



CAFI PROJECT FORMULATION ALLOCATION TO FAO

CONGO

PROJECT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS ROME, 2020

CAFI PROJECT FORMULATION ALLOCATION TO FAO

CONGO

PROJECT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report prepared for the Government of Congo by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations acting as executing agency for the Central African Forest Initiative

CENTRAL AFRICAN FOREST INITIATIVE FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS

Rome, 2020



The Food and Agriculture Organization is greatly indebted to all those who assisted in the implementation of the project by providing information, advice and facilities.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

			<u>Page</u>
PROJEC	CT INFO	DRMATION AND RESOURCES	5
ACRON	IYMS		6
EXECU	TIVE S	UMMARY	7
I. II.	Purp Asse	pose essment of Programme Results	7 8
	i) ii) iii) iv) v)	Narrative reporting on results Indicator-based performance assessment Evaluation, best practices and lessons learned Specific stories Progress under the governance indicators of the CAFI results	8 17 20 21
		framework	23

[Central African Forest Initiative-CAFI] MPTF OFFICE GENERIC FINAL PROGRAMME¹ NARRATIVE REPORT REPORTING PERIOD: FROM 22 JULY 2019 TO 30 APRIL 2020



Programme Title and Project Number

- Programme Title: CAFI Project Formulation Allocation to FAO
- Programme Number: UNJP/PRC/019/UNJ
- MPTF Office Project Reference Number³: 00116876

Participating Organization(s)

FAO

TOTAL:

Programme/Project Cost (USD)

Total approved budget as per project document: USD 314 173 MPTF/JP Contribution⁴: • by Agency (if applicable) Agency Contribution 0 • by Agency (if applicable) Government Contribution 0 (if applicable) Other Contributions (donors) (if applicable)

Programme Assessment/Review/ Mid-Term Evaluation

Evaluation Completed

 \square Yes \square No Date: dd.mm.yyyyEvaluation Report – Attached ☐ Yes ☐ No Date: dd.mm.yyyy

Country, Localit(ies), Priority area(s)/ Strategic results²

Country: CONGO

Priority area/Strategic results

UNDAF 2020-2024 – Outcome 4: By 2024, the most disadvantaged populations in the targeted areas are implementing diversified sustainable economic activities resilient to climate change, generating income and employment in the areas of sustainable agriculture, food security and ecotourism, while respecting environmental standards.

UNDAF 2020-2024 – Output 4.4: National institutions and populations are adopting sustainable practices to manage biodiversity and developing climate change adaptation and mitigation actions.

Implementing Partners

Ministry of Forest Economy of Congo

Programme Duration

Overall Duration Start Date ⁵	9 months 22.07.2019
Original End Date ⁶	30.04.2020
Actual End Date ⁷ Has agency operationally closed the	30.04.2020
Programme in its system?	Yes No
Expected Financial Closure Date8:	

Report submitted by

- Name: Suze FILIPPINI
- Title: FAO Representative in Republic of Congo
- Participating Organization (Lead): FAO
- Email address: suze.filippini@fao.org

USD 314 173

¹ The term "programme" is used for programmes, joint programmes and projects.

² Strategic Results, as formulated in the Strategic UN Planning Framework (e.g. UNDAF) or project document.

³ The MPTF Office Project Reference Number is the same as the number on the Notification message. It is also referred to as "Project ID" on the project's factsheet page on the MPTF Office GATEWAY.

The MPTF/JP Contribution is the amount transferred to the participating UN organizations – see MPTF Office GATEWAY.

⁵ The start date is the date of the first transfer of the funds from the MPTF Office as Administrative Agent. The transfer date is available on the

As per the approval of the original project document by the relevant decision-making body/Steering Committee.

⁷ If there has been an extension, the revised and approved end date should be reflected here. If no extension has been approved, the current end date is the same as the original end date. The end date is the same as the operational closure date, which is when all activities for which a participating organization is responsible under an approved MPTF/JP have been completed. As per the MOU, agencies are to notify the MPTF Office when a programme completes its operational activities. Please see MPTF Office Closure Guidelines.

⁸ Financial Closure requires the return of unspent balances and submission of the Certified Final Financial Statement and Report.

ACRONYMS

CAFI Central African Forest Initiative

EFA Economic and Financial Analysis

EIRR Economic Internal Rate of Return

ENPV Economic Net Present Value

ESMF Environmental and Social Risk Monitoring Framework

ESMS Environmental and Social Management System

GCF Green Climate Fund

GHG Greenhouse Gas

NDC Nationally Determined Contribution

NPV Net Present Value

NGO Non-governmental Organization

PCIV-REDD+ REDD+ Principles, Criteria, Indicators and Verifiers

REDD+ Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation, and the role of

conservation, sustainable management of forests and enhancement of forest

carbon stocks in developing countries

SESA Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment

SIS Safeguard Information System

UNDAF United Nations Development Assistance Framework

FINAL PROGRAMME REPORT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Central African Forest Initiative (CAFI) project has supported the development of a project proposal for the Green Climate Fund (GCF) entitled "PREFOREST Congo – Project to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from forests in five departments in the Republic of Congo".

Specifically, the project has supported the following:

- Analysis of climate-friendly production and transformation models in agriculture, forestry and agroforestry, including their cost-benefit analysis, which can support the implementation of a national strategy for Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and forest Degradation, plus the sustainable management of forests, and the conservation and enhancement of forest carbon stocks in developing countries (REDD+).
- An assessment of different models of sustainable use and management of wood resources for efficient charcoal production with reduced environmental impacts (including through forestry, agroforestry and/or assisted natural regeneration). The analysis of costs and the social, economic and environmental benefits of the different models was also undertaken.
- A study of wood energy consumption at household level, and an assessment of
 feasibility, costs and models of cook stoves, aiming to identify the best alternatives for
 deployment in the framework of the project.
- An assessment of environmental and social risks in project areas, and development of the Environmental and Social Risk Monitoring Framework (ESMF).
- A consultative process with women in targeted project areas (five departments), a gender assessment in the context of the project and a Gender Action Plan for the GCF project.
- Identification of groups of indigenous people that could be affected by project activities, a consultative process with indigenous people to inform about the project, obtain their suggestions and confirm their initial interest and the development of an indigenous peoples' action plan.
- The strengthening of stakeholder consultations on the GCF project proposal and development of a stakeholder consultation report.
- An economic and financial analysis (EFA) of the project in order to assess the economic soundness of the project and its likely impact of project interventions.

The project outputs contributed to the enhancement and finalization of the full GCF proposal package, which was submitted to the GCF in January 2020.

I. Purpose

• The project supported Congo in developing the full proposal for submission to the GCF, including in-depth consultation processes and feasibility and technical assessments. The project contributed to the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2020-2024, specifically:

- UNDAF 2020-2024 Outcome 4: By 2024, the most disadvantaged populations in the targeted areas are implementing diversified sustainable economic activities resilient to climate change, generating income and employment in the areas of sustainable agriculture, food security and ecotourism, while respecting environmental standards.
- UNDAF 2020-2024 Output 4.4: National institutions and populations are adopting sustainable practices to manage biodiversity and developing climate change adaptation and mitigation actions.

II. Assessment of Programme Results

i) Narrative reporting on results

From July 2019 to April 2020, the project completed its expected outcomes and outputs, as described below.

Outcomes

Co-financing from the GCF is mobilized to support the implementation of Congo's REDD+ Investment Plan and to generate emissions reduction and socio-economic and environmental co-benefits in six priority departments of the country.

The project contributed to the implementation of the nationally determined contributions (NDCs) of Congo, specifically to its REDD+ national strategy.

• Outputs

Project Output 1: The GCF project proposal is complete and submitted to the GCF

The GCF proposal was completed and the first version submitted to the GCF Secretariat in January 2020. A second version addressing the GCF's initial comments was submitted in April 2020 The proposal significantly benefited from the following feasibility assessments undertaken by the project:

- Analysis of climate-friendly production and transformation models in agriculture, forestry and agroforestry, including their cost-benefit analysis.
- Assessment of different models of sustainable use and management of wood resources for efficient charcoal production with reduced environmental impacts (including through forestry, agroforestry and/or assisted natural regeneration). The analysis of costs and the social, economic and environmental benefits of the different models was also undertaken.
- Study of wood energy consumption at household level, and an assessment of feasibility, costs and models of cook stoves, aiming to identify the best alternatives for deployment in the framework of the project.

Project Output 2: The results of the consultations are published and demonstrate broad stakeholder support for the project

The project supported decentralized consultations in targeted areas to present and validate its key components. The consultation process was organized as plenary meetings, with complementary individual interviews, site visits and focus groups. In total, 415 people were consulted during the meetings, of whom 62 were women, reflecting the difficulties in engaging women in relation to

social roles and daily tasks (see Project Output 4). The consultations were undertaken in 12 districts of five agricultural and forestry departments, as follows:

- Kouilou Department: Madingo-Kayes, Mvouti and Hinda districts.
- Niari Department: Louvakou District.
- Bouenza Department: Loudima, Kayes and Madingou districts.
- Pool Department: Ngoma TséTsé, Igné, Ngabé and Kinkala districts.
- Plateaux Department: Ngo and Mpouya districts.

The objective of the consultations was to engage the different actors in the formulation and future implementation of the GCF project. The variety of meetings and site visits contributed specifically to the following:

- presenting all components of the project;
- facilitating dialogue and exchanges among local actors regarding the proposed activities;
- identifying aspects related to law enforcement and local governance in agricultural lands;
- informing on issues related to local pressure on ecosystems;
- identifying activities to restore and protect forest ecosystems and biodiversity;
- collecting the expectations and needs of local communities in terms of local development;
- assessing project obstacles and opportunities;
- generating relevant recommendations for the GCF project.

The main concerns expressed during the consultations and related recommendations to the GCF project are summarized in the table below.

CONCERNS	RECOMENDATIONS
Access to land is a major concern for producers. There are difficulties in obtaining long-term availability and expanding crop production, while tree planting is banned and there is conflict between "terriens" over the veracity of the property and tenure insecurity for producer.	 Dialogue required between landowners and agricultural producers to promote the development of agroforestry, by associating the families of landowners. Clarify land ownership by supporting procedures for obtaining official property titles. Develop the practice of long-term leasing contracts. Promote women's access to agroforestry
In the savannah zone, despite the possibilities for expanding agricultural production, access to mechanization is uneven, with slash-and-burn remaining the preferred agricultural method in forests.	 Raise awareness among producers about their role in climate change mitigation. Establish pilot cases in the savannah. Promote access to mechanization in the savannah when the right conditions are in place (no risk of erosion, sufficient topsoil cover), to prohibit slash-and-burn agriculture. Encourage agroforestry in savannah areas (orchards, fast-growing plantations, timber, windbreak hedges). Disseminate good practices for crop rotation and use of organic fertilizers. Build on existing experiences and know-how, and encourage the exchange of experiences.
The size of farms is variable. If the project only	Reconsider the minimum size considering the
supports a minimum size of 10 ha, it will	context of each district, e.g. begin with a minimum
exclude the majority of producers in most	of 2 ha, where mechanization is non-existent, which

CONCERNS	RECOMENDATIONS
districts, in particular where there is little or no mechanization.	can subsequently be increased.
Most groups are not formalized, especially the vast majority of women's groups. The requirement to be in a formal group deprives most producers of access to the project.	 While the proposal of a project by a formal group may be the rule, the formalization of the group should not be a prerequisite, but rather a logical follow-up to be supported by the project. In particular, there is a need to ensure the integration of women, who are too often left behind for development projects, and to adapt the procedures for presenting and approving initiatives to the real situation on the ground.
Wood energy is a resource used everywhere, which increases with the level of need in the cities. In savannah culture zones, this leads to the cutting down even of fruit trees, and in forest zones of trees of value (precious wood), with efforts made to make charcoal from wood and bake the bricks.	 Educate landowners, charcoal-makers and bricklayers on the use of "sustainable" wood energy for their activities. Promote fast-growing energy plantations and disseminate knowledge about planted forests. Impose replanting for each tree felled, favouring tree nurseries (or their creation) and the dissemination of planting and maintenance techniques.
The management of agricultural holdings, the establishment of provisional budgets and operating accounts are almost non-existent practices for farmers, with basic concepts very rarely mastered.	 Capacity development must be a priority and a prerequisite for all producers supported by the project. Raise awareness and promote a long-term vision about the gains from planting forest species and fruit trees. Provide short and long-term support to project beneficiaries.
The terms "agroforestry" and agroforestry techniques are a cause for concern as they are often misunderstood.	 Basic training is essential but is not enough. Both support in implementation and the organization of exchanges of experiences are required if the adoption of and interest in new techniques is to be enhanced among producers living in precarious conditions. Agroforestry techniques must be better known and disseminated.
Producers indicate difficulties in accessing their sites and transporting their produce.	 This is a serious problem in all districts, related to government priorities and planned investments. Marketing needs to be organized, in particular between producers and traders.
Access to financial resources such as microcredits is extremely rare, due to the absence of agencies and options adapted to agricultural producers.	Promote financial tools adapted to farmers and accessible at local level.
20% co-financing from farmers is considered too high by the stakeholders consulted.	• In general, the proposed counterpart funding is well accepted and even considered to be a positive aspect. A rate of 10 percent is considered a better option. For the majority of women and indigenous peoples, adapted arrangements may be needed (e.g. reimbursement upon crop harvesting).

These consultations led to the development of a public consultation report, which contained a participation identifying the key stakeholders, their interests and relevant interventions, in order to maximize their participation during project implementation. Specific arrangements were made to guarantee effective participation by women and indigenous populations (see Outputs 3 and 4).

Project Output 3: A plan for indigenous peoples is prepared, approved and published

The Government of Congo was the first in Africa to adopt a law on indigenous peoples in 2011, however the location of indigenous peoples in the country is still to be identified. Indigenous peoples in Congo were known as "pygmy", but the term is considered pejorative, and Law 05 of 2011 on Indigenous Peoples prohibits it use. Indigenous peoples, who represent almost 1 percent of the population, are the most marginalized group, traditionally living by hunting and gathering in the dense forest of the Congo Basin. Today, many live in or near villages with other ethnic groups.

Indigenous populations were identified in the project areas, specifically in 13 villages in the district of Ngo (Allion, Lomé, Nsah, Abby, Mpoh, Banga, Endion, Egypte, Nazarette, Onianva, Point d'Eau, Ombima, Ngo 2). In line with GCF policy on indigenous populations, an initial assessment and specific management framework for indigenous populations was undertaken. The team conducted surveys and consultations among these populations, aiming to achieve the following:

- Begin to apply the GCF and FAO safeguards and policy on indigenous peoples.
- Identify all indigenous people's groups in project areas, in particular those likely to be affected by the project.
- Collect reference information, in particular history, the number of households, lifestyle, difficulties in life, relations with the Bantu populations, internal hierarchy, land access methods and experiences with agricultural producer groups.
- Sensitize indigenous peoples in the project areas about the reduction of forest emissions in Congo.
- Inform about the planned interventions of the GCF project, assess interest among indigenous peoples in participating and their perceived risks, opportunities, advantages and disadvantages associated with the project.

The consultations found that indigenous peoples are victims of significant discrimination. They are never landowners, their products and work are poorly developed compared with that of the Bantu, they are not integrated into decision-making structures and are never successful during conflicts in villages. In addition, they rarely benefit from equitable sharing of benefits. The indigenous populations interviewed generally felt unable to negotiate medium or long-term land access contracts or usage contracts to plant trees, however they believed that this would be possible with the support of both the project and the Government. Given the difficulties they would face in meeting the minimum eligibility conditions for funding of initiatives, which would be surpassed by their difficulty in building business management capacities, the indigenous people's groups all declared their interest in taking part in the project.

The Planning Framework for Indigenous Peoples supported by this CAFI project is in line with the GCF, REDD+ and FAO safeguards. This plan accurately identifies the obstacles to effective participation by indigenous peoples and proposes ways to correct their marginalization and guarantee their active participation in the GCF project, which, in turn, will pay particular attention to ensuring the participation of indigenous peoples and increase their ability to benefit fully, in particular by using positive discrimination when selecting initiatives. The percentage of

indigenous peoples benefiting from the project must be proportional to their percentage within village populations. Moreover, the GCF project will implement specific measures for indigenous peoples, particularly through training and support in securing their land rights, as well as the establishment of a complaints and monitoring management system.

Project Output 4: A gender mainstreaming framework for the project is prepared, approved and published

The socio-legal status of women in Congo remains a major concern. Although the 2015 constitution enshrines the principle of gender equality in all sectors of national life, some legislative instruments continue to convey disparities.

In order to identify any gender disparities that might prevent women from taking part in and fully enjoying the benefits of the project, the CAFI project supported a gender assessment in all target sites. The general objective of this assessment was to conduct a situational analysis, in order to guarantee incorporation of the practical needs and strategic interests of female beneficiaries during the formulation of the project. To this end, discussion groups were held in the departments of Kouilou, Niari, Bouenza, Pool and Plateaux. A total of around 20 discussion groups were organized with women's groups, as well as approximately 30 individual interviews. The assessment allowed the disparities and social constraints faced by women within the context of agricultural and forestry activities to be highlighted. These are outlined below.

- In terms of cultural barriers, the following can be noted: the inequality of land access and security rights under customary law; the weak decision-making power of women, which does not always allow them to enforce their rights and express their viewpoints in the community, as well as within mixed agricultural groups; poor access to information, coupled with low levels of representation of women in public meetings and consultations, thus limiting their full participation in public life management at community level.
- Obstacles related to education were also raised, and were characterized by high levels of illiteracy in women within agricultural groups in the districts covered by the project. This is a major obstacle that prevents women from benefiting from training opportunities on agricultural techniques and other capacity-building sessions that may be offered to them.
- In terms of socio-economic obstacles or disparities, the assessment highlighted the financial vulnerability of women from certain agricultural groups in the districts targeted by the project. Financial insecurity has many causes, including the size of their yields and the fact that they devote nearly all of the resources from their yields to family expenses, making it difficult to save. In addition, access to credit is not easy for them.
- The assessment also highlighted unmet needs for training and technical support related to agriculture and forestry activities for women in groups, with consequences negatively impacting their productivity. There are major obstacles that increase the social vulnerability of female producers and prevent them from investing in order to adopt more sustainable and profitable practices.
- Discussions with a range of potential beneficiaries also showed that women's access to information in villages is largely dependent upon the channel through which this information is distributed.

Based on the gender assessment, a Gender Action Plan for the GCF project was developed, including the elements outlined below.

- Specific emphasis will be placed on the channels to be used to relay information at community level. This is to ensure that women not only have timely access to information, but also that they can take part in meetings and public consultations. To this effect, agricultural sector chiefs will be deployed as intermediaries in the villages in the framework of the GCF project.
- Within the context of consultations prior to the development of local development plans, the GCF project will ensure the involvement of and effective participation by women in public encounters and meetings. Capacity-building programmes on female leadership and citizenship provided for in the action plan will allow women to make their voices heard during public consultations as holders of rights and full citizens.
- In order to resolve customary discrimination against women in terms of land access, the project will tackle the securing of land rights for women within the context of its Component 1. Furthermore, in terms of incentives, the project will encourage the establishment of emphyteutic leases with female land owners. It will also prioritize women's groups in land allocation. At least 35 percent of the project's land beneficiaries will be women. The objective is to deconstruct the cultural norms that tend to exclude women from land management. In the same vein, community leaders will be educated in terms of behavioural changes (mindsets) related to women's access to and control of land within the customary framework. Also, in order not to increase the existing land-related discrepancies between men and women, the project will endeavour not to purchase land from female land owners.
- In terms of the bottlenecks (family obligations, illiteracy rates) observed during the assessment, which are obstacles for women and prevent them from benefiting from potential training opportunities, strategies were defined in order to adapt the training to be provided within the context of the project to match the profile of female producers and their family constraints.
- Finally, in order to guarantee the ultimate achievement of gender equality objectives, the GCF project will strengthen the technical and institutional capacities of the project team on gender mainstreaming in the implementation of development projects, and more specifically the project interventions. In order to guarantee the effective inclusion of women, the project set a target a proportion of 35 percent of women among participants in each activity (capacity-building, participation in meetings, etc.) as well as all forms of allocations and support to be provided by the project.
- A gender expert will also be recruited for enhanced monitoring of cross-cutting gender inclusion, in line with the project components, as well as the performance indicators defined within the logical framework. It should be specified that these indicators contained in the logical framework, disaggregated by gender, will allow the participation of men and women to be measured in all actions planned by the project. The same applies to the sub-activities planned as precursors to certain activities by way of corrective measures. In terms of monitoring and evaluation, the project will integrate the gender dimension in their evaluation missions, including gender objectives in the outline of the terms of reference. The gender expert recruited within the context of the project will also ensure that all data generated during implementation is routinely disaggregated by gender, including the monitoring and evaluation reports.

Project Output 5: Land issues related to the project are better understood and proposals to better manage environmental and social risk are integrated into an environmental and social management framework

The Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS) was built on the environmental and social safeguard measures of the accredited entity – FAO – in line with GCF environmental and social policy. The ESMS is also linked to the REDD+ environmental and social safeguards, which are, in turn, based on three tools: (i) The REDD+ Principles, Criteria, Indicators and Verifiers (PCIV-REDD+ 14), which breaks down, at national level, the Cancun safeguards of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, (ii) the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) and (iii) The Safeguard Information System (SIS).

The ESMS includes sections on the management of invasive species, pesticide management and complaint management, as well as a REDD+ framework for communication and participation. In addition, the project developed a Planning Framework for Indigenous Peoples. During project implementation, each component and activity will be subject to an ESMS analysis, in line with the GCF requirements for Category B projects. The impact of each activity will be analysed and mitigation and monitoring methods will be identified. No resettlement of populations is planned. A complaints and complaints management system will operate at district, project and GCF levels. All stakeholders will be educated on the good governance standards targeted by the project and on the different procedures for submitting their complaints at district, project and GCF level.

Project Output 6: Additional economic and financial analysis is prepared and integrated into the project proposal to better present the future benefits of the project

An EFA of the GCF project's interventions was conducted in order to assess its economic viability and its impact on the beneficiaries, quantifying the net incremental financial and economic benefits generated by the investments. The financial analysis took into account the estimated benefits from the viewpoint of individual entrepreneurs and farmers, while the economic analysis took into account the incremental benefits and costs of the project's interventions from the perspective of society as a whole.

The quantified benefits taken into account in the EFA are the incremental net benefits of three major categories of intervention, namely (i) the establishment of climate-resilient agroforestry systems over 10 000 ha, (ii) the improvement in production and sales of improved cook stoves by micro and small-sized enterprises (500 producers of economic stoves targeted) and (iii) training of 1 000 charcoal producers in more efficient production techniques. Models were developed for each of the anticipated benefit categories, including variants for the different climate-resilient agroforestry systems proposed by the project.

A time horizon of 25 years was chosen for the EFA. Discount rates of 10 and 6 percent were used for the financial and economic analyses, respectively.

For climate-resilient agroforestry systems, the results of the financial analysis are included in the table below. The table shows that both acacia-based agroforestry systems require a grant (estimated at USD 1 330 per ha) in order to be viable. Although the net present value (NPV) is positive, subsidy of investment costs is also necessary to ensure a positive incremental net benefit for the cocoa-based system during the first year and to reduce the investment costs of grassroots orange and avocado systems.

	Initial	Increm	ental net be	nefit	20-year time	horizon	25-year time	e horizon
	investment for 1 ha	Year 1 with no grant	Year 1 with grant	Year 10	NPV without grant	NPV with grant	NPV without grant	NPV with grant
Acacia - maize - cassava	1 057	-420	910	21	-860	2 448	-819	2 489
Acacia - peanut - cassava	1 192	-345	985	114	-175	3 133	-111	3 197
Cocoa - plantain - butter fruit - peanut	4 028	-176	1 154	912	1 861	4 169	2 694	5 003
Avocado - okra – aubergine	3 778	987	2 317	2 585	17 148	18 357	18 775	19 984
Orange - maize - peanut - pea - cassava	2 973	1 106	2 436	98	3 367	4 576	3 422	4 631

The financial analysis for the production of improved cook stoves shows that the profit made for each improved cook stove sold is between USD 3 and 31, depending on the model of the cook stove. The financial analysis shows that, for charcoal producers, the incremental net benefit is only 5.5 percent higher than for traditional techniques. However, the incremental net benefit is 36 percent higher than for traditional techniques if the equipment (for instance, reservoirs) is subsidized by the project.

This analysis shows that the results of the planned interventions (with grant) are sufficiently high to justify project investment from a financial point of view. The project is also important from an economic point of view. More specifically, with a 25-year time horizon, the economic net present value (ENPV) amounts to USD 13.9 million, while the economic internal rate of return (EIRR) is 10.7 percent, if it is assumed that 70 percent of the 10 000 ha of targeted agroforestry plantations include systems based on acacia and annual crops, 20 percent include cocoa-based systems (with plantain and groundnut) and the remaining areas are planted with avocados and vegetables (5 percent) and oranges mixed with annual staple food crops (5 percent). These figures do not take into account the related benefits for the environment, such as greenhouse gas (GHG) emission reduction. Through interventions in climate-resilient agroforestry, the project should reduce GHG emissions by 630 000 tonnes of CO₂ per year. Moreover, once the target 30 000 improved cook stoves are in use, the project will reduce emissions by approximately 145 000 tonnes of CO2 over a period of eight years. Consistent with the suggestions by the GCF for pilot programmes for REDD+ results-based payments, this economic analysis assumes a price of USD 5 per tonne of CO₂ equivalent. With this price level, the results of the economic analysis are included in the table below.

Results of the economic analysis

		ecounting for HG emissions	Accoun reduced GH	9
	20-year time horizon	25-year time horizon	20-year time horizon	25-year time horizon
ENPV (in million				
USD)	4.8	13.9	40.6	54.4
EIRR	8.2%	10.7%	37.1%	37.5%

The sensitivity analysis shows that the project is not sensitive to moderate cost increases, reduced profits, delays in the accrual of profits and changes to the planned planted areas.

Overall, the ESA concluded that the project is viable from an economic and financial point of view.

• Qualitative assessment

The consultations, assessments and studies undertaken through the project have significantly contributed to enhancing the proposal package, making it more responsive to stakeholders' needs, but also more technically sound and targeted. These have enhanced both the future project impact and its sustainability. Specifically, the Framework Plan for Environmental and Social Management, the Gender Action Plan and the Planning Framework for Indigenous Peoples define the approach to mitigate the risk of marginalization, and ensure the engagement of the most vulnerable groups.

The project played a catalytic role, improving the likelihood of approval by the GCF, which may leverage substantial climate funding and contribute to the implementation of Congo's REDD+ national investment plan and the fulfillment of its NDC. In addition, the project contributed to the establishment of synergies and coordination among climate-related funding sources, initiatives and actors.

ii) Indicator-based Performance Assessment

Using the **Programme Results Framework from the Project Document/Annual Work Plans**, provide details of the achievement of indicators at both output and outcome levels in the table below. Where it has not been possible to collect data on indicators, clear explanation should be given explaining why.

	Achieved indicator targets	Reasons for variance with planned target (if any)	Source of verification
Outcome 19 Co-financing from the GCF is mobilized to support the implementation of the REDD+ Investment Plan of the Republic of Congo and generate emission reductions and socio-economic and environmental co-benefits in six priority departments of the country. Indicator Submission to GCF. Baseline: 0 Planned target: 1	Finalized. Proposal package submitted to the GCF Secretariat in January 2020 (first submission) and resubmitted in April 2020 (second submission).	N/A	Proposal package submitted to the GCF
Output 1 The GCF project proposal is complete and submitted to the GCF. Indicator 1.1 GCF project proposal document. Baseline: 0 Planned Target: 1 Indicator 1.2 Analysis of climate-friendly production and transformation models in agriculture, forestry and agroforestry, which can support the national REDD+ strategy in the key departments of the country. Baseline: 0 Planned target: 1	Finalized. GCF project proposal completed, incorporating results of analysis and assessments.	N/A	https://www.dropbox.com/sh/budb w3jiut15eem/AAAIBhZJn5A97Dy GKY2H4tZNa?dl=0

⁹ Note: Outcomes, outputs, indicators and targets should be as outlined in the Project Document, so that reporting is performed on actual achievements against planned targets. Add rows as required for Outcomes 2, 3 etc.

	Achieved indicator targets	Reasons for variance with planned target (if any)	Source of verification
Indicator 1.3 Assessment of different models of sustainable use and manage wood resources (including through forestry, agroforestry and/or assisted natural regeneration) for efficient charcoal production with reduced environmental impacts. Baseline: 0 Planned target: 1 Indicator 1.4 Study of wood energy consumption at household level, and an assessment of feasibility, costs and models of economic stoves, aiming to identify the best alternatives for deployment in the framework of the project.			
Baseline: 0 Planned target: 1			
Output 2 The results of the consultations are published and demonstrate broad stakeholder support for the project. Indicator 2.1 Report of the decentralized consultations, including a summary of the main needs and recommendations for the GCF project and relevant to the implementation of the PI REDD+. Baseline: 0 Planned Target: 1	Finalized. Consultations undertaken.	N/A	https://www.dropbox.com/sh/budb w3jiut15eem/AAAIBhZJn5A97Dy GKY2H4tZNa?dl=0
Output 3 A plan for indigenous peoples is prepared, approved and published. Indicator 3.1 Consultation report and plan for indigenous peoples aligned with GCF requirements. Baseline: 0 Planned Target: 1	Finalized. Planning Framework for Indigenous Peoples finalized.	N/A	https://www.dropbox.com/sh/budb w3jiut15eem/AAAIBhZJn5A97Dy GKY2H4tZNa?dl=0

	Achieved indicator targets	Reasons for variance with planned target (if any)	Source of verification
Output 4 A gender mainstreaming framework for the project is prepared, approved and published. Indicator 4.1 Gender assessment. Baseline: 0 Planned Target: 1 Indicator 4.2 Gender action plan. Baseline: 0 Planned Target: 1	Finalized. Consultations with women undertaken. Gender assessment in targeted project areas. Gender Action Plan for GCF project.	N/A	https://www.dropbox.com/sh/budb w3jiut15eem/AAAIBhZJn5A97Dy GKY2H4tZNa?dl=0
Output 5 Land issues related to the project are better understood and proposals to better manage environmental and social risk are integrated into an ESMF. Indicator 5.1 ESMF. Baseline: 0 Planned Target: 1	Finalized. ESMF.	N/A	https://www.dropbox.com/sh/budb w3jiut15eem/AAAIBhZJn5A97Dy GKY2H4tZNa?dl=0
Output 6 Additional EFA is prepared and integrated into the project proposal to better present the future benefits of the project. Indicator 6.1 EFA. Baseline: 0 Planned Target:1	Finalized. Annex III of GCF project proposal "Economic and financial analysis".	N/A	https://www.dropbox.com/sh/budb w3jiut15eem/AAAIBhZJn5A97Dy GKY2H4tZNa?dl=0

iii) Evaluation, Best Practices and Lessons Learned

The main challenge faced during project implementation was the time pressure to undertake the studies and consultations for finalization of the proposal package and timely submission to the GCF in January 2020. The recruitment of experts, the organization of field missions and related meetings and consultations with stakeholders are time-consuming processes, particularly when they involve local people.

The CAFI project was implemented at the same time as a GCF readiness project, and synergies were facilitated between the two projects. The GCF project set up a multistakeholder platform with an advisory role for both the GCF and the CAFI projects. The members of the multistakeholder platform, including national experts, officers from public institutions and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), played an important role in the implementation of the CAFI project. In particularly, they provided support for:

- the consultations with local communities and indigenous populations;
- the gender study;
- the assessment of environmental and social risks.

This participatory approach can be considered a significant success. The inclusion of the private sector and civil society in the multistakeholder platform effectively contributed to the implementation of the project and should be replicated in future projects. Moreover, the participation of all stakeholders (sectoral ministries, university, private sector, civil society) in the development of the GCF PREFOREST project was considered a highly positive experience for Congo, and allowed the different actors to follow and understand the stages, studies and consultations necessary for the development of GCF projects.

The model was similar to the task force established for the preparation of the letter of intent between CAFI and Congo. National counterparts feel proud of this experience and are keen to continue undertaking such initiatives in the future.

iv) Specific Stories

Problem/Challenge faced:

Representation and participation of women in consultations and decision making.

Programme interventions:

The project undertook a gender assessment, including consultations with men and women about women's roles in land and forest use and management, their participation in decision-making and the main obstacles and concerns.

Result (if applicable):

The assessment identified that women are involved and contribute significantly to forest and land management. They have different roles and needs in the management of forest resources, and do not seek the same resources as men. Women practice traditional arboriculture, harvest of non-timber forest products for self-consumption and/or sale, collection of fuelwood for food preparation etc.

On the other side, the representation of women in community governance bodies in the districts visited was very low. There were no women among the heads of the departments involved in the project (Bouenza, Niari, Pool, Kouilou and Plateaux) or in Village Committees, which appeared to be linked to the perception in communities and to the socially attributed and recognized roles played by women.

The underrepresentation of women and their weak decision-making power and leadership were also observed within the communities and groups visited. Women participate timidly in public meetings and at times do not have the necessary information on meetings or consultations, or are informed at the last minute.

In terms of access to information, it was found during the field interviews that the channel through which information arrives in a village is one of the bottlenecks for the active participation of women in public meetings. The information is managed by men from the community, who believe that public meetings are first and foremost a matter for them. Village chiefs and community leaders were highly reluctant to associate or involve women in public meetings.

However, each time that the heads of agricultural sectors were used as a contact point, the participation of women in consultation meetings significantly increased.

A plausible explanation for this attitude among village chiefs and other community leaders could be that the latter remain quite marked by the socio-cultural constraints, as well as by the traditional perception of the role of the woman as a wife and mother, with no role in the management of the community's public affairs.

Lessons learned:

The Gender Action Plan of the GCF project recommends strategic reliance upon the heads of agricultural sectors or civil servants (*Direction Départementale de la Promotion de la Femme et de l'Intégration des Femmes au Développement*) to serve as an information contact point in

communities.

It was considered essential to raise awareness, among women as well as men, on social roles and inequalities between men and women. This involves, among other things, training programmes, with the dissemination of the positive results of female participation in community activities implemented by the project, as well as increased awareness campaigns targeting community and religious leaders on the role of women in development.

Development and climate change objectives can only be achieved with the effective participation of men and women in decision-making processes at both local and community levels.



v) Progress under the governance indicators of the <u>CAFI results framework</u>:

Indicator	Responses for Congo
E.E.3	The two studies listed below have
Existence (or progress	contributed, with updated data and
towards adoption) and	information, to making progress towards
implementation of national	sustainable management and alternatives to
or subnational energy	fuelwood.
policies for sustainable	• Models of sustainable use and
management and	management of wood resources for
alternatives to fuelwood.	efficient charcoal production.
E.P.1	• Wood energy consumption at household
Access to updated data on	level and assessment of feasibility, costs
sustainable fuelwood (such	and models of cook stoves.
as number of publications,	
frequency of updating on	
programmes' web sites).	
G.E.1	The consultation process with all
Quality of civil society	stakeholders, with special attention to
representation and	women and indigenous peoples, have
participation (including	enhanced the participation and consensus
indigenous people) in	in the implementation of the REDD+
investment plan decisions,	national investment plan.
their programmes and	
monitoring.	