**Joint SDG Fund**

**Joint Programme Final Narrative Report**

**PORTFOLIO ON INTEGRATED POLICY AND LNOB**

**Cover page**

**Date of Report:** 2 / December / 2022

|  |
| --- |
| ***Programme title, Number, and Country*** |
| **Country**:State of Palestine  **Joint Programme (JP) Title**:Towards a universal and holistic social protection floor for persons with disabilities (PWD) and older persons (OP) in the State of Palestine Joint Programme  **MPTF Office Project Reference Number[[1]](#footnote-1)**:PSP 2019 PAL |

|  |
| --- |
| ***Programme Duration*** |
| **Start date[[2]](#footnote-2)** (day/month/year):1 January 2020  **Original End date[[3]](#footnote-3)** (day/month/year):31 December 2021  **Actual End date[[4]](#footnote-4)** (day/month/year): 31 August 2022  **Have agencies operationally closed the Programme in their system?** Yes  **Expected financial closure date[[5]](#footnote-5):** 31st May 2023 |

|  |
| --- |
| ***Participating Organizations / Partners*** |
| **RC** (name and email):Lynn Hastings, hastingsl@un.org  **Government Focal Point** (ministry/agency, focal point name, and email):Asem Khamis, akhamis@mosa.gov.ps  **RCO Focal Point** (focal point name and email): Dinksew Taye, dinksew.taye@un.org  **Lead PUNO Focal Point** (focal point name and email):Salah Lahham, World Food Programme (WFP), salah.lahham@wfp.org  **Other PUNO Focal Points** (focal point names and emails):Iain Murray, UNICEF ([imurray@unicef.org](mailto:imurray@unicef.org)), Charis Reid, ILO (reid@ilo.org) |

|  |
| --- |
| ***Programme Budget (US$)*** |
| **Total Budget** (as per Programme Document, without co-funding): **$2,000,000**  **Agency/Other Contributions/Co-funding** (if applicable): **$844,825.04**  **Joint SDG Fund Contribution[[6]](#footnote-6) and co-funding breakdown, by recipient organization**:   |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | | **Agency/others** | **Joint SDG Fund contribution** | **Co-funding** | **Total** | | WFP | 559,790 | 164,776.59 | 724,566.59 | | UNICEF | 750,060 | 314,119.45 | 1,064,179.45 | | ILO | 690,150 | 365,929 | 1,056,079 | | **Total** | **2,000,000** | **844,825.04** | **2,844,825.04** | |

**Table of contents**

Contents

[**Executive summary** 4](#_Toc120865106)

[**I. Overall progress and priority, cross-cutting issues** 5](#_Toc120865107)

[**I.1 Context and the overall approach** 5](#_Toc120865108)

[Ensuring an adaptive and strategic JP 5](#_Toc120865109)

[Link with UNDAF/ UNSD Cooperation Framework 6](#_Toc120865110)

[COVID-19 impact 6](#_Toc120865111)

[**I.2 Update on priority cross-cutting issues** 7](#_Toc120865112)

[UN Development System reform - UN coherence at the country level 7](#_Toc120865113)

[Going beyond “business as usual” to produce catalytic results at scale 7](#_Toc120865114)

[SDG acceleration 8](#_Toc120865115)

[Policy integration and systems change 9](#_Toc120865116)

[Contribution to the improvement of the situation of vulnerable groups 9](#_Toc120865117)

[Mainstreaming Gender equality and women empowerment 9](#_Toc120865118)

[Human rights 10](#_Toc120865119)

[Partnerships 10](#_Toc120865120)

[Mobilizing additional funding and/or financing 11](#_Toc120865121)

[Strategic meetings 11](#_Toc120865122)

[Innovation, learning and sharing 11](#_Toc120865123)

[**II. Final Results** 12](#_Toc120865124)

[Overall progress 12](#_Toc120865125)

[Contribution to Fund’s global results 12](#_Toc120865126)

[JP Outputs and Outcomes 12](#_Toc120865127)

[**III. JP finalization and evaluation** 16](#_Toc120865128)

[Final JP evaluation and lessons learned 16](#_Toc120865129)

[**Annex 1: Consolidated Final Results** 18](#_Toc120865130)

[**1. JP contribution to global Fund’s programmatic results** 18](#_Toc120865131)

[**2. Results as per JP Programmatic Results Framework** 19](#_Toc120865132)

[**Annex 2: Strategic documents** 22](#_Toc120865133)

[**2.1. Contribution to social protection strategies, policies, and legal frameworks** 22](#_Toc120865134)

[**2.2. Focus on vulnerable populations** 27](#_Toc120865135)

# **Executive summary**

The Joint Programme (JP) made considerable progress in supporting MoSD towards strengthening the national social protection system and adoption of social protection floors to meet the needs of persons with disabilities (PWD) and older persons (OP). The programme took a multi-lever approach, tackling the supply-side (duty-bearers), demand-side (rights-holders) and enabling environment constraints such that PWD and OP will access more adequate and cost-effective social protection.

Project outputs were achieved against the set objectives around evidence generation, policy frameworks, service provision and capacity-building and awareness-raising. JP activities included data collection for 20,510 persons with disabilities in the West Bank, to better enable referrals for social services and benefits that can be availed for PWD in the system. A functional disability assessment model was proposed as a first step to moving away from the medical model to support improved identification of persons with disability, enabling a rights-based approach. Additionally, there was evidence generated to aid national discussions towards the passage of a disability law, through a costing exercise. A legislative foundation has aimed to ensure a rights-based approach to social protection for this vulnerable group. Work on mapping social services and feasibility and costing for social pensions made progress on increasing the comprehensiveness of social protection. Capacity development of various key stakeholders also served to increase awareness of SP rights and duty-bearer responsibilities, and to build technical capacities in social protection and for services for PWD. A cash pilot targeting PWD in Hebron using categorical targeting and differentiated transfer values, generated learnings on aspects of shock responsiveness of the system and on the impacts of the cash transfer. JP activities included an assessment of the proposed proxy-means test revision (PMT-F v2), analyzing the impact on coverage of the proposed revisions to the formula and providing an evaluation of its fitness in achieving the cash transfer programme (CTP) objectives of the PMT. A revised eligibility proposal for cash transfers (PMT-F) was presented to government in 2021, with recommendations made for improving the formula and/or its application in social protection programming. It also contains a brief review of a proposed Multi-dimensional Poverty Index (MPI) adopted by the Government in January 2020. MoSD and the World Bank were receptive, particularly to the possibility of redefining the transfer value determination mechanism to allow for more inclusive targeting approaches and alternative transfer value determination mechanisms.

**Result 1:** Data Analysis and Evidence Generation

Estimated rate of completion as of JP end date: 100%

**Result 2:** Policy and Legislation

Estimated rate of completion as of JP end date: 80%

**Result 3:** System and service provision

Estimated rate of completion as of JP end date: 80%

**Result 4:** Demand Generation and Capacity-Building

Estimated rate of completion as of JP end date: 100%

**Result 5:** Extending national focus to People with Disabilities and Older Persons to expand social protection floor. The UNCT will build on Mainstreaming, Acceleration and Policy Support (MAPS), WB, WFP and ILO assessment/analyses that also demonstrate commitment and donor engagement on SP. Palestinian Authorities presented Social Protection as a national priority at UNGA 2018 and included it in its Voluntary National Report (VNR).

Estimated rate of completion as of JP end date: 100%

**Result 6:** By fast-tracking social protection measures in two specific areas, one geographic (Hebron) and one by social group (poor and vulnerable population) they will build evidence for nationwide scale-up.

Estimated rate of completion as of JP end date: 100%

# **I. Overall progress and priority, cross-cutting issues**

## **I.1 Context and the overall approach**

### *Ensuring an adaptive and strategic JP*

During the course of the Joint Programme, there were a number of contextual changes that delayed some activities and led to a no-cost time extension of the programme through to end August 2022 to enable completion of the planned activities, while concurrently reprogramming some of the activities in order to address new challenges that arose during the course of implementation. Specifically:

* The draft disability law submitted to the PA Cabinet for review remains, as yet, not approved. This has meant that the plans embedded in the project design to take forward some of the legislative and policy framework for disability rights have not been feasible in the project, and some of the funding allocated to this has been reprogrammed for other activities.
* The Palestinian Authority (PA)’s capacity was significantly limited in 2020 during the onset of the COVID-19 crisis. Due to nationwide lockdowns and social distancing requirements, many of the civil servants could not work with the Ministry being closed for some time and some key decision makers within the MoSD themselves suffering from the virus. Government priorities also changed, focusing on the immediate humanitarian needs and emergency response arising due to the pandemic, while social protection and other projects were deprioritized through 2020. Key activities were delayed due to COVID-19, such as the revision toward a disability functional assessment model, which required in-country specialized support. This activity would have been beneficial to be implemented earlier in the project and thus impacted the flow of the theory of change.
* The PA’s capacity was further constrained in 2020 due to the financial crisis, with the Israeli authorities withholding 80% of the PA’s revenues from May to November 2020, with civil service salaries unable to be paid and further constraining the Government’s capacity to act.
* The PA announced legislative and presidential elections in early 2021; the first elections in more than a decade. In anticipation of the Palestinian Legislative Council, the Government recommended that the JP pause the policy and legislation-related activities, such as approval of the PWD law, until the new council is active. A Presidential Decree was subsequently issued in May 2021, postponing legislative elections. This had knock-on implications for the JP; however, the JP scoped alternate means to enable legislative progress.
* While the implementation of the JP accelerated in early 2021, it saw further delays with the onset of conflict in the Gaza Strip in May 2021. The conflict took the lives of around 250 Palestinians and displaced thousands of people within Gaza. The PA and the UN agencies necessarily reoriented their focus to the immediate humanitarian needs arising from the crisis.
* In 2022, the project extension granted sufficient time for the JP to implement all the planned activities and deliver expected results – ultimately extending the national focus of the social protection system to the vulnerable populations of PWD and OP.
* The JP team and Government partners devised ways to adapt to working under the COVID-19 context, for example, by conducting data collection remotely or organizing consultations in a hybrid manner (both online and in-person).
* Key sizeable activities such as the development of the PWD database, mapping of social service providers, action plans for both PWD and OP and steps towards their implementation, as well as the development of services packages for PWD and OP were launched and continued through 2021.
* While most key activities remained the same, they required some additional time to be implemented and, some activities were reprogrammed (less than 25 percent) to reflect changes on the ground and for the JP to adapt to needs and requirements of the new context. The key changes included:
* The assessment of needs among PWD and OP was updated as a precursor to the definition and costing of services packages tailored to the two groups. This additional work was designed to capture new needs and vulnerabilities emerging out of the two crises and to adapt the diagnosis being made with respect to service offerings to new realities. This request came from MoSD to reflect the impact of COVID and recent escalation on poor people.
* Recognizing delays, especially on the policy front, and with the crises demonstrating the need for the social protection system to become more flexible and shock responsive, the JP adapted some of its activities and developed a cash pilot to test the shock responsiveness of the social protection system for PWD and to generate lessons for future policy and programming. This amended approach to the initial pilot, targeted a total of 4,699 PWD beneficiaries across 2,669 households in the Hebron governorate of the West Bank. Targeted households comprised a total of 13,756 members, (who share the additional care-related costs incurred by PWDs). Targeted households were based on recent data collections establishing the latest overview of PWDs and their needs, through embedding of relevant questions into the MoSD questionnaire (for the social registry).
* The pilot aims to test categorical targeting approaches by targeting households with PWDs registered in the NCTP and waiting lists, and provide differentiated transfer values depending on the number of PWD per household (most government-led social assistance programmes typically provide flat rate transfers without taking into consideration the number of PwD in the household). By targeting different categories of potential beneficiaries and providing differentiated transfer values, the pilot generated learnings on multiple aspects of the current shock responsiveness of the system and how it could be improved, as well as on the impacts of the cash transfer on households. The evaluation yielded recommendations on policy, targeting, coordination and operational considerations, specific to implementing social protection floors for PWD.

### *Link with UNDAF/ UNSD Cooperation Framework*

This Joint Programme is linked with the current Palestinian UN Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF 2018-2022) through Strategic Priority 4, Leaving No One Behind: Social Development and Protection, and the upcoming UN Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework (UNSDCF 2023- 2025), Outcome 2: Palestinians, including the most vulnerable, have equal access to sustainable, inclusive, gender-responsive and quality social services, social protection, and affordable utilities.

The JP contributed to the current UNDAF Strategic Priority 4 on Leaving No One Behind (LNOB): Social Development and Social Protection and its Outcome 4.2 that all Palestinians, especially the most vulnerable, have greater access to unified, integrated, and shock-responsive social protection systems through its achievement of -

* A comprehensive and integrated database for PWD which will inform evidence-based policy-making and programming;
* A medium-term vision and financing framework for SP reform building on SPF assessment;
* Review of current Cash Transfer Programme design from the perspective of PWD and develop rights-based approach for identification and selection of PWD and OP for SP programmes;
* Increased awareness of SP rights and participation in SP systems implementation amongst PWD and OP.

The JP is in line with the updated Social Development Sector Strategy (SDSS) 2021-2023 which highlights the importance of a rights-based approach to social protection. The PUNOs participated actively in the Social Protection Sector Working Group (SPSWG) to ensure that the JP remained relevant and that it contributed to and stays aligned with key strategic developments on the ground. The PUNOs have also consulted bilaterally with other key stakeholders such as the EU and the World Bank.

### *COVID-19 impact*

The JP faced significant delays in implementation of some activities over the course of the Joint Programme due to COVID-19 due to social distancing procedures, suspension of international travel, and with government efforts being focused on addressing the impacts of COVID-19. This meant that the implementation of some activities was significantly delayed, and others had to be implemented through more remote modalities. The JP responded by adding some activities to support the Palestinian government to better assess and address the impacts of COVID-19 through Socio-Economic Impact Assessment and Social Impact Analysis. The JP did not formally repurpose its budget but it decided to reprogramme some of the activities as elaborated above considering contextual changes.

Whilst the JP did not undertake activities directly addressing the socioeconomic impact of COVID-19, the JP reprogrammed some of its total budget to reorient the planned pilot of a services package towards a cash transfer pilot for PWD, to develop more inclusive targeting approaches and test shock-responsive social protection procedures. The timing of the pilot came as the COVID-19 crisis highlighted the importance of national institutions’ readiness to respond to shocks and emergencies swiftly and efficiently.

The JP is also aligned to the UNCT COVID-19 Development System Response developed under the leadership of the UN Resident Coordinator’s leadership in support of the Government of Palestine. Social protection is one of the five major areas of focus for the UNCT and the Response Plan highlights that the “UNCT will assist the Government of Palestine in modernizing its social protection systems and promoting the transfer of technology, including effective identification and registration of beneficiaries, etc.”

The impacts of COVID-19 were included, where possible, into all analyses undertaken by the JP. For instance, the SPF assessment results were initially shared with stakeholders in February 2020, but the official publication of the report was delayed to take note of the impacts of COVID-19 and responses.

The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic continued to affect several activities under the JP throughout 2021. In particular, due to the movement restrictions into Israel which limited the capacity to bring in the best international expertise on some of the specialized subject matters covered by this project, such as on the Functional Assessment of disability. While the UN agencies have pressed ahead with the project regardless of these limitations some activities were postponed to allow the required international expertise to be brought on board. While this delayed the delivery of the project, this strategy was determined to be more effective in the longer term with the policy shifts targetted not time-critical, enabling adjustments to be undertaken in line with the evolving situation and needs on the ground, and enabling discussions with the EU on the potential to scope out options to provide funding to take forward these JP activities in future.

## **I.2 Update on priority cross-cutting issues**

### *UN Development System reform - UN coherence at the country level*

The UN Joint Programme prioritized the UN working together and is a key example of UN Joint Programming under the UNDAF Outcome Strategic Priority on Social Protection/LNOB. The Joint Programme enabled extensive collaboration through joint planning in the project design and joint implementation, including through jointly organized activities, such as the Hebron cash pilot and 5-day TRANSFORM[[7]](#footnote-7) training.

The success of bringing the three UN agencies together on joint programming on social protection policy work is highlighted by the interest shown in the agencies’ work by the EU, with current scoping underway to look at options to continue to fund activities under the JP to support future efforts of social protection policy reforms with the Palestinian Authority. Furthermore, the Joint Programme has laid the foundations for subsequent Joint Programming initiatives, specifically the "Strengthening nexus coherence and responsiveness in the Palestinian social protection sector” with ILO and UNICEF, collaborating on ensuring rights-based and cross-nexus programmatic coherence and enhancing responsiveness of the social protection system. A second Joint Programme “Strengthening livelihoods and social protection in response to rising food prices, rising energy prices and tightening financial controls” has WFP and ILO collaborating on social protection measures to meet the needs of increased vulnerabilities arising from the Ukraine conflict.

### *Going beyond “business as usual” to produce catalytic results at scale*

The Joint Programme took forward priorities outlined in the updated MoSD Social Development Sector Strategy (SDSS) 2021-2023, accelerating the provisions of social protection floors to some of the most vulnerable and previously underserved groups, namely PWD and OP. JP work focused on enabling the provision of services and support in line with the needs of these vulnerable groups, through enabling collection of evidence to inform action, and supporting efforts at improving legislation, delivery systems and programming in support of these groups.

Throughout the course of the project, the PUNOs worked closely with key counterparts to accelerate joint objectives. For example, the creation of the PWD database has enabled a better understanding of PWD needs and has been combined with efforts by the MoSD to build a social registry, thereby accelerating the availability of an integrated dataset to enable better targeting of the most vulnerable. Development of the database drew on the work of other key social protection actors, notably linking with the work being undertaken by the MoSD with support of the World Bank on the Social Registry development, to enable joint data collection for the social registry and digitization efforts and so avoid fragmented support to the MoSD.

Additionally, efforts to test more shock-responsive targeting and transfers to the most vulnerable, through a pilot of PWD in the Hebron governorate was implemented at a time when the PA’s financial constraints saw three of four missed quarterly cash transfers in 2021 and a further two missed payments in the first half of 2022. The National Cash Transfer Programme targets 115,000 households, of which some 40 percent are accounted for by households with PWD and a further 40 percent with OP. The pilot to test shock-responsiveness not only provided much-needed support to PWD as one of the most vulnerable groups at a time of multiple crises but also enabled a shift towards rights-based social protection benefits and to look at ways to improve the shock-responsiveness of social assistance. In so doing, the pilot used disability status for eligibility determination. The transfer value calculation was also based on the number of PWD in each household. This represented a departure from the PMT-F targeting methodology used by the NCTP, instead using a rights-based framework of assistance. The JP undertook a lessons learned evaluation of the pilot to inform future policy and interventions on shock-responsive and rights-based social protection.

The work of the JP has also reinforced and complemented the following ongoing projects in support of the MoSD’s Social Protection reform agenda: Social Protection Enhancement Project (SPEP) under World Bank Funding; Strengthening nexus coherence and responsiveness in the Palestinian social protection sector under EU funding; Monitoring and Evaluation through EU technical support. Given the importance and relevance of this work to ensure that the social protection system targets and supports the most vulnerable groups, discussions are currently underway with the EU to look at the potential for building on and scaling up these efforts with support from the EU from 2023.

With the increase in needs arising from the pandemic, the JP also enabled and supported efforts to accelerate response under the UNCT COVID-19 Development System Response developed under the leadership of the UN Resident Coordinator’s leadership in support of the Government of Palestine. Social protection is one of the five major areas of focus for the UNCT and the Response Plan highlighted that the “UNCT will assist the Government of Palestine in modernizing its social protection systems and promoting the transfer of technology, including effective identification and registration of beneficiaries, etc.”

### *SDG acceleration*

The JP aimed to contribute primarily to the following seven SDG targets.

* Goal 1: End Poverty; 1.3 Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable
* Goal 2: Zero Hunger; 2.1 By 2030, end hunger and ensure access by all people, in particular the poor and people in vulnerable situations, including infants, to safe, nutritious and sufficient food all year round
* Goal 5: Gender equality; 5.1: End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere
* Goal 8: Decent Work; 8.5 By 2030, achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value
* Goal 10: Reduced Inequalities; 10.2 By 2030, empower and promote the social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status
* Goal 16: Peace, Justice, Strong Institutions; 16.6 Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels
* Goal 17: Partnership; 17.9 Enhance international support for implementing effective and targeted capacity-building in developing countries to support national plans to implement all the Sustainable Development Goals, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation

The JP accelerated progress towards these SDGs by taking a multi-lever approach that addressed constraints on the supply-side (duty-bearers), demand-side (rights-holders) and in the enabling environment. In 2020, the JP focused on strengthening the supply side of social protection mechanisms for PWD and OP, by generating necessary evidence on the needs of PWD and OP and thereby laying the groundwork to develop policies, systems and practices for integrated service delivery and on mainstreaming them in the design of the social protection system. Concurrently, it supported efforts at data systems strengthening. In 2021, the JP stepped up efforts to strengthen the demand side through public awareness-raising campaigns and workshops. In 2022, the JP continued with capacity-strengthening efforts, through the implementation of a TRANSFORM workshop that allowed for the consolidation of work already implemented and with the involvement of mid- and high-level policymakers. Through tackling different dimensions of the constraints, the JP aimed to support Palestine to adopt a more inclusive and rights-based social protection system and accelerate progress toward achieving the SDGs.

### *Policy integration and systems change*

Joint Programme work has engaged multiple Ministries – particularly the Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Health, and Ministry of Education, recognizing the cross-cutting issues and support to PWD and OP across government organizations. Similarly, work has engaged a range of civil society organizations, as well as development partners across the UN, World Bank and EU. Key highlights included:

* Review of all relevant sector strategies of 2021-2023 from a disability perspective to learn lessons and to develop recommendations and sectoral policies and programmes to enhance services for PWD to be included in the coming sector strategies 2024-2029.
* Action plan for the implementation of the Strategic Plan for PWD was developed through three rounds of consultations with national and international partners including PWD. The final version of the action plan was approved by participant partners and endorsed by the three main line ministries (MoSD, MoE and MoH).
* The Palestine Disability Assessments for Social Protection report was developed to guide the Palestinian Government, mainly MoSD and MoH, on how the disability assessment tools can be reformed through moving away from the current medical assessment to the functional assessment approach, which assesses a person’s functional limitations as part of assessing their eligibility for assistance and for services. The discussions on the revision to the Disability Assessment model - from a medical model towards a functional model for persons with disability - has brought together the Ministries of Social Development and the Ministry of Health. This discussion has been challenging given the current disability assessment model has not been revised in many years and there is little understanding of how a rights-based perspective on disability can be applied to the assessment process.
* A 5-day capacity-building social protection training was implemented in Arabic for MoSD officials and representatives from 4 other line ministries working on social protection and with participation from key local CSOs. This helped to build a shared understanding of social protection across stakeholders (within MoSD and beyond), including the principles of comprehensive social protection systems as well as a shared learning on how the sector currently operates in OPT.
* A 3-day training of trainers was held for organizations representing and working with OP, including attendance from MoSD, MoH and older persons themselves. This helped to build a coalition of organizations working for OP social protection in OPT, which will continue beyond the JP end date.

### *Contribution to the improvement of the situation of vulnerable groups*

The JP focused on the specific needs of Persons with Disabilities (PWD) and Older Persons (OP). Whilst a range of specialized services are available to PWD and OP, the needs assessment highlighted significant gaps in geographical coverage and the types of services that are available and accessible. The quality of services was also found to be poor. The JP took a rights-based approach, assessing the needs of these two vulnerable groups and constructing a comprehensive service package to address these, in addition to introducing recommendations to reform the disability assessment, moving away from the current medical assessment to the functional assessment approach. Similarly, work on costing of this exercise on services packages and a draft disability law took forward dialogue in terms of feasibility for implementation, working to establish a legislative foundation and ensure a rights-based approach. The comprehensiveness of the social protection system was also enhanced through work on mapping social services and feasibility and costing for social pensions. Capacity development of various key stakeholders increased awareness of SP rights and duty-bearer responsibilities. The creation of a PWD database covering 20,510 individuals in the West Bank supports improved programme design for PWD, enabling referrals to other social services and benefits available in the system.

Estimated number of individuals that were reached through JP efforts:

**Total number:** Total of 4,669 PWD beneficiaries across 2,669 HHs. The targeted households comprise a total of 13,756 members, all of whom typically share the additional care-related costs incurred by PWDs.

**Percentage of women and girls:** Of the 2,669 households, 1,016 were female-headed households. Within targeted households, there were a total of 6,995 females.

### *Mainstreaming Gender equality and women empowerment*

The JP aimed to mainstream gender throughout all dimensions of the JP analysis, implementation and monitoring, ensuring a gender marker of 2.1. The PWD database developed by the JP incorporates disaggregated data on gender. In addition to a contextual gender analysis, the JP also consulted and involved organizations working directly with female PWDs and OPs to support them in strengthening their capacity. In addition to that, direct technical support to MoSD and the relevant national committee was provided to develop the National Social Development Sector Strategy 2021-2023, which is a gender-sensitive document that has disaggregated data on gender and promotes policies and interventions with gender sensitivity.

Estimated % of overall disbursed funds spent on Gender equality and Women empowerment by the end of JP: 30%

### *Human rights*

This Joint Programme builds upon Palestinian Authority’s State Party reporting on the human rights treaty bodies to which it signed up in 2014 and for which the first State Party reports began in 2018. The PA drafted its first State Party report to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disability (CRPD) in 2019 in which the PA identified many policy and operational challenges. Due to COVID-19 the CRPD Committee has not yet met to deliberate on the PA’s State Party report, however, this Joint Programme builds upon some of the areas identified including the need for better data, evidence and policy frameworks for Persons with Disability.

The JP is built on the ideas of the following human rights mechanisms:

* Convention on the rights of persons with disabilities (CRPD)
  + The JP was developed taking the CRPD into consideration. It realizes primarily article 28 on “adequate standard of living and social protection” which states that the “States Parties recognize the right of persons with disabilities to social protection and to the enjoyment of that right without discrimination on the basis of disability” and that the state parties “ensure access by persons with disabilities, in particular women and girls with disabilities and older persons with disabilities, to social protection programmes and poverty reduction programmes.”
  + The joint programme builds upon the work of the Ministry of Social Development and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to discuss the first State Party Report on the Convention of the Rights of Persons with Disability at the Geneva Committee in 2023 presents an important opportunity to push for the approval of the draft Disability Law through the Cabinet.
  + To realize and ensure PWD’s equal access to social protection, the JP has a component on developing comprehensive policy and financing framework for PWD which is in line with CRPD’s article 4 on obliging the state parties to “adopt all appropriate legislative, administrative and other measures for the implementation of the rights recognized in the present Convention.”
* UN Secretary General’s Report on human rights of Older Persons and the United Nations Principles for Older Persons
  + The United Nations Principles for Older Persons outline and encourage the governments to incorporate the 18 principles into their programmes which include that “older persons should have access to social and legal services to enhance their autonomy, protection and care” and that they should be “treated fairly regardless of age, gender, racial or ethnic background, disability or other status…”
* Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW): While the CEDAW does not specifically mention “women and girls with disabilities” or “elderly females,” it is the principal mechanism promoting women empowerment and gender equality. Recognizing the intersecting inequalities, the female PWD and OPs face, the JP aims to incorporate gender mainstreaming into all aspects of its implementation.
* Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 1948 Article 22 on the right to social security and the international labor standards (specifically ILO C102 and R202) that give substance and set minimum standards to realize this right.
* All human rights mechanisms highlight the importance of involving the target population (PWD, OP, females) in the development and implementation of relevant policy and legal frameworks and programmes and to actively consult them in decision-making progress. The JP has a component on enhancing awareness of social protection rights and participation in social protection systems implementation amongst OP and PWD through workshops for relevant parties and general public awareness-raising campaigns.

### *Partnerships*

The JP partners have continued to work with key social protection sector actors, including through the Local Aid Coordination Sector Working Group, and the complementary development partners’ Social Protection coordination meetings. The three PUNOs engaged with these working group structures to coordinate with other international actors on Social Protection, including with the EU, World Bank, UNRWA and FAO, and efforts are made to link to programmes supported by these actors. The Ministry has stated that World Bank’s Social Protection Enhancement Project (SPEP) remains central to national social protection reforms, the project has worked to coordinate all outputs and activities with the Ministry, the SPEP project management unit, and other social protection partners. For example, the PWD database was aligned and integrated with the World Bank’s support to MoSD towards collecting updated information on multi-dimensional poverty and establishing a social registry.

Within the Joint Programme implementation, the JP enhanced partnerships, particularly in the concluding stages of the project which saw planned work realized as fully joint activities, such as the TRANSFORM training and the Hebron Cash pilot. JP activities were also able to build upon one another, for example the services needs assessment, matching and costing work drew from important work completed on the services mapping exercise. Finally, the assessment of the new proxy-means test formula (PMT-F v2) aimed to enable more vulnerability-oriented targeting based around multi-dimensional poverty and has led to further work on a new JP with WFP and ILO, taking forwards analysis on alternative transfer value determination mechanisms.

### *Mobilizing additional funding and/or financing*

The PUNOs mobilized funding to co-fund JP efforts and galvanized additional programme engagement, such as through the EU-funded programme on “Strengthening nexus coherence and responsiveness in the Palestinian social protection sector”. Discussions are also underway with the EU on the potential to take forward and continue funding the JP from 2023. The ongoing joint work with the MOSD enabled opportunities for discussion on other gaps within the national social protection system, which included the need for the development of more shock responsive social protection systems. UNICEF has also mobilized funding from the UK/FCDO and ECHO towards building a more Shock Responsive Social Protection system.

### *Strategic meetings*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Type of event** | **Yes** | **No** | **Description/Comments** |
| Annual JP development partners’/donors’ event |  |  | Donors’ meeting held 26 January 2021 with staff from local missions / global development donors to SDG-F (EU, Italy, Spain, etc.). |
| Final JP event (closing) |  |  |  |
| Other strategic events |  |  |  |

### *Innovation, learning and sharing*

The PUNOs regularly shared updates, feedback and lessons learned through technical team meetings and the steering committee meetings for the JP and the consultative meetings it had with other stakeholders such as the government, the EU and the World Bank. Highlights of work include findings on analysis of key issues such as how to strengthen social assistance targeting, building on lessons from the current Proxy Means Testing approach, and more analysis to define and cost service packages for OP and PWD. Multi-stakeholder events have been held to discuss findings and the way forwards.

# **II. Final Results**

### *Overall progress*

All expected results achieved

Majority of expected results achieved

Only some expected results achieved

The JP succeeded in taking forward all of its planned activities (and reprogramming in response to contextual changes) and delivering on all outputs. However, meaningful movement on the high-level outcomes proved challenging in the context of COVID-19 outbreaks and recurrent annual fiscal crises throughout the project implementation. The SoP is a unique context characterized by frequent shocks and therefore significant flexibility was required in system capacity-building approaches to ensure achievement of project outputs.

### *Contribution to Fund’s global results*

**Contribution to Joint SDG Fund Outcome 1 (as per targets set by the JP)**

Integrated multi-sectoral policies to accelerate SDG achievement implemented with greater scope and scale

The work of the Joint SDG-Fund project has contributed to wider policy dialogue on social protection systems development, giving the UN agencies a platform from which to discuss alongside the World Bank and the European Union, who are the biggest donors to the Social Protection sector in the State of Palestine. The World Bank is rolling out a Social Protection Enhancement Project (SPEP) which MOSD sees as the central pillar of Social Protection reforms with the PA. The work which the UN agencies are undertook through the SDG Fund complemented the work of the SPEP project, with a focus on persons with disabilities and the elderly (identified as priority groups). This work included service package design, case referral systems, and data generation and management. All of these are essential pillars as the PA, and specifically the MOSD, move towards the provision of holistic social protection floors.

**Contribution to Joint SDG Fund Output 3 (as per targets set by the JP)**

Integrated policy solutions for accelerating SDG progress implemented

Joint Programme work builds upon previous work in other sectors/programmes that complement this effort to build a holistic social protection floor for PWD and OP. UNICEF is building upon work on Early Childhood Development (ECD) and Early Childhood Intervention (ECI) for children with disabilities and developmental delays. In 2021 UNICEF worked with the MoH, the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Social Development, and the World Bank to leverage resources for strengthening ECD and Early Childhood Intervention (ECI) systems. Building on previously developed models for parenting education and ECI, UNICEF supported the three sectoral ministries to roll out and implement the Palestinian national multi-sectoral Developmental-Behavioral Scales tool. The work on the Functional Disability Assessment in 2022 will build upon this best practice. In addition, a costing analysis of the package of ECD services was conducted and the development of an ECD investment case, including the action plan for the scale-up of the ECD services. The ECD investment case was validated and recommendations were endorsed by the three sectoral ministries for action, informing the ongoing revision and update of the national sectoral strategies including health, education and social development. In 2021, about 631 children with disabilities, benefited from the early detection of developmental delays and intervention services including assistive devices, in West Bank and the Gaza Strip.

### *JP Outputs and Outcomes*

**Achievement of expected JP outputs**

**Under Output 1. (Data analysis and generation) the JP has achieved the following -**

* Creation of a database for persons with disabilities – A database for persons with disability was created, in coordination with the MoSD and the World Bank’s efforts to build a social registry. A data collection questionnaire went through a highly consultative process with key stakeholders to capture relevant information comprehensively and inform the database. A local company was contracted to carry out data collection activities and input data directly into the national registry system. Data collection was completed for 20,510 PWD in the West Bank, updating information on the caseload eligible for the National Cash Transfer Programme (NCTP). These efforts were combined with efforts towards a social registry by MoSD and WB, including embedding relevant questions into the MoSD’s data collection exercise of all beneficiaries.
* Needs assessment for OP and PWD – A comprehensive needs assessment report for PWD and OP was finalized to inform the identification of gaps in the availability and quality of social services essential to the well-being of these two target groups.
* Analytical study on the characteristics of PWD – The JP conducted, in partnership with the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS), a comprehensive analytical study on the characteristics of persons with disabilities (PWD) in the State of Palestine “[Characteristics of Individuals with Disabilities in Palestine: An Analytical Study Based on the Population, Housing and Establishments Census 2007, 2017](http://www.pcbs.gov.ps/Downloads/book2532.pdf)”. The study gives an overview on PWD in Palestine and will help to ensure improved planning and policy development for PWD. The study provides a profile analysis of the people with disabilities by individual and household characteristics (such as residence, age, gender, region, education, etc.) enabling us to better understand who the persons with disabilities are and their fulfillment of basic needs. Moreover, this study compares the status of persons with disabilities over time using previous Census data of 2007 and the Disabled Individuals Survey of 2011. The individual-level and comparative analyses of the PWDs are complemented with a multivariate analysis that assessed how disability 1) impacts access to basic services; 2) generates (negative) externalities on members of the same household, and 3) affects future opportunities for labor market inclusion and economic mobility. Exploring the situation of PWDs in Palestine through updated Census data enables a better understanding of the successes and limitations of Palestinian communities in catering to the specialized needs of PWD. This knowledge can form the empirical basis for evidence-based advocacy for PWDs and assist in formulating impactful policy instruments and programming to curtail the disadvantages and address the needs of PWDs in Palestine.
* Mapping of social service providers – A mapping of social services providers generated: i) a comprehensive database of social service providers in the West Bank and 50% in the Gaza Strip, especially those providing services to PWD and OP ii) a profile for each service provider, and iii) a full analytical report on the available services for PWD and OP in the West Bank, including regional and service gap analysis. While the analysis on Gaza Strip covers only 50% of social service providers, UNICEF is continuing to work with MoSD to complete the work in Gaza Strip. The deliverables each support the building of a unified national social registry and national case management and referral systems.
* Review of poverty targeting approaches – An assessment was conducted on the proposed proxy-means test [revision (PMT-F v2)](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_848798.pdf), analysing the impact on coverage of the proposed revisions to the formula and providing an evaluation of its fitness in achieving the cash transfer programme (CTP) objectives of the PMT. A revised eligibility proposal for cash transfers (PMT-F) was presented to government in 2021, with recommendations for improving the formula and/or its application in social protection programming. It also contains a brief review of a proposed Multi-dimensional Poverty Index (MPI) adopted by the government in January 2020. MoSD and the World Bank were receptive, particularly to the possibility of redefining the transfer value determination mechanism. Subsequent analysis and recommendations are being produced on a) inclusive targeting approaches and b) alternative transfer value determination mechanisms (funded under another ILO programme). A [social protection floor assessment](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_831347.pdf), “On the Road to Universal Social Protection: A social protection floor assessment in the Occupied Palestinian Territory” was developed with contributions from the Joint Programme (JP). This report generated interest from sector stakeholders including MoSD and has since been translated into Arabic. The ILO will continue to follow up on recommendations under this report, including during the preparation of the next Social Development Sector Strategy in 2023.

**Under Output 2. (Policy and Legislation) the JP has achieved the following -**

* Feasibility and costing of social pension – a comprehensive package of work has been conducted on the feasibility for an old-age social pension in OPT to support the implementation of the National Strategic Plan for Older Persons (OP) (2021-2026). The package includes: i) a feasibility study to detail the existing legal and policy framework providing an entry point for a social pension in OPT; ii) a policy brief to advocate on the need for a social pension in OPT, detailing regional and international best practice and documenting lived experiences of OP in OPT; and iii) a report on inclusive targeting, detailing human-rights and incentive-compatible ways to operationalise a social pension in OPT. separate
* Costing of the revised disability law – The costing provided an overall picture on the expected impact on the budgets of the government, private sector, civil society and local governments, which will help to better plan for the implementation of the law. However, it is important to note that the approval of the disability law has been delayed. After consulting with relevant parties, the PUNOs reprogrammed some of the other activities originally built on the assumption that the disability law would be approved.
* Cash pilot for PWD to test the shock responsiveness of the social protection system – a cash pilot targeting PWD in Yatta in Hebron Governorate was completed, generating lessons for future policy and programming. The pilot tested categorical targeting approaches and provided differentiated transfer values depending on the number of PWD per households (as compared with flat rate transfers typically provided without taking into consideration the number of PwD in the household). The pilot also generated learnings on multiple aspects of shock responsiveness of the system and on the impacts of the cash transfer. The project worked with MoSD to provide a one-off cash transfer to 4,669 PWD beneficiaries (across) 2,669 households. Disbursements were carried out through WFP’s cash transfer platform given constraints faced by the MoS, affording an opportunity to learn lessons in terms of strengthening disbursements through the MoSD’s system. The recently updated national social registry list was used for the identification of targeted beneficiaries and transfer values established according to the number of PWD per household. The transfer value ranged between NIS 520–904 per household (HH), based on the monthly average payment of the National Cash Transfer Programme (NCTP) of NIS 424 plus additional transfers provided on the basis of the number of PWD in the HH. The evaluation yielded key policy recommendations and operational learnings on targeting, coordination and operations.
* Creation of an Action Plan for implementation of the Strategic Plan for PWD – An Action Plan for PWD 2022-2023 was developed and linked to the National Social Development Sector Strategy, the National Development Plan and the SDGs. The action plan was developed through three rounds of consultations with national and international partners including PWD. The final version was approved by the participant partners and endorsed by the three main line ministries (MoSD, MoE, and MoH).
* Review the relevant sector strategies from a disability perspective – Key national strategies (the National Development Plan 2021-2023 and all relevant sector strategies) were reviewed from a disability perspective. Recommendations were developed for sectoral policies and programmes to enhance services for PWD to be included in the coming national sector strategies 2024-2029.

**Under Output 3. (System and Service Provision) the JP has achieved the following -**

* Functional Disability Assessment – The current disability assessment and determination systems were assessed, and the JP worked with the government, mainly MoSD and MoH, in developing systems that are more compliant with the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD). This work was aligned with the international principles of inclusion and a more functional based approach to assessing disability informed by the International Classification of Functioning (ICF). A report with a proposed model has been developed with an Arabic version to be shared with both line ministries and a more detailed debriefing on the process and recommendations planned for early 2023 using other funds.
* Definition and costing of service packages tailored for PWD and OP – the definition and costing of the service packages follows on from the need assessment study. The assessment also investigated experiences associated with the delivery and use of services – using a qualitative approach, the needs of PWD and OP were juxtaposed with the service provision landscape. Coupled with a completed supply-side review of social service availability, gaps in availability and service quality were assessed and recommendations were made for making key investments in the social services offering for OP and PWD to ensure access to a minimum “packages” standard to be integrated into MoSD’s case management system.

**Under Output 4. (Awareness and Capacity-Building) the JP has achieved the following -**

* Building capacities of elderly advocates and raising awareness: A programme of support was implemented to develop the capacities of Palestinian affiliate organizations advocating for OP rights throughout the West Bank and Gaza Strip. The project developed training curricula and materials to raise awareness on OP rights in OPT, including social protection rights found in international conventions and national legislation, where appropriate. A 3-day training of trainers was delivered for 32 participants, through a hybrid model in Gaza and the West Bank. A national campaign for the rights of older persons was rolled out, including 5 videos telling the story of older persons in Palestine and the dissemination of the policy brief for social pensions in Arabic and English.
* Capacity-building of MoSD Disability Department and the General Union for PWD (GUPWD): A needs assessment for both beneficiary institutions were undertaken, ten training activities were conducted; five training activities targeted both beneficiary institutions in the West Bank and four training activities targeted the GUPWD in the Gaza Strip in addition to one on job training for the GUPWD that led to development of a Strategic Framework for the GUPWD for the years 2023-2027 and a Mechanisms of Coordination and Networking. Coaching for MoSD disability department took place and led to development of an implementation plan for the department for the years 2022-2023. This assignment equipped decision makers (within the MoSD Disability Department) with the necessary technical and management skills to enhance social protection floors for PWD. The capacity-building will enlighten subsequent decisions regarding the provision of social protection floors for PWD, for provision of basic social services for PWD, and to enhance protecting PWD rights.
* Delivery of social protection training: A 5-day social protection training course (TRANSFORM) was implemented in Arabic for MoSD officials and representatives from other relevant line ministries working on social protection, and with participation from key local CSOs. TRANSFORM is a capacity-building initiative on the administration of social protection floors for practitioners in the Arab and African region, with a focus on non-contributory social protection. The training package has been recently made available in Arabic and supported the local capacity for leadership and coordination of the social protection sector in OPT. A further phase of this training is planned to be conducted using other funds upon the MOSD request.

**Achievement of expected JP outcomes**

The expected JP outcomes of increasing social protection coverage among the target groups and reducing poverty was ambitious in the dual context of continued COVID-19 outbreaks and recurrent annual fiscal crises experienced by the Palestinian Authority. The poverty incidence is anticipated to have risen substantially as a result of the pandemic, with measures put in place by this project seeking to cushion some of this impact and protect the most vulnerable, notably PWD and OP. Meanwhile, government budget constraints coupled with the suspension of external support provided by international donors to the country’s flagship social protection programme, the Palestinian National Cash Transfer Programme (PNCTP), forced the suspension of planned quarterly payments, during which time WFP continued to provide monthly top-ups to this. External funding for the PNCTP resumed in June 2022, with the first PNCTP payment resuming the subsequent month and full payment only resuming in October 2022.

**Monitoring and data collection:**

Standard monitoring approaches have been utilized, with flexibility added under prior COVID-19 conditions to enable remote monitoring. For the Hebron cash pilot, post-distribution monitoring and Focus Group Discussions fed into the production of an evaluation report, yielding key policy recommendations and operational learnings on targeting, coordination and operations. For the overall project, coordination meetings took place at regular intervals to guide the implementation of the project, and all partners attended validation meetings with MoSD on key outputs such as the services package and costing, as well as the functional disability assessment.

# **III. JP finalization and evaluation**

### *Final JP evaluation and lessons learned*

The date when the evaluation was launched (month/year): June 2022

The date when the evaluation report was approved (month/year): TBC – January 2023

* The JP was aligned with relevant national strategies, specifically the Palestinian National Development Plan 2021-2023 and the Palestinian Social Development Sector Strategy (SDSS) 2017-2022. Key analysis pieces were also aligned with the priorities of the MoSD with evidence of Ministry dialogue and requests for analyses included in this JP, and future work resulting from this JP.
* On the supply side the JP made a significant contribution to supporting the social protection ecosystem through i) building the evidence base; commissioning and conducting large-scale data collection in the form of a new PWD database, needs assessments, and studies, ii) mainstreaming the Social Protection Floor concept and finalization of legal, strategic, and costing frameworks for rights-based and comprehensive social protection frameworks for PwD and OP.
* There are documented increases in the proportion of the population covered by social assistance however there is no evidence of increased access to social protection systems (outcome 1). The increase in coverage is largely attributed to the government’s response to COVID-19 pandemic. The proportion of the population living below the national poverty line has also decreased to levels that are below the baseline (outcome 2). This is also attributed to the social and economic recovery from COVID-19 as pandemic-related restrictions have been largely lifted.
* The programme was effective in supporting the COVID-19 response of MoSD and PCBS, including support for diagnostic studies and planning efforts that shaped the national social and economic response.
* The focus on learning among national and international stakeholders is clear and demonstrable (output 1 and output 2). Both national and international stakeholders have access to a wide set of data and evidence on PwD and OP which can inform social policies and social programs. Possible service packages have been defined and costed, specialized assessments of needs, and a review of targeting has been conducted with an eye to base selection of PwD and OP to social assistance on rights-based mechanisms. Further, a cash pilot was carried out for PWD, on behalf of the government with positive feedback and engagement from the MoSD (output 3).
* Evidence that PwD and OP have enhanced awareness of their rights to effectively take up services through the national social protection system is somewhat limited (output 4). PwD and OP continue to utilize old social protection systems as policymakers are still in the process of adopting new, legal, financing and programming frameworks to strengthen the capacity and responsiveness of the social protection system. The capacity and awareness of non-state actors to represent and advocate for PwD and OP based on rights-based mechanisms has been enhanced (output 4). This later result has not been corroborated by the evaluation team at this stage of the evaluation.
* The programme suffered from delays and low delivery rates in 2020 and 2021. Agencies have worked together to reorient priorities to take account contextual changes that occurred and deliver against programme results. Breaking silos and working together is aligned with SDG Fund reform, goals, and priorities. The agencies were able to leverage and build on their comparative advantages. A unified voice was used to overcome challenges with key partners and each one of the organizations leveraged its relationships to enable joint work. Funding was flexible and allowed for adjustments to be made. Changes in the enabling environment and context and sufficient flexibility in funding have provided an opportunity for review and adjustments but monitoring and evaluation overall has suffered from significant weaknesses affecting knowledge management and communication of results.
* Selected elements of the JP are likely to continue beyond the duration of the programme. This is happening through elements of the programme being taken forward by stakeholders or through the design of other projects that integrate lessons from the JP. These efforts do not yet constitute a guarantee of sustainability.
* The extent to which the Government of Palestine can provide a comprehensive range of social protection services to support system transformation remains fragile and is critical to sustainability.
* A clear positive outcome of the JP was its capacity to enable a platform for PUNOs to work more collaboratively with government, putting forward a well-coordinated and unified approach and enabling PUNOs to speak with one voice.
* Whilst the project focus on policy-level change could not create catalytic results in scope and scale of current policies and services, these initiatives are expected to yield impact in the future, with sufficient time for the impacts to materialize on the ground. Visibility and awareness amongst policymakers has tangibly increased and therefore policy outputs are well-placed to be utilized as part of a push (legal or policy) towards a more holistic, rights-based social protection system. A higher degree of sensitivity towards PwD and OP is expected in the next round of national/sectoral planning 2024-2029.
* Future policy programmes should further emphasize coherence and linkages with existing tools, systems, and functions as those elements are most likely to be adopted and sustained. This was one of the keys of success in this programme and should be replicated in the future.

*After the JP: follow-up and possibilities for sustainability of the impact and further scaling*

Given the importance and relevance of this work to ensure that the social protection system targets and supports the most vulnerable groups, discussions are currently underway with the EU to look at the possibility for building on and scaling up these efforts from 2023. All technical work completed by project end will be used to inform the preparation of the next Social Development Sector Strategy (2024-2029) in 2023. The disability data collection activities, forming the Evidence Generation result were focused during this project on the West Bank. Future work would look to increase coverage through a data collection process for Gaza. Work on transforming the disability assessment modality from a medical approach to functional approach should continue to build a new national assessment system. Work will continue on the comprehensive package towards designing a social pension, with next steps likely involving an analysis and redrafting of MoSD or other laws, based on further discussion with MoSD. The MoSD already has a budget line allocated for a social pension, resulting in an opportunity for both scale and impact if MoSD does indeed act upon the recommendations produced under this project towards implementing a social pension. Similar work will need to be carried out for a social allowance for persons with disability, which MoSD also already has a budget line allocated for. Based on the PMT analysis, there was a willingness from MoSD and the World Bank to learn more about different transfer value determination mechanisms; the ILO is contracting a follow-on piece of work to review, test and recommend alternative mechanisms for setting transfer values. The TRANSFORM trainings held at the end of this SDG project enabled a consolidation of work carried out, with learnings from the Joint Programme presented as case studies throughout the training sessions. The involvement of mid- and high-level policymakers in the capacity-building training strengthened the sustainability of the interventions beyond the project end date. The TRANSFORM trainings will be continued under a joint ILO-UNICEF project funded by the EU, with specific modules on shock-response being rolled out in OPT. Work on the service package for PWD and OP can also be taken forward to present options for transition and adoption in line with fiscal constraints and other realities on the ground. Necessary future work on strengthening the shock-responsiveness of the national social protection system was also highlighted based on learnings from the Hebron cash pilot.

# **Annex 1: Consolidated Final Results**

## **1. JP contribution to global Fund’s programmatic results**

Global Impact: Progress towards SDGs

Select up to 3 SDG *indicators* that your Joint Programme primarily contributed to (in relation to SDG targets listed in your JP ProDoc)

* **SDG 1** End Poverty; 1.3 Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable
* **SDG 10** Reduced Inequalities; 10.2 By 2030, empower and promote the social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status
* **SDG 17** Partnership for the Goals; 17.9 Enhance international support for implementing effective and targeted capacity-building in developing countries to support national plans to implement all the Sustainable Development Goals, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation

**Global Outcome 1: Integrated multi-sectoral policies to accelerate SDG achievement implemented with greater scope and scale**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Outcome indicators** | **Expected final target** | **Final result** | **Reasons for variance from planned target**  **(if any)** |
| 1.1: Number of integrated multi-sectoral policies that accelerated SDG progress in terms of scope[[8]](#footnote-8) | 1 | 0 | The draft disability law submitted to the PA Cabinet for review remains, as yet, not approved. This has meant that the plans embedded in the project design to take forward some of the legislative and policy framework for disability rights have not been feasible in the project, and some of the funding allocated to this has been reprogrammed for other activities. |
| *List the policies:*   * An integrated policy and programming framework for social protection for older persons and persons with disabilities. | | | |
| 1.2: Number of integrated multi-sectoral policies that accelerated SDG progress in terms of scale[[9]](#footnote-9) | 1 | 0 | The draft disability law submitted to the PA Cabinet for review remains, as yet, not approved. This has meant that the plans embedded in the project design to take forward some of the legislative and policy framework for disability rights have not been feasible in the project, and some of the funding allocated to this has been reprogrammed for other activities. |
| *List the policies:*   * An integrated policy and programming framework for social protection for older persons and persons with disabilities. | | | |

**Global Output 3: Integrated policy solutions for accelerating SDG progress implemented**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Output indicators** | **Expected final target** | **Final result** | **Reasons for variance from planned target**  **(if any)** |
| 3.1 Number of innovative solutions that were tested (disaggregated by % successful-unsuccessful) | 1 | 1 | N/A |
| 3.2: Number of integrated policy solutions that have been implemented with the national partners in lead | 1 | 0 | The draft disability law submitted to the PA Cabinet for review remains, as yet, not approved. This has meant that the plans embedded in the project design to take forward some of the legislative and policy framework for disability rights have not been feasible in the project, and some of the funding allocated to this has been reprogrammed for other activities. |

Did your Joint Programme contribute to the strengthening of national capacities to implement integrated, cross-sectoral SDG accelerators?

Yes

No

Explain briefly: The Joint Programme enhanced evidence generation, policy and legislative frameworks, service provision and capacity-building and awareness-raising. It worked extensively with national authorities including MoSD, PCBA, MoH, PMO. The JP’s capacity-building component enabled a consolidation of work carried out. The involvement of mid- and high-level policymakers in the capacity-building training strengthened the sustainability of the interventions beyond the project end date.

## **2. Results as per JP Programmatic Results Framework**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Result / Indicators** | **Baseline** | **Expected final target** | **Final result** | **Reasons for variance from planned target**  **(if any)** |
| Outcome 1: All Palestinians, especially the most vulnerable, have greater access to a unified, integrated, and shock-responsive social protection systems [where this Joint Programme will focus on People with Disabilities (PWD) and Older Persons (OP)] in line with vision for Social Protection Floors in oPt. | | | | |
| Outcome 1.1 indicator: Proportion of population covered by social protection floors/systems, by sex, distinguishing children, persons with disabilities, pregnant women, newborns, work-injury victims and the poor and the vulnerable | TBC (of the 5.8%, 255,224 PWD in SoP – 129,590 Male and 115,634 female) where 127,262 are in the West Bank as target area. | Extreme poor=98,978  PWD=47,738  Number of OP=63,478  Female HH=4,878 | 115,000 HHs covered by PNCTP, an increase from 98,978 HHs in 2019.  The proportion of the population covered by social protection assistance has increased since the baseline was set. Given the limited fiscal sources additions to the number of families covered by PNCTP are not frequent, however the COVID-19 response by MoSD included the addition of 10,000 vulnerable households. Public reporting on other services provided by MoSD to persons with disability and to older people is limited however qualitative information obtained through key informant interviews suggests that there are marginal but consistent increases in the coverage of PwD and OP. | N/A |
| Outcome 1.2 indicator: Proportion of population living below the national poverty line. | 29.2% | Above 30% | The Palestinian economy was stagnant and the socioeconomic situation already difficult prior to COVID-19. COVID-19 exacerbated economic challenges and lead to increases in poverty rates reaching about 30 percent at its peak in 2020. Since then, economic activity has slightly recovered, and poverty rates have regressed to 26.1 percent. | Achieved |
| Output 1.1 | | | | |
| Output 1.1 indicator: A consolidated dataset on PWD is developed | Multiple datasets exist. | Full dataset collected and analyzed to map out disability needs in oPt. | A unified data set was developed and updated with newly collected data on the needs of persons with disabilities. | Achieved |
| Output 1.1 indicator: National Comprehensive database of PWD established and integrated with the NCTP and other relevant databases. | No database in place. | Database completed and linked to MoSD efforts at social registry build. | Data consolidated in national social registry. | Achieved |
| Output 1.2 | | | | |
| Output 1.2 indicator: Integrated policy and programming framework for OP and PWD is developed. | No integrated framework. | Integrated programming and financing framework for PWD and OP developed. | The programme conducted multiple activities to support policy and programming frameworks for OP and PwD. This includes a social protection floor assessment for OP and PwD. The current policy and programming framework for OP and for PwD was developed before the programme started however qualitative evidence from key informants indicate that many of the outputs developed by this project will be integrated and form a solid base for the development of future policy, strategic and planning frameworks. | Within reach (notable contribution) |
| Output 1.2 indicator: A progressive legal framework and national action plan for OP and PWD is available. | Legal/strategic framework incomplete. | Action plan and studies developed for implementation of SPF priorities of PWD and OP. | Legal strategic framework has been improved. The legal environment is not favorable for the passage and adoption of new laws. However, the programme made significant contributions to advance OP and PWD priorities in national action plans. This also included the costing of the disability law which has been drafted but not endorsed yet. Lastly, the activity directly related to the law was re-oriented to support the disbursement of cash assistance and the evaluation of shock responsiveness and preparedness as part of the cash pilot in Yatta, Hebron. | Within reach (notable contribution) |
| Output 1.3 | | | | |
| Output 1.3 indicator: Rights-based approach for the identification and selection of OP and PWD into non-contributory social protection developed and tested | Concerns with exclusion errors of current targeting model. | Alternative selection and identification model piloted. | Completion of Hebron cash pilot and lesson learned report. Alternative selection models have been examined and feasibility assessed. | Achieved. |
| Output 1.3 indicator: Service package for PWD and OP scoped and costed | No service package defined. | Priority social service supply and quality gaps identified and required additional investment costed. | Service packages have been defined and costed. | Achieved. |
| Output 1.4 | | | | |
| Output 1.4 indicator: Capacity and awareness of citizens and non-state actors to represent and advocate for SP for PWD and OP enhanced | Minimal awareness and capacity among citizens, NGOs on elderly issues; limited awareness/ capacity for disability. | Enhanced capacity and awareness among citizens, NGOs on elderly and disability issues. | Awareness efforts focused on NGOs and citizens were carried out through several initiatives. Whilst these efforts were successful, it was difficult to assess the sustained increase in capacity and awareness of citizens and NGOs on elderly issues. | Some progress expected towards enhanced capacity and awareness  Not triangulated and corroborated at this stage |

# **Annex 2: Strategic documents**

## **2.1. Contribution to social protection strategies, policies, and legal frameworks**

***Strategic documents developed or adapted by JP***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Title of the document** | Date  finalized  (MM/YY) | Focus on extending social protection coverage  (Yes/No) | Focus on improved comprehensiveness of social protection benefits  (Yes/No) | Focus on enhancing adequacy of social protection benefits  (Yes/No) | Focus on improving governance, administration and/or implementation of social protection system  (Yes/No) | Focus on cross-sectoral integration with healthcare, childcare, education, employment, food security, etc.  (Yes/No) | *If published, provide the hyperlink* |
| Study of the Social Impacts of the COVID-19 Pandemic in Palestine and its Implications on Policies and Future Governmental and Non-Governmental Interventions | 07/2020 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Socio-economic Impact Survey of COVID-19 | 10/2020 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |  |
| Impacts of COVID-19 Restrictions on the Formal Private Sector in the Occupied Palestinian Territory: A Rapid Assessment | 10/2020 | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | [https://www.ilo.org/ beirut/publications/ WCMS\_770314/lang--en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_831347/lang--en/index.htm) |
| Targeting by proxy: An assessment of targeting efficiency of the proxy means test in the Occupied Palestinian Territory | 06/2022 | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No | <https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_848798.pdf> |
| Mapping Social Services Organizations Serving Persons with Disabilities and Older Persons in the State of Palestine | 10/2021 | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Social Service Mapping – needs assessment, matching report and costing report | 08/2022 | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Estimating the Costs of Implementing the 2019 Draft Law on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities | 04/ 2021 | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| On the road to universal social  protection: A social protection  floor assessment in the  Occupied Palestinian Territory | 10/2021 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | <https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_831347.pdf> |
| Evaluation Report and Policy Brief: Pilot on shock-responsiveness of cash-based social assistance to enhance social protection for persons with disabilities | 08/2022 | Yes | No | No | Yes | No |  |
| Social Protection for older people in Palestine: Policy and Advocacy Module (Books 1 and 2) | 08/2022 | No | No | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Social Pension for Older People in the Occupied Palestinian Territory: Feasibility Study Report | 08/2022 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |  |
| Towards a social pension for all older people in Palestine: Policy Brief | 08/2022 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |  |
| Costs and Options for a Sustainable Tax-Financed Social Pension in the Occupied Palestinian Territories | 08/2022 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |  |
| Report on Facilitation of the 5-day TRANSFORM social protection training package in  Palestine | 08/2022 | No | No | No | Yes | No |  |
| Report on Palestine Disability Assessments for Social Protection | 08/2022 | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Observation on the Current ECD Assessment Tools for Children in Palestine | 06/2022 | No | No | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Action Plan for the Disability Sector in Palestine | 05/2022 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Reviewing the National Sector Strategies from a Disability Perspective: Towards Laws, Policies and Strategies that are More Responsive to the Needs of Persons with Disabilities | 08/2022 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| A Strategic Framework for the Palestinian General Union of Persons with Disabilities (2023-2027) | 08/2022 | No | No | No | Yes | No |  |
| Implementation plan for the General Directorate of Persons with Disabilities Affairs at the Ministry of Social Development 2022-2023 | 08/2022 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |  |
| The Palestinian General Union of Persons with Disabilities: Mechanisms of Coordination and Networking | 08/2022 | No | No | No | Yes | No |  |

***Strategic documents for which JP provided contribution (but did not produce or lead in producing)***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Title of the document** | Date  when finalized  (MM/YY) | Focus on extending social protection coverage  (Yes/No) | Focus on improved comprehensiveness of social protection benefits  (Yes/No) | Focus on enhancing adequacy of social protection benefits  (Yes/No) | Focus on improving governance, administration and/or implementation of social protection system  (Yes/No) | Focus on cross-sectoral integration with healthcare, childcare, education, employment, food security, etc.  (Yes/No) | *If published, provide the hyperlink* |
| Updated Social Development Sector Strategy 2021-2023 | 08/2020 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes |  |
| Assessing System Readiness for Shock Responsive Social Protection in Palestine: Report of findings and options analysis | 09/2022 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No |  |
| Early Childhood Development Investment Case, Costing and Financing Strategy for children from Zero to age 8 in the West Bank and the Gaza Strip | 03/2021 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes |  |

## **2.2. Focus on vulnerable populations**

***Strategic documents developed or adapted by JP***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Title of the document** | **Date**  **when finalized**  (MM/YY) | **Focus on gender equality and women empowerment**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on children**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on youth**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on older persons**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on other group/s**  (List the group/s) | **Focus on PWDs**  (Yes/No) | **Included disaggregated data by disability** - and whenever possible by age, gender and/or type of disability  (Yes/No) |
| Characteristics of Individuals with Disabilities in Palestine: An Analytical Study Based on the Population, Housing and Establishments Census 2007, 2017 | 08/2020 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | PWD | Yes | Yes |

***Strategic documents for which JP provided contribution (but did not produce or lead in producing)***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Title of the document** | **Date**  **when finalized**  (MM/YY) | **Focus on gender equality and women empowerment**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on children**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on youth**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on older persons**  (Yes/No) | **Focus on other group/s**  (List the group/s) | **Focus on PWDs**  (Yes/No) | **Included disaggregated data by disability** - and whenever possible by age, gender and/or type of disability  (Yes/No) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

**Annex 3: Results questionnaire**

[https://forms.office.com/r/DfvPvaGfsg](https://eur03.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fforms.office.com%2Fr%2FDfvPvaGfsg&data=04%7C01%7Cmaya.marquez%40undp.org%7Cb7cbf04bb2bb47d5813908d9fb051fd5%7Cb3e5db5e2944483799f57488ace54319%7C0%7C0%7C637816821720272900%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000&sdata=dxJ5wXGqSgIcG6p2R3Z1YVPp18XQMYnilGplGbFxA3Q%3D&reserved=0)*.*

**Annex 4: Final report on JP evaluation**

1. The MPTF Office Project Reference Number is the same as the one on the Notification message. It is also referred to as “Project ID” on the project’s factsheet page on the [MPTF Office GATEWAY](http://mdtf.undp.org). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. The start date is the date inserted in the original ProDoc submitted and approved by the Joint SDG Fund. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. As per approval of the original project document by the relevant decision-making body/Steering Committee. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. If there has been an extension, then the revised, approved end date should be reflected here. If there has been no extension approved, then the current end date is the same as the original end date. The end date is the same as the operational closure date which is when all activities for which a Participating Organization is responsible under an approved MPTF / JP have been completed. As per the MOU, agencies are to notify the MPTF Office when a programme completes its operational activities. Please see [MPTF Office Closure Guidelines](http://mdtf.undp.org/document/download/5449). [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Financial Closure requires the return of unspent balances and submission of the [Certified Final Financial Statement and Report.](http://mdtf.undp.org/document/download/5388) [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Joint SDG Fund Contribution is the amount transferred to the Participating UN Organizations – see [MPTF Office GATEWAY](http://mdtf.undp.org). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. TRANSFORM, (https://transformsp.org/) training for government staff on social protection, adapted for the MENA region. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Scope = substantive expansion: additional thematic areas/components added or mechanisms/systems replicated. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Scale = geographical expansion: local solutions adopted at the regional and national level or a national solution adopted in one or more countries. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)