Programme Title & Project Number	Country, Locality(s), Priority Area(s) / Strategic Results[2]
• Programme Title: "Institutional Strengthening Programme of the Board of Supreme Audit of Iraq'' • Programme Number: C9-18 • MPTF Office Project Reference Number:[3] 66948	*Country:* Iraq/ in all 18 Governorates *Priority area/ strategic results* Initially Cluster C: Governance and Human Development Post UNDAF: Governance and Human Rights Priority Area

Participating Organization(s)	Implementing Partners
• Organizations that have received direct funding from the MPTF Office under this programme UNDP- Iraq Office	• National counterparts and other International Organizations COUNTERPART ORGANISATION • Board of Supreme Audit of Iraq IMPLEMENTING PARTNERS • Audit Bureau of Egypt • Audit Bureau of Jordan • Court of Accounts of Tunisia • National Audit Office of the United Kingdom • Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India • World Bank • ILO and the UN International Staff College Turin

Programme/Project Cost (US$)		Programme Duration	
Total approved budget as per project document: MPTF /JP Contribution[4]:	USD 4,879,535.98	Overall Duration *49 months* Start Date[5]	7 Dec 2005
Agency Contribution		Original End Date[6]	7 Apr 2007
Government Contribution		Actual End date[7]	31 Dec 2009
		Have agency(ies) operationally closed the Programme in its(their) system?	X Yes ☐

---

[1] The term "programme" is used for programmes, joint programmes and projects.

[2] Strategic Results, as formulated in the Strategic UN Planning Framework (e.g. UNDAF) or project document;

[3] The MPTF Office Project Reference Number is the same number as the one on the Notification message. It is also referred to as "Project ID" on the project's factsheet page on the MPTF Office GATEWAY.

[4] The MPTF/JP Contribution is the amount transferred to the Participating UN Organizations – see MPTF Office GATEWAY

[5] The start date is the date of the first transfer of the funds from the MPTF Office as Administrative Agent. Transfer date is available on the MPTF Office GATEWAY

[6] As per approval of the original project document by the relevant decision-making body/Steering Committee.

[7] If there has been an extension, then the revised, approved end date should be reflected here. If there has been no extension approved, then the current end date is the same as the original end date. The end date is the same as the operational closure date which is when all activities for which a Participating Organization is responsible under an approved MPTF / JP have been completed. As per the MOU, agencies are to notify the MPTF Office when a programme completes its operational activities. Please see MPTF Office Closure Guidelines.

Other Contributions (donors)	Expected Financial Closure date[8]: December 2013
TOTAL: USD **4,879,535.98**	
Programme Assessment/Review/Mid-Term Eval.	**Report Submitted By**
Evaluation Completed **X Yes** ☐ No Date: *March-April.2010* Evaluation Report - Attached **Yes** X **Yes** ☐No Date: *10.06.2010*	o Name: Emad Alemamie o Title: Project Manager Anti-Corruption and BSA o Participating Organization (Lead): UNDP o Email address: emad.alemamie@undp.org

---

[8] Financial Closure requires the return of unspent balances and submission of the Certified Final Financial Statement and Report.

FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT

INSTITUTIONAL STRENGTHENING PROGRAMME
OF THE BOARD OF SUPREME AUDIT OF IRAQ

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

An external evaluation of four ITF governance projects including the *Institutional Strengthening Programme of the Board of Supreme Audit for Iraq* was conducted in 2010. The external evaluators rated the *Institutional Strengthening Programme of the Board of Supreme Audit for Iraq* at 90% and scored the project at 46 out of 51 potential points. The external evaluation stated that the project was considered well-conceived and as well-designed as possible under the circumstances. It was the only project evaluated that was noted as *performed well*. It had and continues to have the potential to stem fraud and corruption and is one of the three anti-corruption agencies in Iraq. Iraq became a signatory to the United Nations Convention against Corruption during the time of this project, in March 2008.

The project met the deliverables to train over 269 Board of Supreme Audit auditors in ten different fields of audit; draft a comprehensive training needs report and long-term institutional strengthening plan; draft audit guides, including a code of conduct and measures against fraud; and further an internal training and coordination secretariat.

The Board of Supreme Audit became increasingly active in assessing whether government ministries carry out government services according to annual plans, regulations and commitments. Previous to the project, government auditing was largely restricted to financial audits with performance audits 33% of all auditing projects. In order to more fully meets its watchdog obligations, the performance audits doubled and were nearing 75% at the end of the project. In 2009, 1300 audits of suspected fraud were forwarded to the Commission of Integrity and the Offices of Inspectors General for further investigation.

In the Open Budget Survey 2012, Iraq scored **Strong**, 67 points, within the good practice range for having a strong independent audit office. Page 40 the Open Budget Survey 2012 states "… the Middle East and North Africa region has the lowest average score (40) for auditor strength. In most countries in the region, SAIs enjoy some level of independence, on paper, in terms of which audits they may decide to undertake, but this is not enough to ensure that these institutions can effectively perform their oversight functions….Iraq and Yemen are the exception to the poor performance in this region, both receiving scores of 67 on SAI strength" (International Budget Partnership, 2013).

I. Purpose

The Outcome of the project was to promote good governance, honesty, transparency and accountability in the use and management of public resources by strengthening the capacity of the Board of Supreme Audit (BSA). The project contributed to Cluster C: Governance and Human Development and the Matrix Outcome: "Strengthening Institutional and Administrative Infrastructure" in the UN-Iraq Assistance Strategy Matrix. Over the lifecycle this project aimed to support the UN Assistance Strategy for Iraq's priority of "Public Sector reform and strengthening institutional/administrative infrastructure" by building the audit capabilities of the BSA, principally through training programmes for BSA auditors. The project achieved the UN Assistance Strategy's short-term objective "to restore the capacity of the Public Administration so that it can start operating according to updated methodologies in a more efficient,

transparent, decentralized and participatory manner". This project remains relevant to the UNDAF 2011-2014 within Priority 1: "Improved Governance, including the protection of human rights" and within the UNDP Country Programme 2011-2014 within Outcome 3 "Strengthened regulatory frameworks, institutions and processes in place for accountable, transparent and participatory governance at national and local levels. Additionally, this project contributes to the attainment of MDG Goal 8: Develop a Global Partner, particularly to Target 12: Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system (includes a commitment to good governance, development both nationally and internationally).

The Board of Supreme Audit (BSA) in Iraq is responsible for the independent financial monitoring of public and private institutions. The BSA has been in continuous existence since 1927 and has continued to work against considerable odds, but over the past two decades its competence was unable to keep up with the evolving techniques from other audit organizations in the region or globally.

The long-term 10-20 year outcomes of this project include better management of public funds; a reduction in the level of waste and corruption; and an inherent trust by the Iraqi citizen in its government. During the project persistent security threats and the continued risk of political and sectarian instability had the potential to place the outcomes in jeopardy. In a climate clouded by mismanagement and corruption, the upgrading of the BSA's skills was to give the Iraqi population increased confidence in those who manage the public purse and inspire a new generation of citizens to trust their Government. The strong support by the Board of Supreme Audit has led to the success of this project which has upgraded training and capacity of a large number of staff. The Board of Supreme Audit leadership pushed to exceed the minimum and resulted in all outputs being achieved with multiple outputs surpassing original targets.

- **Outcomes and Outputs of the Project**

Outcome 1: To promote good governance, honesty, transparency and accountability in the use and management of public resources by strengthening the capacity of the Board of Supreme Audit (BSA).

The project's outputs were:

1.1. To conduct and complete a Training Needs Assessment of the BSA;
1.2. To conduct research, from international experiences, on money laundering to develop future audit programmes;
1.3. To conduct off-the-shelf short-term courses around the Arab Region for 269 auditors in priority areas;
1.4. To conduct training of trainers workshops to develop the long-term training programme for 3 groups of 30 audit practitioners in the areas of: financial auditing and fraud detection; revenue and expenditure; computer auditing; and performance audit;
1.5. To conduct a workshop that aims to develop the capacities of 30 technicians in coordinating and supporting the introduction of the audit operations' computerization as well as BSA's administrative systems, and to develop a guide to this effect;
1.6. To develop and disseminate audit guidance on the training activities referred above and a code of conduct to BSA based on INTOSAI code of ethics;
1.7. To adapt and to disseminate BSA guide on fraud awareness and detection; and
1.8. To promote the sustainability of BSA Iraq's capacity reinforcement ensured.

II. Assessment of Programme Results

Outcome Results:

Outcome 1: To promote good governance, honesty, transparency and accountability in the use and management of public resources by strengthening the capacity of the Board of Supreme Audit (BSA).

This project realized the outcome as the capacity at the Board of Supreme Audit was strengthened at multiple output levels. UNDP supported the BSA to adopt and adhere to international auditing standards and promoted greater transparency and accountability. Both the National Development Strategy and the International Compact for Iraq identified the Board of Supreme Audit as an important subject for public sector reform, and specifically to "strengthen the BSA and decentralize its activities to the regions to ensure transparency in public financial management." This project upgraded the capability of BSA auditors and ensured that training was provided to auditors from the separate regions. "The independent investigations of the Board of Supreme Audit are essential in a state where government oversight is weak and where the delivery of public services is vulnerable to the misuse of public funds" (Freedman, 2010).

Three measurable outcome level results are identified:

- The Board of Supreme Audit became increasingly active since the initiation of the project in assessing whether government ministries carry out government services according to annual plans, regulations and commitments. Previous to the project, government auditing was largely restricted to financial audits, with performance audits 33% of all auditing projects. During the project period, in order to more fully meets its watchdog obligations, the performance audits doubled and were nearing 75% at the end of the project.

- In 2009, fraud was suspected in 1,300 audits which were forwarded to the Commission of Integrity and the Offices of Inspectors General for further investigation.

- In the Open Budget Survey 2012, Iraq scored *Strong,* 67 points, within the good practice range for having a strong independent audit office. "… the Middle East and North Africa region has the lowest average score (40) for auditor strength. In most countries in the region, SAIs enjoy some level of independence, on paper, in terms of which audits they may decide to undertake, but this is not enough to ensure that these institutions can effectively perform their oversight functions….Iraq and Yemen are the exception to the poor performance in this region, both receiving scores of 67 on SAI strength" (International Budget Partnership, 2013).

- *Output Results*

The project has achieved 100% of its planned outputs.

1.1. *To conduct and complete a Training Needs Assessment of the BSA*;
     a. A country-wide training needs assessment was completed.
1.2. *To conduct research, from international experiences, on money laundering to develop future audit programmes*;
     a. A study tour was organized for seven BSA members to Rome, Italy on 24-26 March 2009. This allowed BSA exposure to the system and methods used in Italy for the interception and investigation of "suspect" money-laundering activities and to explore the legal framework systems and procedures for safeguarding, auditing and control of public expenditures. The activities were implemented in cooperation with the International Labour Organisation in Turin, Italy.
1.3. *To conduct off-the-shelf short-term courses around the Arab Region for 269 auditors in priority areas:*

a. Ten courses were offered to 437 BSA auditors (206 female and 231 male) by international audit bodies.
   i. Translation Course:
   ii. Fraud Prevention and Detection Audit Course:
   iii. Financial Audit Course:
   iv. Procurement Audit Course:
   v. International Accounting and Auditing Standards Course:
   vi. Information Technology Audit Course:
   vii. Performance Audit Course:
   viii. Incomplete Records Audit Course:
   ix. Pilot Audit Courses (4)
b. The Board of Supreme Audit selected two type of trainees:
   i. One with less than five years of experience whose exposure would qualify them for basic audit exercises;
   ii. Second with 10 to 15 years of experience whose training would qualify them as trainers for other auditors.
   iii. Other
c. There are further descriptions within qualitative section.

1.4. *To conduct training of trainers workshops to develop the long-term training programme for 3 groups of 30 audit practitioners in the areas of: financial auditing and fraud detection; revenue and expenditure; computer auditing; and performance audit;*

a. During the course of the project the BSA seconded one staff member to work alongside the project manager to mentor, build capacity and increase sustainability within the BSA Training Secretariat.
b. A one month training-of-trainers course on financial audit was provided to 18 auditors provided by the Central Auditing Organisation in Cairo from 25 February-22 March 2007.
c. A one-week training-of-trainers training course in international accounting and auditing standards for eighteen (18) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, during 3-7 June 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom.
d. A two-week training-of-trainers course in fraud prevention and detection auditing for eighteen (18) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, from 21 October to 1 November 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the National Audit Office (NAO) of the United Kingdom
e. A four-week training-of-trainers module for eighteen (18) auditors regarding performance audit, was given in Tunis, Tunisia, from 4 August to 28 September 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the Court of Accounts of Tunisia.
f. A two-week training-of-trainers course in procurement audit for nineteen (19) auditors from the BSA and the Financial Monitoring Office was given in Turin, Italy, at the International Labour Organisation International Training Center. The course was implemented in cooperation with the World Bank while the course materials were prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the ILO International Training Centre and the Court of Accounts of Morocco.
g. This resulted in 91 auditors trained to train others for increased sustainability and self-sufficiency in offering training programmes.

1.5. *To conduct a workshop that aims to develop the capacities of 30 technicians in coordinating and supporting the introduction of the audit operations' computerization as well as BSA's administrative systems, and to develop a guide to this effect;*

a. A three-week training course on the Oracle Developer enterprise system for eighteen (18) information technology technicians from the BSA was conducted in Amman, Jordan, from 18 February to 8 March, 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by a private sector firm specialising training and in these types of systems

b. A four-week training course on the Oracle Developer (Advanced Level) enterprise system was delivered for five (5) information technology technicians from the BSA in Amman from 11 January to 10 February 2009.

c. A five-day meeting from 28 June to 2 July 2009 organized with a BSA team of 7 to discuss the implementation of Electronic Document Management System (EDMS) at the BSA Offices in Iraq. The meeting initiated the preparation of the vision document, a project implementation work plan and exchanged working processes

d. A four-month training session on the actual EDMS, which was concluded at the end of November 2009 in Amman. The training included analysis and design of the system required by the BSA. It also included piloting and testing the installed system.

e. This resulted in training of 30 BSA information technology technicians capacity developed. These trained technicians have begun to computerize audit records to better manage audit exercises and facilitate the transfer of audits to other public servants, especially members of the Council of Representatives.

1.6. *To develop and disseminate audit guidance on the training activities referred above and a code of conduct to BSA based on INTOSAI code of ethics;*
   a. Produced

1.7. *To adapt and to disseminate BSA guide on fraud awareness and detection*;
   a. Produced

1.8. *To promote sustainability of BSA Iraq's capacity reinforcement ensured.*
   a. Multiple actions were taken to promote sustainability including the mentoring of a member within the Training Section.
   b. Building a cadre of 91 experienced auditors who were trained to train others. The external evaluation in 2010 found that the training department was substantially strengthened and had increased the frequency and number of courses offered.

The project supported the development and delivery of ten training courses, held in different venues on a variety of audit-related issues designed to upgrade the skills of the BSA auditors. UNDP further supported the production of two guidelines, one on performance and finance auditing and the other on the detection of fraud. 437 trained audit personnel were trained and continue their practice inside the BSA, some as auditors and inspectors and some as trainers for other members of the audit organization.

Qualitative Assessment:

The project supported the development and delivery of ten training courses, held in different venues on a variety of audit-related issues designed to upgrade the skills of the BSA auditors. The initial target was to train 200 staff member which resulted in 437 auditors (206 female; 231 male) who continue their practice inside the BSA. The project also worked to strengthen the Training Unit through training of trainer courses and exceeded the target of 30 to a cadre of 91 auditors. Additionally, the project assisted to train, develop and pilot an electronic system inside the BSA. UNDP further supported the production of two guidelines, one on performance and finance auditing and the other on the detection of fraud. The project was externally evaluated in 2010 which resulted in a total score of 90% within five areas of review.

- *Training*

Fraud Prevention and Detection Audit Course:
   o A two-week technical training course on fraud prevention and detection audit for twenty-seven (27) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, from 19 February to 1 March 2007. The course

was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom.

Financial Audit Course:
- o A two-week technical training course in financial audit for twenty-six (26) auditors from the BSA was given in Cairo, Egypt, from 25 February to 8 March 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the Central Auditing Organisation of Egypt.

Procurement Audit Course:
- o A two-week technical training course in procurement audit for twenty-eight (28) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, during 9-19 April 2007. The course was implemented in cooperation with the World Bank, while the course material was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the International Labour Organisation-International Training Centre and the Court of Accounts of Morocco.

International Accounting and Auditing Standards Course:
- o A two-week technical training course in international accounting and auditing standards for thirty-nine (39) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, during 16-26 April 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom.

Information Technology Audit Course:
- o A training course in information technology audit for twenty-four (24) auditors from the BSA was given in Noida, India, during 11-30 June 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

Performance Audit Course:
- o A two-week technical training course in performance auditing for twenty-nine (29) auditors from the BSA, was given in Tunis, Tunisia, from 20 August to 3 September 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the Court of Accounts of Tunisia.

Incomplete Records Audit Training Course:
- o A two-week training course in "Incomplete Records Auditing" for twenty-four (24) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, from 30 October to 9 November 2007. Audit and training experts from the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom prepared and delivered the course. The course provided auditors with improved skills in the basics of financial auditing and auditing in an environment of incomplete records.

Institutional Fraud Awareness Workshop:
- o A four-day institutional fraud awareness workshop was delivered to eighteen (18) managers and directors of the BSA in Amman, Jordan, during 11-16 December 2007. The workshop covered the role of the supreme audit institution in a country's overall accountability and transparency framework, the institution's relationship with other government entities, civil society and the public, and covered a practical case of fraud detection.

Translation Course:
- o An eight-week translation course for the Board of Supreme Translator / Auditors was delivered in cooperation with London Metropolitan University from 19 January to 13 March 2009.Twenty-three (23) translators from the BSA participated in this course. The course aimed at improving the skills of translators in the field of written translation and grammar, in addition to others technical skills (i.e. the use of modern translation equipment).

Money Laundering Study Tour:
- o A three-day study tour was organized for seven (7) BSA members to Rome on 24-26 March 2009.It also allowed BSA exposure to the system and methods used in Italy for the interception and investigation of 'suspect' money-laundering activities and to explore the legal framework systems and procedures for safeguarding, auditing and control of public expenditures. The activities were implemented in cooperation with the International Labour Organisation in Turin, Italy.

- *Training of Trainers*

Financial Audit Course TOT:
- o The training-of-trainer financial audit module was provided for eighteen (18) auditors from the BSA by the Central Auditing Organisation in Cairo from 25 February to 22 March 2007 in parallel to course.

International Accounting and Auditing Standards Course TOT:
- o A one-week training-of-trainers course in international accounting and auditing standards for eighteen (18) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, during 3-7 June 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom

Performance Audit Course TOT:
- o Immediately following the technical training on Performance Audit a four-week training-of-trainers module for eighteen (18) auditors was given in Tunis, Tunisia, from 4-28 September 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the Court of Accounts of Tunisia.

Fraud Prevention and Detection Audit Course TOT:
- o A two-week training-of-trainers course in fraud prevention and detection auditing for eighteen (18) auditors from the BSA was given in Amman, Jordan, from 21 October to 1 November 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the National Audit Office (NAO) of the United Kingdom.

Procurement Audit Course TOT:
- o A two-week training-of-trainers course in procurement audit for nineteen (19) auditors from the BSA and the Financial Monitoring Office (OFM) was given in Turin, Italy, at the International Labour Organisation-International Training Center. The course was implemented in cooperation with the World Bank while the course material was prepared and delivered by audit and training experts from the International Labour Organisation-International Training Centre and the Court of Accounts of Morocco.

- *Electronic Data Management*

Oracle Developer Training Course:
- o A three-week training course on the Oracle Developer enterprise system for eighteen (18) information technology technicians from the BSA was conducted in Amman, Jordan, from 18 February to 8 March, 2007. The course was prepared and delivered by a private sector firm specialising training and in these types of systems.

Oracle Developer Training Course II/Advanced Level:
- o A four-week training course on the Oracle Developer (Advanced Level) enterprise system was delivered for five (5) information technology technicians from the BSA in Amman from 11 January to 10 February 2009.

Stakeholder Meeting on Electronic Document Management System:
- o A five-day meeting from 28 June to 2 July 2009 was organized to discuss the implementation of Electronic Document Management System (EDMS) at the BSA Office. The meeting initiated the preparation of the vision document, a project implementation work plan and exchanged working processes between them.
- o This was followed by a four-month training session on the actual EDMS, which was concluded at the end of November 2009 in Amman, Jordan. The training included analysis and design of the system required by the BSA. It also included piloting and testing the installed system.

- • *BSA Structure*

Development of an Institutional Strengthening Plan:
- o The institutional strengthening plan was finalised the end of 2006. During 1st Quarter 2007, the team reassembled and used the plan as the basis for developing a project document and funding request for the second phase of the programme.

Training of a Staff Member of the BSA's Training Secretariat:
- o In December 2006, the BSA seconded one of its staff members to UNDP-Iraq. This staff member worked alongside UNDP-Iraq's Project Manager as part of a planned project activity whereby the BSA's institutional capacities were strengthened through on-the-job training.

Institutional Strengthening Committee Meeting
- o A two-day meeting was held on 9-10 December 2007 with representatives of the BSA, UNDP-Iraq, the World Bank, the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom, the Central Audit Organisation of Egypt, the Audit Bureau of Jordan, the Comptroller and Auditor General of India, and the United States Department of State. During the meeting two actions were taken: (i) the delegates analysed the activities that had already been delivered and identified areas of improvement for the future; (ii) contributions that the various technical partners could make to the BSA programme.

Institutional Meeting of BSA President with National Audit Office of the UK:
- o A one-week meeting between the BSA President and National Audit Office of the United Kingdom was held in London, England on 8-16 December 2008. The meeting discussed current technical cooperation with the BSA, as well as the prospects for future cooperation as UNDP proceeded.

Pilot Audit Workshop:
- o Six (6) auditors from the BSA travelled to National Audit Offices in the United Kingdom for a one-week workshop 26-30 November 2007. It was the first of four workshops aimed to support the BSA to develop institutional audit programmes that comply with international standards, to prepare for a pilot (test) audit, to obtain feedback on the conduct of the pilot audit during the exercise, as well as guidance on the completion of the audit.

Additional Three Pilot Audit Workshops (3):
- o An additional four pilot audit workshops were held in London England on 21-25 July 2008. Six senior audit officers selected to be pilot audit champions within the BSA attended the meetings. The workshops aimed to significantly improve the national capacity of auditing in Iraq.

Institutional Fraud Awareness Guide:
- o A team of five (5) BSA directors spent three days with an international supreme audit institution capacity-building expert during 17-19 December 2007 in Amman, Jordan. The group drafted a structure for an institutional fraud awareness guide.

Fraud Manual Working Meetings (3):
- o Four fraud manual development working meetings were held in Amman, Jordan on 6-7 August 2008. The working meetings were attended by four senior audit officers of the BSA and an international expert in institutional fraud awareness. The meetings were convened to complete work on an Institutional Fraud Awareness Guide being developed for the BSA.

Establishment of Two Specialized Teams
- o Two specialized teams, involving twelve specialists, were established within BSA in support of disseminating knowledge to stakeholders.

- *Partners*

Other Supreme Audit Institutions and International Organisations
The project's key partnerships are its implementing partners: the Audit Bureau of Egypt, the Audit Bureau of Jordan, the Court of Accounts of Tunisia, the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom, the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India, and the World Bank. Each partnership is important beyond the training course being provided. These partnerships, especially those with regional partners, are also important as a means of re-integrating the BSA into the international community of supreme audit institutions and all the benefits this involves, including access to best practices.

Other UN Agencies
UNDP partnered with the International Labour Organisation and the UN International Training Centre on the delivery of an audit training course.

- *Cross-Cutting Issues.*

  1. Gender:
       Criteria established to ensure the participation of female auditors. This resulted in a fair balance within the selection of the 437 BSA auditor employees, based on qualifications for all activities with gender breakdown of (206 female: 231 male).

  2. Human Rights:
       This project had no planned or actual results that directly impacted human rights issues within Iraq. However, as the BSA has/will be conducting performance and financial auditing within human rights there is an indirect impact on transparency, accountability and integrity.

  3. Employment:
       This project had no planned or actual results that directly impact employment creation within Iraq. However, as the BSA audits and refers to other anti-corruption institutions, with mention of the Commission of Integrity and the Offices of Inspectors General there is an indirect two pronged effect on employment from this project in that those employees accused of fraud will lose their position and potentially there may be more positions as corruption issues come under control and services are offered to the citizens of Iraq.

  4. Environment:

This project had no planned or actual results that directly impact environmental issues within Iraq. However, as the BSA has/will be conducting performance and financial auditing within environment there is an indirect impact on transparency, accountability and integrity.

ii) Indicator Based Performance Assessment:

	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance with Planned Target	Source of Verification
IP Outcome 1[9] **To promote good governance, honesty, transparency and accountability in the use and management of public resources by strengthening the capacity of the Board of Supreme Audit.** **Indicator**: Increase type of audits provided as watchdog agency **Baseline**: 33% of audits are performance related **Planned Target:** 50% of audits are performance related	**Fully Achieved** Performance audits double to almost 75% at time of the External Evaluation 2010.		Documented in External Evaluation
Output 1.1 To conduct and complete a Training Needs Assessment of the BSA; **Indicator :**Identify training needs through assessment within the BSA **Baseline:** Limited training need information. **Planned Target:** Training Needs Assessment of the BSA completed in 18 governorates	**Fully Achieved** Training needs assessment completed in 18 governorates which utilized 6 branches in the governorates, 2 technical offices and 6 satellite offices in Baghdad.		Documented in External Evaluation
Output 1.2 To conduct research, from international experiences, on money laundering to develop future audit programmes; **Indicator:** Exposure to methods used for interceptions of suspect money-laundering activities, procedures for safeguarding, and audit controls. **Baseline:** Gaps within experiences on money laundering **Planned Target:** Exposure to other international experiences on suspect money laundering activities and auditing.	**Fully Achieved** BSA exposure to the system and methods used in Italy for interception and investigation of "suspect" money-laundering activities and explored the legal framework, safeguarding and audit role. In 2009, fraud was suspected in 1,300 audits conducted by the BSA which were forwarded to the Commission of Integrity and the Offices of Inspectors General for further investigation as the other two Anti-Corruption Institutions in Iraq.		Documented in External Evaluation Resultant guideline as an outcome of the study tour Study tour documents and evaluation forms UN Training Centre documents
Output 1.3 To conduct off-the-shelf short-term courses around the Arab Region for 269 auditors in priority areas; **Indicator** Number of BSA staff who received specialized training to serve BSA's specific needs through short courses **Baseline:** 30 (2007) **Planned Target:** 200 (2009)	**Fully Achieved** **Exceeded Planned Target** A total of 437 BSA auditors (206 female;231 male) were trained in 10 courses conducted through this project, Exceeded the original target by more		Training evaluation forms, Training reports and projects reports completed

---

[9] Note: Outcomes, outputs, indicators and targets should be **as outlines in the Project Document** so that you report on your **actual achievements against planned targets**. Add rows as required for Outcome 2, 3 etc.

	than 100% with a fair balance between female and male BSA staff. In addition, some staff who received training went back to train other BSA staff inside Iraq within the different Governorates.		
Output 1.4 To conduct training of trainers workshops to develop the long-term training programme for 3 groups of 30 audit practitioners in the areas of : financial auditing and fraud detection; revenue and expenditure; computer auditing and performance audit. **Indicator** Strengthen existing training centre capabilities to be self-sufficient **Baseline:** Require 25 additional trainers **Planned Target:** 30 auditors trained	**Fully Achieved** **Exceeded Planned Target** 91 auditors were trained to train others. Four major training of trainers conducted		Training evaluation forms Training reports and project reports completed.
Output 1.5 To conduct a workshop that aims to develop the capacities of 30 technicians in coordinating and supporting the introduction of the audit operations' computerization as well as BSA's administrative systems and to develop a guide to this effect. **Indicator:** Develop capacities of 30 technicians in computerization of audit. **Baseline:** Not computerized **Planned Target:** One course offered to 30 technicians	**Fully Achieved** **Exceeded Planned Target** 30 Technicians trained Two courses offered Workshops conducted to discuss and plan the Electronic Document Management System System installed and piloted		Training evaluation forms Training reports and project reports completed.
Output 1.6 To develop and disseminate audit guidance on the training activities and a code of conduct to BSA based on INTOSAI code of ethics. **Indicator** BSA specific audit guide and audit report manual -formulated /drafted **Baseline:** no specific audit guide or manuals in place, but preparation through consultative meetings were ongoing (2007) **Planned Target:** BSA specific audit guide and manuals drafted	**Achieved** Target met, audit guide drafted. Ten (10) auditors trained in standardized course manuals for use as reference in the conduct of auditors and the eventual development of audit guidance at the institutional/team levels.		The documents: audit guide and manuals Project progress reports
Output 1.7 To adapt and to disseminate BSA guide on fraud awareness and detection. **Indicator** BSA specific fraud awareness manual formulated /drafted **Baseline:** No specific fraud awareness manuals in place **Planned Target:** BSA specific fraud awareness manual drafted	**Achieved** Target met, fraud awareness manual drafted		fraud awareness and detection manual Project progress reports

Output 1.8 To promote the sustainability of BSA Iraq's capacity reinforcement ensured. **Indicator:** Strengthen the capacity of the training department on current trends to promote sustainability. **Baseline:** Training department and staff not on current trend **Planned Target:** Training department strengthened with frequency and number of courses offered increased	**Achieved** External Evaluation 2010 noted that the training centre was strengthened and has increased the frequency and number of courses offered. The number of advanced auditors to train others increased to 73.		Discussion with the Training Department External Evaluation 2010

iii) Evaluation, Best Practices and Lessons Learned

- *External Evaluation and Key Findings*

Four governance projects funded under the United Nations Development Group Iraq Trust Fund (UNDG ITF) and implemented by UNDP were externally evaluated in 2010. The external evaluation was an in-depth assessment of the operational and development effectiveness of the four projects in line with DAC criteria as well as the operational elements agreed upon for all UNDF ITF project evaluations. The evaluation examined the extent to which each of the project met a number of evaluative criteria which included (1) its relevance, (2) the validity of its design, (3) development results (results achievement), (4) management effectiveness and (5) sustainability. Each of the criteria was measured with reference to specific indicators which total a possible 51 points.

One of the four projects evaluated was this project, *the Institutional Strengthening Programme of the Board of Supreme Audit of Iraq.* The key findings of the evaluation resulted in this project, *the Institutional Strengthening Programme of the Board of Supreme Audit of Iraq* receiving a total of 46 out of 51 possible points as follows:
  o Relevance: 9 out of a possible 9 points
  o Validity of Design: 13 out of a possible 15 points
  o Development Results: 12 out of a possible 12 points
  o Management Effectiveness: 9 out of a possible 12 points
  o Sustainability: 3 out of a possible 3 points.

This resulted in a total of 90% which was the highest score of the four projects being evaluated. The results of the evaluation stated that only one of the projects *"performed well"* which was; the Board of Supreme Audit project.

Please note that the evaluation is available on the MDTF Gateway.

- *Best Practice*

This project enabled the BSA to build a Training Unit within the main structure. The primary role of the Training Unit continues to be to provide training for those BSA employees who did not have the chance to participate in the training reflected in the work-plan. The Training Unit also continues to provide training to auditors from the Inspectors' General Offices, Commission of Integrity and auditors from other Government of Iraq departments.

- *Challenges*

Remote Management and Communication Difficulties/Geographic Separation between BSA and UNDP-Iraq
      The UNDP-Iraq Office was located in Amman, Jordan, due to security issues in Baghdad, Iraq during the course of the project. Thus this was remotely managed which was compounded by communication difficulties resulting from the security and infrastructure issues in Iraq, which resulted in delays. Lessons were learned and documented in the UNDP document on remote management.

Expectations Created by the Original Project Document

The original project document planned for the disbursement of the USD 4.9 million budget over 16 months, including a series of ten different two to four week training workshops. Training courses of this nature are very labour intensive and require a great deal of detailed preparation. Additionally, the release of staff to attend the training and necessary visa required a longer timeframe. However, it is noted all issues were overcome just took a focused and longer timeframe. The lesson learned is to not create unrealistic expectations and ensure a realistic timetable or a phase II.

Number of Professional Staff Assigned to the Project

This issue is closely related to the expectations created by the original work plan. Even with the increase to two full-time staff members dedicated to the project, the project was understaffed as the BSA requested that UNDP-Iraq work on all the training activities, as well as other project activities in parallel.

Length of Time to Prepare Course Materials

The length of time that UNDP-Iraq estimated would be required by the technical partners to prepare the course materials was too optimistic. This resulted in some delays in the delivery of training courses.

Effect of Security Issues

Delays were experienced in the implementation of the project as the security in Iraq was anticipated to improve, rather the security situation negatively changed after the project document was developed. The project document identified that an important assumption was political stability. Additionally, it was also mentioned within the project document that the level of security which was at that time at Security Phase 4+ and challenges which could be faced within Iraq and Iraqis traveling outside of Iraq.

Through delayed in time scale, all components of this project have been achieved.

- *Lessons Learned*

Though it takes longer at times there is potential to establish partnership and sustainable structures in a post conflict environment.

An effective way to assist countries in a post conflict environment is to expose then to relevant good practice to assist in finding ways forward.

Committed leadership within the agency with strong ownership assists projects in their success and sustainability.

Annex I. Abbreviations and Acronyms

ARABOSAI	Arab Organisation of Supreme Audit Institution
BSA	Board of Supreme Audit of Iraq
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
EDMS	Electronic Document Management System
INTOSAI	International Organisation of Supreme Audit Institution
ISC	Institutional Strengthening Committee
ISO	International Standards Organisation
MDG	Millenium Development Goals
SAI	Supreme Audit Institution
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDG ITF	United Nations Development Group Iraq Trust Fund
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme