



United Nations Development Programme
United Nations Development Group Iraq Trust Fund



COMPLETION REPORT FOR PROJECT: REHABILITATION OF SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN LOWER SOUTH IRAQ (B1-11)

Summary

Participating UN Organisation: UN-HABITAT	Cluster: Education and Culture
Project No. and Project Title: B1-11 Rehabilitation of School Buildings in Lower South Iraq	Project Location/Region/Province: Nassiriya and Basrah Muthanna, Missan, Nassiriya and Basrah
Reporting Period: 22 December 2004 to February 2006	Report Number: No. 5 (final report)
Counterpart organisations / implementing partners: Ministry of Education, Local Contractors & Consultants	Project cost: UNDG ITF: \$ 5,270,152
Abbreviations and acronyms: MoE: Ministry of Education DoE: Directorate of Education BoQ: Bill of Quantity	Project Duration: The project duration is 12 months starting 22 December 2004 to 22 December 2005 Actual completion Date : February 2006

I. Purpose

Main objectives and outcomes expected as per approved Project/Programme/project document:

The development goal of the project is to strengthen the educational system in Iraq by enhancing access to primary and secondary education and improving the quality of the learning environment.

The main objectives are to:

- Rehabilitate 90 selected primary and secondary schools in Southern Iraq;
- Develop the skills of construction workers, contractors, building material manufacturers and young professionals in architecture and engineering; and
- Provide employment opportunities in the labour intensive construction sector and income generation at local level for skilled and unskilled workers.

Reference to how the programme/project related to the UN Assistance Strategy to Iraq and how it aimed to support Iraq national development goals and the Millennium Development Goals:

The project is an integral component of the Programme being implemented by Cluster B within the framework of the UN Assistance Strategy for Iraq which, as one of its principal developmental goals for the education sector, seeks to increase participation and completion rates at all levels of education, strengthen service delivery and support and inform policy development. This objective is fully in accordance with the Millennium Development Goals 2 & 3 as they relate to human development and with the goals outlined in the National Development Strategy of the Iraqi Interim Government which identifies school rehabilitation and reconstruction as one of the priority objectives for the educational sector.

Project Management arrangements

Give a brief description of programme/project implementation and monitoring arrangements utilised including:

- **Programme/project implementation and supervision arrangements; indicate in-country and region based capacity of organisation utilised;**

UN HABITAT used its well tested operation modality approach of field implementation with monitoring done remotely from Amman, adhering to a system of tendering and procurement that is based on full transparency, built-in checks and balances and a clear segregation of functions, as follows:

- UN-HABITAT national consultants, with the active participation of local authorities, community groups and beneficiaries, carry out a detailed assessment of the facility to be rehabilitated. An assessment report is prepared and forms the basis for discussion among all stakeholders to agree on the priority needs. As soon as consensus is reached on the broad scope of the rehabilitation works, a Bill of Quantities is prepared by the consultants which sets out, in precise detail, the scope of work and specifications.
- The Bills of Quantities and the technical specifications are sent to the UN-HABITAT Office for review by UN-HABITAT staff. Once approved, the Programme Manager authorizes the preparation of the tender documents. The rehabilitation works are packaged into small contracts - typically between \$50,000 and \$200,000 in size - that can be carried out by small Iraqi Contractors.
- The tender evaluation process incorporates a system of checks and balances with a clear segregation of functions. Tenders are opened publicly by a Tender Opening Committee and evaluated by a *separate* Tender Evaluation Committee. A *separate* technical team based in

Erbil/Iraq prepares the Agency Estimate, using a computerized system, which generates priced Bill of Quantities using monthly updated market prices. For contracts, which exceed \$150,000 the tender evaluation report is subject to review and approval by the United Nations Office in Nairobi (UNON) and the Local Contracts Committee in Nairobi. Contracts less than \$150,000 are reviewed and approved by the Programme Manager under the terms of a delegation of authority.

- Once the lowest acceptable tender is established, the contract is awarded and work begins.
- The rehabilitation works are supervised and monitored by Iraqi national consultants. Progress of the works was monitored through time-series photographs, daily briefings from the consultants, videos, test reports from approved agencies, and interviews with local authority staff and beneficiaries

- **Main international and national implementing partners involved, their specific roles and responsibilities in project implementation and their interaction with the agency;**

UN-HABITAT worked closely with Cluster Partners, particularly UNICEF and UNESCO, who provided ongoing assistance in setting rehabilitation standards and specifications, programme monitoring and quality assurance.

The project was implemented largely through local contractors and local consultants. The rehabilitation works were carried out through small local contractors in order to maximize the employment impact of the project. Local Consultants were engaged to undertake the assessments, prepare designs and tender documents and supervise the rehabilitation works.

- **Indicate extent of cooperation with relevant line ministry**

What do you suggest if we put the following:

The Directorate of Education/ Ministry of Education, at the governorate level was involved in different stages of the project implementation (assessment phase and in the final inspection of the facility).

- **Specific delivery mechanisms utilised**

- Before the facility is accepted, a final inspection is undertaken by an Acceptance Committee, which comprises representatives of the local authority, the beneficiaries, the relevant department of the Government and UN-HABITAT staff and consultants. The final payment is not released until the Acceptance Committee certifies that all work has been satisfactorily completed and that the supplied items are complaint with the specifications in the tender.
- All contracts incorporate a defects liability clause so that any defects, which emerge after completion have to be repaired by the contractor.

- **Indicate intra cluster cooperation and goods/services other agencies supplied/ common services utilised;**

UN-HABITAT worked closely with Cluster Partners, particularly UNICEF and UNESCO, who provided ongoing assistance in setting rehabilitation standards and specifications, programme monitoring and quality assurance.

- **Details on arrangements for procuring and transporting programme/project inputs, to ensure local appropriateness and acceptability, as well as security and value-for-money under the circumstances – attach as annex 3 final list of contracts awarded;**

UN-HABITAT maintained a register of - now over 1000 - Iraqi Contractors and a comprehensive contractor database, which was used as a decision support system to select contractors who were invited to bid. Between 10 and 20 Iraqi contractors were invited to bid for each rehabilitation contract.

- **Systems for programme/project monitoring (including financial tracking and accounting**

audit), quality control (including lesson learning, and corrections), and impact assessment; methods for data collection and monitoring

- Frequent monitoring to the rehabilitated sites was conducted by the Engineer Consultants in order to monitor the progress of work and report on weekly basis to UN-HABITAT Amman office. This monitoring is supported by photos for the rehabilitated sites on different stages.
- Payments were released to the contractor on the basis of work progress and as indicated in the contract document. The payment processing was conducted primarily in Amman Office depending on certification by the supervisors and the team leaders and on photos that show all details of the work progress.
- Final payment for each individual contract was released upon completion of the work which is approved by the supervisor engineer and the team leader and upon a certification by the beneficiaries confirming their acceptance and handing over of the work.
- After the facility was completed, an interview was held with the beneficiaries to assess the level of satisfaction with the standard of the work.

II. Resources

Total approved budget and summary of resources used for the programme/project from the UNDG Iraq Trust Fund (and non-Trust Fund resources where applicable):

UNDG ITF funds received.

UNDG ITF: \$ 5.27 million

Total: \$ 5.27 million

Commitment: \$5,270,152

Disbursement: \$5,270,152

CATEGORY	Actual COST
1. Personnel	849,912.70
2. Contracts	3,852,688.40
3. Training	30,814.00
4. Transport	0
5. Supplies and commodities	9,050.00
6. Equipment	22,721.50
7. Travel	77,004.18
8. Security	900.00
9. Miscellaneous	82,285.00
10. Agency Management Support	344,776.17
Total Expenditure	5,270,151.95

Human Resources

A total of 10 staff/consultants were deployed for this project of which 2 were international staff.

Project Assets

Assets purchased under the project and their disposal

None

Complete final resources utilisation overview at annex 2.

III. Results

An assessment of the extent to which the programme/project component / programme /project has achieved the outcomes and outputs expected

Other than a minor revision in implementation target caused by inflation, the overall, progress was satisfactory and the project had met its objectives as follows :

- Educational activities were resumed/enhanced in 80 schools which had been comprehensively rehabilitated and expanded to provide an improved learning environment for about 42,000 students, as follows:
 - a. Full rehabilitation and expansion of 48 school buildings in Basrah;
 - b. Full rehabilitation and expansion of 32 school buildings in Nassiriya.
- Skills were developed for an estimated 4,100 construction workers and Iraqi professionals.
- Nearly 80 small Iraqi Contractors were awarded rehabilitation contracts averaging about \$52,000 each.
- Approximately 270,000 person-days of employment were generated through local contractors.
- Approximately 42,000 Iraqi Students were benefited from an improved learning environment
- The problem of overcrowding and congestion has been significantly reduced in 34 schools which have been provided with 131 additional classrooms

Has the original problem the project sought to address been adequately solved –Who have been the main beneficiaries, and how have they benefited?

The problem of overcrowding and congestion has been significantly reduced in 34 schools which were provided with 131 additional classrooms benefiting approximately 6,550 Iraqi students.

Which other stakeholders have gained or lost as a result of the programme/project? How was stakeholder participation handled?

Technical staff from the DoE have effectively participated in the different implementation stages of the project.

Compare results achieved against project benchmarks and to the extent possible targets/benchmarks identified in UN/WB Joint Needs Assessments and/or UN Assistance Strategy and National Development Goals

- 1- The project is considered part of the reconstruction and development programmes presented in the Joint UN-Iraq Assistance Strategy 2005 – 2007 and implemented by the UN agencies through national partners and counterparts and via the cluster B approach
- 2- Following the 2003 Needs Assessment and the 2004 Living Conditions Survey, the Unmet Basic Needs (UBN) study which was jointly launched by the Ministry of Planning and Development Cooperation and UNDP shows that a high percentage of people in Iraq live under various levels of poverty and human deprivation despite the huge economic and natural resources of the country. This study with the Rapid Needs Assessment (RNA) of recently Internally Displaced Persons in Kurdistan Region has highlighted the priority needs as the following: *(since education is not one of them why should we mention them)*
 - Shelter
 - Access to public food and rations
 - Healthcare

- Provision of Water and Sanitation facilities
- Provision of Electricity and Fuel

3- NDS for 2005-2007 emphasized on improving quality of life by developing required policies based on current and future needs. Achieving definite aims till 2015 requires hard efforts and developed policies in all life aspects such as economic, social, environmental and educational. The project is in line with the NDS goal 2 as illustrated hereunder,

Goal (2): Achieve primary education for all

Everyone will have the opportunity for education and necessary skills to be able to enter world economy and have citizen rights and obligations. Educational levels are measured based on rates in the primary level and postgraduate level. According to living standards surveys, illiteracy is wide spread in Iraq; 39% in rural areas, 22% of adults didn't join schools and 9% in secondary schools which is the highest educational level for them.

(Target) (4)

Dialogue continues with the Ministry of Education (MoE) regarding a rapid assessment of the impact of insecurity on school attendance after, UNICEF reported that the number of children not attending school continues to be of concern. The education sub-cluster has been making an essential contribution to the long term goal through its programmes to undertake the physical rehabilitation of schools as well as to provide essential education and recreation materials.

Complete log frame results matrix comparing results foreseen and those achieved and attach as annex 1.

Main activities undertaken and achievements/ impacts:

The key activities included selection and assessment for rehabilitation of 80 schools in Basrah and Nassiriya and implementation of the rehabilitation works.

The impact of the project is as follows:

- ◆ Approximately 42,000 Iraqi Students are now benefiting from an improved learning environment
- ◆ The problem of overcrowding and congestion has been significantly reduced in 34 schools which have been provided with 131 additional classrooms
- ◆ The students are now able to learn in a more secure school environment due to the construction of over 2,980 meters of security walls around the schools
- ◆ Standards of hygiene and sanitation have improved at all schools as a result of the rehabilitation of sanitation facilities at 63 schools and the construction of new sanitation facilities at 17 schools
- ◆ Income and employment opportunities were generated for an estimated 4,000 families (about 28,000 persons)
- ◆ The capacity of the small enterprise sector has been enhanced through the involvement of about 80 small Iraqi contractors in the rehabilitation works.

Implementation constraints, lessons learned from addressing these and knowledge gained from assessments, evaluations and studies that have taken place during the project:

Constraints:

The major constraint is the limitation of the budget allocated for each school in comparison to the size of needs existed.

The other constraint is the bad security situation in the targeted governorates which can be prevailed any time to affect the implementation progress and cause it to delay.

Lessons learnt:

In order to provide an acceptable learning environment, the assessments showed that the provision of additional facilities is essential like additional classrooms, new toilets, and boundary walls. These additional facilities have been provided in order to mitigate the poor condition of schools, congestion in classrooms and convert the schools to child friendly standard which have eventually contributed to the increase of enrolment rate and reduce the drop out rate.

Include major external factors affecting implementation and outcomes and the steps taken in programme/project implementation to address, and minimise or mitigate the potential risks;

- Local curfews due to insecurity (out of control)
- Employment difficulties due to unstable situation and interior conflicts. (out of control)
- US Dollar retrogression against local currency. (out of control)
- Interim payments possible delay. (new operational arrangements were taken to avoid payments' delay)

Key partnerships and inter-agency collaboration, impact on results:

The Ministry of Education, the local Education Directorates and the Head Teachers and Teachers at the Schools have been involved in all procedures relating to identification of project locations, finalizing the scope of rehabilitation works, procurement, quality control and progress monitoring. This has helped to ensure transparency, a greater sense of ownership and consistency.

UN-HABITAT worked closely with Cluster Partners, particularly UNICEF and UNESCO, who provided ongoing assistance in setting rehabilitation standards and specifications, programme monitoring and quality assurance. *(I added this part as it is mentioned at the beginning. What do you think?)*

Highlights and cross cutting issues pertinent to the results e.g. Gender disaggregation, policy engagement and participation of the public:

Were the needs of particularly vulnerable or marginalised groups addressed?

Only the school needs were addressed including the additional classrooms, laboratories, libraries, sanitation facilities, admin buildings and etc *(do you think this is the right answer?)*

How did the beneficiaries of the programme/project participate in its development and delivery?

The school masters were involved in all assessment and implementation activities whom their remarks for individual schools' needs were always welcomed and took into consideration.

How did men and women benefit from the programme/project? How was gender inequalities handled?

The schools were selected on gender equality basis with special focus on Girls' schools to mitigate the dropout rates for girls.

Were environmental concerns addressed including environmental impact/risk assessment where relevant?

Not for the project (?)

Were there any specific issues in relation to the security situation?

Due to the unstable security situation, delays occurred which resulted to compensate the work duration via shifting the planned completion dates to several days ahead.

The unstable security situation has caused delays in work implementation which in turn affected the planned completion dates. *(doesn't this looks better?)*

How did the project contribute to capacity building in ministries and elsewhere?

The technical staff (engineers) from DoE in both governorates participated in the assessment and monitoring of the project implementation, which enhanced their experience in the maintenance and rehabilitation works for schools.

IV. Follow up actions and sustainability

Priority actions that should be supported/implemented following completion of project to build on achievements and partnerships rectify shortcomings encountered and use the lessons learned during the project with strong emphasis on achieving sustainability of the outcomes:

Indicate relevant follow up UNDG ITF project or project proposal where appropriate

(no answer?)

Indication of major adjustments in the strategies, targets or key outcomes and outputs:

Explain here any significant adjustments that had to be made and compare final outcomes and outputs with those originally foreseen

- Original target of 90 schools was decreased to 80 schools due to the following:
 - Change/increase in scope of work within the 80 schools (additional classrooms for the overcrowding problem, construction of additional sanitation facilities, etc.)
 - inflation in USD to Iraqi Dinar
- *(should we mention the No. of governorates was decreased?)*

(I've added this part)

Estimated Budget required:

Budget required for any necessary follow up action

N/A

Annex 1 Key Performance Indicators – Log Frame Matrix

Objectives	Measurable indicators	Means of verification	Outcomes
<p>Development Objective</p> <p>overcrowding & congestion in classrooms and in adequate learning environment</p>	<p>overcrowding and congestion has been significantly reduced in 34 schools which have been provided with 131 additional classrooms</p>		<p>Key project outcome against agreed benchmarks including the JNA and NDS where possible</p>
<p>Immediate Objectives:</p> <p>To strengthen the educational system in Iraq by enhancing access to primary and secondary education and improving the quality of the learning environment</p>	<p>Over 42,000 student were able to attend renovated classes and used the water & sanitation facilities, yards, and admin buildings conveniently</p>	<p>The number of students in each school is mentioned in updated records</p>	<p>Educational activities resumed/enhanced in a total of 90 schools in the selected locations to provide improved education for about 36,000 students;</p>
<p>Outputs :</p> <p>The students are now able to learn in a more secure school environment.</p> <p>Standards of hygiene and sanitation have improved at all schools.</p> <p>Significant contribution to employment generation was maintained</p> <p>The capacity of the small enterprise sector has been enhanced</p>	<p>Construction of over 2,980 meters of security walls around the schools</p> <p>Rehabilitation of sanitation facilities at 63 schools and the construction of new sanitation facilities at 17 schools</p> <p>Around 28,000 labourers were enrolled in the project activities</p> <p>Involvement of about 80 small Iraqi contractors in the rehabilitation works.</p>		<p>Key outcomes against projected outputs</p>

Annex 2 PROJECT COSTS

CATEGORY	UNDG ITF approved budget	Actual COST	Percentage of Approved	Budget Revision approved (give date)	Percentage of revision
1. Personnel · including staff and consultants	709,986	849,912.70	19.71		
2. Contracts · including companies, professional services, grants	3,960,000	3,852,688.40	-2.71		
3. Training	30,000	30,814.00	2.71		
4. Transport	9,600	0	-100.00		
5. Supplies and commodities	0	9,050.00	#DIV/0!		
6. Equipment	13,733	22,721.50	65.45		
7. Travel	106,730	77,004.18	-27.85		
8. Security	19,806	900.00	-95.46		
9. Miscellaneous	75,521	82,285.00	8.96		
10. Agency Management Support	344,776	344,776.17	0.00		
Total Expenditure	5,270,152	5,270,151.95			

Annex 3 List of contract awards by procurement method



C:\Documents and
Settings\Administrato























