such reports and documents may include: records of decisions, summary sheets of approved Joint Programmes, annual financial and progress reports, summary of internal and external programmatic evaluation reports.

The NSC will take all reasonable steps to ensure the accuracy of such documents and that confidential materials are not disclosed.

The participating UN organisations will also take reasonable steps to ensure the accuracy of their postings on their respective websites regarding their programme operations and activities, in consultation with the NSC.

## **8. The Role and Accountability of the Resident Coordinator**

The Fund will rely on UN Resident Coordinator (RC) to facilitate cooperation between Participating UN Organizations to ensure that the programme is on track and that promised results are being delivered.

## ***Part II: Rules of Procedure - National Steering Committee***

### **1. Review of Strategy**

The NSC will review the progress of the Joint Programme to ensure coherence and collaboration with the Programme and other national programmes, maintaining close collaboration with national authorities to ensure flexible adaptation of MDG-F funded activities.

### **2. Funding release**

- Based on the approval of the NSC and the receipt of duly signed Submission Form and relevant Project Document, the Administrative Agent will transfer approved funds to the particular participating UN organisations, after ensuring consistency with programme document signed by the participating UN organizations.
- The first installment of funds will be transferred within three to four business days from receipt

of documentation from the NSC. Installments are annual and the first release will be made in accordance with the budget of year one.

- Subsequent installments will be in accordance with Annual Work Plans approved by the NSC. The release of funds is subject to meeting a minimum expenditure threshold of 70% of the previous fund release to the participating UN organisations combined.
- If the 70% expenditure threshold is not met funds will not be released to any agency, regardless of the threshold being met by an individual Participating UN Organization.
- If the overall expenditure of the programme reaches 70% before the end of the twelve-month period, the participating agencies may upon endorsement by the NSC request the MDTF Office to release the next installment ahead of schedule.

### **3. Reporting**

- In line with the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the Administrative Agent and participating UN organisations, the latter will submit, on an annual basis, financial and progress reports to the Administrative Agent. The Administrative Agent is responsible for consolidated reporting to the NSC at the country and the Fund Steering Committee at the global level, respectively.
- The PMC will sign off on the Narrative Joint Programme Progress Report before it is submitted to the Administrative Agent.
- The Office of the Resident Coordinator will ensure that the AA's Consolidated Joint Programme Progress Reports are distributed to NSC members and other relevant parties.
- Decisions and comments by the NSC will be shared with all stakeholders in order to ensure the full coordination and coherence of MDG-F efforts.
- The MDTF Office will issue an annual AA Management Brief for each programme, which contains analysis of fiduciary requirements and key management achievements and challenges as well as recommendations for improvements or corrective action as required. The assessment, takes into account latest policy direction from the Secretariat and Steering Committee; best practices observed throughout Fund activities; audit recommendations; MTR observations; and adherence to Rules and regulations. The AA Management Briefs will be written in English.
- At the Fund-wide level, the MDTF Office designs reporting systems and mechanisms to facilitate that fiduciary requirement can be met by the Participating UN Agencies. The MDTF office will provide the Consolidated Joint Programme Progress Report for each programme and other reports as appropriate to the Fund Steering Committee through the Secretariat.
- Participating UN Organizations will be encouraged to provide Quarterly Updates. The Quarterly Updates would be provided at the outcome level. The Quarterly Update is designed to satisfy basic information requirements to serve as a high level management tool for the Fund, while still being easy for the Country Teams to comply with. The MDTF Office will design and role out an online system to capture the Quarterly Updates.
- Consolidated annual reports should include a section on the activity of the NSC.
- Timeline for submission of reports is shown in the chart below.

Report Name	Coordinating Author /Consolidator	Approving Authority	Dead-Line (reporting period: 1 Jan - 31	Required Language
<b>Consolidated Joint Programme Progress Report</b> (including AA Management Brief, JP Narrative Report	MDTF Office	MDTF Executive Coordinator	31 May	AA Management Brief in English
<b>Narrative Joint Programme Report</b>	Participating UN Organizations jointly at Country Level	PMC	28 February	Working Language of CO/English
<b>Financial Progress Reports</b>	Participating UN Organizations HQ Level	Financial Officer/ Comptroller	31 March	English

### ***Part III: Terms of Reference – Programme Management Committee***

#### **1. Programme Management Committee**

A Program Management Committee (PMC) will be established to provide operational coordination to the Joint Program. The PMC is composed of the participating UN agencies of the Joint Program and the **Department of Foreign Relations and EU Coordination of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism**. The UN Resident Coordinator (RC) or his/her representative will chair the PMC. Other participating General Directorates of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, local authorities and private sector organizations will be invited to the PMC meetings as needed. Experts can be invited as observers to the PMC meetings when needed.

The PMC meets quarterly, but may have to meet more often depending on the need to address issues related directly to management and implementation of the program.

The responsibilities of the PMC will include:

- Ensuring operational coordination;
- Appointing a Programme Manager (based in Ankara), Site Manager (based in Kars) and a support staff as needed;
- Managing programme resources to achieve the outcomes and output defined in the programme;
- Aligning MDG-F funded activities with the UNDAF approved strategic priorities;
- Establishing programme baselines to enable sound monitoring and evaluation;
- Establishing adequate reporting mechanisms in the programme;
- Integrating work plans, budgets, reports and other programme related documents; and ensures that budget overlaps or gaps are addressed;
- Providing technical and substantive leadership regarding the activities envisaged in the Annual Work Plan and provides technical advice to the NSC;
- Establishing communication and public information plans;
- Makes recommendation on re-allocations and budget revisions to the NSC and the RC;
- Addresses emerging management and implementation problems; and
- Identifies emerging lessons learned.